

**COMMITTEE ON ACCREDITATION**  
**MINUTES**  
**May 10-11, 2018**

**Commission on Teacher Credentialing**

**Committee Members Present**

Jose Luis Alvarado  
Jomeline Balatayo  
Suzanne Borgese  
Bob Frelly  
Cheryl Forbes  
Anna Moore  
Iris Riggs  
Kelly Skon

**Absent Members**

Deborah Erickson  
Gerard Morrison  
Margo Pensavalle  
James Webb

**Commissioner Present**

Haydee Rodriguez

**Staff Members Present**

Teri Clark, Director  
Cheryl Hickey, Administrator  
Dr. Catherine Kearney, Administrator  
Dr. Katie Croy, Consultant  
Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant  
William Hatrick, Consultant  
Bob Loux, Consultant  
Roxann Purdue, Consultant  
Gay Roby, Consultant  
Lynette Roby, Consultant  
Karen Sacramento, Consultant  
Jake Shuler, Consultant  
Dr. Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultant  
Erin Sullivan, Consultant  
Michelle Bernardo, Secretary

**Others Present**

Dr. Jay Fiene, CSU San Bernardino  
Dr. Marita Mahoney, CSU San Bernardino  
Dr. Jo Birdsell, Site Visit Team Lead  
Caryl Hodges, Notre Dame de Namur  
Dr. Anthony J. Martinez, Montebello USD  
Dr. Angel Gallardo, Montebello USD  
Angelica Paz, Montebello USD  
Patricia Salcido-Maez, Montebello USD  
Cary Tillery, Site Visit Team Lead  
Chris Reising, San Diego COE  
Jeff Warshaw, San Diego COE  
Jodie Schwartzfarb, Site Visit Team Lead  
Dr. Marisol Rexach, Santa Ana USD  
Dawn Aguila, Santa Ana USD  
Sandy Beller, Site Visit Team Lead  
Amy Gaudette, Saugus Union SD  
Julie McNealy, Site Visit Team Lead  
Leonor Rebosura, Newark USD  
Leticia Salinas, Newark USD  
Virginia Williamson, Newark USD  
Beth Littrell, San Mateo Foster City SD  
Dr. Jane Wilson, Westmont College  
Dr. Jill Hamilton-Bunch, Site Visit Team Lead

**Others Present Via Technology**

Aleeta Powers, Site Visit Team Lead  
Tina Sardina, La Mesa Spring Valley SD  
Brooke Noble, La Mesa Spring Valley SD  
Melissa Meetze-Hall, Site Visit Team Lead  
Manjit Singh, Fresno County SOS  
Brad Huebert, Fresno County SOS  
Kathy Faragia, Fresno County SOS  
Lori Goldstein Walker, Site Visit Team Lead  
Cynthia Parulan-Colfer, Hacienda La Puente  
USD  
Dr. Judy A. Fancher, Hacienda La Puente USD

Jill Rojas, Hacienda La Puente USD  
Joanne Chan, Hacienda La Puente USD  
Carol Clauss, Hacienda La Puente USD  
Barbara Severns, Site Visit Team Lead  
Ben Daley, Ed.D, High Tech High  
Sarah Fine, Ed. D, High Tech High  
Roxanna Stern, Santa Barbara USD

Ryan Gleason, Las Virgenes USD  
Ashley Wenter, Las Virgenes USD  
Kate Pitrone, San Juan USD  
Sheive Jones, Ed.D., San Diego COE  
Carol Tomeo, San Diego COE

### **Item 1 - CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

The May meeting of the Committee on Accreditation was called to order by Co-Chair Robert Frelly at 9:30 a.m. on Thursday, May 10, 2018.

### **Item 2 - APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

It was moved, seconded (Moore/Borgese) and carried to approve the May 2018 agenda.

### **Item 3 - APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE PRIOR MEETING**

It was moved, seconded (Borgese/Riggs) and carried to approve the March 2018 minutes with no corrections or changes.

### **Item 4 - CO-CHAIR AND MEMBER REPORTS**

There were no reports from the Committee members.

### **Item 5 – STAFF REPORTS**

Administrator Hickey announced the budget process is moving along for Special Education and also for local options. Director Clark announced that there was a Senate budget hearing and Assembly budget hearing. Both committees have kept the budget open. This budget will allow for 2 additional staff members for the grants.

Ms. Hickey reported that all site visits have been completed for the year. Summer will be used to update the website, adding additional training for the 9 new team leads, Board of Institutional Review (BIR) training, and a refresher common standards training. Ms. Clark announced work with Special Education is going before the Commission in June providing draft standards, California Teaching Performance Expectations (TPE), and authorization statements for the five preliminary Special Education teaching credentials. The PPS panel work is moving forward meeting next month. In addition, an agenda item for the Early Completion Option is being brought back to the Commission in June.

Ms. Clark reported that staff members Marjorie Suckow and Phi Phi Lau are working on the Harvard Strategic Data Project and that part of that project is to improve the information available in the annual data system. On that subject, Nicole Hill is working on the accreditation data system and contacting all institutions who have not finished developing their report deck. Ms. Clark noted that 76 out of 260 institutions have not yet completed their report deck.

Staff member Gay Roby reported on the progress to implement the Administrator Performance Assessment (APA). Ms. Clark added that contactors are conducting a comparability study of the three Teaching Performance Assessment (TPA) models.

#### **Item 6 – PROGRAM APPROVAL RECOMMENDATIONS**

This item was introduced by Co-Chair, Bob Frelly.

#### **PART 1**

##### **A. Programs for Approval by the Committee on Accreditation**

It was moved, seconded (Moore/Skon) and carried to grant initial accreditation to the following preparation program(s):

###### **Loyola Marymount University**

Professional Preparation for Pupil Personnel Services Child Welfare and Attendance

##### **B. Recommendation about the Withdrawal of Professional Preparation Programs**

It was moved, seconded (Forbes/Balatayo) and carried to grant initial accreditation to the following preparation program(s):

###### **Saint Mary's College of California**

Specialist Teaching – Added Authorization: Reading and Literacy, *effective May 10, 2018*

Specialist Teaching – Reading and Literacy Leadership Specialist, *effective May 10, 2018*

###### **California State University, Long Beach**

Designated Subjects – Special Subjects, *effective May 11, 2018*

Designated Subjects – Supervision and Coordination, *effective May 11, 2018*

Specialist Teaching – California Teachers of English Learners (CTEL), *effective May 11, 2018*

##### **C. Professional Preparation Programs Requesting Reactivation**

There were no requests for program reactivation.

#### **PART 2**

*(The items in Part 2 were for notification purposes only)*

##### **D. Notification about the Transition of Professional Preparation Program(s)**

*The items listed below are for notification purposes only. No action is needed.*

The following program has submitted all required documentation to transition General Education Induction programs to Teacher Induction programs. These institutions will be allowed to offer induction to individuals clearing either their general education or special education credentials.

###### **Burbank Unified School District**

The following programs have submitted all required documentation to transition General Education Induction programs to Teacher Induction programs. These institutions will only be allowed to offer induction to individuals clearing general education credentials.

**Bay Area School of Enterprise  
(REACH Institute)  
Biola University  
Central Unified School District  
Chaffey Joint Union High School  
District  
Fresno Unified School District  
Hebrew Union College**

**Loyola Marymount University  
Pomona Unified School District  
Redwood City School District  
Rowland Unified School District  
Santa Clara University  
Vallejo City Unified School District  
Whittier College**

**E. Programs of Professional Preparation Moving to Inactive Status**

It was noted that the following program sponsor was moving to inactive status. This section is for notification only. No action was required.

**Santa Clara University**

Clear General Education Induction Program, effective May 10, 2018

**California State University, Long Beach**

Teacher Induction, effective May 11, 2018

Clear Education Specialist, effective May 11, 2018

**Item 7 – INITIAL PROGRAM APPROVAL FOR NEW PROGRAM SPONSORS**

The following programs were approved for institutions that are new program sponsors (approved by the Commission for provisional approval).

Las Virgenes Unified School District– After discussion, it was moved, seconded (Balatayo/Forbes) and carried to grant initial program accreditation to Las Virgenes Unified School District. Las Virgenes Unified School District was granted approval to offer a Teacher Induction program.

Santa Barbara Unified School District - After discussion, it was moved, seconded (Alvarado/Borgese) and carried to grant initial accreditation to Santa Barbara USD. Santa Barbara Unified School District was granted approval to offer a Teacher Induction program.

High Tech High Graduate School of Education - After discussion, it was moved, seconded (Riggs/Borgese) and carried to grant initial accreditation to High Tech High Graduate School of Education. High Tech High Graduate School of Education was granted approval to offer Preliminary Multiple Subject/Single Subject (English, Mathematics, Social Science/History, Science) Credential program.

**Item 8 – DISCUSSION OF LATE DOCUMENTS**

Analyst Michelle Bernardo presented information regarding institutions that have not complied with the timelines of the accreditation cycle. Specifically, one institution Rowland Unified School District has not submitted their Common Standards that was due on February 28, 2018. Six institutions had not yet submitted their Preconditions that were due on March 31, 2018 and another 7 submissions were late and 2 were incomplete.

It was reported that Commission staff is continuing to work with these institutions to get the late documents submitted and an update will be provided at the next COA meeting.

### **Item 9 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO NEWARK UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant Lynette Roby presented information about this site visit report. She was joined via technology by team lead Julie McNealy and at the table were institutional representatives Leonor Rebosuro, Leticia Salinas and Virginia Williamson. After discussion, additional stipulations were added to the stipulations already included in the site visit report. It was moved and seconded (Moore/Riggs) to change the initial recommendation from Accreditation with Major Stipulations to grant the status of **Accreditation with Probationary Stipulations** to Newark Unified School District.

#### Stipulations:

1. NUSD must fully transition to the new Teacher Induction standards. In doing so they must provide evidence that:
  - the program is grounded in individualization and growth for each candidate rather than the completion of documents and assignments.
  - a consistent and robust mentoring system is in place and provides “just-in time” support for candidates.
  - the knowledge/experiences from a candidate’s preliminary program is being considered during the development of the candidate’s ILP.
2. NUSD must provide evidence that any Common Standard and Program Standard less than fully met has been addressed.
3. NUSD must provide evidence of a cohesive mentoring structure across all institutions served.
4. NUSD must provide evidence that a system is in place to regularly collect data from multiple sources, analyze it, share it with all stakeholder groups and use the data to inform the effectiveness of the program and make modifications. This must include:
  - a. Feedback from all relevant stakeholders, including K-12 and higher education partners, candidates, mentors, and completers.
  - b. A means for mentors and candidates of sharing feedback that protects their anonymity.
  - c. Feedback about the quality of the candidate/mentor matches to ensure they are productive and positive.
5. NUSD must provide evidence that it has a clear process in place for determining the impact of the program on the teaching and learning of both candidates and students.
6. NUSD must invite CTC staff to attend their advisory committee meetings.

7. NUSD must submit quarterly reports including a report to the COA at the August 2018 COA meeting.
8. That within one year Newark Unified School District will host a revisit. Consistent with the Commission cost recovery policies, the institution will assume the cost for the revisit.

In addition:

- NUSD is prohibited from proposing new credential programs until all stipulations have been met.
- NUSD must notify perspective candidates of the institutions current accreditation status.
- The institution's response to the preconditions is accepted.
- Newark Unified School District continues in its assigned cohort on the schedule of accreditation activities as determined by the Commission on Teacher Credentialing.

#### **Item 10 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO FRESNO COUNTY SUPERINTENDENT OF SCHOOLS**

Consultant Bob Loux presented information about this site visit. Joining him by technology were institutional representatives Manjit Singh, Teacher Induction Program Manager and Kathy Faragia, Coordinator. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Borgese/Alvarado) to grant the status of **Accreditation** to Fresno County Superintendent of Schools.

#### **Item 11 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, SAN BERNARDINO**

Consultant Dr. Katie Croy presented information about this site visit. She was joined at the table by Team Lead Dr. Jo Birdsell, and institutional representatives Dr. Jay Fiene, Dean College of Education and Dr. Marita Mahoney, Director College of Education Office of Assessment and Research. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Balatayo/Alvarado) (Iris Riggs recused) to grant the status of **Accreditation (with a 7<sup>th</sup> year report)** to California State University, San Bernardino.

#### **Item 12 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO NOTRE DAME DE NAMUR**

Consultant William Hatrick presented information about this site visit report. He was joined by institutional representatives Caryl Hodges, Dean. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Borges/Forbes) to grant the status of **Accreditation with Stipulations** to Notre Dame de Namur.

An error was noted by Mr. Hatrick and updated on page 3 of the site visit report. The original statement stated “All program standards were met for Preliminary Moderate/Severe credential programs except for *Program Design Standards 4 and 5* which were met with concerns and Standard 8 which was not met.” and has now been updated to “All program standards were met for the Preliminary Moderate Severe credential program except for *Program Design Standard 5 and Standard 4* which were met with concerns and Standard 8 which was not met.”

### **Item 13 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO MONTEBELLO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant Gay Roby presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by Team Lead Carry Tillery and institutional representatives Dr. Anthony Martinez, Superintendent of Schools; Dr. Angel Gallardo, Assistant Superintendent, Human Resources; Angelica Paz, Teacher on Special Assignment; and Patricia Salcido-Maez, Teacher on Special Assignment. After discussion, additional stipulations were added to the stipulations already included in the site visit report. It was moved and seconded (Alvarado/Balatayo) to change the initial recommendation from Accreditation with Major Stipulations to grant the status of **Accreditation with Probationary Stipulations** to Montebello Unified School District.

Stipulations:

The following are stipulations to be met:

1. By October 15, 2018, the program provides systemic evidence of compliance with the following Program Preconditions:
  - a. candidates are matched with their assigned mentor within 30 days of enrollment;
  - b. candidates' initial Individual Learning Plan is developed within 60 days of enrollment; and
  - c. candidates receive an average of one hour of support weekly from program personnel.
2. Within one year, the institution/unit provides evidence of a collaborative, cohesive, coordinated district-level leadership structure that allows for standards implementation at both the program and unit levels. (Common Standards 1 and Program Standard 6)
3. Within one year, the unit leadership creates and implements a continuous comprehensive improvement process. (Common Standard 4)
4. Within one year, the program provides evidence that they have fully transitioned to the 2015 Induction Program Standards, featuring a mentor-based system of support that is individualized for each candidate, based upon their self-assessed needs as chronicled in their Individual Learning Plans. (Program Standard 3)
5. Within one year, the program creates and implements a structured plan that provides both formative feedback and evaluation of services provided by the mentors. (Program Standard 6)
6. Within one year, the institution will host a focused site visit to verify required changes have been made in the program design and implementation is aligned to the Common and Program Standards.

In addition:

- Consistent with the Accreditation Handbook, the institution must submit within 10 days of COA action its plans and policy changes that will ensure that Preconditions 2, 3, and 4 will be implemented prior to any new candidates being enrolled in the program. The institution must provide a report on Program Preconditions 2, 3, and 4 at the June 28, 2018 COA meeting.
- The program must seek support from other programs from their cluster.
- Candidates must be notified of the institutions current accreditation status.

- Montebello Unified School District is not permitted to propose new credential programs for approval by the Committee on Accreditation until all stipulations have been met.
- Montebello Unified School District continues in its assigned cohort on the schedule of accreditation activities as determined by the Commission on Teacher Credentialing.

**Item 14 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO SAN DIEGO COUNTY OFFICE OF EDUCATION**

Consultant Gay Roby presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by team lead Jodie Schwartzfarb and institutional representatives Chris Reising, Executive Director, Human Resources and Jeff Warshaw, Executive Coach, Learning and Leadership Services, Dr. Sheive Jones, and Carol Tomeo. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Riggs/Forbes) to grant the status of **Accreditation (with a 7<sup>th</sup> year report)** to San Diego County Office of Education.

**Item 15 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO SANTA ANA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant Gay Roby presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by technology by team lead Aleeta Powers and at the table institutional representatives Dr. Marisol Rexach, Director and Dawn Aguila, Program Specialist. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Borgese/Riggs) to grant the status of **Accreditation** to Santa Ana Unified School District.

**Item 16 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO LA MESA SPRING VALLEY SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant Karen Sacramento presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by team lead Sandy Beller and by video institutional representatives Tina Sardina Brooke Noble. After discussion, additional stipulations were added to the stipulations already included in the site visit report. It was moved and seconded (Forbes/Frelly) to change the initial recommendation from Accreditation with Stipulations to grant the status of **Accreditation with Major Stipulations** to La Mesa Spring Valley School District.

Stipulations:

1. Provide evidence that it actively involves faculty, instructional personnel, and relevant stakeholders in the organization, coordination, and decision making for all educator preparation programs.
2. Provide evidence that faculty and instructional personnel regularly and systematically collaborate with colleagues in P-12 settings, college and university units and members of the broader educational community to improve educator preparation.
3. Provide evidence that the program receives sufficient resources to allow for effective operation of the educator preparation program. The resources must enable each program to effectively operate in terms of coordination, admission, advisement, curriculum, professional development and instruction, field based supervision and clinical experiences.
4. Provide evidence that site-based supervisors are provided with ongoing support and are carefully selected, trained, and oriented to provide effective, knowledgeable support for candidates. In addition, provide evidence that mentor training is ongoing.



5. Provide assurance that the institution employs, assigns and retains only qualified persons to teach courses, provide professional development, and supervise field-based and clinical experiences.
6. Provide evidence of the implementation of a comprehensive continuous improvement process in which both the unit and its programs regularly assess their effectiveness and make appropriate modifications based on findings. This process must include the systematic collection, analysis, and use of candidate and program completion data as well as data reflecting the effectiveness of unit operations. That the continuous improvement process collects feedback from all key stakeholders about the quality of the program.
7. Provide quarterly written documentation to the team lead and Commission consultant documenting all actions to remove the stipulations noted above.
8. That within one year of this action, the institution hosts a revisit with the team lead and Commission consultant to collect evidence of actions to address the stipulations noted above. Consistent with the Commission's cost recovery policies, the institution will assume the costs for the revisit.

In addition:

- The institution must provide a report at the June 28, 2018 COA meeting on the progress made to address Program Precondition 5.
- Candidates must be notified of the programs accreditation status.
- La Mesa Spring Valley School District is not permitted to propose new credential programs for approval by the Committee on Accreditation until all stipulations are met.
- La Mesa Spring Valley School District continues in its assigned cohort on the schedule of accreditation activities as determined by the Commission on Teacher Credentialing.

#### **Item 17 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO SAUGUS UNION SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant William Hatrick presented information about this site visit report. He was joined by team lead Melissa Meetze-Hall and institutional representative Amy Gaudette. Quarterly reports were requested by the committee documenting actions taken by the institution to address the stipulations must be submitted to the Commission consultant. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Alvarado/Borgese) to grant the status of **Accreditation with Stipulations** to Saugus Union School District.

#### **Item 18 – DISCUSSION OF GUIDANCE PROVIDED BY STAFF TO INSTITUTIONS PREPARING FOR AN ACCREDITATION SITE VISIT**

This item was presented by Director Teri Clark. This item focused on guidance regarding the number of interviews to be scheduled to take place during the site visit. A table was provided to the committee which consultants use as guidance as institutions build the interview schedule. After discussion, the committee requests that staff add verbiage to the table explain that the percentages are a minimum range. This note will help to provide clarification in a case where there is an institution may question the number of interviews being requested by the site visit team.

### **Item 19 – DISCUSSION OF POTENTIAL CRITERIA AND PROCESS FOR IDENTIFYING EXEMPLARY PROGRAMS**

This item was presented by Director Teri Clark. The Commission has asked staff, with the guidance from the Committee on Accreditation, to develop a process to identify exemplary educator preparation programs. Committee member Alvarado questions whether this is the best way to achieve the goal of creating a support system for institutions to be able to access those who are doing well. Mr. Alvarado proposes creating criteria that has a meaningful outcome to the students not for the recognition it brings to the institution. Member Alvarado also suggests identifying the exemplary institution and having them provide trainings sessions or webinars that would be open to all institutions to learn from. Member Riggs and other Committee members voiced support for the idea of helping institutions but suggests changing focusing not on exemplary programs but rather on practices or aspects of programs. Staff said that it would revisit this in a future COA meeting.

### **RECESS**

Co-chair Moore called for recess at 4:03 p.m. Meeting to reconvene on Friday, May 11, 2018 at 9:00 a.m.

### **RECONVENE**

The meeting was reconvened at 9:06 a.m. on Friday, May 11, 2018 by Co-Chair, Robert Frelly.

### **Item 20 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO SAN MATEO FOSTER CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant Sarah Colombini Solari presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by technology by team lead Lori Goldstein and at the table institutional representative Beth Littrell, Coordinator. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Forbes/Skon) to grant the status of **Accreditation** to San Mateo Foster City School District.

### **Item 21 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO HACIENDA LA PUENTE UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant Gay Roby presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by technology by team lead Carol Clauss and institutional representatives Cynthia Parulan-Colfer, Superintendent; Dr. Judy A. Fancher, Assistant Superintendent, Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment, PreK-12; Jill Rojas, Assistant Superintendent, Human Resources; and Joanne Chan, Coordinator, Instructional Services. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Moore/Borgese) to grant the status of **Accreditation** to Hacienda La Puente Unified School District.

### **Item 22 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO WESTMONT COLLEGE**

Consultant Dr. Katie Croy presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by technology by team lead Dr. Jill Hamilton-Bunch and institutional representative Dr. Jane Wilson, Department Chair. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Balatayo/Riggs) to grant the status of **Accreditation** to Westmont College.

### **Item 23 – REPORT OF THE ACCREDITATION TEAM TO SAN JUAN UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Consultant Dr. Sarah Colombini Solari presented information about this site visit report. She was joined by technology by team lead Barbara Severns and institutional representative Kate Pitrone, Director of the Induction Program. After discussion, it was moved and seconded (Skon/Forbes) to grant the status of **Accreditation** to San Juan Unified School District.

**Item 24 – DISCUSSION ABOUT THE USE OF THE REPORT TEMPLATE FOR 2018-19 SITE VISITS**

Administrator Cheryl Hickey introduced this item. There was discussion regarding adopting the new report template for all site visit reports for next year. There was a question regarding the possible loss of information by using the shorter template as well questions regarding how larger institutions will be able to capture all information with large number of programs. Administrator Kearney’s noted that additional training is needed for responses to the common standards area of the form to provide enough detail without becoming too lengthy. Committee members expressed support for the use of the columns marked “Consistently, Inconsistently, and Not Evidenced.” They agreed that this helps with discussions with team members and bringing them to consensus as well as facilitates consistency. After discussion, it was directed by the committee to use the new template moving forward for next year’s site visits.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no members of the public present.

**ADJORNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned by Co-Chair Robert Frelly at 10:12 a.m. The next meeting of the COA is scheduled for June 28, 2018.