
2A

Action

General Session

Approval of the December 2023 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the December 2023 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the December 2023 meeting.

Presenter: None

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the December 7-8, 2023 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative, Chair
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative
Cheryl Cotton, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Ira Lit, Faculty Member Representative
Monica Martinez, Public Representative (12/7 only)
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU)

Commission Members Absent

None

Thursday, December 7, 2023

General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:03 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

1A: Approval of the October 2023 Minutes

Commissioner Davis moved approval of the October 2023 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Heredia seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1B: Approval of the December 2023 Agenda

Commissioner Davis moved approval of the December 2023 Agenda. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1C: Approval of the December 2023 Consent Calendar

Commissioner de la Torre moved approval of the December 2023 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items #7. Jose Cervantes, and #34. Paige Mercer to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Klatt recused herself from item #65. Tamara Farmer. Commissioner Davis recused himself from item #4. Francesca Bura. Commissioner de la Torre recused himself from items #7. Jose Cervantes, #13. Cameron Forrester-Wood, #26. Russell Loveall, #29. Paul Martinez, #30. Daniel McDonnell, #42. Agustin Orozco, #43. Michael Purtell, #44. Runa Ray, #48. Steve Shin, #53. Cyndie Weinstock, #56. Rupi Kaur Boyd, #61. Daniel Park, and # 65. Tamara Farmer.

1D: Chair's Report

Chair Grenot-Scheyer thanked Commissioners, Commission staff, and Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy for the work they do to support California students and educators and expressed her gratitude to those who attend Commission meetings to provide testimony and input on the Commission's work. She spoke about the emotional, moral, and ethical questions that are provoked by the Israel-Hamas War which is impacting students and colleagues in both PK-12 and higher education. Chair Grenot-Scheyer shared comments made by Dr. Betina Hsieh, president of California Council on Teacher Education and faculty member of California State University (CSU), Long Beach, and by Dr. Eddie Glaude Jr., scholar, theologian and professor of African American studies at Princeton University, and asked everyone collectively to take a moment to pause and reflect on the impact this tragedy is having on the children and youth on both sides of the conflict in the middle east and here at home.

1E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy introduced William Walker, a new Manager with the Division of Professional Practices, Julie Holmes, a new Consultant with the Professional Services Division, and Sarah DeVore, a new Attorney with the Legal Office. Executive Director Sandy reported on her attendance at the Learning Policy Institute Convening "Taking Stock of California's March to Equity - The Local Control Funding Formula at 10" on December 6, 2023. Executive Director Sandy also mentioned that copies of the updated Commission Strategic Plan are available.

1F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner de La Torre reminded everyone about the upcoming certification day on December 9, 2023 for the National Board candidates.

Commissioner Browne reported on the California Community Colleges' recent work around curriculum alignment and Early Childhood Education. She also shared information regarding the upcoming International Educational Conference in Istanbul on teacher preparation and the work from the Hunt Institute on early childhood education.

Commissioner Cotton reported on the "A Call to Action: Building a Better Future for California Students Experiencing Homelessness Summit" hosted by State Superintendent of Public

Instruction Tony Thurmond. She also provided an update regarding the California Department of Education's work on the Literacy Road Map and shared information regarding the California National Board for Professional Teaching Standards Certification Incentive Program.

Commissioner Davis reported on his attendance at a Head Start dinner with Commissioner Browne and provided updates about the BIPOC (Black, Indigenous, and People of Color) program through the National Board Resource Center. He also congratulated Chair Grenot-Scheyer on her 2023 distinguished educator award from California State University, Los Angeles.

Commissioner Francois congratulated Chair Grenot-Scheyer as one of the 2023 distinguished honorees. She announced that the application window for REACH (Race Education and Community Healing) grants has been extended and shared information about the collaboration between University of California (UC) Berkeley, UC Los Angeles, and the California Subject Matter Projects through the 21st Century California School Leadership Academy on three new research briefs. She recognized Gregory Wolf, UC Santa Barbara Gevirtz School alumnus and 2024 Teacher of the year; Ryan Helsel and Sammi Labert, Santa Barbara County Office of Education 2024 Distinguished New Educators; Tiffany Gonzalez, Santa Barbara County Office of Education 2024 Distinguished Mentor; and Sonia Aguila, National Bilingual Teacher of the Year for their service and contributions to the education filed.

Commissioner Pavri acknowledged Chair Grenot-Scheyer for her distinguished educator award and provided an update on the CSU's recent activities around literacy certification and the PK-3 Specialist Instruction credential.

Commissioner White-Smith stated that it is important to remember the love and cultural sharing that brings everyone together and the ability to engage in that freely especially during this time of the year when there's so much dissension. She shared that 75 percent of private institutions in California are minority serving institutions or emerging minority serving institutions, specifically Hispanic Serving Institutions, and reminded everyone that many private institutions have specific programs for foster youth that cover tuition and provide other support and resources.

Commissioner Heredia reported on her attendance at the annual California School Boards Association conference in San Francisco.

Commissioner Cardenas reminded everyone to slow down and be present, especially when working with students, and reported on his attendance at a college fair and at a Career Technical Education conference.

1G: Liaison Reports

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, reported on her attendance at the Learning Policy Institute event on December 6, 2023 and provided updates on the State Board's recent activities.

Ronald Wicks, Commission Student Liaison, provided an update on the progress of establishing a student liaison council fostering connections with student teachers and teacher education students statewide. He spoke about the challenges that he experienced with the Pearson VUE online testing center and suggested the Commission review the student surveys on the testing experience and work on enhancing the online testing process. Lastly, he provided an update on his student teaching experience at Malibu Elementary School.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Educator Preparation Committee since Commissioner Martinez was participating remotely.

2A: Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation 2022-23

Robert Frelly and Katrine Czajkowski, COA Co-Chairs, Cheryl Hickey and Erin Sullivan, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the 2022-23 Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation (COA).

Rebekah Harris, Azusa Pacific University, submitted a written comment which pointed out that Azusa Pacific University had a joint Commission/CAEP (Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation) site visit on February 12-15, 2023.

2B: Request to Adjust the Accreditation Cycle Timeline to Complete Literacy Certification Required by Senate Bill 488

David DeGuire, Director, Cheryl Hickey and Erin Sullivan, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission approval a proposal to adjust the accreditation cycle to accommodate activities required by statute related to certification of literacy instruction as required by Senate Bill 488 (Chap. 678, Stats. 2021).

Cean Colcord, Whittier College, submitted a written comment which voiced support for the proposed adjustment to the accreditation cycle.

Derek Riddle, CSU Stanislaus and CSU Center for the Advancement of Reading and Writing, submitted a written comment which stated that this extension would greatly help them manage the implementation of the new literacy standard and their accreditation work without overwhelming their faculty.

Elizabeth Orozco Reilly, CSU Channel Islands, submitted a written comment which supported the proposed adjustment to the accreditation cycle to complete the literacy certification requirement.

Isabel Vallejo, Lurie College of Education-San Jose State University, submitted a written comment in support of the proposed adjustment to the accreditation cycle. The letter stated that the new schedule would provide ample time to implement the necessary change to fulfill the provisions of SB 488, make adjustments, and ensure that all requirements are effectively embedded within their teacher preparation programs.

Julie Sheldon, Walnut Valley Consortium, submitted a written comment in favor of the proposed adjustment to the accreditation cycle.

June Hetzel, Biola University, submitted a written comment which urged the support of the proposed adjustment of the accreditation cycle by one year.

Marisol Rexach, Santa Ana Unified School District, submitted a written comment which suggested the Commission survey programs that were anticipating site visits to understand their context.

Mel Spence, California Lutheran University, submitted a written comment which stated that this approach may be better as an individual institution decision.

Roxanne Miller, Chapman University, submitted a written comment which raised concerns regarding the proposed adjustment to the accreditation cycle and requested the Commission table this item for additional consideration and specific information gathering from institutions of higher education that carry out not only Commission but also national accreditation and rely on joint reporting and site visits, including input from not only the teacher education but also the school counseling/school psychology community. The letter also asked that the Commission lobby and obtain commitments from national accreditors to extend their accreditation periods for any program that would be affected negatively by this proposal.

Tom Vu, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU), submitted a written comment which asked the Commission to provide guidance and flexibility to institutions' timelines and to work with institutions on a case-by-case basis to determine whether an adjustment to the accreditation cycle timeline works for their specific situation.

Commission Action

Commissioner de la Torre moved to approve the proposed modified accreditation timeline specified in this agenda item. Commissioner Simmons seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2C: Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2021-22

Cara Mendoza, Administrator, and Phi Phi Lau, Research Data Specialist, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2021-22, as required by Title II of the 2008 Reauthorization of the federal Higher Education Act, including a description of credentialing requirements to teach in California public schools and qualitative and quantitative information on teacher preparation programs.

Liz Alvarado, Californians Together, submitted a written comment which emphasized the need for enhanced measures regarding the distribution of institutions granting bilingual certification. The letter proposed the inclusion of targeted goals specifically for bilingual certification and

requested the integration of information on both traditional and alternative routes to ensure a comprehensive understanding of the teacher preparation landscape statewide.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:30 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, December 8, 2023

General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:36 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Professional Practices Committee

Chair Grenot-Scheyer convened the Professional Practices Committee since Commissioner Hartwig was participating remotely.

3A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

2D: Options to Study and Improve California's Teaching Performance Assessments

Amy Reising, Chief Deputy Director, and David DeGuire, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission consideration options to study and improve California's teaching performance assessments. In addition, next steps were described to further support teacher candidates with a potential adoption of a secondary passing standard for the CalTPA and edTPA models. The secondary passing standard would allow program sponsors to recommend candidates for a preliminary credential who scored within - 1.0 Standard Error of Measurement (SEM) if the program sponsor has evidence from additional measures that the candidate has demonstrated competency in the seven Teaching Performance Expectation (TPE) domains.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Lit moved to adopt the secondary passing standard outlined in item 2D for candidates enrolled in an approved program moving forward, which would allow program sponsors to recommend candidates for a preliminary credential who scored within -1.0 Standard Error of Measurement (SEM) if the program sponsor has evidence from additional measures that the candidate has demonstrated competency in the seven TPE domains. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Commission further directed staff to convene a workgroup and return in June 2024 with an analysis and recommendations regarding full implementation.

2E: Update on the 2021 California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program

Stephanie Morgado, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program, including the 2023 Annual Report to the Legislature on the 2021 California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program.

Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District, shared information about the Classified Grant Program at their school district and encouraged the Commission to continue advocating for investments like these as districts seek to recruit, train, and retain the best teachers for their students, families, and communities.

Serette Kaminski, Association of California School Administrators, submitted a written comment which stated that it would be beneficial for the state to compare the programs in a holistic way to uncover the merits and opportunity challenges in a clear and distinguishable way which would help the Legislature in their budget deliberations to determine which types of policies and grants were most helpful in maximizing state funds to move more candidates towards a credential.

Commission Action

Chair Grenot-Scheyer moved to approve the 2023 Annual Report to the Legislature on the 2021 California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program for transmittal to the Legislature. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Commission further directed staff to bring an item to the February 2024 meeting that provides information on how the Commission can be more intentional in its outreach efforts to districts and local educational agencies.

2F: Update on Cohort Four and Report to the Legislature on the 2018 Teacher Residency Grant Program

Kristina Najarro, Lynn Larsen, and Sarah Barwani, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the fourth year of the Teacher Residency Grant Program authorized by 2018 legislation and presented the final report that was

submitted to the State Legislature on December 1, 2023, as required by statute (Education Code §44415).

Mandy Redfern, California Teachers Association, raised concerns regarding the separation of RICA (Reading Instruction Competence Assessment) pass rate data from all other exams data and the 14 teacher residents who did not pass the CalTPA on their first or second attempt.

Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District, provided information about the residency programs at their school district and suggested the Commission consider the administrative cost to implement residency programs which could impact the potential funding received by the residents.

Serette Kaminski, Association of California School Administrators, submitted a written comment which stated that it would be beneficial for the state to compare the programs in a holistic way to uncover the merits and opportunity challenges in a clear and distinguishable way which would help the Legislature in their budget deliberations to determine which types of policies and grants were most helpful in maximizing state funds to move more candidates towards a credential.

2G: Year Four Update and Report to the Legislature on the Local Solutions to the Shortage of Special Education Teachers Grant Program

Kristina Najarro, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the fourth year of the Local Solutions to the Shortage of Special Education Teachers (Local Solutions) Grant Program and presented the final report that was submitted to the Legislature on December 1, 2023, as required by statute.

Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District, shared information about the Local Solutions Grant program at their school district and encouraged the Commission and other educational partners to continue to advocate for this program.

Omar Ezzeldine, Santa Ana Unified School District, submitted a written comment which emphasized the essential need to extend the Local Solutions Grant program and urged the Commission to bring this grant program back so that local school districts can better serve their students.

Roxanne Miller, Santa Ana Unified School District / Chapman University, submitted a written comment which voiced support of the Local Solutions Grant program and suggested that programs like Local Solutions be reauthorized in the future.

Serette Kaminski, Association of California School Administrators, submitted a written comment which stated that it would be beneficial for the state to compare the programs in a holistic way to uncover the merits and opportunity challenges in a clear and distinguishable way which would help the Legislature in their budget deliberations to determine which types of

policies and grants were most helpful in maximizing state funds to move more candidates towards a credential.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

1H: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Sarah Lillis, Teach Plus California, submitted a written comment in support of the proposed revisions to the CSTP (California Standards for the Teaching Profession) and emphasized the need for the revisions to be finalized, adopted, and supported in a meaningful way to improve teaching and learning. The letter also included a brief titled “Transform California Teaching and Learning: Teach Plus California Policy Fellows on Supporting and Funding New Teacher Standards.”

Serette Kaminski, Association of California School Administrators, submitted a written comment which asked the Commission to move forward to update the Child Development Permit and suggested that recommendations should also be made on pathways for seasoned educators to transition to administration. The letter also requested the Commission include an item that discusses integrating the newly adopted *Mathematics Framework for California Public Schools* when preparing new teachers.

1I: Nominations and Elections for the Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2024

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy presented this item regarding the nominations and elections for Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2024.

Commissioner Klatt nominated Marquita Grenot-Scheyer as Chair. Commissioner de la Torre nominated Bonnie Klatt as Vice Chair.

Commissioner Davis moved to elect Marquita Grenot-Scheyer as Chair. Commissioner Lit seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer abstaining.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer moved to elect Bonnie Klatt as Vice Chair. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried Commissioner Klatt abstaining.

1J: Report of Closed Session Items

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reported that the Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Raphael Margolin
- Jermaine Calhoun

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision and called for the transcripts in the following matters:

- Ruth Gray
- Brandee Grivois
- Dawn Pellerin

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the following matters and a Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

- Michael Coggi
- CaSandra Everitt
- Fang Jia
- Jessica Kakimoto
- Omar Musleh
- Edward Ronquillo
- Joseph Sinclair
- Katherine Yetter

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the following matters:

- Rahmin Buckman
- Sarah Chapman
- Darryl Gideon
- Kevin Hernandez
- Lara Rankin
- Douglas Renick
- Carolyn Warren
- Jonathan Wright

The Commission tabled its review of a draft decision and order in the matter of Stacey Weatherman.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #7. Jose Cervantes and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner de la Torre recused himself on this item.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #34. Paige Mercer and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Grenot-Scheyer adjourned the meeting at 1:19 p.m.

Appendix A

2D: Options to Study and Improve California's Teaching Performance Assessments

	Name	Affiliation	Oral/Written Statement
1.	Mandy Redfern	California Teachers Association	Oral
2.	Erin Githens	California Teachers Association	Oral
3.	Miyuki Manzanedo	California Teachers Association	Oral
4.	Doug Gephart	Association of California School Administrators	Oral
5.	Mandy Hu	California Teachers Association	Oral
6.	Angelica Salazar	Public Advocates	Oral
7.	Liza Finkelstein	FULCRUM	Oral
8.	Ruchi Agarwal-Rangnath	CARE-ED/University of San Francisco	Oral/Written
9.	Steve McDougall	California Federation of Teachers	Oral
10.	Devika Sood	FULCRUM	Oral
11.	Maryanne Wolf	Center for Dyslexia, Diverse Learners, and Social Justice	Oral
12.	Heather Calomese	EdVoice	Oral/Written
13.	Marisol Ruiz	Cal Poly Humboldt/California Faculty Association /CARE-ED	Oral
14.	Jessica Sawko	Children Now	Oral
15.	Ron Rapp	California Faculty Association	Oral
16.	Lori DePole	Decoding Dyslexia CA	Oral/Written
17.	Rachel Hurd	San Ramon Valley Unified School District	Oral
18.	Haley Skinner	San Jose State University	Written
19.	Margaret Bradley	San Gabriel Unified School District	Written
20.	Susan Green	California Faculty Association	Written
21.	Kristen Koeller	The Reading League California	Written
22.	Mara Harvey	Natomas Unified School District	Written
23.	Adrienne Miyadi	Irvine Unified School District	Written
24.	Cheena Moslen	California Teachers Association	Written
25.	Steven Clemensen	San Ysidro School District	Written
26.	Judy Buttrill	Self	Written
27.	Tristan Brown	California Federation of Teachers	Written
28.	Ann Berlak	Self	Written
29.	Ashley Joseph	Self	Written
30.	Gabby Stanton-Fischer	California Federation of Teachers	Written
31.	Sharon Strich	Self	Written
32.	Tayari Kuanda	Self	Written
33.	No Name 1	Self	Written
34.	Divya Farias	Oea	Written
35.	No Name 2	CSUF	Written

December 7-8, 2023 Commission Meeting
Approved Minutes

	Name	Affiliation	Oral/Written Statement
36.	No Name 3	Self	Written
37.	Stephanie Singer	University of San Francisco	Written
38.	No Name 4	Self	Written
39.	Rhea Settles	CSU East Bay and The Civility Zone	Written
40.	Rebecca Giovannini	University of San Francisco	Written
41.	Serette Kaminski	Association of California School Administrators	Written
42.	Roberta Ahlquist	San Jose State University	Written
43.	Alysa Aujero	University of San Francisco	Written
44.	Elizabeth McAdams Ducy	Sonoma State University	Written
45.	JR Arimboanga	Self	Written
46.	Talina Colovich	California Teachers Association	Written
47.	Lily Chen-Hafteck	UCLA	Written
48.	Frank Heuser	UCLA	Written
49.	Paul Rosenzweig	UC Riverside	Written
50.	No Name 5	Self	Written
51.	Yolie Flores	Families in School	Written
52.	Allison Mattheis	California State University Los Angeles	Written
53.	Todd Collins	California Reading Coalition	Written
54.	Johnnie Wilson	UC Santa Cruz	Written
55.	Jackson Stillman	Cal Poly Humboldt	Written
56.	Erica Colmenares/Scott Jarvie	San Jose State University	Written
57.	Alexandria Rumbel	Cal Poly Humboldt	Written
58.	Marcella C McCollum	Self	Written
59.	Carolyn Medina	Self	Written
60.	Ian Jones	Cal Poly Humboldt	Written
61.	Katherine Johnson	Oakley Union Elementary School District	Written
62.	Rachel Lambert	UCSB	Written
63.	Resa Kelly	San Jose State University	Written
64.	Aly Gerdes	EESD/ETA	Written
65.	Brian Charest	CARE-ED	Written
66.	No Name 6	Self	Written
67.	David Goldberg	California Teachers Association	Written