
2A

Action

General Session

Approval of the February 2024 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the February 2024 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the February 2024 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

Continuous Improvement

- **Goal 7.** The Commission's work is grounded in research, informed by the voices of practitioners and communities of interests, and supports continuous improvement in educator preparation and licensure.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the February 7-9, 2024 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative, Chair
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative
Cheryl Cotton, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative
Monica Martinez, Public Representative
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative
Phuong Uzoff, Teacher Representative
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU) (2/8 only)

Commission Members Absent

Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Ira Lit, Faculty Member Representative

Wednesday, February 7, 2024

Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 2:45 p.m.

1A: Interview and Recommendations of the Public Member Positions and Alternates for the Elementary Teacher Position for the Committee of Credentials

Applicant Bryan Astrachan requested that his application be considered at a future Ad Hoc Committee meeting when the public member position is considered.

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

Public Member

- Jonathan Ho
- Raquel Jamerson

Elementary Teacher

- Florence Flesche
- Rachel Foster

Commission Action

Commissioner Brown moved to recommend Jonathan Ho be appointed to serve in the Public Member position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Browne seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Browne moved to recommend Florence Flesche and Rachel Foster be appointed to serve as Elementary Teacher alternates on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Committee Chair Martinez adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 4:59 p.m.

Thursday, February 8, 2024

General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:04 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer welcomed Phuong Uzoff as a new member of the Commission.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer announced the appointments for the 2024 Executive Committee:

- Jose Cardenas, Educator Preparation Committee
- Johanna Hartwig, Professional Practices Committee
- Juan Cruz, Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee
- Bonnie Klatt, Legislative Committee
- David Simmons, Certification Committee
- Danette Brown, Appeals and Waivers Committee

2A: Approval of the December 2023 Minutes

Commissioner Davis moved approval of the December 2023 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Cotton was not present during the roll call vote.

2B: Approval of the February 2024 Agenda

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the February 2024 Agenda with an agenda insert 2C. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Cotton was not present during the roll call vote.

2C: Approval of the February 2024 Consent Calendar

Julie Flapan, Computer Science for California, submitted a written comment which applauded California's commitment to ensure teachers are well-prepared to deliver high quality computer science education by providing teachers with important incentives as part of the Computer Science Supplementary Authorization Incentive Grant to pursue certification and support for professional learning. The letter provided suggestions on how the grant program could be improved to better meet the goal of increasing the number of authorized computer science teachers throughout the state and meet the needs of programs and teachers.

Commission Action

Commissioner Martinez moved approval of the February 2024 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items #15. Robert Bryan Jr., #49. David Harp, and #91. Tamiko Pearson to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Cardenas recused himself from item #71. George Maria. Commissioner Davis recused himself from items #56. Jennifer Johnson, #105. Jose Ramirez, #118. Starkesha Royston, and #147. Michael Young.

2D: Chair's Report

Chair Grenot-Scheyer congratulated Commissioner White-Smith as the 2024 recipient of the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (AACTE) Edward C. Pomeroy Award for Outstanding Contributions to Teacher Education. Chair Grenot-Scheyer shared information about the 2024 Black History Month theme "African Americans and the Arts" and highlighted the February 2024 Commission meeting agenda item "Discussion and Potential Adoption of Proposed California Standards for the Teaching Profession."

2E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy introduced Brian Lin Walsh, the new Director of the Administrative Services Division and shared information regarding new hires and promotions that occurred within the Commission. She also reported that the regulations for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education (ECE) Specialist Instruction credential were approved by the Office of Administrative Law. Lastly, Executive Director Sandy provided an overview of the Commission's priorities and milestones for 2024.

2F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Browne reported on her participation at a convening session with the California State University (CSU) on the PK-3 ECE Specialist Instruction credential. She also informed the public about an upcoming PK-3 leadership and teacher education conference and a one-day conference hosted by the Development and Research in Early Mathematics Education (DREME) Network and the Stanford Center on Early Childhood on early math education in May 2024.

Commissioner Francois shared information about the University of California's (UC) development of a statewide PK-3 credential program and provided updated information on the UC/CSU Collaborative for Neurosciences, Diversity, and Learning. She highlighted an

announcement of the newly formed Statewide Residency Technical Assistance Center from the February 2024 CTCNEWS and commended residency programs at the UC campuses on preparing novice teachers with content expertise, high leverage pedagogical skills, and critical dispositions while increasing teacher diversity in the state. She also reported on the efforts of the UC in supporting Proposition 28: Arts and Music in School K-12 Education Funding Initiative.

Commissioner Cotton expressed her excitement about the movement of the early learning credentialing process and the conversation regarding Proposition 28. She provided an update on the California Department of Education's (CDE) work on National Board Certification and shared information regarding the "Proven Professional Development in Mathematics" summit hosted by State Superintendent of Public Instruction Tony Thurmond and the CDE.

Commissioner Pavri stated that a key priority in the CSU, especially in the division of Academic and Student Affairs, is around intersegmental partnerships working together with community college and UC partners to build the educator pipeline. She shared information about the recent CSU convening which was supported by the Silver Giving Foundation and the Heising-Simons Foundation to bring together intersegmental teams from local education agencies (LEAs), community colleges, and CSU faculty to think about the critical elements in building the PK-3 ECE Specialist Instruction credential with a strong focus on working with multilingual learners.

Commissioner White-Smith thanked Chair Grenot-Scheyer for her acknowledgment for the 2024 AACTE Edward C. Pomeroy Award and shared her excitement about the PK-3 ECE Specialist Instruction credential. She shared information about the Keeping History Alive and Bringing STEM to Life grants from Azusa Pacific University which support teachers in securing student resources, teacher resources, and professional development. Commissioner White-Smith also provided an update on the work of the California Community Engagement Initiative 2.0 and recognized Noa Sanaa who performed a spoken word for Black History month at an event in the San Jose area.

Commissioner Davis shared a poem "Dreams" by Langston Hughes and spoke about his experience with the impostor syndrome in his work and the educator preparation arena. He spoke about various ways of helping kids understand their potential for success and stated that through National Board Certification and the addition of the PK-3 ECE Specialist Instruction credential the message of accomplishing dreams and goals can reach an even younger audience. He also reported on his attendance at the 2024 Good Teaching Conference-North.

Commissioner Cardenas shared information about the 2024 National School Counseling Week and reminded everyone about the importance of the social emotional growth of students and the mental health of staff. He also acknowledged the comments from former Commission Student Liaison Kori Jones in the February 2024 CTCNEWS.

2G: Liaison Reports

Ronald Wicks, Commission Student Liaison, spoke about his experience in completing the edTPA requirement and shared concerns regarding various credential requirements that may be a barrier and deterrent for individuals considering a career in the education field. He requested the Commission to allow the current Commission student liaison access to email addresses of students enrolled in credential programs or to create a dedicated webpage on the Commission's website where the student liaison can communicate and receive feedback from students enrolled in credential programs. He also suggested the Commission implement an option for students to subscribe to the web page or email blast allowing them to receive updates and information from the Commission with the ability to opt in or opt out as they desire.

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, reported on her attendance at the January 18, 2024 State Board meeting and provided updates on the State Board's recent activities.

Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee

Committee Chair Juan Cruz convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

3A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2024-25 Budget

Sara Saelee, Fiscal and Business Services Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Governor's proposed 2024-25 budget that relate to the Commission.

Anne Fennell, California Music Educators Association, submitted a written comment and spoke on this item which raised concerns regarding the creation of a proposed Elementary Career Technical Arts and Music Education authorization contained in the Governor's proposed K-12 Education budget that directs the Commission to create a new authorization for Career Technical Education teachers to teach arts classes at the elementary level.

Mary Johnson, Parent-U-Turn, raised concerns regarding the current structure of the teacher education program.

Angelica Salazar, Public Advocates, submitted a written comment which supported the Governor's proposal to streamline teacher requirements by recognizing that completion of a bachelor's degree would satisfy the basic skills requirement and for the proposed improvements to the transcript review process in order to certify subject matter competency.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Jose Cardenas convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

4A: Options for Integrated Undergraduate Teacher Preparation Program Candidates to Meet the Subject Matter Competence Requirement by Degree Major

Jake Shuler, Consultant, and Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission discussion and approval two options to

adjust the requirement for meeting the subject matter competence requirement for candidates in integrated undergraduate teacher preparation programs so that they can take advantage of the degree major option for demonstrating subject matter competence.

Carrie Birmingham, Pepperdine University, stated that candidates who are completing a relevant and appropriate major will be released from the burden of having to take specific courses to meet the subject matter competency or to pass the CSET (California Subject Examinations for Teachers) subtest if one of these options is passed.

Annette Hernandez, Loyola Marymount University, submitted a written comment and spoke on this item. She stated that passing one of these options would make a significant difference for program candidates and voiced support for Option 1.

Carrie Wall, Pepperdine University, submitted a written comment which raised concerns regarding the current subject matter competency policy and voiced support for Option 2.

Gordon Jorgenson, Los Angeles Pacific University, submitted a written comment in support of Option 1.

Terrance Cao, Pepperdine University, submitted a written comment which voiced support for Option 2.

Commission Action

Commissioner Simmons moved to adopt Option 2. This option would allow candidates enrolled in an integrated undergraduate teacher preparation program to begin daily whole class instruction within their student teaching experience before meeting the subject matter requirement; however, all candidates must meet the subject matter requirement before being recommended for their preliminary teaching credential. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4B: Discussion and Potential Adoption of Proposed California Standards for the Teaching Profession

Karen Sacramento, Consultant and Cara Mendoza, Administrator Professional Services Division, presented this item which brought proposed revised California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP) for the Commission's consideration and adoption. In addition, it provided a proposed plan and timeline for Teacher Induction Programs to transition to the new standards.

Kristen Cruz Allen, California Department of Education, assisted staff in presenting this item.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

Commission Action

Chair Grenot-Scheyer moved to adopt the proposed revised 2024 California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP) as presented in Appendix A of the agenda item with amendments to have inclusive language regarding students with disabilities, gifted students, individualized education plans (IEPs), and the English learner Roadmap. Commissioner Simmons seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Commission further directed staff to bring an item back in the future regarding the timeline and implementation of the updated CSTP.

4C: Review of the Passing Score Standards for the California Subject Examinations for Teachers in Art, Multiple Subjects and Music (CSET: Art, CSET: MS Subtest III and CSET: Music)

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which described the process used to review the existing minimum passing standards for CSET: Art, CSET: MS Subtest III and CSET: Music and presented updated minimum passing score standards for potential adoption by the Commission.

Commission Action

Chair Grenot-Scheyer moved to adopt the standard setting review panel's recommended minimum passing standard for each of the specified examinations, CSET: Art, CSET: MS Subtest III and CSET: Music, and apply an SEM (Standard Error of Measurement) adjustment of negative 1.5 (-1.5) to each of the panel-recommended cut scores. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Cruz abstaining.

Professional Practices Committee

Commissioner Hartwig convened the Professional Practices Committee.

5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:40 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, February 9, 2024

General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:35 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Jose Cardenas reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

4D: Child Development Permit Workgroup Update

Renee Marshall, Administrator, Debra Keeler, and Bronwyn Kennedy, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an overview of the progress made by the Child Development Permit Workgroup to build on recommendations provided to the Commission by the Child Development Permit Advisory Panel in 2017 and made further recommendations to the Commission on the structure and requirements of the Child Development Permit in alignment with the state's Master Plan for Early Learning and Care, while taking into consideration the current needs of the field.

Cristal Zeas, Californians Together, thanked the Commission for bringing together the expert workgroup to identify recommendations for updating the Child Development Permit and requested the Commission focus on providing accessible training pathways to expand access to education and training programs tailored to the needs of family care providers including flexible scheduling options and online courses in multiple languages.

Heather Haubrich, Stanislaus County Office of Education, requested the workgroup consider keeping a level of education in between the 12 units and the AA degree to help efficiently staff classrooms and to assist staff with climbing the career ladder one rung at a time. She also requested the workgroup continue its outreach for public input.

Doug Gephart, Association of California School Administrators, raised concerns regarding the lack of a direct path for an administrative credential for the Child Development Permit and requested the Commission convene a workgroup or similar process to review this issue for a workable solution.

Erica, thanked the Commission for convening the workgroup of experts to explore the recommendations and asked the Commission to support programs to provide education in native languages.

Carolyne Crolotte, Early Edge California, submitted a written comment which emphasized the importance of including a focus on bilingual competencies, dual language acquisition, and home language support in the revisions of the Child Development Permit; and building in supports, such as coaching, mentorship, and professional development, that do not come at the expense of the educator, to ensure continuous growth and improvement without creating additional barriers for the workforce. The letter also stated the need to address compensation and pay parity to ensure that the highly qualified and experienced workforce can afford to stay working in their current setting.

Liz Alvarado, Californians Together, submitted a written comment which urged the workgroup to integrate comprehensive training on dual language development into the permit requirements for all candidates and recommended establishing accessible pathways for

candidates, particularly those who are non-English speakers or bilingual, to obtain specialized credentials to support bilingualism and ensure equitable access to early childhood education for all children.

Serette Kaminski, Association of California School Administrators, submitted a written comment which stated that there must be pathways for seasoned educators to pursue an administrative credential as the Commission move forward to update the Child Development Permit.

4E: Proposed Adoption of a Revised Passing Score Standard for the Special Education Version of the Fresno Assessment of Student Teachers Performance Assessment

David DeGuire, Director, Professional Services Division, and Juliet Wahleithner, Director, Educator Preparation Programs & Accreditation, California State University, Fresno, presented this item which provided for review and potential adoption a revised passing score standard for the Special Education version of the Fresno Assessment of Student Teachers (FAST) performance assessment.

Commission Action

Commissioner Martinez moved to adopt the passing standard of 2 for each task in both the Site Visitation Project and the Teaching Sample Project for the FAST: Education Specialist-Mild to Moderate Support needs and FAST: Education Specialist-Extensive Support Needs. Chair Grenot-Scheyer seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

2H: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

2I: Interview and Recommendations of the Public Member Positions and Alternates for the Elementary Teacher Position for the Committee of Credentials

Commissioner Cruz moved to approve the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee to appoint Jonathan Ho to serve in the Public Member position on the Committee of Credentials, and Florence Flesche and Rachel Foster to serve as Elementary Teacher alternates. Commissioner Gross seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Daivs recused himself from this item.

2J: Report of Closed Session Items

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reported that the Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Nicholas Navasero
- John Nguyen

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Donovan Barela

- Juan Jaimes
- Pierre Knox

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision and called for the transcripts in the following matters:

- Shatara Johnson
- Marc Lopes
- Blanca Quintana
- Julie Simbob
- Denique Tarin
- Michael Turner Jr.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the following matters and a Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

- Diane Colegate
- Tara Gutierrez
- Jon Klaus (Commissioner Davis recused himself on this item)
- Jonathan Mesisca
- Lydia Morales
- Cornelius Ogunsalu

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the following matters:

- Michael Coggi
- CaSandra Everitt
- Fang Jia
- Jessica Kakimoto
- Omar Musleh
- Edward Ronquillo
- Joseph Sinclair
- Katherine Yetter

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

- #15 Robert Bryan Jr.
- #49 David Harp
- #51 Tamiko Pearson

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Grenot-Scheyer adjourned the meeting at 9:50 a.m.

Appendix A

4B: Discussion and Potential Adoption of Proposed California Standards for the Teaching Profession

	Name	Affiliation	Oral/Written Statement
1.	Leigh Victoria	Fontana Unified School District	Oral
2.	Wendy Threatt	Escondido Union School District/Teach Plus California	Oral/Written
3.	Bryan Becker	Parent Organization Network	Oral/Written
4.	Audry Wiens	Fontana Unified School District	Oral/Written
5.	Angelica Salazar	Public Advocates	Oral/Written
6.	Bryan Monroy	Teach Plus	Oral/Written
7.	Paul Robak	LAUSD Parent Advisory Committee	Oral
8.	Steve McDougall	California Federation of Teachers	Oral
9.	Toni Loken	The Loken Foundation for Equity and Inclusion	Oral/Written
10.	Mary Johnson	Parent-U-Turn	Oral
11.	Martina Rodriguez	Parent	Oral
12.	Araceli Simeón	Parent Organization Network	Written
13.	Shulamit Ritblatt	delibrainy LLC	Written
14.	Teneh Weller	High Expectations	Written
15.	Evelyn Alemán,	Our Voice: Communities for Quality Education	Written
16.	Yolande Beckles	The National Association of African American Parents and Youth	Written
17.	Manul Buenrostro	Californians Together	Written
18.	Jaime Koo	CA Credentialed Teacher	Written
19.	Ileana Lopez	Parent Institute of Quality Education	Written
20.	Gina Martinez-Keddy	Parent Teacher Home Visits	Written
21.	Vanessa Marrero	Parents for Public Schools of San Francisco	Written
22.	Katy Núñez-Adler	CA Partnership for the Future of Learning	Written
23.	Janis Price	CA Credentialed Teacher	Written
24.	Marcelino Serna	Fontana Unified School District	Written
25.	Vidya Sundaram	Family Engagement Lab	Written
26.	Sarah Lillis	Teach Plus California	Written
27.	Joshua Salas	Alliance Renee & Meyer Luskin Academy/Teah Plus California	Written
28.	Amanda Cloutier	Snowline Joint USD/Teach Plus California	Written
29.	Eric Lewis	San Francisco USD /Teach Plus California	Written
30.	Tammy Phan	Environmental Charter Middle Schools/Teach Plus California	Written
31.	Amy Weisberg	LAUSD	Written
32.	Juan Resendez	Portola High School/University of California	Written
33.	Adam Erkeneff	Capitol Collegiate Academy	Written

February 7-9, 2024 Commission Meeting
Approved Minutes

	Name	Affiliation	Oral/Written Statement
34.	Jacqueline Gardener	North Mountain Middle School	Written
35.	Lorena Ellis	Azusa USD	Written
36.	Rebecca Pariso	Hueneme Elementary School District	Written
37.	Mary Lopez	Riverbank USD	Written
38.	Anaité Letona	Harvest Park Middle School	Written