
1A

Action

General Session

Approval of the December 2015 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the December 2015 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the December 2015 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the December 3-4, 2015 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair
Kathleen Harris, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Joseph Aguerrebere, California State University
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative
Constance Blackburn, Teacher Representative
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Shane Martin, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (12/3 only)
Ref Rodriguez, Public Representative
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California
Michelle Zumot, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Commission Members Absent

Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
Jose Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative
Juliet Tiffany-Morales, School Board Member

Thursday, December 3, 2015

General Session

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the December 3-4, 2015 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:06 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

1A: Approval of the October 2015 Minutes

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the October 2015 Commission Minutes. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Barnes abstaining.

1B: Approval of the December 2015 Agenda

Commissioner Blackburn moved approval of the December 2015 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 1H, 2G and a revised item 2D. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1C: Approval of the December 2015 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Hinde moved approval of the October 2015 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 21. Anh Dinh, 24. Nicole Eden, and 72. Oscar Sevilla to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1D: Chair's Report

Chair Darling-Hammond talked about the recent reauthorization of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA) and the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA).

Chair Darling-Hammond gave a brief report on the results of the evaluation of Executive Director Mary Sandy.

Vice Chair Harris also commended Executive Director Sandy on her leadership.

1E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy thanked staff for their work and support on moving the Commission's agenda forward.

1F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Martin reported that he attended the World Congress on Catholic Education in November 2015.

Commissioner H. Rodriguez stated that December is the month to acknowledge National Board Certified teachers.

Commissioner Aguerrebere stated that California should revisit policies that find ways to support more teachers to elevate their skills and demonstrate what they can do. He also talked about the role of the Commission regarding certification standards on the social and emotional support of children.

Commissioner Hinde recognized special education teachers on the annual National Special Education Day.

Commissioner Barnes reported that she attended the annual California Association of School Counselors conference in October 2015.

1G: Liaison Reports

Ilene Straus, State Board of Education Liaison, updated the Commission on the State Board's recent activities regarding the Elementary and Secondary Education Act reauthorization and the Every Student Succeeds Act as well as on activities relating to assessment, accountability and the English Language Development framework.

Grace Wakefield, Commission Student Liaison, shared her plans for moving forward in the new year.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

2A: Adoption of Draft Preliminary Multiple and Single Subject Teacher Preparation Program Standards and Approval of Draft *Teaching Performance Expectations* (TPEs)

Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, and Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessments, presented this item which provided draft revised Preliminary Teacher Preparation Program Standards and the Draft *Teaching Performance Expectations* (TPEs) for the Commission's review and approval to begin a validity study of the TPEs as part of the redevelopment work of the CalTPA.

Christine Zeppos, Independent California Colleges and Universities' Council on the Education of Teachers, submitted a written letter regarding Standard 3: Clinical Practice, Section A: Organization of Clinical Practice Experiences, which states "*Candidates who are working in private schools and seeking a credential are required to complete a substantive clinical experience of at least 150 hours in a diverse public school setting.*" The letter raised concerns that this new requirement will create unintended barriers for private school teachers to become fully credentialed.

Paul Ammon, California Council on Teacher Education, submitted a written letter which expressed the organization's support for increased attention to arts-integrated teaching in the currently proposed revisions of the California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP) and TPEs for both Multiple and Single Subject Credential candidates.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which requested that the Commission include the following five new areas of focus in the TPEs:

1. The use of emerging technology to enhance instruction
2. Integrating the use of visual and performing arts across content areas to support teaching and learning
3. Updated approaches to classroom management that support social and emotional learning
4. Developing students' critical, creative, and analytic thinking required to be college and career ready
5. More emphasis on candidates' ability to work effectively with special needs and students with disabilities in the regular education classroom, implementing approaches such as Universal Design principles, Multi-Tiered Systems of Support and co-teaching

Brad Strong, Children Now, voiced support of the draft TPEs and requested the Commission to move forward with the validity study.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, voiced support of the draft Preliminary Multiple and Single Subject Program Standards and the draft TPEs.

Raymond Burnell, California Catholic Conference, raised concerns with Standard 3 which requires 150 hours of clinical practice in a public school.

Chair Darling-Hammond moved to adopt the draft revised Preliminary Multiple and Single Subject Teacher Preparation Program Standards with suggested amendments to remove the “public school setting” language and replace it with “a diverse school setting where the curriculum aligns with California’s adopted content standards and frameworks and the school reflects the diversity of California’s student population.” Commissioner Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Harris moved to adopt the draft *Teaching Performance Expectations* for the validity study. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner H. Rodriguez moved to approve the transition plan. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2B: Special Education Teacher Preparation Update

William Hatrick and Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultants, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which reported on work undertaken through a grant provided by the National Governor’s Association (NGA) to consider options for the preparation and credentialing of special education teachers focusing on the recommendations from the Statewide Special Education Task Force.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which suggested the Commission gather stakeholder feedback related to the NGA work and Task Force recommendations.

Noni Reis, California Teachers Association, discussed the priorities for future work in the preparation and credentialing of special education teachers.

Irene Nares-Guzicki, California Association of Professors of Special Education Administration, voiced support of the issue.

Janet Davis Higgins, California Federation of Teachers, raised concerns regarding the evaluation of general education and special education teachers and keeping the *proposed Teaching Performance Expectations* and Teaching Performance Assessment aligned with the California Standards for the Teaching Profession.

Rico Tamayo, California Federation of Teachers, suggested the Commission include general education and special education teachers in the discussion prior to moving forward with a decision. He also raised a concern on the rationale listed on page EPC 2B-5: *Flexibility in placement, grades, and classes can be seen as a positive for districts looking to fill classroom vacancies, or a negative for teachers who may be placed into a classroom that is not their preferred choice.*

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, requested the Commission include advocates of families that have students with disabilities in future conversations on this work and also raised concerns on the implications of underprepared teachers in special education.

David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, stated that any expected credential structure has to support the full continuum of services in placements and has to ensure that general education teachers have access to the support of expert special education teachers; and that specialized training is needed for education specialists who work with students in the low incidence categories. He also said that students with significant intellectual disabilities need to be addressed in a way appropriate to those students in terms of preparation.

The Commission directed staff to work with experts and stakeholders and bring back more information at a future meeting.

2D: Proposed Updates to the Accreditation Framework

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Lynette Roby, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed updated language for the *Accreditation Framework* for the Commission's consideration and possible adoption, based on the work of the Accreditation Strengthening and Streamlining project.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which voiced support of the proposed updates to the Accreditation Framework.

The Commission directed staff to move forward with the work and bring back the updated framework at the February 2016 meeting for Commission consideration.

2C: Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation (COA)

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the 2014-15 Annual Accreditation Report from the Committee on Accreditation.

Reyes Quezada and Pia Wong, Committee on Accreditation, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which thanked the Committee for its work to review and support programs in an effort to maintain the highest-quality programs for teacher candidates.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, suggested surveys be required from candidates applying for preliminary credentials.

2E: Proposed Adoption of Revisions to the Assessment Design Standards for Teaching Performance Assessments

Amy Reising, Director of Development for Teacher and Administrator Performance Assessments, presented this item which provided revisions to the Commission adopted Design Standards for Teaching Performance Assessments (TPA) for Commission consideration.

Commissioner R. Rodriguez moved to adopt the revised Design Standards for Teaching Performance Assessments. Commissioner Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2F: Update on the Development of Administrator Performance Assessment Design and Program Implementation Standards

Amy Reising, Director of Development for Teacher and Administrator Performance Assessments, presented this item which provided an update on Design and Program Implementation Standards for the Administrator Performance Assessment (APA) and proposed that the Commission adopt these standards.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which supported the staff recommendation to adopt the draft APA Design Standards and to outreach to stakeholders to collect suggestions and revisions to the draft APA Implementation Standards.

The Leadership Team, California Association of Professors of Educational Administration (CAPEA), submitted a written letter which provided the following suggestions:

1. That the CAPEs and CPSEL be reviewed as a first step to create a set of comprehensible performance criteria for emerging leaders to guide the APA and inform the assessment of new administrators in the induction program.
2. That the Commission adopt the draft APA Assessment Design and Program Implementation Standards with direction to staff that program providers be included in every stage of the development and implementation process.
3. That prospective model sponsors who meet the APA Design Standards be allowed to design and develop additional APAs beyond the Commission's model.

Nancy Parachini and John Rogers, UCLA, Rebecca Cheung, Tina Trujillo and Jessica Charles, UC Berkeley, submitted a written letter which stated that APA Design and Implementation Standards should be: a) broadened in scope; b) more inclusive of different modes for candidates to communicate knowledge and competencies; and c) scheduled at the times that allow candidates to benefit from the full breadth of programs. The letter also suggested the Commission consult with programs that have already established a strong track record of success in developing school leaders to develop outstanding, equity-focused leaders for California's K-12 public schools.

Deborah Erickson, Point Loma Nazarene University and CAPEA, suggested the Commission enhance the work already done by the institutions with regard to assessment, recognizing the need for reliability and validity, and requested the Commission allow all potential model sponsors access to the results of the study currently being facilitated by the University of San Diego and allow time for institutions to use that data if they want to become a model sponsor.

Peg Winkelman, CAPEA, requested that program providers be a part of every step of the process of developing this assessment.

Doug Gephart, Association of California School Administrators, raised a concern regarding the number of different assessments being developed and validated and suggested the Commission include key stakeholders to produce the best instrument possible through the process.

Noni Reis, California Teachers Association and CAPEA, read the letter that was submitted by the

leadership team from CAPEA.

Rebecca Cheung, UC Berkeley and UCLA, read the concerns listed in the written letter and provided some suggestions as to their recommend actions.

The Commission directed staff to review the alignment between the CAPEs and CPSEL and bring this item back for discussion at the February 2016 meeting.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 3:20 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126(e), to consider the following pending litigation: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE). The Commission also considered adverse actions, petitions for reinstatement and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126(e).

Friday, December 4, 2015

General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:34 a.m. and roll call was taken.

1H: Proposed Amendments and Deletions to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to the Reading and Literacy Added Authorization and Reading and Literacy Leadership Specialist Credential

Chair Darling-Hammond opened the public hearing.

Tammy Duggan, Consultant, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments and deletions to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations pertaining to the Reading and Literacy Added Authorization and Leadership Specialist Credential.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which supported the updates to the regulations for the Reading Certificate and the Reading and Language Arts Specialist Credential.

Commissioner Harris moved to adopt the proposed regulations pertaining to the Reading and Literacy Added Authorization and Leadership Specialist Credential. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1I: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 Section 80499 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to the English Learner (EL) Authorization Requirement

Erin Skubal, Program Analyst, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5, California Code of Regulations, section 80499 pertaining to the English Learner (EL) Authorization requirement for adding a teaching or content area to a general education teaching credential.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which supported the proposed amendments to the EL authorization requirements.

Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education, voiced support of the amended regulations.

Commissioner H. Rodriguez moved to adopt the proposed regulations pertaining to the English Learner Authorization requirement. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

3A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Nanette Rufo, Director, and Gilberto Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

3B: Committee of Credentials Vacancies

Nanette Rufo, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which reviewed the terms of the current members of the Committee of Credentials for the Commission to determine whether to reappoint or declare vacancies for one elementary teacher member, one school board member and two public members.

Commissioner Hinde moved to suspend the policy manual and reappoint Tillie Soliz, Mary Jane Roberts, Jane Smith and Mario Moya to serve on the Committee of Credentials effective June 30, 2016. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

2G: Accreditation: Draft Induction Program Standards and Preconditions and Employment Based Considerations

Karen Sacramento, Consultant, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided revised draft Induction Preconditions, Program Standards, and a Transition Plan for the Commission's consideration, possible revision, and adoption. The item also presented employment based issues for the Commission's discussion and determination of next steps.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which supported the movement from inputs to a focus on program outcomes focused on what candidates know and are able to do at the completion of the preparation program. The letter also stated the organization's interest in engaging in conversations regarding induction candidate fees.

Eric Heins, California Teachers Association, submitted a written letter which raised concerns regarding equity and access if teachers are required to pay for their induction program. The letter also provided suggestions regarding the content of the item.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, voiced support of adopting the draft standards and preconditions including the precondition that induction programs only serve preliminary credential holders who are employed in teaching positions. She also requested the Commission to endorse the recommendation that induction be a two-year program and raised concerns about the issue of equity when candidates are being charged for an induction program.

Janet Davis Higgins, California Federation of Teachers, voiced concerns regarding candidates paying for their induction program and raised questions about the preconditions for the two-year induction programs.

Emily Davis and Kim Ortiz, New Teacher Center, urged the Commission to adopt the draft induction standards, preconditions and the transition plan and voiced support of a two-year program. They requested the Commission provide further clarification in the best practice guidance document on Program Standard 4 and what ongoing training and support for mentors entails.

Ken Burt, California Teachers Association, emphasized the concerns raised in CTA's letter on charging beginning teachers for induction.

Noni Ries, California Teachers Association, provided suggestions on the draft preconditions and program standards.

David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, echoed concerns that were addressed by previous speakers and suggested the Commission add a question to the Declaration of Need for Fully Qualified Educators (DON) regarding charging for induction.

Danielle Forst, CUE, suggested that guidance be provided to align the induction standards with the updated TPEs and CSTP.

Commissioner Harris moved to initiate the regulatory process incorporating the following change: Defining an induction program as not available to a teacher if the teacher has to pay for it. It is "available" only if it is available at no cost to the teacher. Commissioner H. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Harris moved to adopt the program standards as presented, including the edits listed in the EPC 2G Agenda Insert on Standard 1 and Standard 2 with the following modification: The

mentoring approach implemented by the program must include the development of an Individualized Learning Plan (ILP) for candidates based on needs determined by the teacher and program provider, in consultation with the site administrator and guided by the Preliminary Program Transition Plan. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Chair Darling-Hammond moved to adopt the preconditions as presented in the agenda item. Commissioner R. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Harris moved to adopt the transition plan for Induction and Clear Credential programs. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Commission also directed staff to explore options for gathering information from employing districts on the accessibility of induction programs for preliminary credential holders and bring an item back for discussion at a future meeting.

2H: Proposed Revision of the Enrollment Requirement for the Clear Administrative Services Credential Standards

Gay Roby, Consultant, and Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the implementation of the 120-day enrollment requirement contained in the Clear Administrative Services Standards and proposed revisions to that provision.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which supported staff's recommendations addressing the 120-day enrollment requirement for clear administrative services candidates.

Nancy Parachini and John Rogers, UCLA, Rebecca Cheung, Tina Trujillo and Jessica Charles, UC Berkeley, submitted a written letter which 1) supported the recommendation to retroactively waive the 120-day enrollment requirement and 2) opposed the recommendation revising the language of Program Standard 1 to eliminate the 120-day enrollment mandate.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, voiced concerns about eliminating the 120-day enrollment requirement.

Tom Green, UC Berkeley, voiced support of staff's recommendation 1 and requested the Commission consider other remedies to the current shortage such as creating incentives to increase the enrollment of existing programs, a short term waiver process, or accelerating the application/approval process for new program sponsors.

Deborah Erickson, Point Loma Nazarene University, raised concerns regarding the revised language for Program Standard 1 and the ethical conflict between the confidential nature of coaching and the employment of candidates.

Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education, stated that the revised language needs to keep a sense of urgency for the enrollment into the program.

Commissioner Harris moved to waive the 120-day enrollment requirement for all clear administrative services induction programs retroactively from July 1, 2015 through December 31, 2016. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Certification Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Certification Committee.

4A: Certification and Assignment Issues Surrounding Statutory Teacher Leaves

Erin Skubal, Program Analyst, Certification Division, and Erin Henderson, Program Analyst, Professional Services Division, presented this item which addressed certification and assignment issues impacting students whose teacher is out on an extended statutory leave, along with potential solutions for Commission consideration.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a written letter which supported exploration of solutions to provide more flexibility to school leaders in filling assignments resulting from statutory teacher leaves.

Wesley Smith, Association of California School Administrators, submitted a written letter which requested the adoption of the recommendations in the Teaching Permit for Statutory Leave (TPSL) concept paper dated October 2015. The letter also stated that any desirable solution to Statutory Teacher Leave issues must contain the following criteria: 1) instructional and behavioral continuity; 2) transparency and open communication; and 3) compliance with state and federal mandate.

Peter Birdsall, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, submitted a letter which supported the proposed TPSL to provide a targeted solution to a staffing need not currently addressed by other documents.

Laurie Gabriel and David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, expressed concerns regarding California's shortage of long-term substitutes which is exacerbated by the limitations embedded in the 30-Day Substitute Teaching Permit authorization.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, spoke on this issue and submitted a written letter which raised the following concerns regarding the requirements for the proposed TPSL: 1) criteria for eligibility and term of validity, 2) pre-service orientation requirements, 3) mentoring assignment and support requirements, 4) curriculum and lesson planning requirements, and 5) Commission oversight.

Luz Ortega, Los Angeles Unified School District, requested the Commission consider changing the current restrictions on the 30-Day Substitute Permit, that the time allowed for this permit be extended, that substitute permit holders who are selected to step into long-term assignments be provided with mentor support by the employing agency and that employing agencies establish a means for these individuals to be evaluated.

Chair Darling-Hammond appointed Ex-Officio member Joseph Aguerrebere to serve as a voting member in the event that a quorum was needed.

Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education, voiced support of the TPSL.

Janet Davis Higgins, California Federation of Teachers, raised the issue of employers who use retired and potential teachers as their substitute teacher pools and suggested the Commission seek other options such as modified intern programs to resolve teacher shortages.

Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee

Committee Chair Ref Rodriguez convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

5A: Strengthening and Streamlining Accreditation Project Update

Darren Addington, Chief Information Officer, Enterprise Technology Section, presented this item which provided an update on expenditures and project timelines for the Strengthening and Streamlining the Accreditation System Project.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

1J: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice Chair Harris reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- David Palos
- Dixie Wilson
- Richard Odegaard
- Abe Snobar

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Jeffrey Freund
- Beverly Vaughn

The Commission granted the following requests for reconsideration and sustained its previous decisions:

- Chinh Nguyen
- Emigdio Ojeda, III

The Commission granted reconsideration and considered the late materials in the matter of David Garcia, then sustained its previous decision.

The Commission denied the request for reconsideration in the matter of Irfan Bilgin.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and accepted the recommendations of the Committee of Credentials:

- Anh Dinh
- Nicole Eden
- Oscar Sevilla

1K: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

1L: Nominations and Elections for the Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2016

Executive Director Mary Sandy presented this item regarding the nominations and elections for Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2016.

Commissioner Barnes nominated Linda Darling-Hammond as Chair. Commissioner R. Rodriguez nominated Kathleen Harris as Vice Chair. Commissioner Hinde moved to waive the applicable provisions of the Policy Manual to allow for a voice vote. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Hinde move to elect Linda Darling-Hammond as Chair and Kathleen Harris as Vice Chair. Commissioner Aguerrebere seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 12:25 p.m.