
3A

Action

General Session

Approval of the February 2023 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the February 2023 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the February 2023 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the February 9-10, 2023 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative, Chair
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Ira Lit, Faculty Member Representative,
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative
Tony Thurmond, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU)

Commission Members Absent

Monica Martinez, Public Representative

Thursday, February 9, 2023

General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:08 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer welcomed Superintendent Tony Thurmond to the Commission and introduced Ira Lit as a new member of the Commission.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer announced the appointments for the 2023 Executive Committee:

- Monica Martinez, Educator Preparation Committee
- Johanna Hartwig, Professional Practices Committee
- Jose Cardenas, Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee
- Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Legislative Committee

- David Simmons, Certification Committee
- Megan Gross, Appeals and Waivers Committee

1A: Approval of the December 2022 Minutes

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the December 2022 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried with Superintendent Thurmond abstaining.

1B: Approval of the February 2023 Agenda

Superintendent Thurmond moved to approve the February 2023 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 1C and 1H, and to table item 4D to a future meeting. Commissioner Simmons seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1C: Approval of the February 2023 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Klatt moved approval of the February 2023 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 11. Phillip Brundage, 18. Anthony Chu, 28. Walter Duncan, 67. Anthony Payan, 68. Jeremiah Perez and 73. Ronald Polk to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Davis recused himself from "Validation of Service Rendered Without A Credential;" Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo recused herself from item 8. Alexandra Biddle; Commissioner de la Torre recused himself from items 16. Ralph Cato and 91. Rochelle Smith; Chair Grenot-Scheyer recused herself from item 19. Eugene Clayborne and Commissioner Cruz recused himself from item 70. Rebecca Plaud.

1D: Chair's Report

Chair Grenot-Scheyer acknowledged the contributions of all Black Americans in celebration of Black History Month and thanked staff for their work in preparing for this meeting. Chair Grenot-Scheyer spoke about the recent events that occurred in the new year and encouraged everyone to be bold. She also reflected on the work of the Commission and expressed her commitment as the Chair to continue to work in a thoughtful and heartfelt manner, keeping students and educators front and center.

1E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy welcomed Superintendent Tony Thurmond and new Commissioner Ira Lit to the Commission table. She also provided an overview of the Commission's priorities and milestones for 2023.

1F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Browne shared information about the UPK Mixed Delivery Quality and Access Workgroup as well as a network exploratory advisory group sponsored by the Starfish Institute and the Heising-Simons Foundation. She reported on her attendance at the PK-3 ECE Community Circle meeting and spoke about the collaboration between San Francisco State University and community colleges to transform the preparation of PK-3 teachers.

Commissioner Francois shared that her daughter finished her teaching credential program at California State University (CSU), Northridge and was hired by the Los Angeles Unified School District. She also acknowledged the recent lives lost due to violence and hate and provided background information about Black History Month. She provided updates on the University of California's (UC) engagement in doctoral education through the California Teacher Education Research and Improvement Network and on the UC teacher education program collaborative to increase the pipeline for UTK early education teacher preparation across the state. Lastly, she reminded everyone that the State Board of Education approved the appointment of the UCLA Center for Community Schooling and Alameda County Office of Education to serve as the Lead Transformative Assistance Center for the California Community Schools Partnership Program.

Commissioner White-Smith acknowledged Black History Month by sharing information about her recent trip to Egypt and spoke about the importance of having an external perspective on our work. She also provided an update about the Black InGenious Initiative and reported that she will be participating in a Black Educators Networking Event at San Diego City Community College on February 10.

Commissioner Heredia reported on her participation on a panel to promote new pathways and bring more people into teaching as part of a new statewide partnership to support California's teacher recruitment efforts launched by Superintendent Thurmond. She spoke about her attendance at the Steps to College fair hosted by the Mexican Consulate in Sacramento and provided an update about the recent California School Boards Association's activities.

Commissioner Pavri thanked Superintendent Thurmond for his focus on supporting teacher preparation and his efforts to address the teacher shortage. She also announced that the CSU launched their search for a new Chancellor.

Mers Tran, Commission Student Liaison, shared detailed information about the UC Berkeley education program and expressed appreciation for the program being rigorous and critical. Student Liaison Tran shared a story about a colleague, Anna Shim and raised concerns regarding the financial barriers for student teachers.

Commissioner Davis shared two instances from his classroom to help give his students a voice and to help increase student attendance. He also thanked Adam Ibrahim from the CTA (California Teachers Association) for facilitating the grant process between CTA, Stanford, and the UCLA Center X on the BIPOC (Black, Indigenous, and People of Color) cohort program for candidates pursuing National Board Certification.

Commissioner Cardenas thanked Student Liaison Tran for bringing a student voice to the table regarding the struggles candidates go through to enter the teaching profession. He shared information about National School Counseling Week 2023 and reported on his attendance at a webinar by the California Student Aid Commission about the residency programs.

Superintendent Thurmond expressed his appreciation to Terri Jackson for being a mentor and advisor on issues related to education and recognized remarks made by other Commissioners

during their reports. He offered partnership from the California Department of Education on teacher recruitment and invited everyone to share their ideas on how to remove barriers for those who may want to join and stay in the education profession.

Commissioner Simmons shared information about teacher recruitment in his school district.

1G: Liaison Reports

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, reported on her attendance at Superintendent Thurmond's swearing-in ceremony on January 7, 2023. Liaison Rodriguez provided an update regarding the State Board's recent activities and thanked Executive Director Sandy, Professional Services Division Director David DeGuire, and other Commission staff for their efforts to maximize the impact of current educator recruitment and retention efforts as well as to explore the possibility of creating educator apprenticeships in California. Lastly, she acknowledged Commissioner de la Torre for his work with the National Board in Los Angeles and encouraged all teachers to become National Board certified teachers.

Commissioner Davis reported on his attendance at the January 26, 2023 Committee on Accreditation meeting.

Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee

Committee Chair Jose Cardenas convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

2A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2023-24 Budget

Sara Saelee, Fiscal and Business Services Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Governor's proposed 2023-24 budget that relate to the Commission.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Professional Practices Committee.

3A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Educator Preparation Committee due to Commissioner Monica Martinez's absence.

4A: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Northeastern University

Michele Williams-George, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Northeastern University's Eligibility Requirements responses for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

Tomas Galguera and Mike Jackson, Northeastern University, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commission Action

Superintendent Thurmond moved to grant eligibility to Northeastern University and move forward to Stage III. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4B: Update on the Residency Grant Programs

Cara Mendoza, Administrator, Kristina Najarro, Lynn Larsen, Sarah Barwani, Consultants, Professional Services Division; Andrew Brannegan and Kate Hirschboeck, Senior Research Associates, WestEd, presented this item which provided an update on the Teacher Residency Grant Program funded by 2018, 2021, and 2022 legislation, and on the Statewide Residency Technical Assistance Center and School Counselor Residency Programs authorized by 2022 legislation. The item also provided an overview of the findings to date on an evaluation of the Teacher Residency programs authorized by the 2018 state budget conducted by WestEd.

Shilpa Ram, Public Advocates, raised concerns regarding the financial challenges that many residents, in particular residents with diverse backgrounds, continue to experience and encouraged the state to consider increasing its investments in the teacher residency grant program. She questioned if other sources of funding might be available to bolster residency programs and increase their sustainability. She spoke in support of the School Counselor Residency Programs and suggested the possibility of expanding the residency options for administrator credential programs.

Jana Luft, The Education Trust-West, voiced concerns regarding the evaluation findings from WestEd that residencies are struggling to compete with intern pathways to attract candidates and many residents of color are experiencing housing and food insecurity. She urged the state to increase the stipend for residents and offer additional financial support. She also supported the expansion of the residency grant program to include counselors and suggested the inclusion of administrative credential programs to specifically target preparing more school leaders of color.

Jessica Sawko, Children Now, encouraged the Commission to think about what a hybrid apprenticeship residency program might look like to address some of the concerns around living wages and urged the Commission to extend its outreach so that more LEAs become aware of the funds that are available for this grant program.

Sarah Lillis, Teach Plus, expressed her appreciation for all the work done to implement residency programs as well as the reflections and analysis that were shared. She agreed with comments from previous speakers and requested the Commission to think about ways to build on and expand the residency program and to partner with the Legislature and the Governor's office to think through what comes next.

Superintendent Thurmond moved to table the item to Friday to allow more time to address questions from the Commission. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without discussion.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:52 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Yaley, et. al. v. CTC, San Diego Superior Court case number 37-00048902*. While in Closed Session, the Commission also considered potential litigation pursuant to Government Code section 11126(e)(2)(B)(i), and adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code sections 11126, 11517, and 11520.

Friday, February 10, 2023

General Session

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:32 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

4C: Proposed Literacy Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations Pursuant to Senate Bill 488 for Education Specialist Low Incidence Disability Areas

Nancy Brynelson, Roxann Purdue, Heather Kennedy, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the proposed Literacy Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) for the low incidence Education Specialist credential areas of Visual Impairments (VI), Deaf and Hard of Hearing (DHH), and Early Childhood Special Education (ECSE) for the Commission's review and potential adoption.

Cheryl Kamei-Hannan, California State University, Los Angeles; Nancy Hlibok Amann, California Department of Education; Gabrielle Jones, University of California, San Diego; and Janice Myck-Wayne, California State University, Fullerton, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Megan Potente, Decoding Dyslexia CA, disagreed with the addition of "when possible" to the proposed ECSE literacy standard 7F and requested the "when possible" language be removed from the proposed ECSE literacy standard 7F to ensure all teachers are prepared to meet the needs of our youngest learners.

Julie Rems-Smario voiced the importance of adding American Sign Language (ASL) to prevent language deprivation and requested the Commission to build the SB 210 language into the documentation to prepare children for literacy and language readiness.

M Kuntze raised concerns about deaf children being mislabeled with children who have dyslexia, and language deprivation for deaf children. He spoke about the importance of having language acquisition in the first five years to provide children the foundation needed to learn how to read.

Renee Lucero, John Tracy Center, spoke about Listening and Spoken Language and suggested the need to add reference for a spoken language specialist wherever there is a reference to an ASL specialist as part of the educational team. She stated that teachers of the deaf who support students using spoken language need to be familiar with hearing technology in order for students with auditory access to develop the skills to support spoken language. She also provided brief comments on the section about deaf-blind students.

Laura Peterson, California School for the Deaf, responded to the statement regarding deaf children needing listening and spoken language.

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, asked staff a clarifying question about defining experts in the item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Brown moved to adopt the proposed Literacy Program Standards and TPEs for the Education Specialist: Visual Impairments (VI) credential with the modification to replace the phrase “when possible” with “when practicable” and to require all currently approved Education Specialist VI programs transition to the new Literacy Program Standards and TPEs by July 1, 2024. Commissioner Gross seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Simmons moved to adopt the proposed Literacy Program Standards and TPEs for the Education Specialist: Deaf and Hard of Hearing (DHH) and Early Childhood Special Education (ECSE) credentials and to require that all currently approved Education Specialist DHH and ECSE programs transition to the new Literacy Program Standards and TPEs by July 1, 2024. The Commission further directed staff to update the handbook to ensure that SB 210 is addressed appropriately and replace the phrase “when possible” with “when practicable.” Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4B: Update on the Residency Grant Programs

Cara Mendoza, Administrator, Kristina Najarro, Lynn Larsen, Sarah Barwani, Consultants, Professional Services Division; Andrew Brannegan and Kate Hirschboeck, Senior Research Associates, WestEd, presented this item which provided an update on the Teacher Residency Grant Program funded by 2018, 2021, and 2022 legislation, and on the Statewide Residency Technical Assistance Center and School Counselor Residency Programs authorized by 2022 legislation. The item also provided an overview of the findings to date on an evaluation of the Teacher Residency programs authorized by the 2018 state budget conducted by WestEd.

The Commission directed staff to bring an item to the April 2023 Commission meeting for further discussion and provide possible recommendations on residency programs.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

1H: Strategic Planning Update

Amy Reising, Chief Deputy Director, Caitlin Vaccarezza, Vice President, and Aaron Price, President, the Glen Price Group, presented this item which provided draft components of the strategic plan developed in response to the December 2022 Commission meeting and identified next steps in the strategic planning process.

Erin Githens, California Teachers Association, offered a friendly amendment to replace the word “consider” with the word “prioritize” in the 4th Guiding Principle.

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, requested clarification around advanced licensure for teachers.

1J: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:28 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Yaley, et. al. v. CTC, San Diego Superior Court case number 37-00048902*. While in Closed Session, the Commission also considered potential litigation pursuant to Government Code section 11126(e)(2)(B)(i), and adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code sections 11126, 11517, and 11520.

1I: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice De La Torre-Esobedo reported that Staff briefed the Commission on the litigation in the matter of *Dr. Kevin Yaley, Francis Lang, Christine Cole v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing, et al.* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted Ponchita Beckham’s Petition for Reinstatement.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Christopher Axtell
- Danette Boles
- John Ho
- Ursula Leguillow

The Commission discussed the Michael Purtell matter and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner de la Torre recused himself on this item.

The Commission discussed the Guy Torres matter and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Jose Ortiz. Commissioner de la Torre recused himself on this item.

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Kurt Wilkins.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Raul Martin. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Jamil Wells. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision and called for the transcripts in the following matters:

- Peter Almanzar
- Adrian Belcher
- Robert Lanz (Commissioner Cardenas recused himself on this item)
- Samia Luo
- Sheila Milosky
- Laura Mudge
- David Sandals (Commissioners Pavri and Grenot-Scheyer recused themselves on this item)
- Kauser Shaikh
- Matthew Sorensen
- Dioka Okorie (Commissioner Francois recused herself from this item)

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #68 Jeremiah Perez and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

- #11. Phillip Brundage
- #18. Anthony Chu
- #28. Walter Duncan
- #67. Anthony Payan
- #73. Ronald Polk

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Grenot-Scheyer adjourned the meeting at 3:05 p.m.