



Meeting 2 Summary

California Commission on Teacher Credentialing Child Development Permit Workgroup

November 2023

The content of this report was developed under a grant from the Department of Education through the Office of Program and Grantee Support Services (PGSS) within the Office of Elementary and Secondary Education (OESE), by the Region 15 Comprehensive Center at WestEd under Award #S283B190053. This contains resources that are provided for the reader's convenience. These materials may contain the views and recommendations of various subject matter experts as well as hypertext links, contact addresses, and websites to information created and maintained by other public and private organizations. The U.S. Department of Education does not control or guarantee the accuracy, relevance, timeliness, or completeness of any outside information included in these materials. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent the positions or policies of the U.S. Department of Education. No official endorsement by the U.S. Department of Education of any product, commodity, service, enterprise, curriculum, or program of instruction mentioned in this document is intended or should be inferred.



Workgroup Meeting 2

Meeting Date and Time

The Child Development Permit Workgroup met virtually on October 10, 2023, from 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.

Attendees

Workgroup Members

- Liz Alvarado, Californians Together
- Ranae Amezcuita, Los Angeles Unified School District
- Giovanni Aragon, Community Action Partnership Kern
- Jacqueline Cruz, United Teachers Los Angeles
- Helen Davis, University of California, Los Angeles
- Valerie Denero, EveryChild California
- Laurel Doyle, Cosumnes River College
- Becky Green, Imperial Community College District
- LaTanga Hardy, Los Angeles Community College District
- Toni Isaacs, Ventura County Office of Education
- Katie Mervin, EDvance College
- Julie Montali, Sacramento County Office of Education
- Giselle Navarro-Cruz, Cal Poly Pomona



- Stephanie Orozco, First 5 Los Angeles
- Mandy Redfern, Glendale Unified School District
- Chris Reeve, California School Board Association
- Lynette Ridgel, Riverside County Office of Education
- Hilary Seitz, California State University Chancellor's Office
- Tommetta Shaw, Mount St. Mary's University
- Christine Shreve, Holy Cross Preschool
- Amy Smith, California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office
- Heather Snipes, El Dorado County Office of Education
- Jessica Tejada, Mount Pleasant Elementary School District, San Jose
- Betsy Uda, Head Start
- Jeanne Veich, Shasta College
- Pranita Venkatesh, Paragon Montessori, San Carlos
- Melissa Wheelahan, Orange County Office of Education
- Nicole Willard, Windmill School, Portola Valley

Liaisons

- Monica Belton, Department of Social Services
- Shanna Birkholz-Vasquez, California Department of Education
- Melanee Cottrill, Head Start
- Martha E. Dominguez-Brinkley, First 5 California
- Erin Dubey, California Department of Education
- Deborah Stipek, Stanford University
- Lisa Velarde, Department of Social Services
- Melanie Huitt, Department of Social Services, Community Care Licensing Division
- Kate Williams-Brown, Commission on Teacher Credentialing
- Cathy Yun, Learning Policy Institute

Members of the Public

- Anjum Abid, Family day care provider
- Sandra Burwick, Commission on Teacher Credentialing



- Joya Chavarin, Berkeley City College
- Andrea Cruthird-Mays, Merced County Office of Education
- Vanessa Dilks, California Early Childhood Mentor Program
- Andrea Fernandez, California Children's Academy
- Orquidia Frausto, Student
- Mari Estrada, California State University Channel Islands
- Sara Gassner-Wollwage, San Mateo County Office of Education
- Laura Hernandez, ABC Unified School District
- Helen Isaacs, Ventura County Office of Education
- Phyllis Jacobson, Commission on Teacher Credentialing
- InJin Jun, Santa Cruz County Office of Education
- Ravi Kline, San Francisco Unified School District
- Terra Lee, Chabot College
- Ana Leon, West Hills Community College Lemoore
- Alyssa Marc, Kidango
- Christina Marcellus, Capital Advisors
- Rocio Martinez, Childcare Alliance of Los Angeles, Early Care & Education Workforce Registry
- Sol Mechev, Options for Learning
- Alicia McFarland, Ventura County Office of Education
- J. Mulher, Cosumnes River College, Los Rios Community College District
- Mary Beth Miller, Fresno City College
- Anna Nielsen, Thermalito Union Elementary School District
- Cristina Ortega, Santa Barbara County Education Office
- Shana Paulson, Community Action Partnership of San Luis Obispo
- Kim Radmacher, California State University Dominguez Hills
- Cristabel Rodriguez, Long Beach Unified School District
- Jamie Sanbonmatsu, Valley View Children's Center
- Jessica Sawko, Children Now
- Honey Seth, Natomas Unified School District



- Erika Simmons, Amador, Local Planning Council
- LaWanda Wesley, Child Care Resource Center

California Commission on Teacher Credentialing Staff

- Mary Sandy
- David DeGuire
- Debra Keeler
- Bronwyn Kennedy
- Mika Laidler
- Renee Marshall
- June Millovich
- Christina Villanueva

Region 15 Comprehensive Center Staff

- Victor Diaz
- Catherine Goins
- Edith Gurolla
- Brianna Moorehead
- Krista Murphy
- Khamia Powell
- Chelsea Talakoub

Meeting Items

Welcome and Connection

Renee Marshall and Dr. Debbi Keeler welcomed the Child Development Permit (CDP) Workgroup members, liaisons, and members of the public. Liz Jameyson led a brief connection activity to help attendees focus their full attention on the meeting.

Connections to the Charge of the Workgroup

Dr. Mary Sandy provided opening remarks, emphasizing the importance of CDP Workgroup members' diversity of perspectives and positions. She provided a history of the CDP and an

overview of the 2017 Advisory Panel's important work, making recommendations to update the CDP. She then reviewed the three points of the Workgroup charge and underscored the opportunity the CDP Workgroup has to think about what the system needs to develop the early childhood educator (ECE) workforce in the broader context, including universal transitional kindergarten (UTK) and the PK–3 ECE Specialist Credential, all within a mixed-delivery system. She then took questions from attendees.

A summary of the questions and responses is below.

- One member asked how the ECE Competencies¹ fit into the current ECE context. Dr. Sandy responded that the ECE Competencies are foundational and used by the team working on the ECE Teacher Performance Expectations (TPEs)², which help ECE teacher preparation programs develop candidates who will meet performance expectations.
The two documents tie together and should not be fundamentally different.
- Another member asked how we are creating a system to support multilingual learners and commented that it is critical to center diversity, equity, and representation. Dr. Sandy responded that the CTC has made a strong commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion, including increasing access and removing barriers. This commitment takes into account attending to all dimensions of diversity, including linguistic diversity.
- A third member expressed their appreciation for the CTC's commitment to equity and asked Dr. Sandy's perspective on how ECE can become an equitable part of California's public education system. Dr. Sandy responded that taking a developmental and asset-based approach is key to making a difference in the larger educational system.
- A fourth member commented that the PK–3 ECE Specialist Credential is making strides toward a developmental and asset-based approach and referenced a statewide emphasis on continuity between preschool and grade 3.

TPEs and Master Plan Competencies

Dr. Keeler presented an overview of the purpose of this segment of the meeting: to dive more deeply into the MPELC to identify how it recognizes specific competencies for specific job roles and how the ECE TPEs relate to those competencies. She then provided an overview of the organization of the ECE TPEs.

Following this introduction, R15CC and CTC staff facilitated breakout rooms during which participants examined the MPELC competencies and their relationship to a particular job role

¹ *California Early Childhood Educator Competencies*. (2011) California Department of Education.

<https://www.cde.ca.gov/sp/cd/re/documents/ececompetencies2011.pdf>

² *California Early Childhood Education Teaching and Administrator Performance Expectations*. (2019). California Commission on Teacher Credentialing. https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/educator-prep/standards/ece-performance-expectations-pdf.pdf?sfvrsn=854253b1_4

within the ECE TPEs. The groups focused on two questions that pertained to each competency identified in the MPELC:

- Which ECE TPEs (or California Administrator Performance Expectations [CAPES]) are represented in this MPELC competency?
- What could be expanded upon in the ECE TPEs to fully address this competency?

After examining several competencies, each small group discussed the question: *If you had to assign a ranking of a red light, yellow light, or green light, how would you characterize how well the TPEs connect to the MPELC competencies, and why?*

Field Connections

Bronwyn Kennedy provided an overview of field outreach the CTC is conducting, including hosting community circle discussions, conducting focus groups with CDP Workgroup applicants not selected for the workgroup, and holding a presentation and discussion with California Community College Early Child Educators (CCCECE).

One member asked how the results of these conversations would be folded into the CDP Workgroup's thinking. Ms. Marshall and Ms. Kennedy responded that this information is being analyzed and will be presented to the workgroup in a future meeting.

PK–3 ECE Specialist Credential

Ms. Marshall and Dr. Keeler explained the PK–3 ECE Specialist Credential and how it connects to the current permit structure, including where the ladder to the PK–3 ECE Specialist Credential begins. Entry points in the current permit structure begin at the teacher, master teacher, site supervisor, and program director levels.

Workgroup members asked which degree fields are allowable and how candidates climb the ladder from the permit to the PK–3 ECE Specialist Credential in each option for educational requirements the current permit structure allows.

Curriculum Alignment Project

Dr. June Millovich provided an overview of the history and current state of Curriculum Alignment Project (CAP) courses. She described the CAP Classic, which aligned titles and content of foundational courses across colleges to prevent students from taking the same course more than once. For the CAP Expansion, seven courses were added, including those related to infants and toddlers, administration, and students with special needs. Dr. Millovich then provided an overview of the Methods of Evaluation (MOE) project, which includes a library of course content, objectives, and assignments linked to objectives.



A Workgroup member expressed appreciation for the CAP body of work and asked about the number of TPEs in a single course, which Dr. Millovich clarified. Two Workgroup members commented about depth versus breadth and keeping that in mind.

Workgroup Comment

- Include processing time in the agenda to avoid being overwhelmed with too much information.
- Circulate the agenda ahead of time and elicit feedback from the Workgroup members.
- Provide materials and assignments with more advance notice.

Public Comment

- Shana Paulson from the Community Action Partnership in San Luis Obispo commented that she works with many Spanish-speaking individuals who prefer to learn in languages other than English and would like to see more support for this population. She also requested that the Workgroup continue to allow alternative qualifications to ensure a diverse workforce and to consider the Child Development Associate (CDA) credential as an alternative to the associate teacher permit because it is nationally recognized and a good entry point.
- Dr. LaWanda Wesley from the Child Care Resource Center asked whether the ladder and lattice would include similar supports. She emphasized the importance of ensuring that the Workgroup is not creating barriers that may negatively impact the workforce, including keeping people in the ECE workforce. She also noted that income parity with the K–12 system is a necessity, so deciding to work in the ECE field is truly an equitable choice.
- Honey Seth from the Natomas Unified School District requested that the Workgroup keep alternative options in the permit structure, noting that doing so opens doors for people.

Topic Prioritization, Closure, and Exit Ticket

Ms. Jameyson led an exercise where participants dot-voted on a Jamboard to prioritize future meeting topics. The topic choices were extracted from data analyzed from Meeting 1. The dot-voting outcome prioritized topics in the following order:

1. Cost, access, and workforce
2. TK–12 alignment, including with the PK–3 ECE Specialist Credential
3. Coursework



4. Clinical experience and practicum
5. Coaching

Dr. Keeler and Ms. Marshall closed the meeting, asking participants to complete an exit ticket describing their experience in the meeting.