

---

# 1B

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the October 2020 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the October 2020 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the October 2020 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

#### *III. Communication and Engagement*

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## **Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the October 8-9, 2020 Meeting**

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative  
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative  
Cynthia Marten, School Administrator Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative  
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

### **Commission Members Absent**

Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California

### ***Thursday, October 8, 2020***

#### **General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan convened the October 8-9, 2020 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:00 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Sloan introduced Kori Jones as the new Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission.

#### **1A: Approval of the August 2020 Minutes**

Commissioner Barnes moved approval of the August 2020 Ad Hoc Committee minutes. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the August 2020 Executive Committee minutes. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo abstaining.

Commissioner Martinez moved approval of the August 2020 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners De La Torre-Escobedo and Klatt abstaining.

**1B: Approval of the October 2020 Agenda**

Commissioner Klatt moved approval of the October 2020 Agenda with a revised agenda item 3B. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**1C: Approval of the October 2020 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the October 2020 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 29. Oscar Mendez and 30. Nicole Molyneux to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Barnes recusing herself from item 88. Robert Duvall, Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo recusing herself from item 98. Jennifer Smith, and Commissioner Marten recusing herself from items 13. Jason Crawford, 14. Melissa Ferro, and 24. Sarah Martin.

**1D: Chair's Report**

Chair Sloan spoke about the uncertainty of the current environment and the impact on educators. She shared a letter from the California Department of Education, the State Board, and the Commission which addresses strategies to strengthen educator preparation programs (EPPs) and local education agencies (LEAs) partnerships during COVID-19. She also talked about creating new opportunities with the Commission's strategic planning to work collaboratively with other education entities and stakeholders to better understand and learn what needs to be done.

**1E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy welcomed Kori Jones as the new Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission and introduced Kristina Najarro as a new Consultant in the Professional Services Division. She expressed her appreciation for Chair Sloan's remarks and reported on her participation along with Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer on a panel for the launch of this year's Teacher Residency Lab. Executive Director Sandy provided a brief overview of the meeting agenda and reminded the Commission about the upcoming Chair and Vice Chair elections at the December Commission meeting.

**1F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Barnes reminded everyone to take a moment to check in with students and with each other. She raised concerns regarding the uncertainty for new teachers and counselors during this period. She also informed the public about the virtual conference titled *Revolution: Equity, Disparities, and Student Mental Health* hosted by the California Association of School Counselors on October 8, 2020.

Commissioner Jackson thanked Teri Clark and Erin Skubal for their collaboration on getting feedback for the National Council on Teacher Quality Report for California.

Commissioner Marten shared a letter that she wrote to the Commission in 1987 when she was graduating from college in La Crosse, Wisconsin to obtain a California credential as an out-of-state prepared candidate. She also shared the poem *Continue* by Maya Angelou to offer encouragement and hope for fellow Commissioners, teachers, and education community.

Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo shared her experience as an induction mentor and thanked Tracey Allen and her team at Butte County Office of Education for the experience. She expressed her appreciation to the Commission and staff for their work on adopting the teacher induction preconditions and standards in 2016. She also reported on her attendance at the Implicit Bias Training in September and shared a resource titled *Fostering Civil Discourse* at [facinghistory.org](http://facinghistory.org).

### **1G: Liaison Reports**

Kori Jones, Commission Student Liaison, shared questions and concerns that were raised during a recent meeting with her administrators and colleagues at the University of the Pacific. She suggested that a relationship be established between students and the Commission on Teacher Credentialing earlier in the preparation program and shared her plans on ways to bring student voices to the Commission.

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, welcomed Kori Jones as the new student liaison to the Commission and thanked Commissioners for their thoughtful and touching comments they shared this morning. She reported on the resignation of Karen Stapf Walters and welcomed Brooks Allen, Debra Brown, Rigel Massaro, and Zaid Fattah to the State Board of Education. She shared priorities of the State Board and updated the Commission on the State Board's recent activities.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Chair Sloan appointed Commissioner Monica Martinez to serve as the acting committee chair for the Educator Preparation Committee.

Acting Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **2A: Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2018-19**

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, and Phi Phi Lau, Research Data Specialist, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the twentieth Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2018-19, as required by Title II of the 2008 Reauthorization of the Higher Education Act, including a description of credentialing requirements to teach in California public schools and qualitative and quantitative information on teacher preparation programs.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, asked staff a question regarding how the data is being used. She raised concerns regarding the rate of current teacher enrollment, African American teacher

completion rates, and the large amount of special education teachers being prepared through alternative routes.

**Commission Action**

Chair Sloan moved to approve the Annual Report Card on Teacher Preparation Programs for Academic Year 2018-19. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2B: Pathways for Current Education Specialist Credential Holders Interested in Earning the New Education Specialist Credential**

William Hatrick and Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided possible pathways for Education Specialist credential holders prepared under the previous standards and Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) who are interested in earning the equivalent authorization under the new Education Specialist standards and TPEs. Development of such a pathway would ensure that current credential holders interested in obtaining the new Education Specialist authorization(s) meet the 2018 TPEs that were not addressed in their original preparation program.

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association (CTA)**, reminded the Commission about the letter that was submitted by CTA on July 31, 2020 which suggested that the current Education Specialist credential holders should make their own decision on whether or not to earn the new authorization and recommended that language be included in any future regulations that the authorization be obtained only with the teacher's consent.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Hinde moved to 1) approve the options for current Education Specialist credential holders to complete coursework, professional development, demonstrated competence, or a combination thereof to earn the equivalent authorization of the new Education Specialist credentials going into effect summer/fall 2022, and 2) allow approved Preliminary Education Specialist program sponsors, Local Education Agencies, and statewide organizations to verify that a current Education Specialist has met the new TPEs represented in the expanded authorization as outlined in the table on page 5 of the agenda item. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2C: Collaboration between Preparers of Educators and the Local Education Agencies that Employ Program Completers**

Cheryl Hickey and Erin Sullivan, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the statutory and Commission-adopted requirements for collaboration between institutions that prepare educators and the local education agencies that employ new educators. This item also provided the requirements for Preliminary Teacher Preparation programs to develop transition plans for program completers to take to their Commission-approved Induction programs, thereby creating a connection between the two programs and informing the new educators' work during induction.

**Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD)**, spoke about the importance of building collaborative relationships between LEAs and institutions of higher education (IHEs) partners and shared some collaborative work between LAUSD and their local educator preparation programs to meet recruitment needs.

**Patricia Pernin, LAUSD**, spoke about the work that her district program is engaging in with the LEAs and IHEs surrounding the Los Angeles area and expressed the importance of collaboration in their work.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, thanked the Commission staff for their ongoing conversation around this topic and requested the Commission to include teacher unions in the conversations. She expressed her appreciation for the emphasis on and the continued attention and support of the individual development plan and raised concerns regarding the verification of Demonstration of Need.

**Sarah Lillis, Teacher Plus California**, expressed her interest in recognizing the importance of the partnership between LEAs and programs both for pre-service and for induction, and suggested clear guidance be provided on how to demonstrate that collaboration. She also raised concerns regarding the alignment of the individual development plan with the induction program.

## **2D: Update on the Local Solutions to the Shortage of Special Education Teachers Grant Programs**

Cara Mendoza, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the Local Solutions to the Shortage of Special Education Teachers grant program, one of five grant programs administered by the Commission, and provided the first round of data collected for Year One of the Local Solutions grant program.

**Sarah Lillis, Briana Nelson, Nadia Razi, Meghann Serill, and Tamra Simpson, Teacher Plus California**, submitted a letter and Sarah Lillis spoke on this item which thanked Commission staff for the analysis on the activities related to the Local Solutions Grant Program and suggested the Commission find ways to support local leaders to provide more meaningful assessments of the impact of these grants. She recommended the Commission identify key questions to be addressed in the final report in 2023 and steps that Commission staff and grantees need to take to answer these questions. She further asked the Commission to collect turnover data in the next round of analysis and to explore deeper around the nature of the investments in induction, mentor/master teachers and professional learning communities.

**Jacob Guthrie, LAUSD**, stated that the primary solution that LAUSD sought to implement using this grant was to offer a monetary incentive to new fully credentialed education specialists. He also stated that one of the beneficial components of the grant awarded was flexibility provided to grantees to design programs that meet their local needs.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, spoke about the importance of the grants to recruit and retain education specialists.

## **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:05 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation: *Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Mary Armstrong, Lee Pope v. Kathleen Carroll* (Court of Appeal Third Appellate District, Case No. C083250), *Emily Ismael v. CTC* (Sacramento, Superior Court, Case No. 34-2020-80003344), *Commission on Teacher Credentialing v. Kathy Little, Simone Kovats, Debra Sather* (Court of Appeal Third Appellate District, Case No. C092001), and *Staranne Meyers and Linda Stearn v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing; Does 1-25* (Sacramento Superior Court, Case No. 34-2020-80003416). The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement and Proposed Decisions while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

## **Friday, October 9, 2020**

### **General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:31 a.m. and roll call was taken.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Acting Committee Chair Monica Martinez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **2E: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for Newhall School District**

Poonam Bedi, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Newhall School District's responses to the Common Standards and Program Preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional Approval by the Commission.

**Marguerite Armstrong, Amy Gaudette, and Amanda Montemayor, Newhall School District**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Jackson moved to grant Provisional Approval to Newhall School District and set the Provisional Approval period to be three years. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2F: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for Lake County Office of Education**

Hart Boyd, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Lake County Office of Education's responses to

the Common Standards and Program Preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional Approval by the Commission.

**Jamie Buckner-Bridges and Starla Wierman, Lake County Office of Education**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Hinde moved to grant Provisional Approval to Lake County Office of Education and set the Provisional Approval period to be three years. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2G: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for University of Antelope Valley**

Poonam Bedi, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, University of Antelope Valley’s responses to the Common Standards and Program Preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional Approval by the Commission.

**Crystal Stephens, Chonnea Harris, and Barry Ryan, University of Antelope Valley**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

**David Vierra, Antelope Valley Union High School District**, spoke in support of granting Provisional Approval to University of Antelope Valley.

**Commission Action**

Chair Sloan moved to grant Provisional Approval to University of Antelope Valley and set the Provisional Approval period to be two years. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

**4A: Commission on Teacher Credentialing Budget**

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division and Vivian Su, Manager, Fiscal and Business Services, presented this item which provided an overview of the Commission’s enacted budget for Fiscal Year (FY) 2020-21, reviewed the overall revenue and expenditure projections, and presented one-time projected expenditures.

**Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

**3A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices’ current workload.

**Brian Crowell, representing himself**, submitted a letter which raised concerns regarding the data on teachers who have had their credentials suspended and or revoked by the Commission from January 1, 2012 through August 10, 2020.

**3B: Division of Professional Practices Annual Workload Report Fiscal Year 2019-20**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided the annual report on the discipline workload of the Division of Professional Practices (DPP) for Fiscal Year 2019-20.

**Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

**5A: Status of Legislation**

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

**Joanna Pineda, representing herself**, raised a concern regarding the ability to meet the subject matter competence requirement to obtain the preliminary credential.

**Anne Wolff, representing herself**, voiced her disappointment regarding the status of AB 1982 and spoke about the difficulties of passing the CBEST due to her learning disability.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, raised her concerns regarding the RICA and suggested the possibility of restructuring the RICA into subtests so candidates would only need to retake the sections that they are unable to pass. She further suggested foundational reading skills be integrated into coursework and a redesigned TPA be created to phase out RICA by replacing it with more meaningful reading instruction and experiences and an authentic assessment.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, acknowledged the Commission, stakeholders, and state legislators for recognizing that standardized tests are only one way of assessing potential credential holders' subject matter, basic skills and ability to teach foundational reading. She requested the Commission and legislature continue their support and engagement in AB 2485, AB 1982, and SB 614.

**Reconvene General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

**1H: Strategic Plan Development Update**

Mary Vixie Sandy, Executive Director, and Linh Nguyen, Chief Deputy Director, Executive Office, presented this item which provided an update on the strategic planning process and requested the Commission's feedback and guidance to further develop the strategic plan.

### **1I: Report of Closed Session Items**

Chair Sloan reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Mary Armstrong, Lee Pope v. Kathleen Carroll; Emily Ismael v. CTC; Commission on Teacher Credentialing v. Kathy Little, Simone Kovats, Debra Sather; and Staranne Meyers and Linda Stearn v. California Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Does 1-25 and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Rebecca Conemac
- Nicole MinerRose

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- David Garcia
- Calli Manderino

The Commission adopted the Proposed Decision in the matter of Nels Mikkelson.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #30 Nicole Molyneux and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #29 Oscar Mendez and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

### **1J: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Audience Presentation

**Araceli Simeón, Parent Organization Network, Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, and Shulamit Ritblatt, Center for Family, School, and Community Engagement**, submitted a letter and Araceli Simeón spoke gave a brief overview of a report released by the Parent Organization Network and partners, Public Advocates and San Diego State University's Center for Family, School, Community Engagement on the topic of family engagement training in pre-service program in California. She thanked the Commission and its staff for their support, collaboration and transparency on strengthening educator preparation to improve family engagement.

**Grace Harm, Student Liaison California Teachers Association**, introduced herself as the new Student Liaison to the Commission for the California Teachers Association.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 12:39 p.m.