
2A

Action

General Session

Approval of the April 2021 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the April 2021 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the April 2021 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the April 13-16, 2021 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University
Megan Gross, Teacher Representative
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative (4/14 Closed Session, 4/15 and 4/16)
Cynthia Marten, School Administrator Representative (4/14 Closed Session and 4/15 only)
Monica Martinez, Public Representative
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative (4/15 and 4/16 only)
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

Commission Members Absent

None

Tuesday, April 13, 2021

Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 3:01 p.m.

1A: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation

Cheryl Hickey and Erin Sullivan, Administrators, Professional Services Division, provided information about the finalists for open positions on the Committee on Accreditation (COA).

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

Postsecondary Finalists

- Sonia Arnak
- Robert Frelly

- Kristy Pruitt
- J. Kevin Taylor

K-12 Finalists

- Jason Lea
- MaryBeth Murray

Commission Action

Commissioner Hartwig moved to recommend Robert Frelly and J. Kevin Taylor be appointed to serve as postsecondary members on the COA. Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Wall moved to recommend Sonia Arnak and Kristy Pruitt be appointed to serve as alternates on the COA. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Wall moved to recommend Jason Lea be appointed to serve as a K-12 member on the COA. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Hartwig moved to recommend Marybeth Murry be appointed to serve as an alternate on the COA. Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Committee Chair Klatt adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 5:21 p.m.

Wednesday, April 14, 2021

General Session

Chair Tine Sloan convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:02 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

2A: Strategic Planning Session

Amy Reising, Acting Chief Deputy Director, and Mary Vixie Sandy, Executive Director, presented this item which provided a summary of issues and questions surfaced by Commissioners during the December 2020 strategic planning session and provided an opportunity for Commissioners to consider areas for further study and needed updates to its mission, vision, values, and goals for the next five years.

Lauren DeNoia, representing herself, submitted a written comment which requested the Commission to consider adding an authorization in Behavior Analysis to the Pupil Personnel Services credential.

Yelena, representing herself, raised concerns regarding the difficulties with completing credential requirements.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:11 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Juan M. Jaimes v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Second Appellate District, Division Seven, Case No. B291851) and *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Third Appellate District, Case No. C092001) and related cases pending administrative hearing. The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, transcript reviews, Decisions and Orders, and Proposed Decisions in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Thursday, April 15, 2021

General Session

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 9:02 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Chair Sloan welcomed Jose Cardenas, Michael de la Torre, Megan Gross and Susan Heredia as new members of the Commission and congratulated Commissioner Johanna Hartwig on her reappointment.

Chair Sloan honored Commissioner Kevin Kung whose term with the Commission has ended.

2B: Approval of the February 2021 Minutes

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the February 2021 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Heredia abstaining.

2C: Approval of the April 2021 Agenda

Commissioner Klatt moved approval of the April 2021 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 2A and 6B. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2D: Approval of the April 2021 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the April 2021 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw item 30. Elizabeth High to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marten recused herself from items 42. Mark Little, 59. John Prior, 65. Jose Soto, 80. Katharine Girvin and 85. Kenneth Pride.

2E: Chair's Report

Chair Sloan provided a brief overview of the April 2021 meeting agenda and summarized the work that was done during the Strategic Planning Session on Wednesday, April 14, 2021.

2F: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy introduced David DeGuire as the new Director of the Professional Services Division.

2G: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo shared data that was collected by the Butte County Office of Education regarding the struggles youth have been dealing with due to the devastation from the Oroville Dam crisis, the Camp Fire, and the COVID-19 pandemic within Butte County.

Commissioner Cardenas reminded everyone that May is Mental Health Awareness Month. He informed the public that California Student Mental Health Week is from May 10 through May 14.

Commissioner Browne spoke about the importance for institutions of higher education to reach out to students.

2H: Liaison Reports

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, provided a brief update on the State Board's recent activities on assessment, adoption of the state literacy plan, and adoption of the state's first Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

Kori Jones, Commission Student Liaison, thanked the Commission for providing flexibilities to candidates as they complete their teacher preparation programs and suggested ongoing support of flexibilities for teacher candidates in the future.

Executive Committee

Chair Tine Sloan convened the Executive Committee.

3A: Proposed 2022 and 2023 Commission Meeting Schedules

Hai Jue Theriault, Program Analyst, Executive Office, presented this item which provided proposed meeting schedules for 2022 and 2023 for the Executive Committee to consider and to recommend a schedule of meetings to the full Commission for approval.

Commission Action

Commissioner Cooney moved to approve the proposed Commission meeting schedules for 2022 and 2023 listed on page EC 3A-2 of the item. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo second the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

4A: Teacher Supply in California, 2019-20 A Report to the Legislature

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a report to the Governor and the Legislature on the number of teachers who received credentials, certificates, permits and waivers to teach in California public schools. In addition to the written Teacher Supply report, information on the educator supply dashboards was provided.

Shilpa Ram, Public Advocates, raised concerns regarding the decrease in total enrollment in teacher preparation programs since 2017-18, the decline in Career Technical Education (CTE) credentials issued, and the increase in the number of teaching waivers issued in California since 2015-16.

Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District, requested the Commission include information in future reports regarding the race, ethnicity and gender of new credential holders to have a better understanding of the trends overtime regarding teacher diversity in the state.

Commission Action

Commissioner de la Torre moved to approve the Teacher Supply in California, 2019-20 report for transmittal to the Governor and the Legislature. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marten was not present during the roll call vote.

4B: Update on the Development of the California Education Specialist Teaching Performance Assessment and Initial Pilot Study

Amy Reising, Acting Chief Deputy Director and James Webb, Consultant, Performance Assessment Policy and Development Division, presented this item which provided an update on the development of the Teaching Performance Assessment (TPA) for Education Specialists and a summary of design team meetings from February 2020 to March 2021. Guiding principles for the continued development of this assessment and fall 2020 pilot study data were presented as information for the Commission. In addition, staff sought approval from the Commission to provide additional time for a comprehensive field test for the lower incidence credential areas of emphasis (Early Childhood Special Education, Deaf/Hard of Hearing, and Visual Impairments).

Heather Klesch, Evaluation of Systems group of Pearson, and Vicki Graff, Education Specialist CalTPA Design Team, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Lidiana Blair, California State University Long Beach, submitted a written comment which voiced support of the proposals outlined in this item.

Jennifer Mahdavi, Sonoma State University, submitted a written comment which raised a concern regarding the possibility of having teacher candidates take multiple TPAs.

Commission Action

Chair Sloan moved to approve staff recommendations to 1) confirm the expectation that Mild to Moderate Support Needs and Extensive Support Needs credential programs begin their administration of the Education Specialist CalTPA in fall 2022; 2) approve an additional year for Early Childhood Special Education, Deaf and Hard of Hearing, and Visual Impairments to develop performance assessment guides for Cycle 1 and Cycle 2 with a field test for these credential areas in 2022-23; and 3) direct staff to include successful demonstration of proficiency on a performance assessment as a requirement for the preliminary credential in its rulemaking package establishing the new Education Specialist credential and bridge authorizations. Commissioner de la Torre seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Gross recused herself from the voting. Commissioner Marten was not present during the roll call vote.

4C: Review and Proposed Adoption of the Revised Mild to Moderate Support Needs and Extensive Support Needs Teaching Performance Expectations

William Hatrick and Sarah Solari-Colombini, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided revisions to the Preliminary Education Specialist Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) adopted in 2018 for the Mild to Moderate and Extensive Support Needs credentials and requested that the Commission authorize the use of these updated TPEs in the recently approved regulatory changes for Special Education.

Commission Action

Commissioner Jackson moved to adopt the changes and authorize the use of the new TPEs in the Special Education regulatory packet that was approved at the December 2020 meeting. Chair Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioners Cooney and Marten were not present during the roll call vote. Commissioner Gross recused herself from this item.

4E: Annual Update on the Accreditation Data System

Cheyenne Jones, Analyst, and Erin Sullivan, Administrator, Professional Services Division presented this item which provided an update on the Commission's implementation of the Accreditation Data System (ADS).

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:48 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Juan M. Jaimes v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Second Appellate District, Division Seven, Case No. B291851) and *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Third Appellate District, Case No. C092001) and related cases pending administrative hearing. The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, transcript reviews, Decisions and Orders, and Proposed Decisions in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, April 16, 2021

General Session

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:30 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Chair Sloan announced the appointment of Amy Reising as the Chief Deputy Director of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Monica Martinez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

4D: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to Pupil Personnel Services Credentials and Educator Preparation Program Standards in School Counseling, School Psychology, School Social Work, and Child Welfare and Attendance

Joshua Speaks, Manager, Certification Division, presented this item which provided the proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations to update the regulations to align with the recently adopted Pupil Personnel Services (PPS) Educator Preparation Program Standards. The proposal included amendments to section 80049; the repeal of the outdated PPS standards in sections 80632, 80632.1, 80632.2, 80632.3, and 80632.4; and the addition of sections 80605 and 80614.

Commission Action

Chair Sloan moved to adopt the proposed regulations and direct staff to submit the final rulemaking file to the Office of Administrative Law. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioners Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo and Simmons were not present during the roll call vote.

4F: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Relay Graduate School of Education

Hart Boyd and Poonam Bedi, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Relay Graduate School of Education's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

Davida Gatlin, Alice Waldron, and Maya Weatherton, Relay Graduate School of Education, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Mayme Hostetter, Relay Graduate School of Education, provided a brief overview of the Relay Graduate School of Education credential programs and thanked the Commission for its consideration.

Commission Action

Commissioner Klatt moved to grant eligibility to Relay Graduate School of Education and move forward to Stage III. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Jackson abstaining and Chair Sloan in opposition. Commissioners De La Torre-Escobedo and Heredia recused themselves from the voting.

4G: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Huntington Beach Union High School District

Michele Williams-George, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Huntington Beach Union High School District's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

Rocky Murray, Kendra Rosales, and Chris Long, Huntington Beach Union High School District, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Gross moved to grant eligibility to Huntington Beach Union High School District and move forward to Stage III. Commissioner Heredia seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4H: COVID Flexibilities: Recommendation to Extend the Waiver of Preconditions Related to Demonstration of Subject Matter Competence and Student Teaching

Sarah Solari-Colombini, Consultant, and Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which requested the Commission's consideration of extending the waiver of preconditions requiring demonstration of subject matter competence prior to daily whole class instruction for the 2021-22 academic year as adopted by the Commission.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Heredia moved to extend through academic year 2021-22 the Commission's previous action to waive Precondition 6 for Preliminary Multiple and Single Subject teacher candidates and Precondition 3 for Education Specialist candidates. Commissioner Cardenas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4I: Update on Examinations: CSET, RICA, and CBEST

Cara Mendoza, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on several Commission-owned examinations including new online proctoring opportunities for the California Subject Examinations for Teachers (CSET): Multiple Subjects Subtests I and III, and English Subtests I-IV, the California Basic Educational Skills Test (CBEST), and the Reading Instruction Competence Assessment (RICA). In addition, information

about a new subtest structure for the RICA and a proposal to retire the paper-based form of the CBEST were addressed.

Heather Klesch, Evaluation of Systems group of Pearson, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Coreen Carrillo, Cal Poly, submitted a written comment which stated that it would not be fair to test students this year due to the pandemic.

Jen Churton, representing herself, submitted a written comment which stated that the CBEST and CSET should be removed as prerequisites to the credential program.

Jennifer Mahdavi, Sonoma State University, submitted a written comment which suggested the Commission eliminate high-stakes tests for entry into the teaching profession entirely.

Danette Brown, California Teachers Association, asked staff clarifying questions regarding the RICA and requested the Commission examine the RICA through a diversity, equity, and inclusion lens.

Marisol Ruiz, National University, stated that the coursework in the teacher preparation program and TPEs should be sufficient to prove that teacher candidates are ready to enter the workforce and urged the Commission to eliminate the RICA.

Lexi Lopez, EdVoice, voiced support of dividing the RICA into three parts and suggested the Commission direct the examination vendor to produce enhanced score reports of all candidates' performance to help direct their further preparation and remediation for any part of the assessment that they did not pass.

Commission Action

Commissioner Heredia moved to direct staff to revise regulations to retire the paper-based form of the CBEST and the forty-one-dollar (\$41.00) fee for this version of the CBEST. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4J: Draft Subject Matter Requirements for Art, Music, and Multiple Subjects Updated to Align with the 2019 California Arts Standards for Public Schools

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided draft Subject Matter Requirements (SMRs) for the Single Subject credentials in Art and Music, and SMRs for the Multiple Subject credential updated to align with the 2019 California Arts Standards for Public Schools, Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve for the Commission's review and input, and requested Commission direction to move these draft SMRs forward for content review by the field.

Commission Action

Commissioner Jackson moved to direct staff to move the draft SMRs for Art, Music, and Multiple Subjects forward for content review by the field. Chair Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Legislative Committee

Committee Chair De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Legislative Committee.

6A: Status of Legislation

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

Shilpa Ram, Public Advocates, spoke in support of SB 488 (Rubio), AB 312 (Seyarto) and AB 437 (Kalra).

Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District, voiced support of AB 437 (Kalra), SB 488 (Rubio), and AB 815 (Luz Rivas).

6B: Analysis of Bill

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an analysis of AB 437 (Kalra) for Commission discussion and consideration.

Nicoleta Bateman, CSU San Marcos, submitted a written comment which shared with the Commission some feedback pertaining in section 3(iii) of AB 437.

Steve Bautista, The Association of California Community College Teacher Education Programs, submitted a written comment which supported the elimination of high stakes testing and the expanded use of alternate methods of demonstrating subject matter competency, and requested the Commission ensure that the proposed changes benefit the rich diversity of aspiring K-12 educators who begin their pathway at a California community college.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

2I: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation

Chair Sloan moved to accept the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee to: 1) appoint Robert Frelly, Jason Lea, and J. Kevin Taylor to the Committee on Accreditation beginning July 1, 2021; and 2) appoint Sonia Arnak, MaryBeth Murray and Kristy Pruitt as alternates. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2J: Proposed 2022 and 2023 Commission Meeting Schedules

Chair Sloan moved to accept the recommendations of the Executive Committee for the 2022 and 2023 meeting schedules as presented in agenda item 3A on page 2. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2K: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of *Juan M. Jaimes v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Second Appellate District, Division Seven, Case No. B291851) and *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Third Appellate District, Case No. C092001) and related cases pending administrative hearing, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Sharon Bock-Dixon
- Ivan Luna

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Stephen Boyd
- Noelle Furrer
- James Jacobs (Commissioner Cardenas recused himself from this item)
- Protus Taniform

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Tina McIntire. Commissioner Marten recused herself on this item.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Kristin Dove. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order. Commissioner Marten recused herself on this item.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Lauren Williams. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Rhonda Luna and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the Proposed Decision in the matter of Christopher Taylor.

The Commission discussed the matter of Item #30 Elizabeth High and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

2J: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, requested the Commission have an item to discuss issues regarding the Career Technical Education credentials on the Commission agenda.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 1:02 p.m.

Appendix A

COVID Flexibilities: Recommendation to Extend the Waiver of Preconditions Related to Demonstration of Subject Matter Competence and Student Teaching

	Name	Affiliation	Written/Oral Statement
1	Richard Ayers	University of San Francisco	Oral/Written
2	Amy Conley	Humboldt State University	Oral
3	Marisol Ruiz	Humboldt State University	Oral
4	Bryan Johnson	Los Angeles Unified School District	Oral
5	Brenda Quispe	Self	Oral
6	Samantha Evans	CSU, Channel Islands Student CTA	Oral
7	Nenit Wills	National University	Oral
8	Brian Charest	California Alliance of Researchers for Equity in Education (CARE-ED)	Written
9	Renee Costello	Self	Written
10	Kitty Epstein	Self	Written
11	Conor Ezarik	University of San Francisco	Written
12	Jon Gary	Self	Written
13	Laura Hannemann	University of San Francisco	Written
14	Miriam Hennig	University of San Francisco/CARE-ED	Written
15	Rebecca Joseph	Cal State LA	Written
16	Otak Jump	Notre Dame de Namur University	Written
17	Richard Kahn	Antioch University Los Angeles	Written
18	Amber Lamprecht	UC Berkeley	Written
19	Paula Lane	Sonoma State University	Written
20	Jennifer Mahdavi	Sonoma State University	Written
21	Rachel Narr	CSU Northridge	Written
22	Lisa Norton	Touro University California	Written
23	Jonathan Oyaga	Student California Teachers Association	Written
24	David Preston	Santa Maria Joint Union High School District	Written

April 13-16, 2021 Commission Meeting
Approved Minutes