
2B

Action

General Session

Approval of the February 2021 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the February 2021 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the February 2021 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the February 11-12, 2021 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative
Cynthia Marten, School Administrator Representative
Monica Martinez, Public Representative
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

Commission Members Absent

None

Thursday, February 11, 2020

General Session

Chair Tine Sloan convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:02 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Sloan announced the appointments for the 2021 Executive Committee:

- Monica Martinez, Educator Preparation Committee
- Michael Cooney, Professional Practices Committee
- Bonnie Klatt, Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee
- Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Legislative Committee
- David Simmons, Certification Committee
- Terri Jackson, Appeals and Waivers Committee

Chair Sloan congratulated Commissioner Cynthia Marten on her recent nomination as Deputy U.S. Education Secretary by President Biden. Commissioners Browne, Grenot-Scheyer, Hartwig and Martinez also shared their congratulations and gratitude for her service to the Commission.

Chair Sloan reported that an Executive Order from the Governor allowed a 60-day extension for the terms of Commissioners Johanna Hartwig and Kevin Kung.

1A: Approval of the December 2020 Minutes

Commissioner Martinez moved approval of the December 2020 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1B: Approval of the February 2021 Agenda

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the February 2021 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 1C, 3F and 5A. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1C: Approval of the February 2021 Consent Calendar

Chair Sloan moved to withdraw the consent item regarding the vacancies on the Committee of Credentials (COC) and to declare vacancies on the COC to invite additional applicants to be reviewed and interviewed by the Ad Hoc Committee while keeping the three incumbents on the potential list of appointees. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the February 2021 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 39. Jonathan Fil, 96. Ted Moschitto, 99. Heather O Bier, 116. Kevin Rocha, and 136. Scott Werner to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo recusing herself from item 77. Jeremy Kriss.

1D: Chair's Report

Chair Sloan spoke about the work in educator preparation and responding to the ever-changing needs over the past 11 months and the things that the Commission needs to attend to as schools prepare to go back to in-person instruction. Chair Sloan suggested more articulated partnerships between the preparers and schools to create new opportunities for educators to use their expertise to benefit P-12 students.

1E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy expressed her appreciation and congratulations to Commissioner Marten for her service to the Commission and the education community. She introduced Cassandra Henderson as a new Consultant in the Performance Assessment Policy and Development Unit and Debra Keeler as a new Consultant in the Professional Services Division. Executive Director Sandy also provided an overview of the Commission's priorities for 2021.

1F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Francois acknowledged the Commission and its staff for the work on strengthening and streamlining the accreditation system. She shared her experience regarding the virtual accreditation site visit at UCLA and thanked the Commission's accreditation team,

especially William Hatrick and Kristina Najarro, for their responsiveness and hard work during this accreditation process.

Commissioner Browne spoke about the attention from the community college system regarding the work on Early Childhood Education (ECE). She stated it is essential to bring ECE into the public school system for access and affordability for all families so their children can have quality preschool education.

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer shared a Resolution of Commendation to Ms. Teri Clark, former Professional Services Division Director of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing, for her many contributions to the California State University and the state of California and wished her the very best as she embarks on a new chapter in her life.

1G: Liaison Reports

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, congratulated Commissioner Marten on her nomination. She provided a brief report on the State Board's recent activities including upcoming decisions around the administration of the statewide assessment, distance learning guidance, ethnic studies model curriculum, and the state literacy plan. She also shared the work to support educators of English learners through the California Statewide System of Support and information on the upcoming release of the school reopening data dashboard.

Kori Jones, Commission Student Liaison, shared her perspective as a new second grade teacher and spoke about the support she has received from her education preparation program as she prepares to complete the edTPA. She also updated the Commission on her recent activities and shared concerns that were raised during conversations with various education groups.

Commissioner Simmons reported on his attendance at the meeting with the Collaborative Group to discuss support and guidance for the 2020-21 program completers. He also thanked Erin Skubal and Executive Director Sandy for notifying the field about the flexibility that local education agencies have regarding the basic skills examination requirement that will be helpful to employers as they reopen.

Commissioner Kung reported on his attendance at the January 28, 2021 Committee on Accreditation meeting. He also wished everyone a happy lunar new year.

Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee

Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Fiscal and Policy Planning Committee.

2A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2021-22 Budget

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, and Vivian Su, Manager, Fiscal and Business Services, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Governor's proposed 2021-22 budget that relate to the Commission.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

3A: Recommendations for Supporting 2020-21 Program Completers as They Move into Practice

Sarah Solari-Colombini, Consultant and Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the flexibilities that have been provided to educator preparation programs, program applicants, and program completers for the 2020-21 year. The item continued the discussion on the appropriate supports for these program completers as they become in-service educators.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted [written comments](#) or [spoke on this item](#).

Commission Action

Commissioner Klatt moved to approve the staff recommendations:

1. To extend the ability for Commission-approved educator preparation programs to recommend a candidate for a Program Sponsor Variable Term Waiver (PS-VTW) due to COVID-19 through August 31, 2021.
2. To approve the additional five institutions: Alder Graduate School of Education, Kings County Office of Education, Merced County Office of Education, Tulare County Office of Education, and Ventura County Office of Education, as eligible to recommend candidates for a PS-VTW.

The Commission further directed staff to bring an item regarding the larger scope of testing for discussion at a future Commission meeting. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marten was not present during the roll call vote.

3B: Draft Updated Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations

Iyore Osamwonyi, Assistant Consultant and Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the updated Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and new Bilingual Teaching Performance Expectations for the Commission's initial review. In addition, the item presented a policy issue for Commission discussion regarding the panel's recommendation that clinical practice be required for all bilingual authorization candidates.

Sharon Merritt, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education, thanked the Commission and its staff for their ongoing commitment to working collaboratively on the changes to the bilingual authorization standards as well as the establishment of the new Bilingual Authorization Teaching Performance Expectations (BTPEs). She spoke about the need for standards to include clear parameters for field work along all pathways and suggested the inclusion or requirement of field work as part of the bilingual authorization.

Megaly Lavadenz, Loyola Marymount University, spoke in support of the panel's recommendations to include clinical practice for bilingual authorized candidates across multiple pathways.

Danette Brown, California Teachers Association, voiced concerns regarding requiring clinical practice for the sequential route and the exam candidates.

Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Education, voiced support for embedding clinical practice in programs for all pathways to strengthen the effectiveness of bilingual teachers in the field. She also requested specific guidance be provided to programs for clarity regarding the transition expectations before the new bilingual standards are adopted.

Clara Amador-Lankster, National University, talked about the importance of including a rich and robust clinical practice requirement for the bilingual program standards and raised concerns regarding the lack of a clinical practice component within the current exam-only option.

Commission Action

Chair Sloan moved to table this item until Friday, February 12, 2021, for further discussion. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:37 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Juan M. Jaimes v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Second Appellate District, Division Seven, Case No. B291851) and *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Third Appellate District, Case No. C092001) and related cases pending administrative hearing. The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Proposed Decisions and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, February 12, 2021

General Session

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:39 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Educator Preparation Committee

Chair Sloan reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee due to Commissioner Monica Martinez's absence.

3D: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District

Michele Williams-George, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

Leslie Williams, Meghan Sutcliffe, and Katharine Nissen, Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Hartwig moved to grant eligibility to Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District and move forward to Stage III. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Martinez was not present during the roll call vote.

3F: Update on the Work Relating to the Child Development Permit

Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, Amy Reising, Director, Performance Assessments Policy and Development, and Members of the Master Plan for Early Learning and Care Committee, presented this item which provided an update on the work to date relating to the Child Development Permit, including information on the Commission's activities under the Preschool Development Grant-Renewal (PDG-R) and the state's new Master Plan for Early Learning and Care. The item reported on activities during the seven-month period between the most recent prior update to the Commission in June 2020 and the present.

Kris Perry, California Health and Human Services Agency, Jannelle Kubinec and Lupita Alcala, WestEd, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Partners in Education, Articulation, and Coordination through Higher Education (PEACH), submitted a letter which thanked the Commission for creating a new dedicated webpage and mailing list for the Early Childhood Education (ECE) community, and for the funds that have been allocated in the PDR-R grant to promote the implementation of the ECE Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) and program guidelines. The letter raised questions and concerns regarding the replacement for the Child Development Permit Verification of Completion (VOC) process; the Teaching Performance Assessment (TPA) and the role of ECE practicum; equitable access to articulated teacher preparation pathways; and the development of an ECE credential in relation to the Commission's responsibilities to implement the Master Plan's goals and objectives. The letter suggested an organizational or flow chart that relates TPEs, ECE Program Guidelines, TPAs, and Program Quality Review process be created to help the field. The letter requested that the design teams represent diverse cultures and races and questioned the potential costs and additional staffing needed for institutions of higher education to meet the potential future program approval requirements in order to be eligible to recommend candidates for the Child Development Permit.

Sondra Moe, PEACH, raised questions and concerns regarding the status of the current VOC process.

Chair Sloan appointed Ex-Officio member Andrew Wall to serve as a voting member for the purpose of maintaining a quorum.

Janet Fish, PEACH, spoke about the importance of equitable access to articulated teacher preparation pathways and urged the Commission to put this on the agenda and consider the

Child Development Permit Advisory Panel's 2017 recommendations for revising the Child Development permit.

Denise Kennedy, PEACH, raised questions regarding the ECE credential related to the Master Plan and the Commission's responsibilities to achieve the goals of the Master Plan.

La Tanga Hardy, PEACH, expressed her excitement about the funds that have been allocated in the PDG-R grant to promote the implementation of the ECE TPEs and program guidelines.

Toni Isaacs, PEACH, raised concerns regarding the lack of a practicum and requirement of an associate or baccalaureate degree of the current Child Development Permits. She suggested there be a collaborative process among the Commission and early childhood faculty across all higher education systems to ensure quality practicum experiences are a required component in the Child Development Permit Matrix.

Nancy Hurlbut, PEACH, stated that a flow chart that relates TPEs, ECE Program Guidelines, TPAs, and Program Quality Review Team would be helpful for the ECE communities. She raised questions regarding the concept of a credential versus a permit and suggested that the design teams represent diverse cultures and race. She also requested the Commission discuss the additional cost and staff needed for institutions of higher education to be able to recommend students for the Child Development Permit.

Carolyn Crolotte, Early Edge California, spoke in support of the Commission's efforts to align its work with the recommendations in the Master Plan for Early Learning and Care. She voiced an interest in how the TPA and peer review design teams will address the needs of dual language learners and infants and toddlers; what lessons learned will be gained from the pilots; and how this information will be disseminated to institutions of higher education.

Jessica Sawko, Children Now, spoke about the need to ensure educators have living wages and wages that are consistent with the amount of training expected of them, in addition to elevating and aligning the standards to the need of children at various stages of development. She suggested an infrastructure be put in place for multiple pathways and entries into the field. She also expressed interest in learning about the information that will be gathered from the pilots on how to support dual language learners.

3E: Initial Institutional Approval – Change of Control and Name for Brandman University to University of Massachusetts Global

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information about a change of control and name for Brandman University, a Commission-approved program sponsor, to the University of Massachusetts (UMass) Global.

Gary Brahm, Patricia Clark White, Brad Damon, Brandman University, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Klatt moved to approve Brandman University to continue as a Commission-approved program sponsor under the name UMass Global. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marten and Chair Sloan were not present during the roll call vote.

3B: Draft Updated Bilingual Authorization Program Standards and Teaching Performance Expectations

Iyore Osamwonyi, Assistant Consultant and Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which continued the discussion regarding clinical practice and draft BTPEs.

The Commission directed staff to gather additional feedback from the field regarding the draft BTPEs for Commission consideration. The Commission further directed staff to continue its work with the panel and stakeholders to collect additional data and seek more input around clinical practice within the draft program standards.

3C: Annual Update on the Accreditation Data System

Commissioner Kung moved to table this item to the next Commission meeting. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marten and Chair Sloan were not present during the roll call vote.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

4A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Legislative Committee

Committee Chair De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Legislative Committee.

5A: Status of Legislation

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the status of those legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners. In addition, the item also provided an analysis regarding AB 312 (Seyarto) for Commission discussion and consideration.

Commission Action

Commissioner Jackson moved to take a *Support* position on AB 312 (Seyarto) related to the basic skills requirement. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marten and Chair Sloan were not present during the roll call vote.

Reconvene General Session

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reconvened the General Session due to Chair Sloan's absence.

1H: Strategic Planning Session

Commissioner Martinez moved to table this item to a future Commission meeting.

Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marten and Chair Sloan were not present during the roll call vote.

1I: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of *Juan M. Jaimes v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Second Appellate District, Division Seven, Case No. B291851) and *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Court of Appeal Third Appellate District, Case No. C092001 and related cases pending administrative hearing, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Scott Fisch
- Surjit Kaur
- Precious Nash
- Juan Casique

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Bob Klein
- Carlos Avila

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Tina McIntire. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matters of Kristin Dove and Lauren Williams and called for the transcript. Commissioner Marten recused herself on the matter of Kristin Dove.

The Commission voted to reduce or otherwise mitigate the proposed penalty and adopt the balance of the Proposed Decision in the matter of Maria Migliore.

The Commission voted to make a clerical correction and adopt the Proposed Decision in the matter of Matthew Smith.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Tony Tran and referred the matter back to the Administrative Law Judge to take additional evidence.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #99 Heather O Bier and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

- #39 Jonathan Fil
- #96 Ted Moschitto
- #116 Kevin Rocha
- #136 Scott Werner

1J: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Jatinder Dosanjh, representing himself, submitted a letter which asked the Commission about the possibility of completing an accredited college program or courses in lieu of the RICA exam.

Nicholas LaPointe, representing himself, submitted a letter which raised questions and concerns regarding passing the CBEST.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Vice Chair De La Torre-Escobedo adjourned the meeting at 12:07 p.m.

Appendix A

Recommendations for Supporting 2020-21 Program Completers as They Move into Practice

	Name	Affiliation	Written/Oral Statement
1	Rick Ayers	University of San Francisco	Oral
2	Ruchi Rangnath	University of San Francisco	Oral
3	Otak Jump	Notre Dame De Namur University	Oral/Written
4	Nicholas Henning	CSU Fullerton	Oral
5	Danette Brown	California Teachers Association	Oral
6	Kristine Specht	Self	Oral
7	Mary Donlan	Tulare County Office of Education	Oral
8	Antonio Vasquez	Self	Oral
9	Marianne Mehuys	San Jose State University	Oral
10	Alexander Nguyen	Self	Oral
11	Sara Lillis	Teach Plus	Oral
12	219 Educational Scholars	California Alliance of Research for Equity in Education (CARE-ED)	Written
13	Brenda Quispe	Self	Written
14	Laura Hannemann	University of San Francisco	Written
15	Briana Ronan	Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo	Written
16	Kelly Vaughn	Notre Dame De Namur University	Written
17	Brian Charest	CARE-ED	Written
18	Antoinette Linton	CSU, Fullerton	Written