
1A

Action

General Session

Approval of the August 2023 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the August 2023 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the August 2023 meeting.

Presenter: None

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the August 24-25, 2023 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative, Chair
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California (8/24 only)
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Ira Lit, Faculty Member Representative
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU) (8/24 only)

Commission Members Absent

Cheryl Cotton, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative
Monica Martinez, Public Representative
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University

Thursday, August 24, 2023

Executive Committee

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the Executive Committee at 9:02 a.m.

1A: Educator Preparation Student Liaison

Hai Jue Theriault, Program Analyst, Executive Office, presented this item which provided information regarding the selection process for the Educator Preparation Student Liaison.

Kori Jones, Former Educator Preparation Student Liaison, submitted a written comment which offered support and congratulations to the potential new student liaison.

Commission Action

Commissioner Hartwig moved to appoint Ronald Wicks to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year effective October 1, 2023. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:14 a.m. Chair Grenot-Scheyer recognized the passing of Gary Sandy and asked everyone to take a moment of silent reflection to send healing thoughts to Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy and her family.

Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

2A: Approval of the June 2023 Minutes

Commissioner Klatt moved approval of the June 2023 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Cardenas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2B: Approval of the August 2023 Agenda

Commissioner de la Torre moved approval of the August 2023 Agenda with an agenda insert for item 2C. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Daniel Carrillo, Riverside University Health System, submitted a letter to support the amendment to Education Code section 44011 that prohibits prospective employees from being employed due to Penal Code 11550 convictions.

2C: Approval of the August 2023 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Heredia moved approval of the August 2023 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items #35. Jennifer Garrett, #48. Albert Lorello, #55. Jeffrey Mead, #57. Andrew Mendonca, #60. Oscar Mojica, #61. Ronald Mooshagian, #62. Raymond Murphy, #66. Josh Porter, #67. David Preston, and #72. Kenneth Ring to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner de la Torre recused himself from items #6. Noemi Avena, #64. Dioka Okorie, #91. Beatriz Travaglia, and #106. Michael Rosner.

2D: Chair's Report

Chair Grenot-Scheyer acknowledged the members of the Committee of Credentials and thanked them for their service. She raised concerns regarding the unprecedented events resulting from the global climate crisis. She spoke about the current highly charged political environment which thrust schools center stage and shared her concerns regarding the U.S. Supreme Court decision on Students for Fair Admissions v. President and Fellows of Harvard College.

2E: Executive Director's Report

Chief Deputy Director Amy Reising thanked Mers Tran for their contributions as the outgoing Educator Preparation Student Liaison and welcomed Ronald Wicks as the new Commission

student liaison starting October 1, 2023. She also expressed her condolences to Executive Director Sandy and her family.

2F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Francois expressed her sympathy to Executive Director Sandy and her family. She shared her excitement for the beginning of the new school year and thanked Commission staff for their support to the field. She shared some of the remarks from U.C. President Michael Drake regarding the Supreme Court's decision on the use of race in college admission and expressed her disappointment regarding the Supreme Court's ruling to reject the Biden Administration's plan to discharge student loan debts. She spoke about the University of California's continued efforts on finding creative solutions to meet the challenges of these two decisions and thanked colleagues from the AICCU and California State University (CSU) for their collaboration and partnership.

Commissioner Browne provided an update regarding the California Community Colleges' work on building support and capacity for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction credential and shared information on a pilot program for free tuition created by her institution and the California Senate. She also reported on her attendance at the Child Development Permit Workgroup meeting.

Commissioner White-Smith shared her gratitude to the staff for the work that they do and expressed her condolences to Executive Director Sandy and her family. She provided an update on the Black InGenious Initiative and shared information regarding the Education Deans for Justice and Equity summer 2023 conference hosted by the University of San Diego.

On behalf of Commissioner Pavri, Chair Grenot-Scheyer reported that CSU Long Beach received \$11 million and CSU Dominguez Hills received \$22 million from the Ballmer Group to fund scholarships and expand early childhood education specialist credential programs.

Commissioner Davis expressed his appreciation to Commissioner Browne for co-presenting with him at a Politics of Education class at San Jose State on the PK-3 credential and thanked Commission staff Renee Marshall for her assistance. He reported on his attendance at the All of the Above podcast where he spoke about his role as a Commissioner and classroom teacher, and shared the work that the state is doing to attract teachers, especially BIPOC (Black, Indigenous, and People of Color) teachers, and his work at Stanford at the National Board Resource Center. He conveyed his condolences to Executive Director Sandy and her family and expressed his appreciation to Student Liaison Tran. Lastly, he thanked the Child Development Workgroup for their work on the Child Development Permit.

Commissioner Heredia shared her excitement about the opening of the full first dual immersion school in her school district and thanked her colleagues at CSU Sacramento in the College of Education for their partnership.

Commissioner Simmons shared information about the beginning of the school year at his school district and spoke about the housing crisis that his community has experienced. He also shared information about his district's TK programs.

Commissioner Cardenas reported on his attendance at the annual American School Counselor Association conference "Dream Big" in Atlanta. He shared information about the beginning of the school year at his campuses and thanked all educators for helping students dream big and to make their dreams possible.

2G: Liaison Reports

Mers Tran, Commission Student Liaison, expressed their interest in being a part of the community of student voices within the Commission. Student Liaison Tran provided an update about their activities after graduating from UC Berkeley's education program and expressed their gratitude to the team at Latitude High School. Lastly, Student Liaison Tran thanked the Commission for providing support and inspiration over the last year.

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, expressed her condolences to Executive Director Sandy and her family and thanked Student Liaison Tran for their input at the Commission meetings. She reported on her attendance at the State Board's July 2023 meeting and at the California Multi-Tiered System of Support conference in Anaheim.

Certification Committee

Committee Chair David Simmons convened the Certification Committee.

3A: Roadmap to Education Careers Initiative Update

Erin Skubal, Director, Angel Lopez, Policy Manager, and Phoebe Au-Yeung, Education Career Counselor, Certification Division, presented this item which provided an update on the ongoing work related to the Roadmap to Education Careers Initiative as established by Assembly Bill 178.

Tonya Golden, California Federation of Teachers, raised concerns regarding the timeline to process credential applications.

Jessica Sawko, Children Now, submitted a written comment and spoke on this item. She applauded the work to date on the implementation of the Roadmap to Education Careers and suggested that the tools and resources be available in multiple languages to improve equitable access. She also recommended the inclusion of a bilingual educator to this work and adding the bilingual authorization to the list of career options. Lastly, she suggested the Commission request information regarding the number of individuals assisted via email and chat and gather data about what sort of interest and demand there is in the profession of teaching.

Liz Alvarado, Californians Together, suggested the Commission include the bilingual education pathway and bilingual authorization to the roadmap and add chat resources or tools in multiple languages.

Angelica Salazar, Public Advocates, raised concerns regarding the Commission's capacity to do more transcript reviews for teacher candidates to meet the basic skills requirement (BSR) and recommended the Commission consider what additional resources may be needed on the roadmap to offer all teacher candidates in-house transcript review service by Commission staff. She urged the Commission to ensure teacher candidates avoid the unnecessary testing barriers by becoming aware of and using the BSR calculator tool which could result in equitable support for BIPOC teacher candidates, and voiced support of adding the bilingual authorization information.

Melissa Valenzuela-Stookey, Education Trust-West, thanked the Commission for its work to develop the Roadmap to Education Careers Initiative and requested these tools and valuable information be available in multiple languages. She suggested the future inclusion of filters for each program type, the inclusion of a bilingual educator to this work and adding the bilingual authorization to the career pathway tool as well as additional information on affordability.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Educator Preparation Committee due to Commissioner Martinez's absence.

4B: Literacy Performance Assessment Pilot Study-Participant Waiver Requests

David DeGuire, Director, and Heather Kennedy, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided criteria for the selection of institutions to participate in the Literacy Performance Assessment (LPA) pilot study. This item recommended that the Commission approve the selection criteria for participation; approve the requested waiver for selected institutions that meet proposed criteria; discuss and determine if participants may waive both the TPA and RICA requirements; and adopt a minimum performance level for successful completion of the revised CalTPA Cycle 2 for use during the 2024 pilot.

Adam Ebrahim, California Teachers Association, raised concerns regarding the impact of a retrofitted Literacy Performance Assessment and questioned how it is going to be measured.

Jessica Sawko, Children Now, submitted a written comment which supported staff recommendations to implement the new LPA.

Commission Action

Commissioner de la Torre moved to adopt the criteria listed on pages 5-6 of the item for the selection of institutions to participate in the Literacy Performance Assessment pilot study. Commissioner Heredia seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Lit moved to require candidates to pass the LPA with a minimum score of 14 across the 8 proposed rubrics, with the agreement that candidates who do not pass the LPA will need to take and pass the current RICA and the current TPA model adopted by their program. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner de la Torre moved to approve waiver requests from selected institutions to waive the requirement for the assessment of reading instruction competence requirement for their candidates who successfully complete the LPA and meet the pilot expected performance level set by the Commission. Commissioner Heredia seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner de la Torre moved to approve waiver requests from selected institutions to waive the requirement for the reading instruction competence assessment requirement for their low incidence Education Specialist candidates (DHH, ECSE, and VI) who successfully complete the LPA and meet the pilot expected performance level set by the Commission. Commissioner Lit seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Professional Practices Committee.

5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:50 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in educator discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, August 25, 2023

General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:38 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Chief Deputy Director Amy Reising introduced Debra Keeler, Consultant, and Jack Boss, Data Analyst to the Commission.

Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee

Committee Chair Jose Cardenas convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

6A: Update on the Enacted 2023-24 Budget

Brigid Hanson, Director, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the Commission's portion of the enacted 2023-24 budget.

Legislative Committee

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Legislative Committee.

7A: Status of Legislation

Jonathon Howard, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of those legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee

4A: Child Development Permit Workgroup Plan

Renee Marshall, Administrator, and Debra Keeler, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for review and potential affirmation a plan for a workgroup of Early Childhood Education experts to build on recommendations provided to the Commission by the Child Development Permit Advisory Panel in 2017 and make further recommendations to the Commission on the structure and requirements of the Child Development Permit in alignment with the state's Master Plan for Early Learning and Care and current needs in the field.

Toni Isaacs, Ventura County Office of Education/Moorpark College, expressed her appreciation for being a part of the Child Development Permit Workgroup and thanked Commission staff for their leadership on this work.

Manuel Buenrostro, Californians Together, submitted a written comment which expressed his support for the work being undertaken by the Child Development Permit Workgroup. He urged the workgroup to consider incorporating Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) that address the unique requirements of teaching dual language learner children and emphasized the importance of creating a bilingual pathway within the Child Development Permit for teachers working in programs with a high concentration of dual language learner children who share a common home language.

Jessica Sawko, Children Now, submitted a written comment which recommended the Commission charge the workgroup to also focus on the question of "How can the Child Development Permit build up and toward the PK-3 ECE Specialist Credential?".

Commission Action

Commissioner Davis moved to affirm the proposed plan and focus questions for the Child Development Workgroup as presented in this agenda item. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4C: Study Session on Preparation Program Completer Survey Data

David DeGuire, Director, Professional Services Division; Susan Patrick, Senior Researcher, and Tara Kini, Chief of Staff and Director of State Policy, Learning Policy Institute, presented this item which provided findings from the Learning Policy Institute's analysis of five years of survey data from educator preparation program completers, as well as from their cooperating teachers/mentors and employers. The report also covered what the perceptions of new

educators captured in these surveys can illustrate about the state of educator preparation in California.

Liz Alvarado, Californians Together, supported the state's initiatives to enhance the readiness of educators to deliver effective instruction for English learners and raised concerns regarding educator preparation programs that are falling short in preparing teachers for meeting the instructional needs of English learners and of students with special needs. She echoed some of the recommendations in the report calling for the backing of more integrated dual credential programs in bilingual education and special education and suggested teacher preparation programs use this survey data for continual improvements.

Mari Gray, California State University, East Bay, requested data on programs for leadership preparation and other information such as demographics, variation in terms of candidate feelings about preparation, and outcomes by program type.

Manuel Buenrostro, Californians Together, submitted a written comment which supported efforts by the state to improve preparation of all educators to provide instruction for English learners, including the support for all credential candidates in the provision of English Language Development strategies. He also supported the recommendation for integrated and dual credential programs in bilingual education.

Jessica Sawko, Children Now, submitted a written comment which raised concerns in several areas and urged the Commission to review the data carefully and to develop an action plan to address some of the most alarming issues elevated in the report that are under the Commission's purview.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

2H: Report of Executive Committee

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reported that the Executive Committee appointed Ronald Wicks to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year effective October 1, 2023.

2I: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Channon Jackson, Alameda County Office of Education, requested the Commission reconsider the 90 units requirement for substitute teachers.

Angelica Salazar, Public Advocates, submitted a written comment which requested the Commission bring an agenda item to the October Commission meeting regarding CBEST to redress the severe adverse impact the CBEST has had on diversifying California's teaching force.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 10:43 a.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in educator discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

2J: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reported that the Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Jorge Orozco (Commissioner de la Torre recused from this matter)
- Arthur Palomo
- Nicolas Collier

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Hugh Tolliver, III (Commissioner Susan Heredia recused from this matter)
- Nereida Rojas-Seitz

The Commission adopted a Decision and Order in the following matters:

- Robert Lanz (Commissioner Jose Cardenas recused from this item)
- Samia Luo
- Manuel Madrid-Olguin
- Sheila Milosky
- Charles So

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Samuel Agyei-Fosu Godman. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Christopher Cino. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of David Keck. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Starranne Meyers. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order. Commissioner Susan Heredia recused from this item.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Maurice Myers. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Morgan Walton. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Curtis Williams. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision and called for the transcripts in the following matters:

- Rahmin Buckman
- Michael Coggi
- Darryl Gideon
- Kevin Hernandez
- Fang Jia
- Jessica Kakimoto
- Edward Ronquillo
- Joseph Sinclair
- Stacey Weatherman
- Katherine Yetter

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and accepted the recommendations of the Committee of Credentials:

- #60. Oscar Mojica
- #61. Ronald Mooshagian
- #66. Josh Porter
- #67. David Preston

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

- #35. Jennifer Garrett
- #48. Albert Lorello
- #55. Jeffrey Mead
- #57. Andrew Mendonca
- #62. Raymond Murphy
- #72. Kenneth Ring

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Grenot-Scheyer adjourned the meeting at 12:22 p.m.