

---

# 3A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the June 2020 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the June 2020 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the June 2020 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

#### *III. Communication and Engagement*

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## **Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the June 18-19, 2020 Meeting**

---

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative  
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative  
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative  
Cynthia Marten, School Administrator Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative  
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (6/18 only)

### **Commission Members Absent**

Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative

### ***Thursday, June 18, 2020***

#### **General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan convened the June 18-19, 2020 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:03 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Sloan reminded the public about the online meeting process due to the COVID-19 crisis.

Chair Sloan announced that Kathleen Allavie stepped down from the Commission. Chair Sloan shared a message from Ms. Allavie that expressed her appreciation for the opportunity to serve on the Commission the last two years.

**1A: Approval of the April 2020 Minutes**

Commissioner Rodriguez moved approval of the April 2020 Ad Hoc Committee Meeting minutes. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Martinez was not present during the roll call vote.

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the April 2020 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Martinez was not present during the roll call vote.

**1B: Approval of the June 2020 Agenda**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the June 2020 Agenda with an agenda insert for item 6B. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Martinez was not present during the roll call vote.

**1C: Approval of the June 2020 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the June 2020 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw item 22. Oscar Mendez to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Martinez was not present during the roll call vote.

**1D: Chair's Report**

Chair Sloan read a letter from Executive Director Sandy and herself sent to the education community regarding the deaths of George Floyd, Breonna Taylor, and Ahmaud Arbery; and the impact of institutional racism and inequities that face Black Americans and people of color. She spoke about working across all sectors to protest, to heal and to move the needle on equity to make education opportunities accessible for all students and open the profession to people from all races and backgrounds. She suggested Commissioners voice their thoughts through Commissioner reports, agenda items, and future strategic planning sessions to help shape new ideas for racial and education justice.

**1E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy reminded the public about the deadline to submit applications for the Educator Preparation Student Liaison position.

Executive Director Sandy spoke about how COVID-19, the ongoing racial injustice in society, and the recent events in our community have had an impact both physically and spiritually. She also shared that this challenging time is an opportunity for Commissioners, staff and stakeholders to work together and contribute to an improvement in racial justice for all members of our community.

**1F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Browne reported on the efforts of the community colleges to improve their system for students and their increased focus on student readiness for the current and upcoming online teaching and learning environment.

Commissioner Marks talked about the work and curriculum developed by the public Waldorf School Community Collaborative in the Sacramento region to meet the needs of children and their families during the lockdown period. She also shared a poem *“No Matter What”* which was written by students in her class.

Commissioner Barnes raised concerns regarding the issues students face and deal with daily due to the current situation and suggested that the education community have conversations and a plan for students and staff when children come back to classrooms.

Commissioner Marten acknowledged the heartbreak and anger that people feel about the events that happened in the past several weeks nationally and the death of George Floyd. She shared a statement from all superintendents from large urban districts across the nation provided through the Council of the Great City Schools. She also shared a statement from George Floyd’s second grade teacher about his life. She spoke about the recent decision made by the Supreme Court on DACA (Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals) protection. Lastly, she reported on her school board of education’s approval of a reopening plan.

Commissioner Simmons raised concerns regarding the uncertainties that the local education community is currently facing to hire staff. He also spoke about the need to address how the state is going to teach the full curriculum in the current environment.

Commissioner Wall reflected on the structures that have been created by institutions of higher education (IHE) and how those structures advantage some and disadvantage others. He suggested that as IHE’s and others continue to develop new systems it is important to attend to outcomes that can be unjust and be conscious of their intentions and desired outcomes.

Commissioner Francois acknowledged Chair Sloan and Executive Director Sandy for their courage in making a statement and using their platform to speak their truth in this moment, and expressed her appreciation for all the comments from Commissioners and the solidarity statements that have been made over the past month. She suggested the Commission think about anti-black racism during this time, in addition to cultural responsiveness, equity, and anti-racism; and listen to the field of scholars and practitioners who have done the work of anti-racism to educate us on how the Commission can move forward when framing policies. Lastly, she reported that UC Berkeley was awarded the California Department of Education’s 21<sup>st</sup> Century California School Leadership Academy Statewide Center Grant on improving leadership in schools with a focus on equity and instructional leadership.

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer shared some of the communication efforts happening in the CSU educator preparation leadership group and notified the public that CSU is hosting a series of webinars this summer focusing on equity, inclusion, social justice, and historic justice directed at people of color. She also reported that the CSU was awarded three million dollars from the state legislature to establish a center to address closing the achievement gap.

Commissioner Rodriguez expressed her appreciation for the letter written by Chair Sloan and Executive Director Sandy and reiterated the need for the Commission to maintain an anti-racist lens moving forward. She also spoke about the loss of a colleague at her school and acknowledged Governor Newsom's leadership with respect to COVID-19.

Commissioner Jackson thanked the Commissioners for their comments and spoke about her personal experience visiting the National Memorial for Peace and Justice in Alabama.

### **1G: Liaison Reports**

Ilene Straus, State Board of Education Liaison, updated the Commission on the State Board's recent work, including matters related to the COVID-19 pandemic, issues of racial injustice, and the gaps in equitable access and learning opportunities for various student populations.

Commissioner Rodriguez reported on the recent activities of the Committee on Accreditation.

### **1H: Update on Actions Addressing the COVID-19 Crisis, Considerations for 2020-21, and Possible Additional Actions for Commission Consideration**

Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division; Amy Reising, Director, Performance Assessment Development Division; and Erin Skubal, Director, Certification Division, presented this item which provided an update on the actions taken by the Commission and the Governor to address the COVID-19 crisis, along with the initial implementation of those actions, and opened a discussion of what additional flexibilities the Commission might want to consider for the 2020-21 year.

**Jane Robb, California Teachers Association**, requested information on certificated assignments be made available to all stakeholders on the Commission's public web page.

**Carrie Yi, representing herself**, asked a question regarding the timeline for educator preparation programs to approve teacher candidates who have not passed the RICA to receive their preliminary credentials.

**Serette Kaminski, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, thanked the Commission staff for their rapid response and partnership with the field to help keep the school system running and offered county offices as a resource for future discussions regarding the Child Development Permit as well as the program leader collaborative input group.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **2A: Potential Changes to the Accreditation Framework**

Erin Sullivan and Cheryl Hickey, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided potential revisions to the adopted Accreditation Framework for Commission discussion and possible adoption.

**Lyeah Granderson, representing herself**, submitted a letter which raised concerns about public school students in the Los Angeles Unified School District, especially Black students, who are disproportionately affected by mishandling by the Special Education Department.

**Wendy Zacuto, Speak Up**, requested more interplay between the preparation of teachers in special education and general education in educating students with disabilities and special needs to better support children and parents who require specialized education.

**Lisa Mosko, Speak Up**, raised concerns that general education teachers are not required to have adequate knowledge of special education practices to support students and that the course required for all educators does not cover the basics of IDEA (Individuals with Disabilities Education Act) or best practices for identifying and supporting students with disabilities. She urged the Commission to involve the voice of parents in the accreditation process and framework and to take a closer look at how to support and prepare all educators to meet the needs of students with disabilities.

**Angela Sutherland, representing herself**, stated she is unclear about how the common trunk is being incorporated into the current framework and raised concerns regarding the disconnect between general education and special education in the Sacramento City Unified School District.

**Robin Cowan, representing herself**, spoke about the importance of incorporating the parent perspective and voice so all educators have the appropriate knowledge and tools to quickly and properly identify students that may need special education services. She also asked the Commission to consider having parents partner with credentialing programs which could create positive relationships and encourage parents to be advocates on behalf of teachers.

#### **Commission Action**

Chair Sloan moved to accept the proposed modifications to the Accreditation Framework. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **2C: Report on the Teaching Performance Assessment Comparability Study**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the findings of the Comparability Study of the three Commission-approved Teaching Performance Assessment models for the Commission's consideration.

**Andrea Sinclair, Human Resources Research Organization (HumRRO), Nicole Merino and Ray Pechone, Stanford Center for Assessment, Learning and Equity, and Jean Behrend, California State University, Fresno**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

#### **Recess**

#### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:54 p.m. to consider pending litigation in the matter of Emily Ismael v. CTC (Case No. 34-2019-80003046) and also to consider adverse

actions, Petitions for Reinstatement , Proposed Decisions and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

***Friday, June 19, 2020***

**General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:33 a.m. and roll call was taken.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**2B: Discussion of Proposed Changes in Language for Initial Program Review Preconditions**

Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, and Poonam Bedi, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the Commission's current Initial Program Preconditions addressing the Demonstration of Need and the Practitioners' Participation in Program Design that a program sponsor must demonstrate in order to propose a new educator preparation program.

**E. Toby Boyd, California Teachers Association (CTA)**, submitted a letter which supported the direction of the proposed changes and offered some additional language for Commission consideration to clarify and strengthen the evidence required to demonstrate satisfaction of the Preconditions for program approval.

**Mariama Gray, California State University, East Bay**, voiced support of recommendations regarding Demonstration of Need in the letter from CTA and requested the Commission consider the impact on the CSU to prioritize programs in underserved communities and credential areas, and encouraged collaboration with the CSU when approving future programs.

The Commission directed staff to seek feedback from stakeholders regarding the modified Preconditions and bring an agenda item back to the Commission for consideration.

**2D: Update on the Work of the Bilingual Authorization Work Group**

Iyore Osamwonyi, Assistant Consultant, and Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the Bilingual Authorization work group, the panel members, and a summary of the work to date.

**Magaly Lavadenz, Bilingual Authorization Work Group**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Sharon Merritt, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education**, voiced support for the Bilingual Authorization Work Group and expert panel and their work in examining the current Bilingual Authorization Standards, and suggested the standards include robust requirements for bilingual field placement for all language groups.

**Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Education**, voiced support for the Bilingual Authorization Standards content analysis paper as well as the progress of the Bilingual Standards Work Group. She also encouraged Commission staff to continue to find ways to make the CalTPA a more appropriate assessment for bilingual candidates.

**2F: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for Yuba City Unified School District**

Poonam Bedi, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Yuba City Unified School District's responses to the Common Standards and Program Preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional Approval by the Commission.

**Pamela Aurangzeb, Cindy Gappa, and Martin Ramirez, Yuba City Unified School District**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Commission Action**

Chair Sloan moved to grant Provisional Approval to Yuba City Unified School District and set the Provisional Approval period to be three years. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2E: Update on the Work Relating to the Child Development Permit**

Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the work relating to the Child Development Permit, including (A) information on the current Child Development Permit structure; (B) a summary of the prior work of the Commission's Child Development Advisory Panel; (C) the development and adoption of the set of first-ever Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) for the early care and education workforce along with the first-ever set of Program Guidelines to identify and support quality expectations for the postsecondary programs that prepare this workforce; (D) work currently underway to support pilot implementation of the TPEs and Program Guidelines in the field, including support from the state's Child Development Grant- Renewal federal funding; and (E) plans for moving the work forward in the future.

**Marlene Zepeda, representing herself**, submitted a letter which raised concerns regarding the status of the ECE-TPEs. The letter stated that without a focus on diversity that is reflective of the field's current thinking, racial, ethnic and English-only bias will be institutionalized in teacher preparation for the foreseeable future.

**Partners in Education, Articulation, and Coordination through Higher Education (PEACH)**, submitted a letter which raised concerns regarding the alignment between the Curriculum Alignment Project (CAP) courses and ECE-TPEs and requested extra time be given to implement the ECE-TPEs due to COVID-19 to ensure that there is broad and systematic stakeholder involvement and data analysis to design a robust and representative pilot program. The letter also stated that it is critically important for the Commission to continue planning for review and consideration of the Child Development Permit Advisory Panel recommendations.

**Nancy Hurlbut, PEACH**, spoke about aligning the TPEs with the CAP courses and raised concerns regarding the distribution of the CAP survey. She also suggested that broad stakeholder input be collected during the piloting of the TPEs.

**La Tanga Hardy, PEACH**, reiterated the statement in the letter from PEACH.

**Carolyne Crolette, Early Edge California**, requested the Commission consider the needs of dual language learners (DLL) when developing a competency-based early learning teacher preparation system. She asked the Commission to provide an update on the status of incorporating their feedback to further embed the needs of DLL and their families into the TPEs and the process to provide additional input. She stated it is critical to have experts and stakeholders involved in the process to ensure that a competency-based early learning teacher preparation system that addresses the needs of DLL and their families is included in the master plan for early learning and care and is in alignment with the California English learners roadmap.

**Jessica Sawko, Children Now**, thanked Executive Director Sandy for her leadership and help to secure funding for the pilot program. She also spoke about the importance of the development of the master plan on early learning and care and their continued engagement and collaboration with the Commission in the work to rollout of the TPEs and ultimately revise the Child Development Permit.

#### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

#### **3A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

**Brian Crowell, representing himself**, submitted a letter which raised concerns regarding data provided by Commission staff per his public records request for the ages of teachers referred to the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for credential revocation from May 15, 2019 through May 15, 2020.

#### **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Certification Committee.

#### **4A: Proposed Additions and Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to Official Transcripts**

Joshua Speaks, Manager, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations pertaining to official transcripts.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Barnes moved to adopt the proposed amendments to the Title 5 regulations pertaining to official transcripts to allow submission of the rulemaking notice file to the Office

of Administrative Law. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

#### **5A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2020-21 Budget**

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, and Vivian Su, Manager, Fiscal and Business Services Section, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Governor's proposed 2020-21 budget that relate to the Commission.

### **Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

#### **6A: Status of Legislation**

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of those legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

#### **6B: Analysis of Bill**

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an analysis of AB 1982 (Cunningham), which impacts the Commission's work.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, voiced support of AB 1982 and suggested the Commission take a Support if Amended position.

**Anne Wolff, representing herself**, spoke in support of AB 1982.

**Serette Kaminski, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, voiced support of AB 1982 with the Commission's proposed amendments and urged the Commission to support the bill.

### **Commission Action**

Chair Sloan moved to accept the position of Support if Amended on AB 1982 with an additional amendment to remove the sentence that the same course may not be used to satisfy more than one basic skill component. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

#### **11: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair Hinde reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of Emily Ismael v. CTC and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted Katharine Mancini's Petition for Reinstatement.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Donovan Barela
- James Davis Jr.
- Alejandro Gonzaga
- Gabriel Macias
- Jennifer Parks

The Commission adopted the following Administrative Law Judge's Proposed Decisions:

- Jones Okeke
- Julie Simbob

The Commission discussed the matter of #22 Oscar Mendez and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

### **1J: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

**Rubi Saldana, representing herself**, submitted a letter asking for the percentage of children in special education that transition to general education. The letter also raised a concern that general education teachers do not have the necessary training to serve students with special needs.

Chair Sloan acknowledged the hard work of all the educators across all the professional spectrums and the hardships that people are going through during this time and reminded everyone about the power of acts of kindness.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 12:35 p.m.