
3A

Action

General Session

Approval of the February 2017 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the February 2017 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the February 2017 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the February 9-10, 2017 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative
José Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University (2/9 only)
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative
Ref Rodriguez, Public Representative
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California (2/10 only)
Michelle Zumot, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Commission Members Absent

Kathleen Harris, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Shane Martin, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

Thursday, February 9, 2017

General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond convened the February 9-10, 2017 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:06 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Darling-Hammond congratulated Commissioners Kirsten Barnes, Alicia Hinde, Haydee Rodriguez, and Ref Rodriguez on their reappointments.

Chair Darling-Hammond announced appointments for the 2017 Executive Committee:

- José Gonzalez, Educator Preparation Committee
- Michael Cooney, Professional Practices Committee
- Kirsten Barnes, Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee
- Kathleen Harris, Legislative Committee
- Bonnie Klatt, Certification Committee

1A: Approval of the December 2016 Minutes

Commissioner Barnes moved approval of the December 2016 Commission Minutes. Commissioner H. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1B: Approval of the February 2017 Agenda

Commissioner Klatt moved approval of the February 2017 Agenda with an agenda insert for item 4A. Commissioner H. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1C: Approval of the February 2017 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the February 2017 Consent Calendar. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Escobedo recusing herself from item 98. John Schleh.

1D: Chair's Report

Chair Darling-Hammond discussed the report that was released by the Learning Policy Institute regarding the teacher shortage in California.

1E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy introduced Jake Shuler as a new Consultant in the Professional Services Division.

Executive Director Sandy shared the Commission's priorities for 2017.

1F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Gonzalez recognized February 6-10, 2017 as National School Counseling Week.

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer acknowledged the work done by the Learning Policy Institute. She also spoke about a new report by the American Association of State Universities and Colleges and presented a "Save the Date" flyer for the Better Together: California Teacher Summit on July 28, 2017.

Commissioner Hinde talked about her children's participation in the Women's March.

1G: Liaison Reports

Grace Wakefield, Commission Student Liaison, reported on her conversation with a colleague regarding the appointment of the new Secretary of Education.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair José Gonzalez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

2A: Update on the Review of the Child Development Permit

Erin Sullivan, Consultant, Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, and Deborah Stipek, Chair, Child Development Permit Advisory Panel, presented this item which reported on the recommendations of the Child Development Permit Advisory Panel (CDP AP) and the results of the field review, including potential next steps for the Commission's consideration.

Andrea Ball, Early Edge Initiative, spoke in support of moving forward with the Panel's recommendations and suggested the Commission make addressing the needs of dual language learners more explicit.

Kisha Williamson, Partnerships for Education, Articulation and Coordination through Higher Education (PEACH), spoke on this item and submitted a letter which recommended the Commission vote to build out the candidate performance expectations structure to all levels of the Permit and finalize preparation program standards. She also spoke on the importance of aligning the performance expectations and preparation program standards to the California Early Childhood Education (ECE) competencies.

Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers, voiced concerns about dual language and the use of California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP) for ECE educators.

Harold Acord, Moreno Valley Educators Association, spoke in support of Panel's recommendations and voiced the importance of CCP (Children Center Permit) teachers.

Sarah Neville-Morgan, First 5 California, raised concerns regarding the lack of deep focus on cultural and linguistic responsiveness; the need to establish rigorous criteria for the 21 hours of professional development required by every level of the permit; and the need for a monitoring mechanism and funding to support preparation programs. She also stressed the importance that the standards ensure that every course that applies to the education requirements includes the opportunity to demonstrate the application of knowledge, reflective practice and peer-to-peer support.

2B: Proposed Revisions to the Preconditions for Subject Matter Proficiency Requirements Applicable to Candidates in Undergraduate Integrated Teacher Preparation Programs

Hart Boyd, Program Analyst, and Miranda Gutierrez, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed revisions to the Preconditions for Preliminary Multiple Subject, Single Subject, and Education Specialist programs for subject matter proficiency requirements applicable to candidates in integrated undergraduate teacher preparation programs for the Commission's consideration and possible adoption.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a letter which supported the staff recommendation to allow candidates in undergraduate integrated teacher preparation programs to advance to fieldwork experiences and to solo teaching prior to fully completing subject matter requirements.

David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, spoke in support of the proposed revisions.

Commissioner Hinde moved to adopt the proposed revision to Preliminary Multiple Subject and Single Subject Program Precondition 6 and Education Specialist Program Precondition 3 as these relate to subject matter proficiency for integrated undergraduate programs. Commissioner Zumot seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2C: Initial Institutional Approval: Potential Revisions to the Criteria and Process

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided potential revisions to the criteria and process for Initial Institutional Approval (IIA) adopted at the February 2016 Commission meeting.

Danette Brown, California Teachers Association, voiced appreciation for the Commission's effort to refine the accreditation process and asked a question regarding whether stakeholders would have the opportunity to know what evidence has been submitted to avoid submitting duplicate documents.

Ryan Gleason, Las Virgenes Unified School District, requested the Commission reopen the initial institution approval process and provide efficiencies to districts interested in submitting programs.

Sarah Lillis, EdVoice, spoke about the process to allow the public to submit information about an institution and recommended that the institution be notified of the information submitted by third parties so they can have the opportunity to provide a written response or be prepared to respond when their program is presented to the Commission. She also raised concerns about the subjective measure for the Veracity in Claims and Documentation criterion and suggested the Commission allow staff to make a recommendation based on information provided.

Commissioner R. Rodriguez moved to adopt the proposed changes to the Criteria and Process of Initial Institutional Approval with the following amendments: 1) add "complete" before accurate and truthful information under Criterion 10a and 10b; 2) remove "Google and Nexus" under Criterion 11 and change "2-3 years" to "5 years" under 11d; 3) all the questions under Factors to Consider in Criterion 11 will be framed as two-sided questions that include "To what extent" or something similar and identifies the specific type of program when necessary; 4) reorder Criteria 9 and 10; and 5) allow staff to make a recommendation for Veracity in the Claims and Documentation Criterion. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:30 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126(e), to consider the following pending litigations: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE); *Luis Osollo v. Linda Darling-Hammond, Et Al* (United States District Court Central District of California, CV-16-03045-SJO (AS)); and *Jack Poster v. Rialto Unified School District, California Commission on Teacher Credentialing, et al* (United States District Court Central District of California, CV16-01839 AB). The Commission also considered adverse actions, petitions for reinstatement and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126(e).

Friday, February 10, 2017

General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:36 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Chair Darling-Hammond announced that Commissioner Bonnie Klatt would chair the Educator Preparation Committee due to Commissioner José Gonzalez's absence.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

2D: Dual Certification for Single Subject and Designated Subjects Career Technical Education Teaching Credentials

Bob Loux, Consultant, Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, and Carolyn Zachary, California Department of Education, presented this item which reviewed California's history of credentialing Career Technical Education (CTE) teachers and identified current issues impacting the supply of CTE teachers. It also presented recommendations from a CTE workgroup intended to address the shortage of CTE teachers and increase opportunities for students to participate in experiential and work-based learning.

Cliff Adams-Hart, Mission Valley ROP, submitted a letter which raised concerns regarding finding highly trained and skilled CTE instructors to help CTE students navigate the learning and skill attainment required for entering the workforce.

Al Mijares, Orange County Department of Education, submitted a letter which suggested the following language for the first bullet of Proposal 1: "Single Subject teachers must have 500 of hours of recent industry experience—The Commission could specify a different number of hours to be eligible for the initial new CTE permit. Recency would be defined as one year in the last five years or two years within the last ten."

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a letter in support of the proposals provided in the item and asked the Commission to consider a one-time extension of the "first-year" permit for teachers who do not reach 250 hours of industry experience. The letter also asked the Commission to include credit for recent but not current community college teaching experience and supported the recommendation to require coursework for teaching English learners in Proposal 2 and Proposal 3.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, spoke in support of the recommendation regarding course work for teaching English learners in Proposal 2 and Proposal 3. She also expressed concerns that the pedagogy class in Proposal 3 would not adequately cover and ensure community college teachers are prepared to provide instruction consistent with all of the California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP).

Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers, voiced support for Proposal 1 with 250 hours of industry experience and raised concerns about Proposal 2 regarding the Teaching Performance Assessment (TPA). She also spoke about the importance of having an English learner authorization.

Anna Fontus, Linked Learning Alliance, expressed the importance of having industry experience for teachers and spoke in support of 250 hours of industry experience as a starting point for teacher candidates. She also suggested more robust data be collected on the CTE teacher workforce to assist districts and local industry sectors with developing programs.

Jack Mitchell, Arts, Media, and Entertainment Industry Sector, asked the Commission to be cautious about any reduction in qualifying hours for a teacher to earn a CTE credential and voiced support of 500 hours of industry experience.

Jeff Frost, Orange County Department of Education, voiced support for the 500 hours option under Proposal 1 and recommended the addition of a recency component for the initial qualifying industry experience hours.

David Simmons, Ventura County Office of Education, voiced support for the 250 hours of experience option under Proposal 1; 2) recommended that the TPA go through an accredited program under Proposal 2; 3) raised concerns regarding how pedagogy is defined under Proposal 3; and 4) supported Proposal 4 if it were implemented on a voluntary basis.

Paul Watters, representing himself, raised concerns with allowing 250 hours of experience for the initial permit under Proposal 1 and recommended 500 hours of industry experience be required for the initial CTE permit and 250 hours for each renewal.

Bridget Mondt, Orange County Department of Education, voiced support for all four proposals with the following suggestions: Proposal 3 – eliminate the third bullet and require completion of a CTE teacher preparation program; and Proposal 1 – include a recency component for the industry experience requirement.

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, reiterated the same concerns and recommendations raised by Mr. Simmons. He also spoke in support of alternate pathways to certification and stressed that all credential pathways be equivalent and meet the standards set by the Commission.

Annie Johnston, UC Berkeley College & Career Academy Support Network and Pathway Teacher Workforce Network, requested the Commission consider what industry experience is applicable and asked the Commission to update standards and support program development for integrated four-year single subject credentials that qualify teachers to teach CTE in the academic world.

Stephanie Biagetti, CSU, Sacramento, spoke in support of creating pathways for Single Subject and CTE dual credentialing.

Clayton Mitchell, representing himself, expressed concerns with lowering the experience requirement and encouraged the Commission to maintain 1,000 hours of industry experience. He addressed Proposal 1 and recommended 500 hours of experience for initial certification and completion of 250 hours of experience for renewal.

Sheryl Ryder, Placer County Office of Education, spoke about the completion of the California Subject Examinations for Teachers (CSET) for a CTE credential and how the CSET aligns with the fifteen industry sectors in CTE. She also raised concerns regarding the lack of input from industry partners and requested the Commission look at requirements for CTE credentials in other states.

Donna Wyatt, California Department of Education, raised concerns regarding requiring less than 500 of hours of industry experience. She also answered questions that were raised by the Commission members regarding CTE programs and funding.

The Commission directed staff to bring this item back with more background information and proposals for next steps at a future Commission meeting.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

3A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Gilberto Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Legislative Committee

Acting Committee Chair Ref Rodriguez convened the Legislative Committee.

4A: Status of Legislation

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission.

Anna Fontus, Linked Learning Alliance, asked the Commission to push for adding Career Technical Education (CTE) as a high need field under AB 169 (O'Donnell).

Annie Johnston, UC Berkeley College & Career Academy Support Network, requested the Commission work with Assembly member O'Donnell on AB 169, specifically on how CTE relates to Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) and the data collection needed for identifying high priority and shortage areas.

Luz Ortega, Los Angeles Unified School District, spoke in support of AB 169 (O'Donnell).

Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee

Committee Chair Kirsten Barnes convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

5A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2017-18 Budget

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, and Elizabeth Hambridge, Manager, Fiscal and Business Services, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Governor's proposed 2017-18 budget that relate to the Commission.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

1H: Report of Closed Session Items

Commissioner Cooney reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC* and no reportable action was taken.

Staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Osollo v. CTC* and there was no reportable action.

Staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Jack Poster v. CTC* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Philip Brezine
- Shawn Martin

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Susan Bush
- Duane Flanigan
- Dori Keigley

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Juan Jaimes and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Cornelius Ogunsalu
- Samantha Sorkin

The Commission granted the following requests for reconsideration and sustained its previous decisions:

- David Acrea
- Lisa Pilch
- Carlos Shaw

The Commission granted the request for reconsideration in the matter of Mark Sanchez and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

1I: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Audience Presentations

Josh Brown, Teach Plus, requested the Commission create a master mentor teacher authorization that would allow teachers to be identified statewide by their ability to work with preservice teachers.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 11:29 a.m.