
1A

Action

General Session

Approval of the April 2023 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the April 2023 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the April 2023 meeting.

Presenter: None

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the April 19-21, 2023 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative, Chair
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Ira Lit, Faculty Member Representative
Monica Martinez, Public Representative
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative
Tony Thurmond, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU)

Commission Members Absent

Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative

Wednesday, April 19, 2023

Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 2:01 p.m.

1A: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation

Erin Sullivan and Cheryl Hickey, Administrators, Professional Services Division, provided information about the finalists for open positions on the Committee on Accreditation (COA).

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

K-12 Finalists

- Julie Sheldon
- Malaika Bryant

- Marissa Luna Lopez
- Patrick McKee

Postsecondary Finalists

- Allison Legget
- Anne Jones
- Hannah Geddy
- Michael Hills

Commission Action

Commissioner Pavri moved to recommend Patrick McKee and Marissa Luna Lopez be appointed to serve as K-12 members, and Julie Sheldon and Malaika Bryant be appointed to serve as alternates on the COA. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Davis moved to recommend Michael Hills and Allison Legget be appointed to serve as postsecondary members and Anne Jones and Hannah Geddy be appointed to serve as alternates on the COA. Commissioner Pavri seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Committee Chair Martinez adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 5:23 p.m.

Thursday, April 20, 2023

Executive Committee

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the Executive Committee at 9:03 a.m. Roll call was taken.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer delegated her role of chairing the meeting to Vice Chair Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo.

2A: Proposed 2024 and 2025 Commission Meeting Schedules

Hai Jue Theriault, Program Analyst, Executive Office, presented this item which provided proposed meeting schedules for 2024 and 2025 for consideration by the Executive Committee.

Commission Action

Commissioner Hartwig moved to approve the 2024 and 2025 meeting schedules as presented in this item. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo adjourned the Executive Committee at 9:07 a.m.

General Session

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:08 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

3A: Approval of the February 2023 Minutes

Commissioner Klatt moved approval of the February 2023 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Chair Grenot-Scheyer was not present during this item, and Commissioner Gross was not present during the roll call vote.

3B: Approval of the April 2023 Agenda

Commissioner Martinez moved approval of the April 2023 Agenda with an agenda insert for item 6A. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Chair Grenot-Scheyer and Commissioner Gross were not present during this item.

3C: Approval of the April 2023 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the April 2023 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items #8. Lanny Conte and #38. Moises Perez to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Chair Grenot-Scheyer was not present during this item. Commissioner Cardenas recused himself from items #28. Kathleen Magana and #50. Meredith Suter; Commissioner Davis recused himself from item #83. Te Jung; and Commissioner de la Torre recused himself from items #1. Benjamin Adams, #21. Gary Lambert, #24. Eliana Lopera, #37. Bobby Nwosa, #52. Christopher Tanaka, #54. Yolanda Turner, and #58. Gregory Wahlmeier.

3D: Chair's Report

There was no report.

3E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy introduced Bronwyn Kennedy, a new Consultant with the Professional Services Division, and Anita Fitzhugh, the new Public Information Officer with the Office of Governmental Relations. Executive Director Sandy also provided a brief overview of the April Commission meeting agenda.

3F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Browne provided an update regarding the work on the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction credential and the development of teacher apprenticeship programs at community colleges. She also spoke about the restructuring of the California Early Childhood Mentor Program and expressed her appreciation for being a participant in the UPK Mixed Delivery Quality and Access Workgroup.

Commissioner Cardenas reminded everyone that May is Mental Health Awareness Month and reported on his attendance at the SkillsUSA Leadership and Skill Conference in Ontario, CA.

Commissioner Davis reported on his attendance at the 2023 California Teachers Association Good Teaching Conference (South) and spoke about his first National Board Certification Pinning Ceremony. He talked about his experience of having Dr. Melba Beals of the Little Rock Nine speak to the students in his class. He also voiced the importance of mental health awareness and expressed his appreciation for the services provided by counselors, social workers, and mental health professionals.

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo expressed her sympathies on the loss of her colleague, Steven Tadeo and shared a poem “Prayer for the Morning” by Audette Fulbright.

Commissioner White-Smith conveyed her condolences to Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo on the loss of her colleague. She shared information about the celebration of Autism Awareness Day and Neurodiversity Week at the University of San Diego. She also reported on the work by the AICCU on diversifying the teacher pipeline as well as expanding the number of counselors, principals, and other leaders in their education community.

Superintendent Thurmond acknowledged and offered his condolences to the community on the loss of Steven Tadeo and thanked Commissioners for speaking about the various needs around mental health awareness. He shared highlights regarding the efforts by the California Department of Education (CDE) on residency programs and literacy.

3G: Liaison Reports

Mers Tran, Commission Student Liaison, thanked Commissioners who spoke in support of mental health awareness month. Student Liaison Tran also provided an update on the UC Berkeley education program and the current landscape of education.

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, reported on her attendance at the State Board’s March 2023 meeting. She also provided an update regarding the work of the National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) on transforming and redesigning schools.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Professional Practices Committee.

4A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices’ current workload.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

5A: Review of the Passing Score Standards for the California Subject Examinations for Teachers in Dance and Theatre (CSET: Dance and CSET: Theatre)

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which described the process used to review the existing minimum passing standards for CSET: Dance and for CSET:

Theatre and provided updated minimum passing score standards for potential adoption by the Commission.

Commission Action

Commissioner de la Torre moved to accept staff recommendation to set the passing score for each subtest at the panel-recommended passing score standard with a -2 SEM adjustment. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Chair Grenot-Scheyer was not present during this item.

5B: Review and Proposed Adoption of the Revised California Teaching Performance Assessment Design Standards

Heather Kennedy and James Webb, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed revisions to the adopted California Teaching Performance Assessment Design Standards and requested that the Commission authorize the use of these updated standards to develop Literacy Teaching Performance Assessments as required by SB 488 (Chap. 678, Stats. 2021).

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, expressed his appreciation for the thoughtful integration of the new Literacy Teaching Performance Expectations into the performance assessment design standards and the explicit requirement for assessor programs to ensure assessors are equipped with a deep knowledge of implicit bias as it relates to their duties. He urged the Commission to be mindful of the scope of the new assessment to ensure it complements the clinical practice in teacher preparation programs and encouraged the Commission to engage teacher candidates, new teachers, mentors, and professors to provide feedback throughout the development of the successor to the RICA as required by SB 488.

Allison Smith, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities-Education, submitted a written comment in support of switching to a performance assessment and embedding it within the Teaching Performance Assessment.

Commission Action

Commissioner Davis moved to adopt the recommended changes in Appendix A of this item with the following additional suggestions 1: address issues on race and hair, and gender and gender expression; 2: be inclusive of any form of potential bias as outlined in Penal Code 422.55 and AB 537; and 3: include live links as a reference for further clarification on these areas of potential bias and authorize the use of the California Teaching Performance Assessment Design Standards to direct the development of literacy performance assessments that reflect the full continuum of placements for multiple subject general education, PK-3, and education specialists. Commissioner de la Torre second the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

5C: Teacher Supply in California, 2021-22 A Report to the Legislature

David DeGuire, Director, Cara Mendoza, Administrator, and Phi Phi Lau, Research Data Specialist, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a report to the Governor and the Legislature on the number of teachers who received credentials, certificates,

permits and waivers to teach in California public schools. In addition to the written Teacher Supply report, information on the educator supply dashboards was updated with the most recent data.

Erin Githens, California Teachers Association, voiced concerns regarding the data on new hires in relation to the projected increase for the 2022-23 school year. She expressed that while the data underscores the ongoing staffing crisis it does not suggest avenues for understanding the root causes within the Commission's purview and suggested a discussion about what data, including intentional listening and learning with new teachers and teacher candidates could lead to greater insights to this issue.

Liz Guillen, Public Advocates, suggested that the agency's top-line findings be front and center in the executive summary on the front page of the report. She raised concerns about the reversal of the trend in the number of newly credentialed teachers and the lack of complete data on the number of fully prepared teachers that are currently serving. She also shared recommendations from the executive summary of the California Educator Diversity Road Map developed by Public Advocates, Californians for Justice, and Education Trust-West.

Jana Luft, Education Trust-West, spoke about the importance of the public having access to data about the educator workforce to guide efforts that ensure all students, especially students of color and those from low-income households, have diverse and effective educators. She raised concerns regarding missing data which makes it impossible to gauge the discrepancy between teacher and student diversity for the last three years at the school district or the county levels and requested these data be made available as soon as possible.

Manuel Buenrostro, Californians Together, elevated the concerns that were raised by Public Advocates and Education Trust-West about the gaps in the data in the current report and voiced the support of more data transparency. He echoed the support for the recommendations of the CDE Educator Diversity Advisory Group and the need to continue to focus on recruitment, retention, and the support for teachers in high need areas. He suggested a more complete picture of the different bilingual authorizations that are provided to educators be included in table 9a of this item.

Kathy Thompson, Tulare County Office of Education, submitted a written comment which expressed an interest in collecting data on California teachers leaving the state.

5D: Revisit of the February 2023 Update on Residency Grant Programs

Cara Mendoza, Administrator, Kristina Najarro, Lynn Larsen, Sarah Barwani, Consultants, Professional Services Division; Andrew Brannegan and Kate Hirschboeck, Senior Research Associates, WestEd, presented this item which provided a follow-up to the February 2023 update on the Teacher Residency Grant Program funded by 2018, 2021, and 2022 legislation and on the Statewide Residency Technical Assistance Center and School Counselor Residency Programs authorized by 2022 legislation. Commission staff and the project team from WestEd also reviewed key findings and answered questions about the data presented in the February 2023 agenda item.

Allison Smith, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities-Education, submitted a written comment which shared struggles that have been experienced at some of their institutions.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:39 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Commission on Teacher Credentialing, et al. vs. Russell Charles Earnest (Case C095602, Court of Appeal for the Third Appellate District)*. While in Closed Session, the Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Petitions for Reduction in Penalty, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, April 21, 2023

General Session

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:35 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo opened the public hearing.

3H: Proposed Regulations Regarding Options for Meeting the Subject Matter Competence Requirement

David DeGuire, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which framed a public hearing on the proposed regulations approved by the Commission at its June 2022 Commission meeting to clarify and standardize implementation of options for meeting the subject matter competence requirement in Education Code sections 44259 and 44310 that were created by Assembly Bill 130 (Chap. 44, Stats. 2021).

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner de la Torre moved to approve the revised proposed regulations in Appendix B of this item with the deletion of the word “credential” in subdivision (b) paragraph (4) and to also add the following majors: child and family studies, early childhood studies, human development and family science, family science, and child adolescent and family studies for meeting the subject matter competence requirement for the PK-3 ECE Specialist Instruction credential. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Superintendent Thurmond was not present during this item.

3I: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential

David DeGuire, Director, and Phyllis Jacobson and Renee Marshall, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed regulations relating to California Code of Regulations (CCR), 80067, 80067.1, 80067.2, and 80067.3 approved by the Commission at its December 2022 Commission meeting to implement the PK-3 Early Childhood Education (ECE) Specialist Instruction Credential and the accompanying Program Preconditions, Program Standards, and Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs), along with an analysis of and responses to public comments on the draft regulations received prior to the Commission meeting and proposed amendments to the draft regulations for the Commission's consideration.

[Appendix B](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Simmons moved to approve the proposed draft regulations with the amendments presented in Table 5 of the agenda insert and to also include the additional minor revisions listed on page GS 3I-8 of this item. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo closed the public hearing.

Legislative Committee

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Legislative Committee.

6A: Status of Legislation

Jonathon Howard, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of those legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

Sally Fox, California Association for Bilingual Education, spoke about their three co-sponsored bills: AB 1127, AB 370 and AB 393, and voiced their opposition to SB 691.

Jessica Sawko, Children Now, spoke about their sponsored bill AB 694 and co-sponsored bill AB 1106.

Reconvene General Session

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reconvened the General Session.

3J: Strategic Planning Update

Amy Reising, Chief Deputy Director, Caitlin Vaccarezza, Vice President, and Aaron Price, President, the Glen Price Group, presented this item which provided a draft strategic plan for Commission consideration and possible adoption.

Commission Action

Commissioner Martinez moved to approve the draft strategic plan and directed staff to take all suggested revisions to the Chair and Vice Chair for final review prior to posting. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Superintendent Thurmond was not present during the roll call vote.

3K: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo moved to accept the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee to: 1) appoint Mike Hillis, Allison Legget, Marissa Luna Lopez, and Patrick McKee to the Committee on Accreditation beginning July 1, 2023; and 2) appoint Malaika Bryant, Hannah Geddy, Anne Jones, and Julie Sheldon as alternates. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3L: Proposed 2024 and 2025 Commission Meeting Schedules

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo moved to accept the recommendations of the Executive Committee for the 2024 and 2025 meeting schedules as presented in agenda item 2A on page 2. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3M: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:18 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Commission on Teacher Credentialing, et al. vs. Russell Charles Earnest (Case C095602, Court of Appeal for the Third Appellate District)*. While in Closed Session, the Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Petitions for Reduction in Penalty, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

3N: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice De La Torre-Escobedo reported that staff briefed the Commission on the litigation matter of *Commission on Teacher Credentialing, et al. vs. Russell Earnest* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission denied Dena Moore's Petition for Reduction in Penalty.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Mariah Goodrich-Jones
- Lee Hammond
- Protus Taniform
- Erin Van Note

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Raul Martin.

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Jamil Wells.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Peter Almanzar. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Adrian Belcher. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Stacy Mc Cay. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Laura Mudge. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Dioka Okorie. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of David Sandles. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order. Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer recused herself on this item.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Kauser Shaikh. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Matthew Sorensen. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of La Shawn Witt. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision and called for the transcripts in the following matters:

- Samuel Agyei-Fosu Godman
- Christopher Cino
- Casandra Everitt
- Maurice Myers
- Starranne Meyers
- Curtis Williams

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #8 Lanny Conte and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed the matter of #38 Moises Perez and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo adjourned the meeting at 5:25 p.m.

Appendix A

3H: Proposed Regulations Regarding Options for Meeting the Subject Matter Competence Requirement

	Name	Affiliation	Oral/Written Statement
1.	Kimberly Barker	Self	Oral
2.	Nancy Hurlbut	PEACH/CA EC BACC	Oral/Written
3.	Denise Kennedy	Cal Poly Pomona	Oral/Written
4.	Deanna Davis Hall	Child Development and Education Department	Oral
5.	Anthony Ayala	Solano Community College	Oral/Written
6.	Janet Fish	California State University, Northridge	Written
7.	Kheng Ly-Hoang	Cal Poly Pomona	Written
8.	Katherine Bono	California State University, Fullerton	Written
9.	Jennifer Paris	Self	Written
10.	Cindy Stephens	College of the Canyons	Written
11.	Kalpana Thatte	Santa Clara County Office of Education	Written
12.	Donna Cecil	Self	Written
13.	Eden Haywood-Bird	Cal Poly Pomona	Written
14.	Allison Smith	Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities-Education (AICCU-ED)	Written
15.	Valerie Winston	Self	Written
16.	Stephanie Hernandez	Self	Written

Appendix B

3I: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential

	Name	Affiliation	Oral/Written Statement
1.	Liz Alvarado	Californians Together	Oral/Written
2.	Anna Powell	Center for the Study of Child Care Employment	Oral
3.	Megan Potente	Decoding Dyslexia CA	Oral
4.	Anthony Ayala	Solano Community College	Oral/Written
5.	Deanna Davis Hall	Child Development and Education Department	Oral/Written
6.	Cindy Stephens	College of the Canyons	Oral/Written
7.	Kimberly Barker/Adria Taha-Resnick	California Association for the Education of Young Children	Oral
8.	Andrea Mazo	Riverside County Office of Education	Oral
9.	Nancy Hurlbut	PEACH/CA EC BACC	Oral/Written
10.	Harold Acord	California Teachers Association	Oral
11.	Jessica Sawko	Children Now	Oral/Written
12.	Doug Gephart	Association of California School Administrators	Oral
13.	Katherine Squires	Self	Oral
14.	Denise Kennedy	Cal Poly Pomona	Oral/Written
15.	Eden Haywood-Bird	Cal Poly Pomona	Oral/Written
16.	Seon Chun-Burbank	Vanguard University of Southern California	Written
17.	Toby Boyd	California Teachers Association	Written
18.	Efrain Mercado/Serette Kaminski	California Teachers Association/Association of California School Administrators	Written
19.	Janet Fish	California State University, Northridge	Written
20.	Luis Molina/Patricia Lozano	Early Edge California	Written
21.	Lori DePole/Megan Potente	Decoding Dyslexia CA	Written
22.	Kheng Ly-Hoang	Cal Poly Pomona	Written
23.	Sharon Donovan	City College of San Francisco	Written
24.	Monica Juarez	West Los Angeles College	Written
25.	Rachel Johnson	Ventura College	Written
26.	Donna Cecil	Self	Written
27.	Allison Smith	Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities-Education (AICCU-ED)	Written
28.	Jaylene Rodriguez	Self	Written
29.	Natalie Tong	Self	Written
30.	Katherine Bono	California State University, Fullerton	Written