

---

# 1A

## Action

### *General Session*

### **Approval of the June 2021 Ad Hoc Minutes and the August 2021 Minutes**

---

**Executive Summary:** The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the June 2021 Ad Hoc Committee meeting and the August 2021 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** That the Commission approve the minutes of the June 2021 Ad Hoc Committee meeting and the August 2021 Commission meeting.

**Presenter:** None

### **Strategic Plan Goal**

#### ***III. Communication and Engagement***

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the June 16, 2021 Ad Hoc Committee Meeting

---

---

### Commission Members Attending

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair

Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair

Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

***Wednesday, June 16, 2021***

### Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 1:02 p.m. and roll call was taken.

### **1A: Interview and Recommendation of Members and Alternates to the Public Member, School Administrator, and Secondary Teacher Positions for the Committee of Credentials**

Katie Elliott, Attorney, Legal Office, presented this item which provided information about the selection process for appointments to the Committee of Credentials.

**Jannis Wilson, Escondido Union High School District**, submitted a written comment which requested the Commission to reappoint the three members of the Committee of Credentials whose terms would be ending on June 30, 2021.

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

#### *Secondary Teacher*

- Judithanne Gollette
- Kevin Kung
- Jacqueline Sparrow

#### *School Administrator*

- Tammy Patten
- Franklin "Brent" Tilley
- Amanda Wade

#### *Public Member*

- Allison Leggett
- Denise Payne

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Wall moved to recommend to the full Commission the appointment of Kevin Kung to serve in the Secondary Teacher position on the Committee of Credentials.

Commissioner Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Sloan moved to recommend Jacqueline Sparrow be appointed as a Secondary Teacher alternate on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Sloan moved to recommend to the full Commission the appointment of Franklin “Brent” Tilley to serve in the School Administrator position on the Committee of Credentials.

Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Wall moved to recommend Tammy Patten be appointed as a School Administrator alternate on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Wall moved to recommend to the full Commission the appointment of Denise Payne to serve in the Public Member position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Sloan moved to recommend Allison Leggett be appointed as a Public Member alternate on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Committee Chair De La Torre-Escobedo adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 5:12 p.m.

## **Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the August 5-6, 2021 Meeting**

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative  
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative

### **Commission Members Absent**

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

### ***Thursday, August 5, 2021***

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy started the August 5-6, 2021 Commission meeting at 9:03 a.m. and roll call was taken.

### **1A: Nomination and Election for Chair Pro Tempore for the August 5-6, 2021 Commission Meeting**

Mary Vixie Sandy, Executive Director, presented this item which provided information regarding the election of a Chair Pro Tempore (Pro Tem) to serve as the presiding officer at the August 5-6, 2021 Commission meeting due to the absences of Chair Tine Sloan and Vice Chair Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Simmons moved to appoint Commissioner Cooney to serve as the Chair Pro Tempore for the August 5-6, 2021 meeting. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Cooney abstaining.

### **General Session**

Chair Pro Tem Cooney convened the General Session of the August 5-6, 2021 Commission meeting. Chair Pro Tem Cooney announced that Ex-Officio members were selected in advance

in the following order: 1) Annamarie Francois, 2) Kathryn Brown, and 3) Marquita Grenot-Scheyer to serve as voting members for the purpose of maintaining a quorum during the meeting.

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

**2A: Approval of the June 2021 Minutes**

Chair Pro Tem Cooney announced that the approval of the June 2021 Ad Hoc Committee minutes would be delayed until the October 2021 Commission meeting due to the absence of the Ad Hoc Committee members.

Commissioner Jackson moved approval of the June 2021 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2B: Approval of the August 2021 Agenda**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the August 2021 Agenda with a revised agenda item 6A. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2C: Approval of the August 2021 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the August 2021 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 34. Cody Shelton, 35. Dakota Shelton, 36. Shane Shelton, and 40. Angel Tejada to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Cardenas recused himself from item 5. Michael Bender.

**2D: Chair's Report**

Chair Pro Tem Cooney acknowledged Commissioner Klatt's absence due to the fire near Colfax. He also shared details regarding the absences of Chair Sloan and Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo.

**2E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy wished teachers, students and their families, school administrators, school counselors and nurses, school librarians, and all other school staff the very best during the uncertainty of current conditions as schools are getting ready to reopen. She encouraged everyone do their best and make the most of this optimistic moment at this point of time in the year.

**2F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Francois expressed her appreciation for the love and support that she received from the Commission and others in the field after the passing of her mother. She shared her excitement about the higher education segments trying to solve the pervasive problems around equity and leadership that the state has been challenged by for decades. She reported on the work of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century California School Leadership Academy; spoke about the importance of the University of California's role in teacher education to improve teacher and leader quality, student achievement, student learning and school transformation; and expressed her excitement about the state's commitment to bilingual education.

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer shared information about a new grant that the California State University (CSU) has received from the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation to establish the CSU Center for Transformational Educator Preparation Programs (CTEPP) to strengthen the recruitment, preparation, and retention of Black, Indigenous, and other teachers of color to serve California's diverse students and families.

Commissioner Browne spoke about the community colleges' excitement regarding the work that's been done around early childhood education. She shared information about the collaboration between the community colleges and CSU to encourage the teacher pipeline, particularly for Black students, people of color and women, and to have an affordable teacher preparation pathway that is also streamlined so students can easily move from the community college systems into the CSU system.

### **2G: Liaison Reports**

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, provided a brief update on the State Board's recent activities on educator quality. She congratulated Michael Kirst, former president of the California State Board of Education, for being the 2021 recipient of the James Bryant Conant Award in recognition of his unwavering commitment to improving school finance systems to serve students more equitably.

Kori Jones, Commission Student Liaison, applauded all the students, parents and families for taking on the challenge of getting acclimated back to school and offered her prayers and encouragement to all interns, student teachers, educators and teachers who are staying the course. She provided an update regarding the workshop that she conducted with the California Teachers Association Student Liaison about the pathways to becoming an educator.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **3A: Adoption of Subject Matter Requirements and Teaching Performance Expectations for Art, Music, and Multiple Subjects to Align with the 2019 California Arts Standards for Public Schools**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided revised draft Subject Matter Requirements (SMRs) for Art, Music, and Multiple Subjects Subtest III for potential adoption by the Commission.

**Vanessa** submitted a written comment which asked staff questions regarding the courses needed to fulfill CSET multiple subject requirements.

**Angie** submitted a written comment which asked staff questions regarding the new CSET waiver requirement.

**Nicoleta Bateman, California State University San Marcos**, submitted a written comment which raised concerns regarding the acceptance of a B.A. degree in Liberal Studies as evidence of meeting Subject Matter Requirements for Multiple Subjects.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner de la Torre moved to adopt revised Subject Matter Requirements for Art, Music and Multiple Subjects Subtest III, as presented in this agenda item. Commissioner Heredia seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **3B: Determination of Passing Scores for the Reading Instruction Competence Assessment Subtests**

Cara Mendoza, Administrator, and David DeGuire, Director, Professional Services Division, and Heather Klesch, Evaluation Systems group of Pearson, presented this item which provided information for the Commission's consideration to determine the passing scores for the new Reading Instruction Competence Assessment (RICA) subtests.

**Grace Allen, Public Advocates**, thanked the Commission for the work on gathering data to determine the passing score of the new RICA subtests. She raised concerns that the nature and quality of the content have remained unchanged and that there continues to be low and disparate pass rates among teacher candidates of color. She asked questions regarding a possible timeline for when the new and reconfigured RICA would be operational and about the registration fee for taking the three subtests.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Cardenas moved to approve the passing scores for the new RICA subtests as listed on page 3B-5 of this item. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **3C: Update on the Progress to Revise the Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations**

Iyore Osamwonyi, Assistant Consultant, and Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the progress to revise the Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and draft Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations.

**Martha Hernandez, California Together**, submitted a written comment which voiced support for the draft Bilingual Authorization Program Standards.

**Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Education**, submitted a written comment which agreed with the panel's recommendation of 20 hours of field work and voiced support for the flexibility opportunities outlined for candidates to practice teaching in the language other than English.

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, asked questions and raised concerns regarding the requirement of 20 hours of field experience and requested the Commission to refine this component to reduce the potential barriers and obstacles created for teachers seeking a bilingual authorization.

**Shilpa Ram, Public Advocates**, asked the Commission about the concerted efforts in place to increase the number of teacher preparation programs that offer bilingual authorization.

**3D: Update on the Work of the Early Childhood Education Design Teams under the Preschool Development Grant-Renewal and Proposed Program Quality Peer Review Process**

Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Cassandra Henderson and Debra Keeler, Consultants, Professional Services Division, Amy Reising, Chief Deputy Director, and June Millovich, CAP Co-Director and Faculty Member, Saddleback Community College, presented this item which provided an update on the work accomplished to date by the Early Childhood Education (ECE) Teaching Performance Assessment and the Program Quality Peer Review Design Teams under the Preschool Development Grant-Renewal (PDG-R) and presented the proposed Program Quality Peer Review process developed by the Peer Review Design Team. The item reported on activities of both Design Teams during the six-month period since the most recent update to the Commission in February 2021 and discussed next steps in this work as well as related work in alignment with the state's Master Plan for Early Learning and Care relative to the Child Development Permit and implementation of universal transitional kindergarten.

**Ayumi Nagase, Sonoma State University; Jan Fish, CSU Northridge; Linda Platas, San Francisco State University; Nancy Hurlbut, Cal Poly Pomona; and Sharon Seidman, CSU Fullerton,** submitted a written letter which raised questions and concerns regarding the ECE Teaching Performance Assessment and the Program Quality Review Design Teams' process and requested the Commission's careful consideration and clarity on which teachers will be expected to use the ECE Teaching Performance Assessment or CalTPA to demonstrate their competencies. The letter advocated that NAEYC (National Association of the Education of Young Children) higher education program accreditation be a recognized alternative for a program to receive Commission accreditation and suggested that the development of this system include equal leadership representation from all four California higher education systems.

**Jan Fish, CSU Northridge; Yolanda Carlos, Pacific Oaks College; Denise Kennedy, Cal Poly Pomona; Helen Davis, UCLA; Nancy Hurlburt, Cal Poly Pomona; and Laura Manson, Santa Monica College,** submitted a written letter which raised concerns and recommendations regarding the following issues:

1. Top-level leadership representation of all four California higher education sectors is necessary to the success of the Pilots;
2. To ensure equity and reflection of reality, the concept and scope of "student/candidate" in the Pilots needs to be inclusive of all who may apply for a Teacher Level Child Development Permit and the 2-year, 4-year and graduate programs and institution(s) where they pursue their education as well as reflective of current national recommendations for ECE Teacher Level professional preparation (TWB8; NAEYC);
3. Added financial and workload costs indicated by participants in the implementation Pilots and institutionalization of the CTC Pilot-related initiatives need to be identified and carefully considered now--during the process of the Pilots—including costs to the state, higher education institutions, ECE/CD preparation programs, participating administrators and faculty members, and individual student/candidates; and
4. Throughout the Pilots, we must periodically question, "What is the "value-added" of this work?" "What is lost and what is gained?"

**Jan Fish, CSU Northridge and PEACH**, urged the Commission to engage system level representatives from all four California higher education sectors in the pilots. She suggested that NAEYC Program Accreditation as an alternative accreditation for ECE preparation programs and requested the Commission to evaluate any costs for institutions and students associated with this work.

**Sondra Moe, Rio Hondo College**, suggested that the concept and scope of candidates in the pilots be inclusive to all who might apply for Child Development permits to ensure equity and a reflection of reality.

**Kelly Reynolds, Early Edge California**, supported the Commission's efforts to align the work with the recommendations in the Master Plan for early learning and care and move towards a competency-based teacher preparation system. She requested the Commission consider a P-3 approach that creates a streamlined teacher preparation process and aligned early learning system to expand TK to serve all four-year-olds while reviewing pathways to TK credentialing. She suggested that Early Edge California serve as a resource to the Commission and participate in stakeholder engagement related to the TK and state preschool credential pathways.

**Deborah Stipek, Stanford University**, spoke about the importance of the ECE performance expectations which serves as a clear guide for what higher education programs need to focus their attention on. She raised concerns regarding the 24 units required for the Child Development teacher permit and the kind of supervised practical experiences that are necessary to develop the skills described in the TPEs. She suggested that the Commission be advocates for significant changes in the permit requirements or develop a P-3 credential and become advocates for additional resources for higher education to improve the preparation of early childhood teachers.

**Carol Gossett, Fresno Pacific University**, requested the Commission to keep including private universities and four-year colleges in the process and suggested the Commission move the TPA information forward to those preparation programs who are in the pilots to better understand where to concentrate their efforts.

### **3E: Review and Proposed Adoption of the Revised Assessment Design Standards**

James Webb, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided revisions to the adopted Assessment Design Standards and requested that the Commission authorize the use of these updated standards in the recently approved regulatory changes with the requirement of a teaching performance assessment for Education Specialist credential candidates.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Jackson moved to adopt the changes and authorize the use of the new standards to reflect the full continuum of placements for preliminary credential candidates and the full age span from birth to 22. Commissioner Simmons seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

## **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 12:18 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Peter Heffner v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing (Los Angeles Superior Court, Case No. BS174007)*. The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, and Proposed Decisions in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

### **Friday, August 6, 2021**

### **General Session**

Chair Pro Tem Michael Cooney reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:33 a.m. and roll call was taken.

### **Executive Committee**

Chair Pro Tem Michael Cooney convened Executive Committee.

### **4A: Educator Preparation Student Liaison**

Hai Jue Theriault, Program Analyst, Executive Office, presented this item which provided information regarding the selection process for the Educator Preparation Student Liaison.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Martinez moved to appoint Adriana Baez to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year beginning October 1, 2021. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Monica Martinez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **3F: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District**

Michele Williams-George, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District's responses to the Common Standards and Program Preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional Approval by the Commission.

**Leslie Williams, Katherine Nissen, and Meghan Sutcliff, Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Hartwig moved to grant Provisional Approval to Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District and set the Provisional Approval period to be three years. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**3G: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage V: Consideration of Full Institutional Approval for High Tech High Graduate School of Education**

Erin Sullivan, Administrator, and Poonam Bedi, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, the report from the Provisional Site Visit for High Tech High Graduate School of Education and the Committee on Accreditation's recommendation for an accreditation decision for High Tech High Graduate School of Education.

**Sarah Fine, Kelly Wilson, and Hayley Murugesan, High Tech High Graduate School of Education,** assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Heredia moved to grant full approval to High Tech High Graduate School of Education with the requirement that the institution address all stipulations identified in the site visit team report within the time frame designated in the report and report back to the Committee on Accreditation for their further consideration and action. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**3H: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage V: Consideration of Full Institutional Approval for University of California, Merced**

Bob Loux, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, the report from the Provisional Site Visit for University of California, Merced and the Committee on Accreditation's recommendation for an accreditation decision for University of California, Merced.

**Jill Orcutt, Mari Harris, and Michael Pierick, University of California, Merced,** assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Martinez moved to grant full approval to University of California, Merced with the requirement that the institution address all stipulations identified in the site visit team report within the time frame designated in the report and report back to the Committee on Accreditation for their further consideration and action. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**3I: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage V: Consideration of Full Institutional Approval for Las Virgenes Unified School District**

William Hatrick and Michele Williams-George, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, the report from the Provisional Site Visit for Las Virgenes Unified School District and the Committee on Accreditation's recommendation for an accreditation decision for Las Virgenes Unified School District.

**Ryan Gleason, Las Virgenes Unified School District,** assisted staff in presenting this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner de la Torre moved to grant full approval to Las Virgenes Unified School District with the requirement that the institution address all stipulations identified in the site visit team report within the time frame designated in the report and report back to the Committee on Accreditation for their further consideration and action. Commissioner Cardenas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

#### **5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

**Brian Crowell**, submitted a written comment which requested the Commission to direct the Division of Professional Practices to include age, race, gender and credential area for persons referred to the Commission for discipline.

### **Legislative Committee**

Chair Pro Tem Michael Cooney convened the Legislative Committee.

#### **6A: Status of Legislation**

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

**Joanna Pineda**, submitted a written comment which asked staff a question about how soon other majors will be accepted for the preliminary credential.

**Jennifer Robles**, submitted a written comment which raised questions regarding the Trailer Bill (AB 130) about using an interdisciplinary major to waive the CSET requirement.

#### **6B: Bill Analysis**

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an analysis of AB 898 (Lee) which impacts the Commission's work. The analysis summarized current law, described the bill's provisions, and recommended amendments.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Hartwig moved to take an *Oppose Unless Amended* position on AB 898. Commissioner de la Torre second the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Pro Tem Cooney reconvened the General Session.

## **2H: Report of Executive Committee**

Chair Pro Tem Cooney reported that the Executive Committee appointed Adriana Baez to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year beginning October 1, 2021.

## **2I: Report of Closed Session Items**

Chair Pro Tem Cooney reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Peter Heffner v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Leonard Isenberg
- Brook Penca
- Samuel Smith

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Shawna Berlin and called for the transcript.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

- #34 Cody Shelton
- #35 Dakota Shelton
- #36 Shane Shelton
- #40 Angel Tejada

## **2J: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

## **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Pro Tem Cooney adjourned the meeting at 12:17 p.m.