

---

# 3C

## Information

### *Educator Preparation Committee*

### **Update on the Progress to Revise the Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations**

---

**Executive Summary:** This agenda item presents an update on the progress to revise the Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and draft Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations.

**Recommended Action:** For information only

**Presenters:** Iyore Osamwonyi, Assistant Consultant, and Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, Professional Services Division

#### **Strategic Plan Goal**

#### ***II. Program Quality and Accountability***

- b) Effectively and efficiently monitor program implementation and outcomes and hold all approved educator preparation programs to high standards and continuous improvement through the accreditation process.

---

# Update on the Progress to Revise the Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations

---

## Introduction

This item presents an update on the work to revise the Bilingual Authorization program standards and draft Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations (BTPEs) as well as updates on the collaborative discussions between Commission on Teacher Credentialing (Commission) staff and the Bilingual Authorization expert panel and stakeholder groups. A full list of the panel members and liaisons can be found in [Appendix A](#).

## Background

At the [June 2020](#) Commission meeting, staff presented an update on the work of the expert panel composed of bilingual educators, preparation program personnel, administrators, and liaisons from statewide advocacy groups who were tasked to review and recommend revisions to the program standards for the Bilingual Authorization. The panel was charged with making recommendations to the Commission for the following purposes:

- a. To update the pedagogical knowledge, skills, and abilities needed by individuals seeking a Bilingual Authorization. The set of updated knowledge, skills, and abilities recommended by the panel will, if adopted by the Commission, serve as the “Bilingual Authorization Teaching Performance Expectations,” or BTPEs.
- b. To update the set of program standards for the Bilingual Authorization, including clarifying and updating, as needed, expectations for fieldwork within Bilingual Authorization preparation programs.

At the [February 2021](#) Commission meeting, staff presented a proposed draft of the Bilingual Authorization program standards and new BTPEs for the Commission’s initial review. The Commission directed staff to conduct a field review of the proposed BTPEs and to seek additional input on the draft standards. Between February 2021 and July 2021, staff worked collaboratively with the panel members to solicit their input on aspects of the draft field experience program standard and BTPE survey feedback. Staff also met with the California Teachers Association (CTA) and California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education (CABTE). Each group shared their thoughts about the clinical practice component of the draft program standards presented in February 2021 and discussed how it might be revised to appropriately align with expectations for the authorization, and to ensure that requirements were feasible for both concurrent candidates (those earning a preliminary credential and a bilingual authorization at the same time) and teachers who already hold a multiple subject or single subject credential who seek to add the authorization.

## Fieldwork Requirement for Bilingual Authorization Candidates

The Commission’s February 2021 discussion focused on policy issues and implications raised with regard to the language in the proposed draft standards that called for some type of clinical

or field experience for candidates for a bilingual authorization. The draft language was based on the clinical practice standard for initial teaching credential programs which requires 600 hours. While the draft standard language for the bilingual authorization did not indicate a specific number of hours, it appeared that a full clinical practice would be expected of bilingual authorization candidates. Comments focused on how an extensive clinical practice requirement of 600 hours might force candidates seeking to add a bilingual authorization to an existing credential to step away from their current assignments for a full clinical practice experience. Additionally, similar concerns might also prevent veteran teachers from earning a bilingual authorization.

Further discussion with the expert panel, CTA, and CABTE resulted in clarification that the bilingual panel was not seeking to implement a full 600-hour clinical practice experience requirement similar to that of initial teaching credential candidates. Rather, the panel is seeking reasonable and flexible opportunities for candidates to practice teaching in the language other than English, and to demonstrate the content and concepts learned. The panel clarified that they envision this could be accomplished by candidates in approximately 20 hours of field experience. Field experiences with appropriate flexibilities (such as those listed below) could be feasible for both concurrent and sequential bilingual candidates. During meetings with the BILA panel, it was noted that relationships between the partner school districts and the Bilingual Authorization program will be essential to ensure field experiences are available for all bilingual authorization candidates.

The panel and stakeholders provided a number of examples of opportunities for field experiences that could be effective for all bilingual candidates. Examples of field experiences for candidates include:

- Virtual teaching options where the preparation program collaborates with local bilingual education programs and/or heritage language programs/schools in the local community to develop lessons on virtual platforms.
- Designed experiences to practice within flexible times, synchronously or asynchronously, including classroom observations of bilingual education classrooms.
- Video comparative analysis of bilingual education classrooms to include a focus on literacy development of L1 (first language) and L2 (second language), biliteracy, cross-language transfer, use of language of instruction, code-switching, code-mixing, translanguaging in content area learning, assessment for TK-12 student learning, and assessment for candidate teaching effectiveness.
- Focused conversations (virtual or in person) with certificated bilingual teachers about their own practice and program challenges, including, but not limited to, a focus on dual language classroom management, language and literacy assessment, and content area learning assessment.
- Veteran teachers may complete a field experience within their own classroom.
- Participation in school and district committees, district level activities, leadership teams, professional associations, and professional learning relating to dual language learning, bilingual literacy, and bilingual education theory and practice.

In addition, a concurrent candidate's field experience might be embedded within their preliminary preparation program by placing the candidate in a bilingual instructional setting. Examples of how field experiences for these candidates could be implemented and examples of a range of feasible candidate field experiences could be included in the Bilingual Authorization Program Planning Questions (PPQs) that guide program sponsors as they design their bilingual authorization programs.

### **Survey on Draft Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations**

As noted above, the panel was also charged with reviewing the knowledge, skills, and abilities needed by individuals seeking a bilingual authorization. If adopted by the Commission, these panel recommendations would serve as the new Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations (BTPEs). A draft of the BTPEs was presented at the February 2021 Commission meeting for discussion. As developed, the BTPEs build upon the universal TPEs required for multiple and single subject candidates and address competencies based in specialized knowledge required for bilingual teachers. The proposed draft BTPEs are organized by the six domains of the Commission's adopted Teaching Performance Expectations for Multiple Subject, Single Subject, and Education Specialist preliminary credentials:

1. Engaging and Supporting All Students in Learning
2. Creating and Maintaining Effective Environments for Student Learning
3. Understanding and Organizing Subject Matter for Student Learning
4. Planning Instruction and Designing Learning Experiences for All Students
5. Assessing Student Learning
6. Developing as a Professional Educator

In spring 2021, staff designed a survey for stakeholder review and input on the proposed BTPEs. The BTPE survey was open for feedback over a four-week period from March 19-April 16, 2021. The survey link was disbursed via the PSD e-News, as well as through program contacts from Commission-accredited bilingual authorization programs and members of, and liaisons to, the bilingual panel. Survey participants were asked to indicate their credential held, employer, and role within their institution. The survey feedback was reviewed and analyzed, and revisions to the BTPEs were made in response to the feedback received. Feedback indicated the majority of respondents agreed that the draft BTPEs appropriately align with the expectations of a beginning bilingual teacher. Feedback indicated that several BTPEs should be reviewed for clarity. Also, it was suggested that the terms within the BTPEs should be current and evaluated for appropriateness. Feedback also suggested that the BTPEs should recognize transnational students' experiences. For example, it was noted that there are many transnational students who receive part of their education in California and part in another country, and that it is important for educators to understand the transnational dimensions of the life of a student and their family.

Staff shared the BTPE survey results analysis with the panel and is working collaboratively to incorporate appropriate edits to the BTPEs based on survey and panel feedback. The revised draft BTPEs will be presented to the Commission with the proposed program standards revisions at its October meeting.

### **Policy Issue: Examination Route and Field Experience**

Teachers seeking a bilingual authorization have three options for obtaining the authorization:

- Completion of a Commission-accredited program;
- Taking and passing the three subtests of the California Subject Matter Examinations for Teachers (CSET) for target language proficiency (reading, writing, speaking, and listening), bilingual methodology, and culture; or
- Successfully completing a combination of coursework at a Commission-accredited program and passage of applicable CSET World Languages examination subtest(s).

During discussions with the panel, many panel members expressed strong beliefs that a field experience should also be required for candidates who earn the authorization by passing the approved CSET World Languages examinations. Staff informed the panel that the Commission does not have statutory authority to create additional requirements for examination candidates. The panel was also informed that this recommendation would require legislative action.

It is important to note that panel members urged the Commission to update the CSET exams required for the Bilingual Authorization to ensure that they are current. Commission leadership has met with members of CABTE and the expert panel to better understand issues related to the language and culture examinations. As the Commission considers future plans for evaluating and updating its current suite of subject matter examinations, it is anticipated that the language and culture examinations for the Bilingual Authorization will be addressed.

### **Next Steps**

Staff designed a survey on the proposed Bilingual Authorization program standards that includes changes to the field experience standard based on comments from the Commission at the February 2021 meeting, as well as discussions with stakeholders and the panel. The [survey](#) is now available for stakeholder input and will be open through the end of August 2021. The draft standards that are out for review can be found in [Appendix B](#). Survey results will be analyzed and shared with the panel for discussion. Staff will continue to work with the panel to consider the feedback received from the survey and incorporate any changes, as appropriate. Staff is planning to bring the proposed revised program standards and the revised draft Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations to the Commission's October meeting for consideration and possible adoption.

**Appendix A**  
**Bilingual Authorization Work Group Members**

**Liaisons from Statewide Advocacy Organizations**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Current Position</b>
Bradley Allen	Association of California School Administrators	Director, English Language Service Department, Twin Rivers Unified School District
Carolina Serna	Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities	Associate Professor, School of Education, Biola University
Agustín Amaro	California County Superintendent Educational Services Association	Learning Specialist, English Learners, Humboldt County Office of Education
Kati Bassler	California Federation of Teachers	English Learner Specialist, Salinas Union High School District
Fay Shin	California State University	Chair, Department of Teacher Education, CSU Long Beach
Chaz Garcia	California Teachers Association	Instructional Coach, Oakland Unified School District
Margarita Jimenez-Silva	University of California	Director of Teacher Education, Associate Professor, UC Davis

**Expert Panel Group Members**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Current Position</b>
Adam Sawyer	California State University, Bakersfield	Assistant Professor, Director of Liberal Studies, Coordinator of Bilingual Authorization
Ana Maria Flores	Sweetwater Union High School District	Retired Bilingual Teacher
Cheryl Forbes	UC San Diego	Director of Teacher Education
Claire Arias Kassir	San Diego Unified School District	English Language Instructional Resource Teacher
Eduardo Muñoz-Muñoz	San José State University	Assistant Professor, Bilingual Authorization Program Coordinator
Fernando Rodriguez-Valls	California State University, Fullerton	Professor, College of Education
Joanna Meadvin	Sobrato Early Academic Language	Program Coordinator
Magaly Lavadenz	Loyola Marymount University	Distinguished Professor of English Learner Research, Policy and Practice

<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Current Position</b>
		Executive Director, Center for Equity for English Learners
Michelle Soto-Peña	California State University, Stanislaus	Assistant Professor, Bilingual Education Advisor and Coordinator
Nilsa J. Thorsos	National University	Professor, Department of Special Education
Pilar Vargas	Sweetwater Union High School District	Assistant Principal, Montgomery High School
Soo Goda	Saddleback Valley Unified School District	Assistant Principal, Gates Elementary School
Tina Cheuk	California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo	Assistant Professor, Elementary Science Education
Vickie Teshin-Anderson	Santa Clara County Office of Education	Assistant Director, Charter Schools Department

#### **California Department of Education Liaisons**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Current Position</b>
Elena Fajardo	Administrator, Language Policy and Leadership
Lorrie Kelling	Consultant, Language Policy and Leadership

#### **Commission Staff to the Panel**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Division</b>
Miranda Gutierrez	Professional Services Division
Iyore Osamwonyi	Professional Services Division

## **Appendix B**

### **Proposed Draft Bilingual Authorization Program Standards**

#### **Standard 1: Program Design**

The bilingual teacher preparation program provides an explicit guiding statement of its philosophy, purpose, and rationale relating to bilingual education as a modality for teaching and learning, advancing the educational success of bilingual learners, and facilitating the effective participation of bilingual citizens within healthy schools and communities. Consistent with the elements of the program's guiding statement, the program's design of coursework and field experiences organized for candidates demonstrates (a) valuing the assets brought by students to the content and practice of bilingual education; (b) promoting policies, practices, and activities for faculty, staff, and candidates consistent with the ideals of racial and social justice; and (c) supporting equity, inclusion, and anti-racist practices in all aspects of the program.

The program's design is cohesive and effective in coordinating broader activities, services, and interactions between the program and its sponsoring institution. The program design of coursework and field experiences help provide candidates with a clear theoretical and practical understanding necessary to design and implement instruction that addresses the socioemotional, sociolinguistic, sociopolitical, and instructional needs of bilingual learners in a variety of bilingual instructional settings in California public schools.

The sponsoring institution demonstrates a high priority for the program by providing appropriate resources, support, and a demonstrated commitment to bilingual teacher preparation and bilingual education for students in California's public schools.

The roles of the program's leadership team are clearly delineated, and program leadership is provided by highly qualified faculty/staff with prior experience in a bilingual setting in California and/or the holding of a Bilingual Authorization (or the equivalent), or an advanced degree in bilingual/multicultural education or related field.

The program demonstrates initial, ongoing, and dynamic collaboration with LEAs that serve as sites for field experiences so that candidates have opportunities to apply concepts and knowledge as described in the Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations (BTPEs). The program ensures that candidates placed in bilingual settings within LEAs have sufficient language ability in both English and the target language, including but not limited to academic language of both English and the target language, to provide both effective content instruction and literacy instruction to all students in bilingual settings. The program ensures that candidates placed in bilingual settings within LEAs are knowledgeable about the types of bilingual programs being offered to K-12 students within the LEAs, as applicable (e.g., immersion, dual immersion, two-way bilingual, etc.) so that candidates are prepared to be effective in their field placements.

The program helps candidates make connections between the general education teaching performance expectations and the bilingual teaching performance expectations so that



candidates understand how these two sets of related competencies are reflected in both preparation and instructional practice with bilingual K-12 students in California public schools. The program's curriculum ensures that candidates are offered opportunities and ways to learn, practice, and be assessed on the BTPEs, as well as to understand the complex theoretical and practical theories of the bilingual field (e.g., language acquisition theory and practice, bilingual and multilingual instructional approaches and methodologies, cultural products and respect for cultural traditions, content instruction and assessment using more than one language as the medium of communication and assessment, etc.).

The design of the program provides candidate options for completion of the program in a concurrent model and/or as a post-credential model. The design also specifies how candidates will meet field experience requirements and program modality (e.g., distance, hybrid, and face-to-face) and how the program is responsive to local needs and current contextual conditions. For concurrent candidates, the program helps candidates transition to induction as appropriate, and to the opportunities for ongoing professional development in the field of bilingual education.

### **Standard 2: Preparing Candidates toward Mastery of the Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations (BTPEs)**

The Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations describe the set of professional knowledge, skills, and abilities (i.e., competencies) expected of bilingual and biliterate candidates in order to effectively educate and support all students in meeting the state-adopted academic standards.

The program's organized coursework and field experience provide opportunities for candidates to learn, apply, and reflect on each Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectation. As candidates progress through the program, pedagogical assignments are increasingly complex and challenging. The scope of the pedagogical assignments (a) addresses the BTPEs as they apply to bilingual teacher preparation, and (b) includes program-embedded candidate assessments that provide formative feedback to candidates relative to their progress in the program and towards meeting requirements for the authorization.

As candidates progress through the curriculum, faculty and other qualified mentors assess candidates' pedagogical performance in relation to the BTPEs and provide formative and timely performance feedback regarding candidates' progress toward mastering the BTPEs.

### **Standard 3: Field Experience**

The program demonstrates initial and ongoing collaboration with LEAs that serve as sites for field experiences so that candidates have opportunities to apply concepts and knowledge as described in the Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations. The program provides candidates with opportunities to apply bilingual pedagogies in practice in a bilingual setting through a bilingual system of support, as well as ongoing guidance and assistance by qualified and trained bilingual mentors to guide improvements in practice. The program provides candidates with experiences that are integrated into coursework and are aligned with the

BTPEs. Field experiences must consist of a minimum 20 hours of field experience across the arc of the bilingual authorization program.

#### **Standard 4: Monitoring, Supporting, and Assessing Candidate Progress towards Meeting Program Requirements**

Program faculty, program supervisors, and mentors monitor and support candidates during their progress towards mastering the BTPEs. Evidence regarding candidate progress and performance is used to guide advisement and assistance efforts. The program provides support and assistance to candidates and only retains candidates who make progress toward meeting program expectations and requirements for the authorization. Appropriate information, advice, and assistance is accessible to guide candidates' satisfaction of all program requirements in addition to mastering the BTPEs.

#### **Standard 5: Assessment of Candidate Competence**

Prior to recommending each candidate for a bilingual authorization, one or more persons responsible for the program determine on the basis of documented evidence that each candidate has demonstrated satisfactory performance on the full range of the Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations and language proficiency, prior to candidate application for the bilingual authorization. During the program, candidates are guided and coached on their performance in bilingual instruction using formative and summative coursework and fieldwork-embedded assessments. Evaluation as well as verification of each candidate's performance is provided by coursework, faculty, mentors, and program supervisors.

As part of assessing candidate competence and readiness for application for the credential, the program must verify that the candidate has attained a language proficiency level in listening, speaking, reading, and writing the target language that is equivalent to the passing standard on the appropriate CSET: World Languages language examination. The program creates clear guidelines by which the candidate will be assessed. Assessment of candidate language competency if conducted by the program rather than through the CSET examination should include the candidate's knowledge of academic language, instructional language, and content-specific language of the target language appropriate to the credential sought by each candidate.