

---

# 3A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the August 2022 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the August 2022 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the August 2022 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

#### *III. Communication and Engagement*

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the August 25-26, 2022 Meeting

---

---

### Commission Members Attending

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community Colleges  
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative  
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative  
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative  
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative  
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative (8/25 only)  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative  
Kimberly White-Smith, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU)

### Commission Members Absent

None

### *Thursday, August 25, 2022*

#### General Session

Chair Tine Sloan convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:58 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Sloan welcomed Marquita Grenot-Scheyer as the new Public member and Shireen Pavri as the new Ex Officio member representing the California State University to the Commission. Chair Sloan also thanked Student Liaison Adriana Baez for her service to the Commission.

#### 1A: Approval of the June 2022 Minutes

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer moved approval of the June 2022 Ad Hoc Committee meeting minutes. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Martinez moved approval of the June 2022 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Heredia seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Cardenas, Cruz, and Davis abstaining.

**1B: Approval of the August 2022 Agenda**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the August 2022 Agenda with an agenda insert for item 1C and a revised agenda item 3A. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**1C: Approval of the August 2022 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the August 2022 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 40. Roman Martinez, 55. Clement Satcher, 59. Daniel Stidham, 65. Sherman Gardin, and 82. Raymond Beltran to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Cardenas seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Gross abstaining from item 13. Jaclyn Capie; Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo recused herself from items 24. Megan Dukes, and 53. Saeid Safadoost; and Commissioner de la Torre recused himself from items 3. Sean Baggett, 17. Diane Corey, 22. Brigit Diza, 35. Ernesto, Higuera, 63. Michelle Anderson, 64. Rimaayne Bowman, 65. Sherman Gardin, 66. George Mclin, 68. Benjamin Patapoff, and 71. Christopher Cerbone.

**Susan Green, California Faculty Association**, submitted a written comment which thanked the Commission for the proposed updates to Commission-adopted standards for the purpose of replacing the term “stakeholder” throughout with acceptable terminology and offered the Ethnic Studies and Teacher Preparation faculty’s consultation on the most current scholarship, language, and practices in their fields.

**1D: Chair’s Report**

Chair Sloan provided a brief overview of the August 2022 Commission meeting agenda.

**1E: Executive Director’s Report**

Executive Director Sandy welcomed Marquita Grenot-Scheyer and Shireen Pavri to the Commission. She notified the public of the vacancies on the Committee of Credentials and the vacancy for the Educator Preparation Student Liaison position. Executive Director Sandy also spoke about the work that needs to be completed this fiscal year.

**1F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Browne expressed her appreciation regarding the Commission offering flexibility for student teaching. She provided an update regarding the work by community colleges on developing early childhood apprenticeship programs and expressed her excitement about the work that the Commission and Legislature are doing to support the PK-3 credential.

Commissioner Klatt reported on her attendance at a National Endowment for the Humanities residential seminar this summer.

Commissioner Pavri shared three initiatives that are underway in the CSU's Educator and Leadership Programs Division.

Commissioner Jackson notified the public that the California Department of Education (CDE) is seeking applications for the Anti-bias Education Grant Program. She highlighted the success of the National Board Subsidy and Incentive Program and notified the public that CDE will be seeking applications for the second cohort of this program next month.

Commissioner White-Smith offered the private and non-profit colleges and universities as a partner to participate fully in solving the issue of providing diverse students and teachers for schools in California.

Commissioner Francois provided an update on the work of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century California School Leadership Academy. She reported that Alameda County Office of Education and UCLA Center for Community Schooling were recently awarded the California Community Schools State Transformative Assistance Center Grant. She also spoke briefly about the work of the Community Partnerships for Teacher Pipeline.

Commissioner Cardenas spoke about the excitement of students returning to school and raised concerns regarding teacher shortages and the decrease in student enrollment. He provided an update on his recent activities at various events and conferences and expressed the importance of having connections with students and each other. He also spoke about AB 2508 which addresses student mental health and, urged everyone to continue to collaborate and work together to support students, teachers, administrators, nurses, school psychologists, classified staff, and everyone in education.

### **1G: Liaison Reports**

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, reported on her attendance at the State Board's July 2022 meeting. She thanked Commission staff for partnering with CDE on the recent data release on teacher assignment and shared two recently published commentaries by State Board President Linda Darling-Hammond on literacy in EdSource.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **2A: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for Gateway High School**

Michele Williams-George, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Gateway High School's responses to the Common Standards and Program Preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional Approval by the Commission.

**Aaron Watson and Donna Scarlett, Gateway High School**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to grant Provisional Approval to Gateway High School and set the Provisional Approval period to be three years. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2B: Discussion and Potential Adoption of Proposed Precondition Changes Related to the Subject Matter Competence Requirement**

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Jake Shuler, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission consideration and potential action proposed revised language for the Preliminary Multiple Subject, Single Subject, and Education Specialist program preconditions to align with the changes in California Education Code sections 44259 and 44282 that resulted from passage of Assembly Bill 130 in 2021.

**Nancy Hurlbut, CA EC Baccs Coordinating Team**, submitted a written comment which raised concerns about child development/early childhood majors not being recognized as approved subject matter areas for the Multiple Subject Credential. She thanked Professional Services Division Director David DeGuire for his quick response and willingness to work on these raised concerns.

**Jan Fish, California State University Northridge/PEACH**, requested the Commission to consider a baccalaureate program in child development and early childhood education as part of the subject matter areas for the Multiple Subject Credential.

**Donna Cecil, San Diego Mesa College/CCCECE**, voiced her support of the written comments submitted by PEACH and the CA EC Baccs Coordinating Team and thanked Mr. DeGuire for reaching out to collaborate with them.

**Denise Kennedy, Cal Poly Pomona/PEACH**, also expressed her appreciation to Mr. DeGuire and suggested that a child development/early childhood education representative be included on the Commission in the near future.

**Jessica Sawko, Children Now**, voiced support of this item.

**Rebekah Harris, Azusa Pacific University**, submitted a written comment which requested the Commission to work with relevant partners to investigate expanding paragraph B of Multiple Subject and Single Subject Precondition 6 and Education Specialist Precondition 3 to allow undergraduate teacher candidates in integrated bachelor's credential programs that are not integrated with a Commission-approved subject matter preparation program to be allowed to satisfy a minimum of four-fifths of an academic degree major in the subject area of the credential area being sought prior to beginning daily whole class instruction.

**Toni Isaacs, PEACH**, submitted a written comment which raised concerns regarding not having child development and early childhood as subject matter areas for the Multiple Subject

Credential. She offered their support to move forward and re-imagine education to support teacher preparation so that it meets the learning and development needs of all children.

**Sondra Moe, Rio Hondo College**, submitted a written comment which stated that Child Development/Early Childhood Education programs of study should be designated to meet the subject matter competence requirement for the Multiple Subject credential.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer moved to adopt the proposed revisions to:

- Multiple and Single Subject Precondition 5 and 6
- Education Specialist Precondition 2 and 3
- Multiple and Single Subject Intern Precondition 2
- Education Specialist Intern Precondition 2

Commissioner Gross seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2C: Update on the Development of Draft Literacy Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations Pursuant to Senate Bill 488**

Nancy Brynelson and Roxann Purdue, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for the Commission's review draft Literacy Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) for Multiple Subject, Single Subject, Education Specialist – Mild to Moderate Support Needs (MMSN) and Extensive Support Needs (ESN), and the proposed PK-3 Early Childhood Education (ECE) Specialist Instruction Credential. The draft Standards and TPEs are currently undergoing a field review, and the agenda item included a summary of early findings from the field. This item also presented an update on the work to implement Senate Bill 488 (Chap. 678, Stats. 2021).

**Eduardo Munoz-Munoz, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education (CABTE)**, submitted a written comment and spoke on this item which stated that it is essential that the new standards/TPEs are grounded on the assets-oriented ELA-ELD framework. He requested the Commission to affirm the elements of the standards/TPEs related to the specific needs of emergent bilingual students and suggested the Commission continue to place the teaching of foundational skills in the context of literacy instruction for meaning-making and bilingual language development.

**Sally Fox, California Association for Bilingual Education**, concurred with the written comments submitted by CABTE and Californians Together. She stated that English learner students need credentialed educators to fully understand the process of language acquisition and stressed that effective literacy development is part of a comprehensive approach that will lead bilingual learners and the state to a more prosperous future.

**Judith Reising**, spoke about the importance of foundational skills and requested the Commission to adopt the foundational skills exactly as documented in the standards and TPEs. She also asked the Commission to include a TPE which requires teacher candidates to know how to work with students with dyslexia or at risk with dyslexia.

**Manuel Buenrostro, Californians Together**, spoke and submitted a written comment on this item which supported literacy instruction that is comprehensive, integrated, and emphasizes all five of the language themes of foundational skills, meaning making, language development, effective expression, and content knowledge. He requested a continued focus on a comprehensive literacy approach that includes strategies to support students' home languages and asked that representatives of the literacy design team include individuals with expertise in teaching reading to English learners and multilingual students.

**Lori DePole, Decoding Dyslexia California**, agreed that one of the primary requirements of SB 488 was to incorporate the California Dyslexia Guidelines into teacher preparation program standards and TPEs and raised concerns regarding not having a single TPE that requires Multiple Subject, Single Subject, or PK-3 teachers to understand a structured literacy approach to instruction as outlined in the California Dyslexia Guidelines.

### **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:43 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, Consent Determinations, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, and 44248, Government Code sections 11126, 11517, and 11520, and Title 5, CCR section 80320.

### ***Friday, August 26, 2022***

### **General Session**

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:45 a.m. and roll call was taken.

### **Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

### **3A: Update on the Enacted 2022-23 Budget**

Sara Saelee, Manager, and Brigid Hanson, Director, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Enacted 2022-23 budget that relate to the Commission.

### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Professional Practices Committee.

### **4A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

### **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair David Simmons convened the Certification Committee.

### **5A: Proposed Regulations Pertaining to Credential Requirements for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential**

Erin Skubal, Director, Certification Division, presented this item which provided for potential adoption by the Commission the proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations section 80067 pertaining to the credential requirements for updating the Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer moved to adopt the proposed regulations pertaining to the credential requirements for updating the Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential with the following amendments so staff can submit the rulemaking packet to the Office of Administrative Law.

- Section (d) (1) on page 5A-10
  - (A) Either 1) hold a valid Child Development Permit at the Teacher level or higher, or 2) verify employment as a lead teacher in a Head Start program, or 3) verify employment as a lead teacher in a childcare and development center serving preschool-aged children.
- On page 5A-11
  - (iii) Lead teacher means an adult who has direct responsibility for the care and development of children from birth to 5 years of age in a center-based early childhood care setting, and serves in a teaching capacity with 3 and/or 4 year olds.
- Section (h) on page 5A-12
  - (2) For the clear credential candidate that has met the requirement in section (b)(2)(i), submission of a formal online recommendation including submission of an application as defined in section 80002; the processing fee as specified in section 80487(a)(1); and fingerprint clearance as specified in section 80442.
  - (3) For the clear credential candidate that has met the requirement in section (b)(2)(ii), the candidate may apply directly to the commission by submitting an application as defined in section 80002; the processing fee as specified in section 80487(a)(1); and fingerprint clearance as specified in section 80442.

Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Chair Sloan was not present during this item.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Commissioner Martinez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.



**2D: Revisiting CalAPA Standard Setting Study Findings and Passing Score Recommendations**

Gay Roby, Consultant, Professional Services Division, Amy Reising, Chief Deputy Director, and Heather Klesch, Vice President, Educator Solutions for Licensing and Learning at Evaluation Systems group of Pearson, presented this item which provided (a) an update on the development and implementation of the California Administrator Performance Assessment (CalAPA); (b) foundational information about the standard setting process for Commission examinations and assessments with recommendations for revising the passing score standard for the CalAPA, including an implementation date for any changes made to the passing standard scores; (c) information and timeline describing how the Commission and its technical contractor Evaluation Systems group of Pearson (ES) will continue supporting Preliminary Administrative Services Credential (PASC) programs in the fifth year of operational administration, 2022-23.

**Mari Gray, California State University East Bay**, spoke in support of the passing score recommendations of the standard setting panel and thanked Commission staff for their collaborative work and consistent support for developing an authentic assessment for education leaders. She asked the Commission to continue to consider the context in which aspiring administrators work to conduct the CalAPA cycles and taking into consideration what leading for more equitable student outcome looks like in diverse settings.

**Tonikiaa Orange, University of California Los Angeles and University of California Berkeley**, submitted a written letter and spoke on this item which supported the final recommendations of the standard setting panel for the academic year beginning on July 1, 2023. She raised concerns regarding the data that was provided in the item and suggested strategies for preventing disproportionate pass rates and for going beyond the current implicit bias training. The letter also requested the Commission to develop a timeline for seeking key expert input related to improvements to the CalAPA.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner de la Torre moved to accept the passing score recommendations of the standing setting panel listed in Table 6 on page 2D-9 for the academic year beginning on July 1, 2023. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Chair Sloan was not present during this item.

The Commission further directed staff to continue to collect and study candidate data and return in two years to consider future revisions to the passing standards and potential side conditions.

**2E: Education Specialist Teaching Performance Assessments: Review and Potential Approval of edTPA and FAST**

David DeGuire, Director, and Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division presented this item which provided for the Commission's potential approval the edTPA and Fresno Assessment of Student Teachers (FAST) teaching performance assessments for the Mild to Moderate Support Needs (MMSN) and Extensive Support Needs (ESN) credential areas of

emphasis. The item also provided a description of each performance assessment and the model sponsors' plans for conducting standard setting studies.

**Nicole Merino and Ray Pecheone, Stanford Center for Assessment, Learning, and Equity (SCALE); Juliet Wahleithner, Fresno State University; and Lori Kroeger, Evaluation Systems group of Pearson**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Susan Green, California Faculty Association**, submitted a written comment which opposed high stakes testing as a method of assessing teacher candidates.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Davis moved to approve the Special Education edTPA (MMSN and ESN) for California, the Fresno Assessment of Student Teachers – Mild to Moderate (FAST: ES-MMSN), and the Fresno Assessment of Student Teachers – Extensive Support Needs (FAST: ES-ESN) as having met the requirements laid out in the Commission's Assessment Design Standards and direct the sponsors to conduct standard setting studies for their assessments. Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reconvened the General Session

### **2F: Annual Report on Passing Rates of Commission-Approved Examinations from 2016-17 to 2020-21**

This item was tabled to a future Commission meeting. The following public comments were provided to the Commission:

**Shilpa Ram, Public Advocates**, raised concerns regarding the gaps in education in conjunction with differences in exam scores among subgroups and the considerable differences in the initial and cumulative pass rates for several subgroups. She also suggested the Commission have staff look more closely at the exam pass rate data to provide test related career counseling and examine the impact and quality of any financial test preparation and/or emotional support that candidates may receive to help them pass a given test.

**Rebecca Harris, Azusa Pacific University**, submitted a written comment which requested the Commission to investigate the possibility of expanding the privacy policy for test participation to allow use of background information that examinees provide to include analysis to inform program sponsor support, advice, and assistance, and thereby consider allowing program sponsors to access demographic information in Results Analyzer.

**Sarah Lillis, Teach Plus California**, submitted a written comment which requested a subsequent report, made public, that details the ways in which the Bias Review Committee has mitigated testing bias and further examination on the exam passing rate as it relates to the CPACE.

**Susan Green, California Faculty Association**, submitted a written comment which thanked the Commission for collecting and reporting the data to continue a conversation on the validity of testing as a gatekeeping event for the profession and raised concerns regarding the gaps in pass rates based on race/ethnicity.

## **2I: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

### **Audience Presentations**

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, spoke about the concept of literacy in the United States and requested the Commission to think about and determine the requirements for literacy.

**Anne Wolff**, spoke and submitted a written comment that proposed that a student educator stipend program be created.

**James Corcoran**, submitted a written comment which provided a brief overview regarding his case and the formal review of his credential.

**Sarah Lillis, Teach Plus California**, submitted a written comment which raised concerns about the delay in the adoption of the new California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP).

## **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:10 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, Consent Determinations, and transcript reviews in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, and 44248, Government Code sections 11126, 11517, and 11520, and Title 5, CCR section 80320.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reconvened the General Session.

### **1H: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reported that the Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Amanda Nunes
- Sheena West
- Hannah Silvers

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- James Davis Jr.
- Lamar Sally - Commissioner de La Torre recused himself on this item

- Kim Balque - Commissioner de La Torre recused himself on this item

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Charles Drouaillet.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the following matters, and a Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

- Elia Cisneros
- Christian Hansen
- Lincoln Johnson
- Jon Keller
- Kristin Meadows

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Bernardo Lopez
- Elizabeth Flores

The Commission rejected the following Proposed Decisions and called for the transcript:

- Thomas Gutierrez - Commissioner de La Torre recused himself on this item
- Archer Nishioka
- Kurt Wilkins

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials:

- #59 Daniel Stidham
- #65 Sherman Gardin - Commissioner de La Torre recused himself on this item

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item for #82 Raymond Beltran and granted the application.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

- #40 Roman Martinez
- #55 Clement Satcher

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo adjourned the meeting at 4:08 p.m.

## Appendix A

### Proposed Regulations Pertaining to Credential Requirements for the PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
1	Harold Acord	California Teachers Association	Oral
2	Renee Marshall	California Community Colleges	Oral
3	Samantha Thompson	Education Trust-West	Oral
4	Luis Molina	Early Edge California	Oral
5	Elena Montoya	Center for the Study of Child Care Employment	Oral/Written
6	Jessica Sawko	Children Now	Oral
7	Hopeton Hess	Center for the Study of Child Care Employment	Oral
8	Manuel Buenrostro	Californians Together	Oral/Written
9	Jan Fish	California State University Northridge/PEACH	Oral
10	Donna Cecil	San Diego Mesa College/CCCTE	Oral
11	Eden Haywood-Bird	Cal Poly Pomona	Oral
12	Soon Young Jang	Cal Poly Pomona	Oral
13	Nancy Hurlbut	CA EC Baccs	Oral/Written
14	Toni Isaacs	PEACH	Written
15	Sondra Moe	Rio Hondo College	Written
16	Toby Boyd	California Teachers Association	Written