



Meeting 5 Summary

California Commission on Teacher Credentialing Child Development Permit Workgroup

March 2024

The content of this report was developed under a grant from the Department of Education through the Office of Program and Grantee Support Services (PGSS) within the Office of Elementary and Secondary Education (OESE), by the Region 15 Comprehensive Center at WestEd under Award #S283B190053. This contains resources that are provided for the reader's convenience. These materials may contain the views and recommendations of various subject matter experts as well as hypertext links, contact addresses, and websites to information created and maintained by other public and private organizations. The U.S. Department of Education does not control or guarantee the accuracy, relevance, timeliness, or completeness of any outside information included in these materials. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent the positions or policies of the U.S. Department of Education. No official endorsement by the U.S. Department of Education of any product, commodity, service, enterprise, curriculum, or program of instruction mentioned in this document is intended or should be inferred.

Workgroup Meeting 5

Meeting Date and Time

The Child Development Permit Workgroup met virtually on February 27, 2024, from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.

Attendees

Workgroup Members

- Amy Smith, California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office
- Becky Green, Imperial Community College District
- Chris Reeve, Legislative Director, California School Board Association
- Christine Shreve, Holy Cross Preschool
- Giovanni Aragon, Community Action Partnership Kern
- Giselle Navarro-Cruz, Cal Poly Pomona
- Heather Snipes, El Dorado County Office of Education
- Helen Davis, University of California, Los Angeles
- Hilary Seitz, California State University Chancellor's Office
- Jacqueline Cruz, United Teachers Los Angeles
- Jeanne Veich, Shasta College
- Jessica Tejada, Mount Pleasant Elementary School District, San Jose
- Julie Montali, Sacramento County Office of Education



- Katie Mervin, EDvance College
- La Tanga Hardy, Los Angeles Community College District
- Laurel Doyle, Cosumnes River College
- Liz Alvarado, Californians Together
- Lynette Ridgel, Riverside County Office of Education
- Mandy Redfern, Glendale Unified School District
- Melissa Wheelahan, Orange County Office of Education
- Nicole Willard, Windmill School, Portola Valley
- Pranita Venkatesh, Paragon Montessori, San Carlos
- Ranae Amezquita, Los Angeles Unified School District
- Stephanie Orozco, First 5 Los Angeles
- Tommetta Shaw, Mount St. Mary's University
- Toni Isaacs, Ventura County Office of Education
- Valerie Denero, EveryChild California

Liaisons

- Cathy Yun, Learning Policy Institute
- Deborah Stipek, Stanford University
- Erin Dubey, California Department of Education
- Kate Williams-Brown, Commission on Teacher Credentialing
- Lisa Velarde, California Department of Social Services
- Melanee Cottrill, Head Start
- Monica Belton, California Department of Social Services
- Shanna Birkholz-Vasquez, California Department of Education

Members of the Public

- Alana Pinsler, California Department of Education
- Alida Garcilazzo, Lynwood Unified School District
- Alison Gimpel, El Dorado County Office of Education
- Amanda Elsemore, Siskiyou County Office of Education
- Amy Carnahan, Yosemite Community College District

- Amy Carr, Mendicino County Office of Education
- Ana Leon, West Hills College, Lemoore
- Andrea Fernandez Mendoza, California Children's Academy
- Ashley Fisher, Tehama County Office of Education
- Carolina Mendez, Los Angeles Valley College
- Caroline Jen, East Los Angeles College
- Carolyne Crolette, Early Edge California
- Donna Cecil, San Diego Mesa College
- Elizabeth Ashline, Alliant International University
- Emma Johnston Leon, Montessorita
- Erica Vuong, Sacramento County Office of Education
- Heather Haubrich, Stanislaus County Office of Education
- Ilona Gergi, Culver City Unified School District
- Javonelle Fosu, The Children's Collective, Inc.
- Jeanette Mulhern, Columnes River College
- Juliet Terry, Child Care Resource Center
- Karla Delgado, Catalyst Kids
- Karla Martinez, Hope St. Family Center
- Kathy Wilson, Elk Grove Unified School District
- Ken Herron, Early Childhood Discovery Centers, Inc.
- Laprice Brown, San Joaquin Delta College
- Lauren Handley, San Luis Obispo County Office of Education
- Leah Catching, Marin County Child Care Commission (LPC)
- Leslie Cox, Family Service Association
- Linda Haddadin, California Department of Social Services
- Lisa Schut, Modesto Junior College
- Lucia Garay, Retired
- Malissa Mastropierro, Stanislaus County Office of Education
- Martina Ebesugawa, Diablo Valley College
- Mary Beth Miller, Fresno City College

- Mary Hampton, Family Service Association
- Melanie Long, Castaic Union School District
- Nicole Hall, California Department of Education
- Paula Madrigal-Patel, Chula Vista Elementary School District
- Rachel Champagne, Catalyst Family
- Regan Bynder, Ventura County Office of Education
- Robin Stearns, Beginnings & Beyond Montessori, East Bay Montessori Training
- Rosa Candelas, Ontario-Montclair School District
- Sharlene Joachim, Santa Monica College
- Singrid Sesmundo, San Bernardino County Superintendent of Schools
- Soledad Galvez, Options for Learning
- Terrissa Hein, Contra Costa County Office of Education
- Tony Jordan, Stanislaus County Office of Education
- Tonya Byers, Yuba County Office of Education
- Veronica Garcia, Stanislaus County Office of Education
- Victoria Coverson-Baxter, San Mateo County Office of Education Early Learning
- Wendy Shenk-Evans, Montessori Public Policy Initiative
- Yolanda Carlos, Pacific Oaks College
- Yumi Lee, Modesto Junior College

California Commission on Teacher Credentialing Staff

- David DeGuire
- Debra Keeler
- Bronwyn Kennedy
- Phyllis Jacobson
- Mika Laidler
- Renee Marshall
- June Millovich
- Nicholas Newman

Region 15 Comprehensive Center Staff

- Liz Jameyson
- Victor Diaz
- Edith Gurolla
- Barbara Jones
- Brianna Moorehead
- Krista Murphy
- Andrea Rolla

Presenters

- Lindsay Meeker
- Patrisia Gonzalez
- Valentina Ware
- Shanna Birkholz Vasquez (liaison)

Meeting Items

Item 1: Welcome and Connection

Renee Marshall shared updates, including approving a new PK–3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Credential. Bronwyn Kennedy led a brief connection activity and shared information on efforts to conduct field outreach. Liz Jameyson reviewed the exit ticket responses from Session 4 and revisited the Workgroup agreements for team meetings. Dr. Debra Keeler provided the Meeting 5 agenda and previewed the meeting objectives. Ms. Jameyson offered a reminder of the Workgroup's process and progress by reviewing the Roadmap to Recommendations graphic—a visual representation of the topics and progress across the Workgroup's seven planned sessions.

Item 2: Permit Levels Data Based on Meeting 4

Ms. Jameyson provided a high-level summary of the data from Meeting 4 discussions on the draft revised matrix, including Workgroup comments on unit and degree requirements, the number of administrative levels, coursework, and practicum. She also shared high-level themes in Workgroup comments on entry into the profession and the permit's alignment with the TK–12 educational system.

Item 3: Specific Areas of Emphasis

This segment included two presentations on specific areas of emphasis: infants and toddlers and dual-language learners. The first speaker was Nicole Hall from the California Department of Education (CDE). Ms. Hall provided a presentation on California's Early Head Start Childcare Partnership Grant. She addressed Early Head Start requirements for serving infants and toddlers, details on appropriately staffing infant and toddler programs, and recommendations for integrating competencies that effectively meet the needs of infants and toddlers.

Second to speak were Patrisia Gonzalez and Valentina Ware from the Early Education Division at CDE. They delivered a presentation on serving multilingual learners in preschool programs, including universal prekindergarten. Lindsay Meeker from Fresno State University then presented about early childhood approaches and the assets of a multilingual workforce.

After each segment, presenters addressed Workgroup questions and comments.

Following the presentations and question and answer period, the Workgroup engaged in a whole group discussion about the workforce in relation to infants, toddlers, and multilingual learners.

Items 5 and 6: Matrix Discussions

Dr. Keeler transitioned the group to small-group discussions, collecting input on the draft matrices. She began with an overview of a competency-based system for teacher preparation and reviewed the current renewal requirements for the child development permit compared to the TK–12 system. Next, she gave instructions for small-group matrix discussions.

Each group completed a Child Development Permit Matrix Worksheet with key considerations about authorization, unit and degree requirements, specific core coursework, experience and fieldwork, and renewal requirements. The groups reviewed various levels of the current matrix compared to proposed revisions in the matrix structure and noted comments and questions.

Item 7: Workgroup Comments

Note that the Workgroup comments below have been paraphrased and summarized for clarity.

- There was an appreciation for the provisional permit, which attends to equity within a multiple-subject permit structure.
- The mentorship conversation was appreciated. Additional consideration should be given to the hours required as a mentee before becoming a mentor.
- Some groups struggled with balancing equity within the permit system, especially pay and qualifications.
- Workgroup members and liaisons appreciated having time to examine materials thoroughly.

Item 8: Public Comments

Members of the public made verbal comments in the meeting and captured them on a Padlet.

Verbal public comments in the meeting

Note that public comments below have been paraphrased and summarized for clarity.

- Jan Fish: She appreciated the level of involvement, depth of thought, and thoroughness of considering birth through eight. Additionally, there was appreciation for attending to administrative levels, adult development, supervision, and the units it takes to achieve this. However, there was no discussion about family engagement and partnership, which should be included in units, especially for ECE 1 and 2.
- Heather Haubrich, *Stanislaus County Office of Education*: She appreciated the Workgroup and acknowledged this hard and important work. She was hopeful that there will be a great revision to the structure now that there are so many advances in the field. She expressed several things she would like the work group to consider: There is a big jump in unit requirements between ECE 1 and ECE 2, which may negatively

impact the workforce. In her experience, candidates have difficulty moving between the two levels. Additionally, her community has no option to use candidates' worksites as practicum. Therefore, that is a barrier to getting their practicum completed, and thus access into the field. Next, courses from other disciplines related to child development that are not counted because they are not from education should be considered. Finally, courses should be better defined because our ECE workforce is confused by loose definitions.

- Wendy Shenk-Evans, *Montessori Public Policy Initiative*: She expressed concern about providing California's youngest children with quality early childcare education. She emphasized that children should be welcomed through various funding streams, including recognizing Montessori credentials and giving credit to educators with prior Montessori training.
- Emma Johnston Leon, *Montessorita*: Based on her experience running a credentialed Montessori program, she advocated that a highly qualified teacher is one with a Montessori credential, which includes child development, instructional methods, lesson planning, and differentiated instruction and is provided by the national or international Montessori associations. The U.S. Department of Education recognizes this credential. She believed that ECE 1, 2, and 3, and other categories, should include Montessori trained professionals.
- Robin Stearns, *Beginnings & Beyond Montessori, East Bay Montessori Training*: Based on her experience with college-level Montessori training, she advocated that the rigor be the same regardless of the organization providing the training. She currently runs a Montessori training program and advocated that a freestanding Montessori program should be considered college-level.
- Lisa Schut, *Modesto Junior College*: Regarding ECE administrative permits, she encouraged alternative bachelor's degrees, not just those in ECE or child development.
 - Emma Johnston Leon, *Montessorita*: She expanded the conversation by expressing receptiveness to any bachelor's degree, as long as the candidate has ECE units and additional training and preparation required to work in ECE.

Public comments from the Padlet

Public comments from the Padlet were summarized because of the length.

Comments focused on infant and toddler coursework, recognition of prior learning, and the integration of specialized skills, such as CPR certification, into unit requirements. Public members added comments about the essential nature of understanding infants and toddlers developmentally and language and literacy development from prenatal stages. One comment emphasized the term "early relational health" and the necessity for it to be part of the PK–3

credential system. The importance of honoring the critical development period of infants and toddlers was mentioned, with a call for at least 3 to 6 units in infant and toddler specialization.

Comments also underscored the need to recognize alternative educational pathways, such as Montessori credentials, which align with the National Association for the Education of Young Children's Professional Standards and Competencies. The model legislation within the 2020 *Unifying Framework for the Early Childhood Education Profession* suggests that states adopt policies allowing for credit for prior learning and recognizing Montessori and infant-toddler credentials as equivalent to specific ECE designations. This inclusion would facilitate the placement of individuals with Montessori credentials at appropriate ECE levels. Moreover, there is a push for ongoing professional development and support for teachers, addressing the underfunding of infant and toddler programs, and the importance of bilingualism and dual language learner competencies embedded in all coursework.

Members of the public advocated for integrating specialization and base-level training and stressed the need for a workforce that sees their bilingual abilities as an asset, suggesting the development of multilingual ECE pathways. Comments from Early Edge California emphasized the master plan's recommendations for multilingual learners, highlighting the need for bilingual authorizations and home language support for educators. Finally, there was a call to ensure that current program directors have pathways to qualify as administrators in universal prekindergarten programs and the importance of compensating bilingual staff for their skills.

Item 9: Closure and Exit Ticket

Dr. Keeler and Ms. Marshall closed the meeting by expressing excitement about the revisions and appreciation for the Workgroup.