

---

# 1A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the April 2020 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the April 2020 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the April 2020 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

#### *III. Communication and Engagement*

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## **Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the April 22-24, 2020 Meeting**

---

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member Representative, Chair  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Kathleen Allavie, School Board Member Representative  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative  
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative  
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative  
Cynthia Marten, School Administrator Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative  
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

### **Commission Members Absent**

None

***Wednesday, April 22, 2020***

### **Ad Hoc Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 3:05 p.m.

### **1A: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation**

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, provided information about the finalists for open positions on the Committee on Accreditation (COA).

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

#### ***Postsecondary Finalists***

- Cheryl Forbes

- Lynn Larsen

*K-12 Finalists*

- Jason Lea
- Gerald Morrison

**Edmundo Litton, Loyola Marymount University**, submitted a letter in support of the applicants for the three positions on the COA.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Rodriguez moved to recommend Cheryl Forbes be reappointed to serve as a postsecondary member on the COA. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Martinez moved to recommend Lynn Larsen be appointed to serve as a postsecondary member on the COA. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Martinez moved to recommend Gerald Morrison be reappointed to serve as a K-12 member on the COA. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Committee Chair Rodriguez adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 4:25 p.m.

***Thursday, April 23, 2020***

**General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan convened the April 23-24, 2020 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:01 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Sloan noticed the public regarding the online meeting protocols due to the COVID-19 crisis.

Chair Sloan welcomed Cynthia Marten and David Simmons as new members to the Commission.

**2A: Approval of the January 2020 Minutes**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the January 2020 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Allavie and Barnes abstaining.

**2B: Approval of the April 2020 Agenda**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the April 2020 Agenda with a revised item 2B and an agenda insert for item 3A. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2C: Approval of the April 2020 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Barnes moved approval of the April 2020 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 35. Daniel Franco, 43. Tracey Hart, 60. Laura Kuykendall, 66. Jason Marcus, 70. Amytza Maskati, 98. Jeffrey Schilp and 108. Dung Tran to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2D: Chair's Report**

Chair Sloan spoke about the impact of COVID-19 on school children, educators and credential candidates. She also provided an overview on two items on the agenda that focused on potential actions for consideration to assist and provide pathways for educators and credential candidates affected by the COVID-19 Health and Safety Restrictions.

**2E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy welcomed Commissioners Marten and Simmons and introduced Linh Nguyen as a new Chief Deputy Director of the Commission.

**2F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Allavie reported that she was elected as the president for her school board and expressed her appreciation to all teachers on their efforts to getting the students online learning.

Commissioner Browne, on behalf of California Community Colleges, thanked the Commission for the guidance provided to educator preparation programs on field experience in response to COVID-19.

Commissioner Hartwig shared a children's book "*Right now, I am fine.*" by Daniela Owen for children experiencing anxiety due to the COVID-19 outbreak.

Commissioner Barnes spoke about mental health resources available through the California Department Education and the California Association of School Counselors to help staff, students and others suffering with anxiety due to COVID-19.

Commissioner Hinde acknowledged the students from the class of 2020.

**2G: Liaison Reports**

Ilene Straus, State Board of Education Liaison, updated the Commission on the State Board's efforts on addressing the challenging situation related to COVID-19.

Lindsey Balidoy, Commission Student Liaison, extended her gratitude to the Commission for the constant communication and leadership during this uncertain time.

Commissioner Rodriguez acknowledged the hard work of the Commission staff and the leadership from the State Board of Education during the pandemic. She also reported on the recent activities of the Committee on Accreditation.

### **Appeals and Waivers Committee**

Committee Chair Kevin Kung convened the Appeals and Waivers Committee.

### **3A: Consideration of Actions to Assist Applicants, Educators, and Credential Candidates Impacted by Emergency Health and Safety Conditions Related to COVID-19**

Erin Skubal, Director, Certification Division, presented this item which provided actions that the Commission may take in order to assist applicants, educators, and credential candidates impacted by the emergency health and safety conditions related to COVID-19. Specifically, the item addressed three areas where the Commission may take action: 1) the option for the Commission to consider deferring the Basic Skills Requirement for individuals unable to complete the examination due to the current crisis; 2) the option for the Commission to consider allowing re-issuances or renewals of credentials, permits, and waivers where the holder was unable to complete the requirements for renewal due to the ongoing crisis; and 3) the option for the Commission to approve multiple requests made by Commission-approved institutions for Variable Term Waivers for candidate(s) that were unable to complete one or more program requirements.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted [written comments or spoke on this item.](#)

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to approve the options presented in this agenda item and in the agenda insert. Commissioner Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Marks was not present during the roll call vote.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **4A: Flexibility for Commission-Approved Educator Preparation Programs Due to the COVID-19 Crisis**

Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which addressed educator preparation program and credential requirements and suggested possible actions the Commission might take to provide flexibility for programs and candidates due to the COVID-19 crisis. Specifically, the item focused on potential modifications to Commission standards and preconditions for (1) preliminary multiple subject, single subject and education specialist teacher preparation programs, (2) services credential programs, and (3) induction programs, as well as performance assessments.

[Appendix B](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted [written comments or spoke on this item.](#)

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Marks moved to approve the following recommendations:

- Preliminary Multiple and Single Subject Credential Requirements:
  - Programs have the authority to determine that a candidate has completed sufficient clinical practice hours to address all TPEs even if the candidate has not completed 600 hours of clinical practice.
  - Programs may take the passage of a Commission-approved TPA into consideration when determining that a candidate has completed sufficient clinical practice hours.
  - Programs have the authority to determine that a candidate has satisfied the formal program evaluation requirement.
  - Programs have the authority to determine that a candidate has satisfied the 'solo' teaching experience.
- Preliminary Education Specialist Credential Requirements: The program will decide the appropriate range of experience and at what grade levels. Documentation of what is needed would be included in the Individual Development Plan that goes from the preliminary program to the induction program.
- Preliminary Teacher Preparation Preconditions Requiring Candidates to Meet Subject Matter Requirement: Waive Precondition 6 (general education candidates) and Precondition 3 (special education candidates) for individuals enrolling in a Commission-approved teacher preparation program for the 2020-21 year to meet the subject matter requirement.
- Teacher and Administrator Induction:
  - Affirm that the 2019-20 year of participation in induction is a full year for all candidates on track to complete the year as defined by the program.
  - Individuals with a preliminary credential and those near the end of their preliminary program who will hold a PS-Variable Term Waiver may participate in the induction program in 2020-21.
- Services Credentials: Endorse the flexibility identified by the national associations for Pupil Personnel Services credentials and the Speech-Language Pathology credential and allow programs to make the determination when candidates have met the expectations as long as they complete the hourly requirements defined in Title 5 regulations.
- Postpone the CalAPA standard setting study to spring 2021 and extend the current passing standard for CalAPA for the 2020-21 year.

Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Marten was not present during the roll call vote.

### **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:30 p.m. to consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement and Proposed Decisions in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

**Friday, April 24, 2020**

**General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:31 a.m. and roll call was taken.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**4C: Adoption of Subject Matter Requirements and Teaching Performance Expectations for Theatre and Dance**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided revised draft Subject Matter Requirements (SMRs) and Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) for Theatre and Dance for potential adoption by the Commission.

**David Metz, representing himself**, raised a question regarding the methods used by Evaluation Systems and the Commission to inform the public about the field review survey.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to adopt the revised Subject Matter Requirements and Teaching Performance Expectations for Theatre and Dance. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4B: Teacher Supply in California, 2018-19 A Report to the Legislature**

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a report to the Governor and the Legislature on the number of teachers who received credentials, certificates, permits and waivers to teach in California public schools. In addition to the written Teacher Supply report, information on the educator supply dashboards was provided.

**Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Education**, raised concerns regarding the inequitable ethnicity distribution of the current teaching workforce and requested gatekeepers such as the RICA be removed to increase a diverse representation in classrooms.

**Rigel Spencer Massaro, Public Advocates**, raised concerns regarding teacher shortage, teacher diversity and the disproportional impact that underprepared teachers have on high need special education students, African American students, and English learners. She also requested the Commission continue to support and strengthen the teacher pipeline.

**Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District**, spoke about the importance of the data provided in the teacher supply report and requested the Commission include information on race, ethnicity, and gender of new credential holders in future reports to better graph the trends overtime regarding teacher diversity in the state. He also asked the Commission and other stakeholders to continue to support the statewide efforts among IHEs and LEAs to recruit

and retain excellent educators and to continue advocating for adequate funding given the uncertainty of future budgetary resources and the effects on the workforce due to the COVID-19 crisis.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Hinde moved to approve the Teacher Supply in California, 2018-19 report for transmittal to the Governor and the Legislature. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4D: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Newhall School District**

Poonam Bedi, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Newhall School District's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

**Marguerite Armstrong, Amy Gaudette, and Amanda Montemayor, Newhall School District,** assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to grant eligibility to Newhall School District and move forward to Stage III. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4E: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for San Mateo Union High School District**

Poonam Bedi, Assistant Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, San Mateo Union High School District's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

**Sabbie Hopkins and Kirk Black, San Mateo Union High School District,** assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to grant eligibility to San Mateo Union High School District and move forward to Stage III. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

**5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.



### **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Certification Committee.

#### **6A: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to Theatre and Dance Credentials**

Joshua Speaks, Manager, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations sections 80004, 80005, 80089.1, 80089.2, and 80089.3 to clarify, interpret, and make specific the Education Code sections pertaining to Single Subject Theatre and Dance credentials.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Allavie moved to adopt the proposed amendments to the Title 5 regulations pertaining to Single Subject Theatre and Dance credentials. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **6B: California Statewide Assignment Accountability System**

Erin Henderson, Research Data Analyst, and Erin Skubal, Director, Certification Division, presented this item which provided an overview of the new California Statewide Accountability System (CalSAAS) that was created in response to the statutory changes made to assignment monitoring provided by the Budget Act of 2018 and Assembly Bill (AB) 1219 (Chap. 782, Stats. 2019).

**Rigel Spencer Massaro, Public Advocates**, voiced continuing support regarding the additional capacity at the Commission to leverage this type of data, the connection between credential data and employment data, which makes CalSAAS and other analysis possible for the state and local communities. She also requested that the California Department of Education get the data to the Commission sooner to enable CalSAAS to provide the local communities with information on their teacher quality earlier than the summer.

### **Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

#### **7A: Status of Legislation**

Sasha Horwitz, Government Relations & Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of those legislative measures of interest to the Commission and addressed questions regarding any other legislation identified by Commissioners.

**Rigel Spencer Massaro, Public Advocates**, voiced support of AB 2485 and AB 1982. She also spoke in support of SB 614 and AB 3002.

**Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Education**, requested the Commission to take a supportive role in SB 614.

**Sarah Ashley Jones, California Teachers Association Student Liaison**, spoke in support of SB 614 and requested the Commission to take a support position as this bill moves forward.

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, voiced support of AB 1982 and AB 2485 and requested the Commission and the Legislature to help get these bills through quickly.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, spoke in support of the legislation on expanding options for teacher candidates to meet the competency requirements for passing the RICA, CBEST, and CSET.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

### **2H: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation**

Chair Sloan moved to accept the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee to appoint Cheryl Forbes, Lynn Larsen and Gerard Morrison to the Committee on Accreditation beginning July 1, 2020. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2I: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

### **2J: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair Hinde reported that the Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Jason Allen
- Julie Quock

The Commission denied the Petition for Reinstatement in the matter of Tylene De Vine. Commissioner Kung recused himself from this item.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- John Jefferson III
- Melissa Jones

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Jones Okeke and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Lee Hammond
- Reba Joyner

The Commission voted to reduce or otherwise mitigate the proposed penalty and adopt the balance of the Proposed Decision in the matter of Richard Murino. Commissioner Rodriguez recused herself from this item.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #35 Daniel Franco and adopted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Cooney recused himself from this item. The Commission also discussed Consent Calendar items #43 Tracey Hart, #66 Jason Marcus, and #70 Amytza Maskati, and adopted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

#60 Laura Kuykendall

#98 Jeffrey Schilp

#108 Dung Tran

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 11:20 a.m.

**Appendix A**

**Consideration of Actions to Assist Applicants, Educators, and Credential Candidates Impacted by Emergency Health and Safety Conditions Related to COVID-19**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
1	Mariama Gray	California Association of Professors of Education Administration	Oral
2	Serette Kaminski	California County Superintendents Educational Services Association	Oral
3	Tricia Gallagher Geurtsen	UC San Diego	Oral
4	Victoria Graf	California Association of Professors of Special Education/CEC Teacher Education Division	Oral/Written
5	Renee Hall	Self	Oral/Written
6	Miguel Zavala	Urban Learning Program, Cal State Los Angeles	Oral/Written
7	Sheridan Kautzmann	CSU East Bay	Oral
8	Ruchi Rangnath	University of San Francisco	Oral/Written
9	Harold Acord	California Teachers Association	Oral
10	Bryan Johnson	Los Angeles Unified School District	Oral
11	Sarah Lilli	Teacher Plus California	Oral/Written
12	Romel Antonie	California Charter Schools Association	Oral
13	Jarrett Austin Thomas	Self	Oral
14	John Borba	California State University Stanislaus	Oral
15	Laura Barhydt	Self	Oral
16	Eleanor Scott	Self	Oral
17	Lyn Scott	California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education	Oral
18	Michael Del Castillo	Self	Oral
19	Richard Ayers	Self	Oral
20	Martha Gunter	Self	Oral/Written
21	Angelica Montes	Self	Oral
22	Olivier Castaneda	Self	Oral
23	Bill Lucia	EdVoice	Written
24	Becky Sumbera/Ardella Dailey	California Association of Professors of Education Administration	Written

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
25	Tammra Dettviler-Velarde	Self	Written
26	Alison Dover	Self	Written
27	Alma Cisneros-Haight	Self	Written
28	Ogechi Ibeanusi	Self	Written
29	Maya Jones	Self	Written
30	Kathrynn Kang	Self	Written
31	Nicholas Linnet	Self	Written
32	Annette Minafo	San Francisco Unified School District	Written
33	Oona Fontanella-Nothom	Self	Written
34	Tricia Ouellette	Self	Written
35	Karina Pannizzo	Self	Written
36	Ferdinand Rivera	Loyola Marymount University	Written
37	SueEllen Thomas	Self	Written
38	Tiana Andrade	Self	Written
39	Andrew Duong	Self	Written
40	Beth Foraker	Self	Written
41	Shai Maor	Self	Written
42	Liz Mitchell	Self	Written

**Appendix B**

**Flexibility for Commission-Approved Educator Preparation Programs Due to the COVID-19 Crisis**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
1	Mariama Gray	California Association of Professors of Education Administration	Oral
2	Terrance Cao	Pepperdine University	Oral/Written
3	Olivier Castaneda	Self	Oral/Written
4	Marcia Russell	Ventura County Office of Education	Oral
5	Danette Brown	California Teachers Association	Oral
6	Martha Gunter	Self	Oral
7	Angelica Montes	Self	Oral
8	Lyn Scott	California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education	Oral
9	Kelli Ann Agner	Mount Saint Mary's University	Oral
10	John Borba	California State University Stanislaus	Oral
11	Brandy Sanchez	Self	Oral
12	Arlene Acosta	Self	Oral
13	Julie Sheldon	Walnut Valley Consortium Induction Program	Oral
14	Renee Hall	Self	Oral
15	Rachel Engelskirger	Self	Oral
16	Marlene Ferry	Self	Oral
17	Mark Spencer	Self	Oral
18	Joy Kutaka-Kennedy	Self	Oral
19	Joseph Robinson	Self	Oral
20	Janelle King	Self	Oral
21	Alison Dover	Self	Written
22	Charles Toombs/Theresa Montano	California Faculty Association	Written
23	Sarah Lillis	Teacher Plus California	Written
24	Shannon Bui	Oak Grove School District	Written
25	Liliana Contreras	Campbell Union School District	Written
26	Marena Doxie/Katherine Clemmensen	Evergreen School District	Written
27	Bill Lucia	EdVoice	Written

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
28	Michael Del Castillo	Self	Written
29	Tammra Detviler-Velarde	Self	Written
30	Julie Fiero	Self	Written
31	Oona Fontanella-Nothom	Self	Written
32	Rebecca Joseph	Self	Written
33	Kathrynn Kang	Self	Written
34	Brian LaMay	Self	Written
35	Ogechi Ibeanusi	Self	Written
36	Nicholas Linnet	Self	Written
37	Tricia Ouellette	Self	Written
38	SueEllen Thomas	Self	Written
39	Miguel Zavala	Urban Learning Program, Cal State Los Angeles	Written
40	Enrique Gonzalez	Self	Written
41	Tiana Andrade	Self	Written
42	Andrew Duong	Self	Written
43	Beth Foraker	Self	Written
44	Shai Maor	Self	Written
45	Liz Mitchell	Self	Written