

---

# 1A

## Action

### *General Session*

### Approval of the October and November 2022 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the October and November 2022 meetings of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the October and November 2022 meetings.

**Presenter:** None

### Strategic Plan Goal

#### ***III. Communication and Engagement***

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## **Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the October 12-14, 2022 Meeting**

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative  
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative  
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative  
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California (10/13 only)  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative  
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative  
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU)

### **Commission Members Absent**

None

### ***Wednesday, October 12, 2022***

#### **Ad Hoc Committee**

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 1:34 p.m.

#### **1A: Interview and Recommendations of a Member to the Elementary Teacher Position, School Board Member Position, Public Member Position, and Alternate for the School Administrator Position for the Committee of Credentials**

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

##### *Elementary Teacher*

- Ebony Batiste
- Kimberly Cantrell

- Lenora Gerber
- Patricia Pernin

*School Board Member*

- Tracy Kelly
- Suzan Solomon

*Public Member*

- Gina Plate
- Jacqueline Rivera

*School Administrator Alternate*

- Adrienne Peralta

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Cruz moved to recommend Ebony Batiste be appointed to serve in the Elementary Teacher position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner de la Torre moved to recommend Lenora Gerber be appointed to serve as the first Elementary Teacher alternate on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cruz moved to recommend Kimberly Cantrell be appointed to serve as the second Elementary Teacher alternate on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cruz moved to recommend Suzan Solomon be appointed to serve in the School Board Member position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner de la Torre moved to recommend Jacqueline Rivera be appointed to serve in the Public Member position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cruz moved to recommend Gina Plate be appointed to serve as Public Member alternate on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cruz moved to recommend Adrienne Peralta be appointed to serve as School Administrator alternate on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 5:15 p.m.

### ***Thursday, October 13, 2022***

#### **Executive Committee**

Chair Tine Sloan convened the Executive Committee at 9:01 a.m.

#### **2A: Educator Preparation Student Liaison**

Hai Jue Theriault, Program Analyst, Executive Office, presented this item which provided information regarding the selection process for the Educator Preparation Student Liaison.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to appoint Mers (Meryssa) Tran to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year, effective immediately. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:12 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

#### **3A: Approval of the August 2022 Minutes**

Commissioner Davis moved approval of the August 2022 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Cardenas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **3B: Approval of the October 2022 Agenda**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the October 2022 Agenda with an agenda insert for item 4A. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **3C: Approval of the October 2022 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Davis moved approval of the October 2022 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 13. Lawrence Brown III, 16. Jesus Caro, 25. Christine Flores, and 36. Elizabeth Kahf to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **3D: Chair's Report**

Chair Sloan announced that Executive Director Sandy was selected to receive the James A. Kelly Award for Advancing Accomplished Teaching, which is the highest award bestowed by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS). Chair Sloan also announced that she will step down from the Commission after the December 2022 Commission meeting.

### **3E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy thanked Chair Sloan and expressed her appreciation for receiving the James A. Kelly Award. She also introduced new staff Rosemary Wrenn and Frances Kellar, Consultants, and Renee Marshall, Administrator, from the Professional Services Division.

### **3F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Davis shared information about a grant launched by the National Board Resource Center at Stanford (NBRC) and the California Teachers Association (CTA) to support Black, Indigenous, and People of Color (BIPOC) teachers across the state of California to earn National Board Certification and serve as teacher-leaders in their communities.

Commissioner Browne provided an update about the Community Colleges recent activities.

Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo spoke about her experience with teaching ethnic studies and the feedback she received from her students.

### **3G: Liaison Reports**

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, reported on her attendance at the State Board's September 2022 meeting.

Commissioner White-Smith stated that 74 percent of AICCU's institutions are Hispanic serving or emerging Hispanic serving institutions and half of AICCU's undergraduates are first generation college students. She acknowledged her colleagues that have developed Spanish and English dual language programs in the area of school psychology as well as teacher preparation. She also shared that the California Council on Teacher Education Conference will be held in San Diego the week after the October Commission meeting. She announced that the University of San Diego School of Leadership and Education Sciences partnered with the San Diego Foundation and the Black Community Investment Fund to build a pathway of excellence for black students in the San Diego region.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Acting Committee Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **4A: Proposed Adoption of Literacy Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations Pursuant to Senate Bill 488**

Nancy Brynelson, Roxann Purdue, and Heather Kennedy, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for review and adoption revised Literacy Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) for educator preparation programs leading to the following credentials: Multiple Subject, Single Subject, Education Specialist: Mild to Moderate Support Needs (MMSN) and Extensive Support Needs (ESN), and the proposed PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential, as required by SB 488.

**Kelly Reynolds, Early Edge California**, thanked the Commission for including stakeholder feedback to ensure multiple pathways into the ECE field and voiced the importance of including individuals with experience in early literacy and dual language learners on the Literacy performance assessment design team to ensure that multilingual learners are best served. She also suggested additional language emphasizing the use of the home language.

**Manuel Buenrostro, Californians Together**, spoke and submitted a written comment on the item which thanked the Commission and staff for incorporating stakeholder feedback within the proposed Literacy Program Standards and TPEs and suggested representatives of the Literacy performance assessment design team include individuals with expertise in teaching reading to English learners and multilingual students.

**Ajay Lucas, UNITE-LA**, submitted a written comment which thanked the Commission for its continued work on developing the infrastructure for the PK-3 credential and asked that the design team working on the Literacy Performance Assessment (LPA) include individuals with expertise and experience in teaching reading to dual language learners and English learners.

**Lori DePole and Megan Potente, Decoding Dyslexia**, submitted a written comment which commended the work done by Commission staff and the work group on the implementation of SB 488 and offered several recommended changes regarding the proposed Literacy Standards and TPEs.

**Luis Molina and Patricia Lozano, Early Edge California**, submitted a written comment which voiced support for the item and expressed that it is important that the literacy design team include individuals with experience in early literacy and dual language learners while developing LPAs. The letter also requested additional language emphasizing the use of the home language.

**Patricia Chavez, Sobrato Early Academic Learning**, submitted a written comment which expressed support for the item and asked that the design team that will work on the LPAs include individuals with expertise and experience in teaching reading to dual language learners and English learners.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Simmons moved to adopt the proposed Literacy Program Standards and TPEs for the Multiple Subject/Single Subject Credential, Education Specialist Credential, and Proposed PK-3 ECE Specialist Credential. Chair Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4B: Adoption of Teaching Performance Expectations and Program Standards for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential**

Phyllis Jacobson and Renee Marshall, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission adoption Program Preconditions, Program Standards, and Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education (ECE)

Specialist Instruction Credential. The proposed Program Preconditions, Program Standards, and Teaching Performance Expectations presented in this agenda item are intended to create new sections 80067.1, 80067.2, and 80067.3 respectively of Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations. This work is responsive both to the direction provided by the state's Master Plan for Early Learning and Care and to the need for additional ECE teachers to support the statewide Universal Transitional Kindergarten (UTK) implementation as called for in the Governor's budget.

**Deborah Stipek, Stanford University, and Megan Franke, University of California Los Angeles,** assisted staff in presenting this item.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

### **Commission Action**

Chair Sloan moved to adopt the proposed Literacy Program Standards and TPEs for the Multiple Subject/Single Subject Credential, Education Specialist Credential, and Proposed PK-3 ECE Specialist Credential with the modification to Precondition 3. Commissioner Heredia seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:07 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

### ***Friday, October 14, 2022***

### **General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:36 a.m. and roll call was taken.

### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Professional Practices Committee.

### **5A: Division of Professional Practices Annual Workload Report Fiscal Year 2021-22**

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided the annual report on the discipline workload of the Division of Professional Practices for Fiscal Year 2021-22.

### **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair David Simmons convened the Certification Committee.

**6A: Report to the Legislature on Credentialing Related to Educator Assignment Monitoring Pursuant to Assembly Bill 1219**

Erin Skubal, Director, and Anne Harris, Assignment Program Manager, Certification Division, presented this item in response to Education Code section 44258.9(k) which required the Commission to report to the Legislature, by December 1, 2022, details on the development of the California Statewide Assignment Accountability System (CalSAAS) and the results of assignment monitoring.

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, voiced concerns regarding the certification of CALPADS (California Pupil Achievement Data System) data and asked staff clarification questions regarding misassignment.

**Shilpa Ram, Public Advocates**, asked staff about the proposed timeline for monitoring described in Figure 28 of the agenda item. She questioned whether the Commission has considered or explored incentives to encourage local education agencies (LEAs) to comprehensively report their data and to do so with fidelity and asked if there is outreach that the California Department of Education and the Commission could do to encourage LEAs to report their data accurately and completely.

**Melissa Figueira, Education Trust-West**, thanked the Commission for its work to improve the state system for monitoring educator assignments. She encouraged the Commission and other state education leaders to act on the report's recommendations with urgency, beginning with clarifying and aligning statutory definitions for metrics across agencies and data sets, strengthening CALPADS reporting requirements and increasing accuracy of reporting actual assignments as well as improving the monitoring timeline to return results to districts within the same school year.

**Cindy Kazanis and Monique McWayne, California Department of Education**, submitted a written letter which voiced support for the item.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Gross moved to approve the Assembly Bill 1219 Report for transmittal to the Legislature with the modification for San Diego County in Appendix D. Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Acting Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**4B: Adoption of Teaching Performance Expectations and Program Standards for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential**

Chair Sloan and Commissioner Heredia withdrew the incorrect motion which was voted on previously.

**Commission Action**

Chair Sloan moved to adopt the proposed Preparation Program Preconditions, Program Standards, and Teaching Performance Expectations for the PK-3 ECE Specialist Instruction Credential and approve the language as new regulations to create Title 5 Regulation sections 80067.1, 80067.2, and 80067.3, respectively. This would include the proposed revision to Precondition 3 to mirror California Education Code 44320(a) and read, "Professional preparation, including student teaching, shall be made available in the upper division course offerings at all California public institutions of higher learning." Commissioner Simmons seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Gross was not present during the vote call.

**4C: Refinements to Stages II, III, and IV of the Initial Institutional Approval Process**

Poonam Bedi and Hart Boyd, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission consideration refinements to the Initial Institutional Approval Process for possible adoption.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to adopt the proposed refinements to Stages II, III, and IV of the Initial Institutional Approval process in Appendix A. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4D: Proposed Adoption of the Passing Score Standard for the Revised California Subject Examinations for Teachers, Multiple Subjects, Subtest III (CSET: MS, Subtest III)**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which described the standard setting process used to recommend preliminary passing scores for CSET: Multiple Subjects, Subtest III and presented preliminary passing score standards for potential adoption by the Commission.

**Erin Githens, California Teachers Association**, raised concerns regarding whether the assessment is a valid proxy for subject matter knowledge and if the Commission provided sufficient alternatives for candidates to show subject matter competency. She also questioned who is being excluded from the profession by this assessment as it relates to teacher quality.

**Ursula Estrada-Reveles, Riverside County Office of Education**, suggested the Commission adopt a passing rate at a negative 1.5 Standard Error of Measurement (SEM) for the CSET: MS, Subtest III.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Simmons moved to apply a negative 2 SEM to the passing score standard for the CSET: MS Subtest III and to revisit the passing score standard within a year. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Martinez was not present during the vote call.

#### **4E: Proposed Adoption of Passing Standard for the Education Specialist edTPA Performance Assessment**

David DeGuire, Director, Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, and Lori Kroeger, Senior Educational Consultant, Evaluation Systems group of Pearson, presented this item which provided for review and potential adoption a passing standard for the California Education Specialist edTPA performance assessment.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Heredia moved to adopt the following recommendations:

1. That the Commission establish the passing standard for initial implementation at 40 with the application of a -2.0 SEM, making the actual initial passing score 37.
2. That the Commission require the assessment sponsor to collect additional data during this first year of implementation, hold a new standard setting study in spring 2023, and submit an updated recommended passing standard to Commission staff in time to present to the Commission for action during their June 2023 meeting.
3. That the Commission retain the option of adjusting the passing score for the first operational year if the new standard setting study and impact data indicate a need.

Chair Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Martinez abstaining.

#### **Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Legislative Committee.

#### **7A: Status of Legislation**

Jonathon Howard, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of those legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

#### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

#### **3H: Interview and Recommendations of a Member to the Elementary Teacher Position, School Board Member Position, Public Member Position, and Alternate for the School Administrator Position for the Committee of Credentials**

Chair Sloan moved to accept the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee to 1) appoint Ebony Batiste to serve in the Elementary Teacher position, Lenora Gerber be appointed as the first Elementary Teacher alternate and Kimberly Cantrell as the second Elementary Teacher alternate on the Committee of Credentials; 2) appoint Suzan Solomon to serve in the School Board Member position on the Committee of Credentials; 3) appoint Jacqueline Rivera to serve in the Public Member position and Gina Plate be appointed as Public Member alternate on the Committee of Credentials; and 4) appoint Adrienne Peralta to serve as School Administrator alternate. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer was not present during the vote call.

### **3I: Report of Executive Committee**

Chair Sloan reported that the Executive Committee appointed Mers (Meryssa) Tran to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year effective immediately.

### **3K: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

### **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:56 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

### **3J: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reported that the Commission granted Stefanie Noorani's Petition for Reinstatement.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- David Acrea
- Anthony Guy (Commissioner de La Torre recused himself from this matter)
- David Gonzalez (Commissioner de La Torre recused himself from this matter)

The Commission adopted a Decision and Order in the following matters:

- Elia Cisneros
- Christian Hansen
- Lincoln Johnson
- Jon Keller
- Kristin Meadows

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Thomas Gutierrez. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

Commissioners Michael de la Torre and Annamarie Francois recused themselves from the Thomas Gutierrez matter.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Archer Nishioka. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decisions in the matters of David Keck, Raul Martin, Jose Ortiz, Charles So and Jamil Wells, and called for the transcripts.

The Commission discussed consent calendar items #13. Lawrence Brown III and #16. Jesus Caro, and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #25. Christine Flores and #36. Elizabeth Kahf and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 4:07 p.m.

## Appendix A

### Adoption of Teaching Performance Expectations and Program Standards for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential

	Name	Affiliation	Written/Oral Statement
1	Melissa Figueira	Education Trust-West	Oral
2	Manuel Buenrostro	California Together	Oral/Written
3	Jan Fish	California State University Northridge/PEACH	Oral
4	Kelly Reynolds	Early Edge California	Oral
5	Nancy Hurlbut	Cal Poly Pomona/PEACH/CA EC Baccs	Oral
6	Todd Collins	California Reading Coalition	Oral
7	Denise Kennedy	Cal Poly Pomona/PEACH	Oral/Written
8	Lori DePole	Decoding Dyslexia California	Oral
9	Steven Propheter	California Department of Education	Oral
10	Harold Acord	California Teachers Association	Oral
11	Maeva Marc	Kidango	Oral/Written
12	Jessica Sawko	Children Now/California STEM Network	Oral/Written
13	Kareem Weaver	Self	Oral
14	Megan Franke	University of California Los Angeles	Oral
15	Rachel Hurd	Self	Oral
16	Tony Ayala	PEACH	Oral
17	Megan Potente	Decoding Dyslexia California	Oral
18	Liza Finkelstein	Self	Oral
19	Kathy Sun & Kathy Stoehr	Santa Clara University	Written
20	E. Toby Boyd	California Teachers Association	Written
21	JunHee Doh	Catalyst California	Written
22	Ajay Lucas	UNITE-LA	Written
23	Luis Monila	Early Edge California	Written
24	Kim Bambao	San Mateo County Office of Education	Written
25	Patricia E. Chavez	Sobrato Early Academic Learnin	Written
26	Elena Montoya/Lea Austin/Hopeton Hess	University of California, Berkeley	Written
27	Cathy Humphreys	Self	Written
28	Kyndall Brown	California Mathematics Project	Written
29	Carolyn Pfister	Self	Written
30	Linda Platas	San Francisco State University	Written
31	Philip Halperin & Steven Kellner	California Education Partners	Written

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the November 18, 2022 Meeting

---

### Commission Members Attending

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative  
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative  
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California (10/13 only)  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative  
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative

### Commission Members Absent

Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative  
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU)

### *Friday, November 18, 2022*

#### General

Chair Sloan convened the General Session of the November 18, 2022 Closed Session meeting at 3:04 pm. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

#### Recess

#### Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 3:09 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats, and Debra Sather v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing (Case C092001, Court of Appeal for the Third Appellate District)* pursuant to California Government Code section 11126.

**Reconvene General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

**Report of Closed Session Item**

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats, and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* and no reportable action was taken.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 4:06 p.m.