Minutes of the January Commission Meeting

January 8, 2004
Commission Offices, 1900 Capitol Avenue, Sacramento

COMMISSION MEMBERS ATTENDING
Lawrence Madkins, Teacher, Chair
Elaine Johnson, Public Representative, Vice-Chair
Kristen Beckner, Teacher
Chellyn Boquiren, Teacher
Leslie Littman, Designee, Office of the Superintendent of Public Instruction
Alberto Vaca, Teacher
Os-Maun Rasul, Non-Administrative Services Credential Holder
Steve Lilly, Faculty Member

COMMISSION MEMBERS ABSENT
Alan Bersin, Administrator
Margaret Fortune, Public Representative
Beth Hauk, Teacher

EX-OFFICIO REPRESENTATIVES
Sara Lundquist, California Postsecondary Education Commission
Karen Symms Gallagher, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities
Athena Waite, University of California
Bill Wilson, California State University

COMMISSION STAFF PRESENTING
Sam Swofford, Executive Director
Mary Armstrong, General Counsel, Director, Professional Practices Division
Janet Vining, Staff Counsel, Professional Practices Division
Kimberly Hunter, Staff Counsel, Professional Practices Division
Lee Pope, Staff Counsel, Professional Practices Division
Dale Janssen, Director, Certification, Assignment & Waivers Division
Elizabeth Graybill, Interim Director, Professional Services Division
Leyne Milstein, Director, Information Technology & Support Management Division
Crista Hill, Manager, Fiscal & Business Services
Anne Padilla, Consultant, Office of Governmental Relations
Teri Clark, Consultant, Professional Services Division
Cheryl Hickey, Consultant, Professional Services Division
Karen Sacramento, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division
Amy Jackson, Administrator, Professional Services Division
Diane Tanaka, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division
Thursday, January 8, 2004

GENERAL SESSION
The general session was called to order by Chair Madkins. Roll was taken and everyone joined in the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF THE DECEMBER 2003 COMMISSION MINUTES
A motion to approve the December 2003 Commission minutes was made (Lilly), seconded (Vaca) and carried without dissent. Vice Chair Johnson expressed concern about the statement of the Chair's motion at the December meeting on accreditation review, asking if the minutes adequately reflected his indication that any review would be collaborative and inclusive. Chair Madkins said he is committed to collaboration but that he felt the motion as stated in the minutes was accurate.

APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 2004 AGENDA
A motion to approve the agenda for the January 2004 meeting with in-folder items (pertaining to EXEC-3, GS-5, FPPC-1 and PERF-1) was made (Littman), seconded (Vaca) and carried without dissent.

APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 2004 CONSENT CALENDAR
A motion to approve the January 2004 Consent Calendar with in-folder items was made (Rasul), seconded (Lilly) and carried without dissent.

Division of Professional Practices

For your approval, the following items have been placed on the Consent Calendar for the January 8, 2004 meeting of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing:

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE OF CREDENTIALS
Education Code section 44244.1 allows the Commission to adopt the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials without further proceedings if the individual does not request an administrative hearing within a specified time.

1. **AUSTIN, Ronnie M.** Los Angeles, CA
   All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

2. **BIERA, Ernest A.** Napa, CA
   All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California
Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

3. **BOYLE, Zachariah T.** Corona, CA  
   All pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44345.

4. **CHENG, Patricia C.** San Mateo, CA  
   All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **suspended for a period of sixty (60) days** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44420.

5. **COOPER, Raymond D.** La Mirada, CA  
   All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

6. **DECORDES, Robert C.** Rancho Palos Veres, CA  
   All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

7. **DUFFEY, Kimberly G.** Palm Dessert, CA  
   All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

8. **FALCON, Regino R.** Calexico, CA  
   Mr. Falcon is the subject of **public reproval** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44421.

9. **FRYMYER, Heather L.** Canyon Country, CA  
   All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **suspended for a period of thirty (30) days** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44420.

10. **GIBSON, Scott C.** Bakersfield, CA  
    Mr. Gibson is the subject of **public reproval** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44421.

11. **HANLINE, Robert W.** Orange, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **suspended for a period of one hundred eighty (180) days** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44421.

12. **HOLEMEYER, Robert D.** La Habra, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **suspended for a period of ninety (90) days** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44421.

13. **HOLLADAY, John E.** Rancho Cucamonga, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

14. **JAFARI, Hamid** Granada Hills, CA
All pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44345.

15. **JENSEN, Tony M.** Alta Loma, CA
All pending applications are **denied** and all certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **suspended for a period of sixty (60) days** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44345 and 44421.

16. **JOHNSON, Ronald D.** Columbia, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

17. **LOGUE, Richard A.** San Pedro, CA
Mr. Logue is the subject of **public reproof** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44421.

18. **MacDONALD, Tracey L.** San Bernardino, CA
All pending applications are **denied** and all certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **suspended for a period of forty-five (45) days** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44345 and 44421.

19. **MANNING, Susan M.** Suisun City, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections
44421 and 44345.

20. **MARTIN, Gary J.** Westminster, CA
All pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44345.

21. **MARTIN, Teresa R.** Sacramento, CA
All pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44345.

22. **NODEN, Barry T.** Brawley, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

23. **OLIVEIRA, Jeanne M.** Castro Valley, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **suspended for a period of thirty (30) days** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44421.

24. **POWELL, James N.** Cypress, CA
Mr. Powell is the subject of **public reproval** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code section 44421.

25. **RIZZO, Sergio A.** San Ysidro, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

26. **SEDANO, Ignacio D.** El Centro, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

27. **THEODORATOS, Theodore** Alameda, CA
All certification documents under the jurisdiction of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing are **revoked** and any pending applications are **denied** for misconduct pursuant to Education Code sections 44421 and 44345.

**CONSENT DETERMINATIONS**

28. **QUINT, Stacey A.** Concord, CA
The Proposed Consent Determination, which stipulates that Ms. Quint's credential is suspended for a period of twenty (20) days, is adopted.

29. WAHHAB, Fawzi I. Sacramento, CA
The Proposed Consent Determination, which stipulates that Mr. Wahhab agrees not to seek reinstatement of his self revoked credentials, is adopted.

30. WHITE, James E. Houston, TX
The Proposed Consent Determination, which stipulates that Mr. White's credentials are suspended for a period of five (5) days, is adopted.

PRIVATE ADMONITION
Pursuant to Education Code section 44438, the Committee of Credentials recommends one (1) private admonition for the Commission's approval.

PROPOSED DECISION
31. AGUILAR, Alfonso Manteca, CA
The Administrative Law Judge's Proposed Decision, which reflects the Committee of Credentials' recommendation to deny all pending applications, is adopted.

REQUEST FOR REVOCATION
The Commission may revoke credentials upon the written request of the credential holder pursuant to Education Code sections 44423 and 44440.

32. RUPPERT, Richard A. Crescent City, CA
Upon his written request, pursuant to Education Code section 44423, his supplementary authorization of severe handicapped on his Clear Specialist Instructional Credential in Special Education is revoked.

33. WAHHAB, Fawzi I. Sacramento, CA
Upon his written request, and while allegations of misconduct were pending, all certification documents are revoked pursuant to Education Code section 44423. This does not constitute consent for purposes of Education Code section 44440(b).

MANDATORY ACTIONS
All certification documents held by and applications filed by the following individuals are mandatorily revoked or denied pursuant to Education Code sections 44346, 44346.1, 44424, 44425 and 44425.5, which require the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing to mandatorily revoke the credentials held by individuals convicted of specified crimes and to mandatorily deny applications submitted by individuals convicted of specified
crimes.

34. **HALUCH, Todd J.** Huntington Beach, CA

35. **HAMILTON, Kelly L.** Banning, CA

36. **MUENCH, Morris A.** Victorville, CA

37. **PALIWODA, Jerry C.** Glendora, CA

38. **SANTIAGO, Jeffrey M.** Vissalia, CA

39. **SCHOOP, Michael E.** Pleasanton, CA

**AUTOMATIC SUSPENSIONS**
All certification documents held by the following individuals were automatically suspended because a complaint, information or indictment was filed in court alleging each individual committed an offense specified in Education Code section 44940. Their certification documents will remain automatically suspended until the Commission receives notice of entry of judgment pursuant to Education Code section 44940(d) and (e).

40. **CHATTAWAY, Blake N.** Palmdale, CA

41. **FAUNCE, Thomas A.** Northridge, CA

42. **KENNEDY, Richard R.** Sacramento, CA

43. **SCOTT, Richard L.** Laguna Beach, CA

44. **THOAMS, Alan L.** Los Angeles, CA

45. **WEST, Thomas L.** Riverside, CA

**DISABILITY SUSPENSION**
Pursuant to Education Code section 44336, all certification documents are suspended for the duration of the disability effective November 26, 2003.

46. **GRAHAM, Terril L.** Santa Ana, CA

**NO CONTEST SUSPENSION**
All credentials held by the following individual were suspended, pursuant to Education Code section 44424 or 44425, because a plea of no contest was entered to an offense specified in the above sections of the Education Code.
The credentials will remain suspended until final disposition by the Commission.

47. **METCALF, Harold L.** Newcastle, CA

**TERMINATION OF AUTOMATIC SUSPENSION**
Pursuant to Education Code section 44940(d), the automatic suspension of all credentials held by the following individual is terminated and the matter referred to the Committee of Credentials for review.

48. **ROBINSON, Keith A.** Bonita, CA

Certification, Assignment, & Waivers Division

**DENIAL OF CREDENTIAL WAIVER REQUESTS**
The Appeals and Waivers Committee having reviewed these waiver requests has recommended they be denied. The employing districts have not asked for reconsideration of the Committee's decisions.

1. Barbara Wozniak/Oakley Union Elementary School District
2. Michael Jacobs/Carmel Unified School District
3. Carol Jean Barrett/Salinas Union High School District
4. Robbin Ruiz/Coachella Valley Unified School District
5. Torray Johnson/Chaffey Joint Union High School District
6. Angeles Birdo/Kern County
7. Keysha Washington/Little Citizens/Westside Academy (NPS)
8. Rosemary Crespo/San Francisco Unified School District
9. Jesus Carlos Hernandez/King City Joint Union High School District
10. Virginia Wagner/Mt. Diablo Unified School District

Professional Services Division

**APPROVAL OF PROFESSIONAL TEACHER INDUCTION PROGRAMS**
The Induction Program Review panel has determined that the following proposed Professional Teacher Induction Programs meet all applicable standards established by the Commission and recommends the programs for approval by the Commission. The 6 programs of professional teacher induction being recommended for approval at this time are:

12. Buena Park Elementary School District Beginning Teacher Support and Assessment Induction Program
13. Fresno County Office of Education District Beginning Teacher Support and Assessment Induction Program
14. Grossmont Union High School District Beginning Teacher Support and
Assessment Induction Program
15. Hart Union High School District Beginning Teacher Support and Assessment Induction Program
16. Los Angeles Unified School District, District Intern Beginning Teacher Support and Assessment Induction Program
17. Orange County Office of Education Beginning Teacher Support and Assessment Induction Program

APPROVAL OF SUBJECT MATTER PREPARATION PROGRAMS SUBMITTED BY COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES
The Single Subject Program Review panel has determined that the following proposed program meet all applicable standards established by the Commission and recommend the program for approval by the Commission.

Subject Matter Programs:

English
California State University, Fullerton

APPROVAL OF THE RELEASE OF A REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS TO SELECT AND INDEPENDENT CONTRACTOR, PURSUANT TO ASSEMBLY BILL 54 (OROPEZA, 2003)
Staff requests approval to release a Request for Proposals pursuant to Assembly Bill 54 (Oropeza, 2003). This legislation requires the Commission on Teacher Credentialing, in consultation with the Department of Education, to contract for a study concerning the availability and effectiveness of cross-cultural training for teachers.

This study, to be conducted through an independent contractor, would focus on 10 culturally diverse schools that reflect the diverse demography and geography of California. Several evaluative components, including teacher training in cultural competence, teacher demographics, student demographics and parent-school interactions will be included in this study. Assembly Bill 54 also requires that the study include recommendations to both improve cultural competency training for teachers, and to identify features of a model program for cultural competency training for teachers.

The Commission budget supports the costs of preparing the proposed Request for Proposals and selecting contractors. Funding for this study ($280,000) is included in the 2003-04 State Budget. Assembly Bill 54 requires that a report of the findings of the study, along with recommendations, be forwarded to the Legislature by May 1, 2005.

ANNUAL CALENDAR OF EVENTS
The annual calendar of events was provided as an information item.
CHAIR'S REPORT
Chair Madkins thanked the Commission for flexibility in adapting to a late-starting meeting that allowed the Commission's business to be done in a single day without incurring hotel costs. He said using such a schedule when appropriate should help the Commission save money at a time when resources are severely restricted.

Chair Madkins also noted that for the second time one of his students has been selected to intern in Washington, D.C. He said teachers take pride in the accomplishments of such students.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT
Dr. Swofford noted that Commissioner Boquiren was attending the meeting to help provide a quorum but that it is her last meeting. The Commission had expressed its gratitude for her participation in the Commission's work and best wishes for the future at the December meeting.

REPORT ON MONTHLY STATE BOARD MEETING
A statement that addressed the State Board of Education meeting scheduled for December was provided in the agenda materials. The State Board cancelled its December meeting, scheduled to consider any objections to teacher quality requirements under No Child Left Behind, because no objections were raised to its proposed regulations. The Board's January meeting was scheduled for January 7 and 8.

LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
Standing in for Commission Hauk, Chair Madkins convened the Legislative Committee of the Whole.

LEG-1: Status of Legislation of Interest to the Commission
Anne Padilla, consultant, Office of Governmental Relations, noted that the Commission was meeting at a point in time between the Governor's State of the State Address and release of the Governor's Budget Proposal for 2004-05. This means that, while general concepts have been put forth by the Governor, the budget details are still lacking. She noted that the Governor was holding a press conference today to announce an agreement with the Education Coalition that public schools will forgo $2 billion of the $4 billion they would otherwise be entitled to under Prop. 98. In return, the Governor's proposed budget included a per-pupil increase of $200, state coverage of $105 million in pension costs, $200 million for community colleges, and a majority of new funds in a form that allows discretionary use by districts.

Ms. Padilla also reported that the Assembly has elected Assemblyman Fabian Nunez as the new Speaker. He is a former governmental relations director for the Los Angeles Unified School District.

Turning to legislation, Ms. Padilla drew the Commission's attention to bills
described in the agenda material. They included:

AB 54 (Oropeza), which was signed into law last year. The Commission is working to implement the cultural competency training study called for in the bill.
AB 242 (Liu), a holdover bill from the prior year that is derived from the Joint Master Plan Committee. A portion of the bill has to do with teacher training and the author is expected to produce amendments in that area. The author has been informed about the Commission's action that phases out emergency permits.
SB 187 (Karnette), another bill signed into law last year. The law makes technical changes to the district internship program and staff is now working to implement them.

LEG-2: Analyses of Bills of Interest to the Commission.
There were no bills to discuss.

No action was taken; the items were for information only.

FISCAL PLANNING AND POLICY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
Commissioner Vaca convened the Fiscal Planning and Policy Committee of the Whole.

FPPC-1: Update on the Fiscal Year 2003-04 Budget Act6 and Proposed 2004-05 Governor's Budget
Leyne Milstein, director, Information Technology and Support Management Division, drew the Commission's attention to different parts of the report included in the agenda materials. One key item is that the Commission has lost 24.3 positions as of November 2003. This is in addition to 10.5 positions lost on July 1, 2002, for a total staffing reduction of 18 percent over two years.

Ms. Milstein also noted that new executive orders ban new contracts and most travel, although exemptions can be sought by agencies that are not General Fund-dependent and that are not in a position that makes it likely they will become insolvent.

She also reported that the Commission continues to face not only reduced capacity because of staffing losses but also reduced revenues because of the decline in applications. Revenue from this source is down 8 percent year-to-date and is continuing to decrease monthly. For the current year, the Teacher Credential Fund is short $2.8 million. This has been addressed by the Department of Finance with a loan. Ms. Milstein said the continuing loss of revenue will affect the Commission's ability to perform its work in all divisions.

Ms. Milstein said the Commission will be briefed on budget details after the Governor releases his proposal.
Commissioner Boquiren asked if the quality of work has begun to suffer because of decisions to reduce phone hours and other measures. Dale Janssen, director, Certification, Assignment and Waivers Division, said there has been no negative response about the reduced phone hours. The increasing reliance on the web page has provided more information to the field even as phone hours have been cut back.

Vice Chair Johnson asked if teacher applications are down because of the perception that there are no jobs. Mr. Janssen said staff is still assessing the reasons for the decline. But based on preliminary information, it is largely attributable to a sharp decline in emergency permit renewals. Vice Chair Johnson said that means that doing the right thing - moving to eliminate emergency permits - has left the Commission short of the money needed to do essential work.

Ms. Milstein agreed, adding that part of the problem stems from a prior reduction in the application fee from $60 to $55 - a decision that made sense at the time because excess revenue was being generated. But now the revenue no longer matches the operational needs. She said the Education Code requires that the fee be set at a level commensurate with the workload. Discussions are occurring with the Department of Finance about how to resolve the problem.

Dr. Swofford said part of the problem is that mandates are created with no extra funding. When the funding disappears, the mandates continue. He said despite cutbacks, the staff is making a strong and largely successful effort to complete work in a timely manner without creating a backlog.

Ex Officio Representative Symms Gallagher asked how the fee is raised. Dr. Swofford said the Commission has the authority to raise the fee but needs to work closely with the administration and Department of Finance. Because of other more pressing concerns and the issue of timing, it is taking some time to get attention focused on the fee.

Commissioner Vaca asked about the so-called salary savings requirement. Ms. Milstein explained that the standard state practice is to budget 5 percent less for staffing than is justified by the number of positions. In a normal year, this is a reasonable amount that reflects temporary vacancies and other factors. But with the hiring freeze, this 5 percent reduction can no longer be covered by salary savings and instead represents a direct cut into operational funds. What this means for the Commission is that it begins the year with more than a $500,000 deficit in this area.

No action was taken; the item was for information only.

PERFORMANCE STANDARDS COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
Vice Chair Johnson convened the Performance Standards Committee of the
PERF-1: Recommended Subject Matter Requirements for Single Subject Teaching Credentials in Art, Languages other than English, Music and Physical Education, and the Preliminary Educational Technology Examination

Dr. Phil Fitch, Consultant, Professional Services Division and Diane Tanaka, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division, briefed the Commission on this item. Dr. Fitch said that subject matter requirements for math, science, English and Social Science were approved in 2002, an update of the prior requirements adopted in 1992. The current phase addresses other subjects and updates requirements last adopted in 1994. Among the staff working on the matter were Joe Dear, Helen Hawley and Susan Porter.

Ms. Tanaka described the process of arriving at the recommended subject matter requirements, which including forming panels, gathering standards and working with a bias review committee. Once preliminary requirements were formed, a survey was sent to 16,000 people and about 22 percent were returned. The requirements were further refined based on the input. Once the Commission adopts the requirements, the process of developing tests will proceed with a target date of September 2004 for the new tests to begin. After that, standard setting studies will occur and eventually passing scores will be set.

Dr. Fitch said staff is recommending the adoption of the five sets of subject matter requirements that begin on page 15 of the agenda materials.

Commissioner Lilly, noting the extraordinarily complete process of development, moved to adopt the requirements. His motion was seconded by Commissioner Beckner, who thanked staff for their outstanding work.

Designee Littman asked how they fit in with No Child Left Behind and the academic content standards. Dr. Fitch said that the Commission's standards will actually be higher than NCLB, and Beth Graybill, interim director, Professional Services Division, noted that the Commission requires that subject matter requirements be aligned with the academic content standards. Dr. Fitch added that when the subject matter requirements were distributed to national professional associations to determine if there were missing areas, none were identified.

The vote was taken; the motion carried without dissent.

REPORT OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

The Executive Committee approved its November 5, 2003 minutes. The Executive Committee declared the school administrator member position on the Committee of Credentials vacant and directed staff to proceed with the process of obtaining applications for this position. The Executive Committee approved reappointment of the current incumbent, Rita Bianchi, to the public
representative position. The Executive Committee recommends approval of the proposed amendments to Sections 301, 422, 450, 460 and 500 of the Commission Policy Manual.

The changes were approved without dissent.

REPORT OF APPEALS AND WAIVERS COMMITTEE
Commissioner Os-maun Rasul convened the meeting of Appeals and Waivers Committee to order.

A&W-1: Minutes of the December 3, 2003, Meeting of the Appeals and Waivers Committee
It was moved, seconded, and carried (Vaca/Littman) that the minutes of the Appeals and Waivers Committee meeting of December 3, 2003, be APPROVED. Commissioner Lunquist abstained from the vote due to her absence.

A&W-2: Waivers: Consent Calendar
It was moved, seconded, and carried (Vaca/Littman) that the Committee APPROVE the 248 waiver requests on the Consent Calendar.

A&W-3: Waivers: Conditions Calendar
It was moved, seconded, and carried (Vaca/Littman) that the Committee APPROVE waiver requests 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 7 on the Conditions Calendar with specific conditions attached. The Commission recommends the following action on individual waiver requests listed below:

#1 The waiver request, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Industrial and Technology Education, submitted by Newark Unified School District for Michael Craig with the condition to take the CBEST at least twice and obtain a passing score of 41 in one section prior to consideration of a subsequent waiver.

#2 The waiver request, Pupil Personnel Services Credential in School Social Work, submitted by San Francisco Unified School District for Gloria Enid Beale with the condition no subsequent waiver will be considered.

#3 The waiver request, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Foreign Language: Spanish, submitted by Woodland Joint Unified School District for Gabriela Avila with the condition no subsequent waiver will be considered.

#4 The waiver request, Pupil Personnel Services Credential in School Counseling, submitted by San Pasqual Valley Unified School District for Paul Frances Keegan with the condition no subsequent waiver will be considered.

#5 - The waiver request, Pupil Personnel Services Credential in School Counseling, submitted by Norris School District for Lisa Gail Jordan with the condition to be considered for a subsequent waiver the individual must
complete at least 12 semester units toward the credential and have a letter from their university reviewing the program status.

#7 - The waiver request, Pupil Personnel Services Credential in School Psychology, submitted by Ravenswood City Elementary School District for Jessle Flores Ticar with the condition to be considered for a subsequent waiver the individual must complete at least 12 semester units toward the credential and have a letter from their university reviewing the program status.

It was moved, seconded, and carried (Littman/Vaca) that the Committee APPROVE waiver request 6 on the Conditions Calendar with the specific condition attached.

#6 - The waiver request, Pupil Personnel Services Credential in School Counseling, submitted by Compton Unified School District for Horalia Montes with the condition the applicant must be fully qualified for the credential by 6/30/04.

A&W-4: Waivers: Denial Calendar
It was moved, seconded, and carried (Vaca/Littman) to recommend preliminary denial of the 13 Waiver Requests on the Denial Calendar. These waiver requests will be brought to the Commission for action at the February 2004 meeting.

REPORT OF CLOSED SESSION
Vice Chair Johnson reported on the Closed Session items:

The Commission denied Margarita Morales' Petition for Reinstatement.

The Commission denied reconsideration in the matter of Francis Hendershott and sustained its prior decision.

The Commission reconsidered and sustained its prior decision in the matter of Linda Wilson.

COMMISSION MEMBER REPORTS
Vice Chair Johnson noted that she and Ex Officio Representative Wilson attended the semi-annual meeting of the Center for the Future of Teaching and Learning, which included the release of the center's latest report on teacher shortages and distribution. Vice Chair Johnson also attended a California Federation of Teachers conference that focused on the issues of accountability, budget and compliance with regard to No Child Left Behind. Also in her role as a technical reader for EdSource, she reviewed their new document on NCLB - and she recommended it highly as a very good source of information.

AUDIENCE PRESENTATIONS
Bob Polkinghorn, UC Assistant Vice President for Educational Outreach, Beverly Young, CSU Assistant Vice Chancellor of Academic Affairs, and Veronica Villalobos, AICCU Vice President, delivered a joint statement outlining a proposal for reviewing the current accreditation process. Mr. Polkinghorn served as the spokesman. He thanked the Commission for its commitment to the collaborative process and said it is important that the stakeholders work together to keep California at the forefront of teacher development. He presented a letter that outlined an approach that is guided by three principles: 1) full respect for the Commission's responsibility to make decisions on how the accreditation process should proceed; 2) willingness and readiness to bear all costs related to the engagement of stakeholders in the process; and 3) support for a review process that is both transparent and expeditious.

Mr. Polkinghorn said under the group's plan, the stakeholders would share in the responsibility for conceptualizing changes and offering a final product. They would bring their experience and expertise to the Commission at no extra cost. He said the group was asking the Commission to receive the plan, refer it to staff and then have them return it to the Commission as an action item in February to establish a process that includes and respects the proposal.

Chair Madkins thanked the group for their comments and then called other speakers forward. They included:

Bruce Kitchen, the School District Liaison for the School District HR and Personnel Administrators for San Bernardino and San Diego Counties. Mr. Kitchen supported the collaborative process outlined by the higher education group, saying it would reduce the hazard of unintended consequences.

Sharon Robison, Association of California School Administrators. Ms. Robison also supported the proposal and offered her organization's commitment to work with the Commission if such a collaborative process were adopted.

Susan Westbrook, California Federation of Teachers. As a member of the 2042 panel, Ms. Westbrook said she saw how powerful collaborative processes can be when they involve all of the stakeholders. She supported the group's proposal.

Chair Madkins noted that he is already on record as pledging that all Commission activities will have as wide inclusion as possible. He said he appreciated the effort that went into the proposal and said he was sure that the accreditation review process would proceed in a cooperative way. He asked Dr. Swofford to address the matter.

Dr. Swofford noted that the Education Code provides for a system for
accreditation and specifies that it be governed by an accreditation framework that sets forth the policies of the Commission regarding accreditation. The law also establishes the Committee on Accreditation (COA) and its responsibilities, as well as providing for the modification of the framework. Section 8 of the Framework specifies that the Commission and COA are jointly responsible, in consultation with educational institutions and organizations, for the design of a comprehensive evaluation of accreditation. Similar consultation is called for whenever modifications to the framework are made. The actual modifications occur in public meetings of the Commission after the Commission has considered all the relevant input.

Dr. Swofford said staff is working with the COA co-chairs to put together a work plan to provide for the consultation required in the framework. He said the process will ensure broad stakeholder input. A draft work plan will be sent to Commissioners and later posted on the Commission's web site. Plans for reviewing the accreditation system will be discussed at the January 22 meeting of COA, which stakeholders are encouraged to attend.

Chair Madkins asked that the Commission be given an update in February. Dr. Swofford said an oral update would be possible, but that the time between the January 22 meeting and the Commission's February 5 meeting would be too short for a written report. The expectation is that the work plan will cover five or six months and include monthly updates and progress reports. He said it might be valuable for the Commission to review the law and different responsibilities at the February meeting.

Chair Madkins said he wants to make sure the group's proposal gets to the COA, that the Commission get an update at the February meeting and that the review of the law take place. Dr. Swofford said those three points would be accepted as staff direction.

Ex Officio Representative Wilson noted that the four ex officio representatives on the Commission worked with the group on the proposal and that he believes nothing in the proposal is inconsistent with the law. He said he was looking for assurance that the stakeholders will be part of the process, including COA discussions. Chair Madkins stated again that he is committed to have open inclusion and transparency.

Vice Chair Johnson summarized that the proposal has been received by the Commission and it has been referred to staff as the group requested. Having it come forward as an action item in February will not be possible because of the time constraints and agenda requirements. When it does come to the Commission, it undoubtedly will reflect consideration of the proposal. She said the Commission will then make a decision since it has the ultimate responsibility for making decisions.

Dr. Swofford agreed with Vice Chair Johnson, noting that the COA should not be rushed to judgment. There needs to be a deliberate, thoughtful
discussion. The work plan will reflect the need to have the two bodies work together, as well as involve stakeholders.

Ex Officio Representative Wilson said he felt reassured by the discussion. Ex Officio Representative Waite said she feels strongly that the people in the field have a great deal to offer, and that rich dialogue has been the key factor in the good work that the Commission has done. Commissioner Lilly agreed that the best product comes from people working together. Ex Officio Representative Lundquist expressed her appreciation for those who worked on the proposal and also said she feels assured that a collaborative approach will be taken.

Chair Madkins thanked the group for bringing forward the proposal, noted that the Commission had accepted it, referred it to staff and would await an update in February.

OLD BUSINESS
The quarterly agenda for February, March and April 2004 was presented for information only. Dr. Swofford noted that the timeline will be adjusted since the Commission is not meeting in April.

NEW BUSINESS
None.

ADJOURNMENT
The meeting adjourned. The next meeting will be held on February 5, 2004 at the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing Office, 1900 Capital Avenue, Sacramento, Californi