
1A

Action

General Session

Approval of the November 2019 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the November 2019 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the November 2019 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the November 20-22, 2019 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member, Chair
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Kathleen Allavie, School Board Member
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative (11/21 only)
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative
Castle Redmond, Public Representative (11/22 only)
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

Commission Members Absent

Monica Martinez, Public Representative

Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 4:19 p.m.

1A: Interview and Recommendation of Members/Alternates to the Secondary Teacher Position for the Committee of Credentials

Ani Kindall, Attorney, Legal Office, presented this item which provided information about the selection process for appointments to the Committee of Credentials.

The Committee interviewed Julia Knoff, Jannis Wilson and Carol McKee Marque.

Committee Action

Commissioner Browne moved to recommend Julia Knoff be appointed to serve in the Secondary Teacher position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Klatt moved to recommend Jannis Wilson as the first alternate and Carol McKee Marque as the second alternate for the Secondary Teacher position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Browne seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Committee Chair Hartwig adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 5:55 p.m.

Thursday, November 21, 2019

General Session

Chair Tine Sloan convened the November 21-22, 2019 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:02 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

2A: Approval of the September 2019 Minutes

Commissioner Rodriguez moved approval of the September 2019 Executive Committee minutes. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the September 2019 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2B: Approval of the November 2019 Agenda

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the November 2019 Agenda. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2C: Approval of the November 2019 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Allavie moved approval of the September 2019 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 31. Matthew Fischer, 37. Paul Gappmayer, 41. Alfred Gragg, 53. Bradley Johnson, and 69. Lauren Morris, to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Jackson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2D: Chair's Report

Chair Sloan spoke about essential questions that guide the Commission's work and asked Commissioners to think about these guiding questions when planning agenda items and the Commission's future work.

2F: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy summarized the work accomplished by the Commission over the past year.

2G: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Barnes reported on her attendance at the California Association of School Counselors fall conference in Riverside.

Commissioner Allavie spoke about the expansion of the Pipeline Scholarship program between Riverside Unified School District and UC Riverside.

2H: Liaison Reports

Ilene Straus, State Board of Education Liaison, updated the Commission on the State Board's recent activities.

Commissioner Browne updated the Commission on the progress of the community college system redesign.

Commissioner Rodriguez reported on her attendance at the October 2019 Committee on Accreditation meeting.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

3A: Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation 2018-19

Anna Moore and Bob Frelly, Committee on Accreditation Co-Chairs, Cheryl Hickey and Erin Sullivan, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the 2018-19 Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation.

Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Education, stated she was pleased with the continued increase in teachers obtaining the bilingual authorization and requested the Commission to not create obstacles for teachers of color and bilingual candidates.

Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education, spoke about the ongoing need to have more bilingual education experts to serve on program review and accreditation site visits.

3B: Update on the Accreditation Data System

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the Commission's implementation of the Accreditation Data System.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA), submitted a letter which thanked Commission staff for the work done to implement and launch the Accreditation Data System.

Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education, talked about his experience with the Accreditation Data System and raised a concern regarding the importance of the ability to track the performance and progress of candidates who completed a program through an approved program sponsor and candidates that completed the exam only option for the bilingual authorization.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, expressed her excitement about the Accreditation Data System and raised several questions regarding collecting and improving the data.

3C: Discussion of the *California Dyslexia Guidelines* and Their Potential Use within Educator Preparation

Roxann Purdue, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the 2017 California Dyslexia Guidelines developed by the California Department of Education as required by Assembly Bill 1369 and suggested how the Commission might use these Guidelines in teacher preparation, induction, administrator preparation, and pupil personnel services preparation.

Theresa Costa Johansen and Richard Gifford, California Department of Education, assisted staff in presenting this item.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted [written comments or spoke on this item](#).

Commission Action

Commissioner Hinde moved to endorse the inclusion of the Dyslexia Guidelines as described in this item. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3D: Possible Adoption of New Teaching Performance Expectations Addressing Teaching Reading and Developing Literacy

Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultant, and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the draft Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) that explicitly address the knowledge, skills and abilities necessary for the development of literacy, including the teaching of reading, for Commission review and possible adoption.

[Appendix B](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted [written comments or spoke on this item](#).

Commission Action

Commissioner Sloan moved to adopt the new Teaching Performance Expectations addressing teaching reading and developing literacy with an amendment to change the term “struggling readers” to “students with reading difficulties.” Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3E: Further Discussion of Candidate Assessment Options for the Teaching of Reading and Developing Literacy

Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which reviewed current assessment practices related to the teaching of reading and development of literacy, including issues raised by stakeholders. This item also presented possible options for Commission discussion regarding how best to assess teacher candidate knowledge and skills in the future.

[Appendix C](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted [written comments or spoke on this item](#).

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:33 p.m. to consider the pending litigation in The Matter of Kathy Little, Simone Kovats and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Committee of Credentials of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Doe 1 through Doe 20, (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2019-80003254); The Matter of Brandon Blevins v. CTC (Case no. 37-2019-00049010); The Matter of an Appeal before The State Personnel Board (*Case no. 19-1012*); and The Matter of Emily Ismael v. CTC (Case no. 34-2019-80003046). The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, November 22, 2019

General Session

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:32 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

3F: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for Stella Middle Charter Academy

Hart Boyd, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Stella Middle Charter Academy's responses to the Common Standards and applicable preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional Approval.

Marina Velez and Nicole Wellman Noble, Stella Middle Charter Academy, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Allavie moved to grant Provisional Approval to Stella Middle Charter Academy and set the Provisional Approval period to be three years. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3G: Update on Three State-Funded Grant Programs

Iyore Osamwonyi, Assistant Consultant, and Cara Mendoza, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on three state-funded grant programs: the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program, the California Center on Teaching Careers, and the Integrated Undergraduate Teacher Preparation Program. This item also presented the 2019 Annual Report to the Legislature for the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program, and the California Center for Teaching

Careers: Final Report to Legislature as required by statute for Commission review and approval to transmit to the Legislature.

Donna Glassman-Sommer, California Center on Teaching Careers, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA), submitted a letter which expressed their interest in the data contained in the 2019 Report to the Legislature on the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program.

Bryan Johnson, Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD), thanked Commission staff for compiling this report and shared the positive outcome of the grant program at LAUSD. He further encouraged the Commission to continue to advocate for these types of programs which has helped to recruit, train and retain the best teachers for their students.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, expressed her excitement and interest in the data provided in the report.

Commission Action

Commissioner Hartwig moved to approve the 2019 Annual Report to the Legislature on the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program and the California Center on Teaching Careers: Final Report to the Legislature November 2019 for transmittal to the Legislature. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3H: Proposed Blueprint for the New California Subject Examinations for Teachers (CSET) Single Subject Examinations for Theatre and Dance

Mike Taylor, Consultant, and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the proposed Examination Blueprint for the new California Subject Examinations for Teachers (CSET) in Theatre and Dance. This item included reference information on how the CSET examinations have been designed for other single subject content areas and provided the opportunity for the Commission to provide input on the test design for the new single subject content areas of Theatre and Dance.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA), submitted a letter which spoke about their interest in participating in the larger discussion around the future of the CSET and subject matter competency across subject areas and credential types.

Jane Robb, California Teachers Association, requested the Commission to include a list of advisory panel members in the agenda item.

Commission Action

Commissioner Hinde moved to approve the proposed blueprint for the CSET single subject examinations in Theatre and Dance. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3I: Plan to Review and Update the *California Standards for the Teacher Profession*

Cara Mendoza and Karen Sacramento, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a plan to work with a Content Expert Work Group to provide recommended revisions/updates to the California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP).

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA), submitted a letter which stated their anticipation in contributing to the review and revision of the CSTP in 2020 as part of the ongoing commitment to greater alignment with the state's teacher preparation and induction system, as well as the state's conceptual framework for professional growth and development of California's teachers throughout the span of their careers.

Certification Committee

Committee Chair Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo convened the Certification Committee.

4A: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to the Teaching Permit for Statutory Leave

Thomas Johnson, Analyst, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations section 80022 to allow local employing agencies to request a Teaching Permit for Statutory Leave (TPSL) to be used when a teacher of record is unable to provide instructional services due to being on Military Leave or Administrative Leave.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA), submitted a letter which supported proposed amendments to add extended military leave and administrative leave to the list of approved types of leave for the TPSL.

Jane Robb, California Teachers Association, raised concerns on including administrative leave as a recognized form of statutory leave for the TPSL.

Doug Gephart, Association of California School Administrators, voiced support for the proposed amendments pertaining to the TPSL.

Luz Ortega, Los Angeles Unified School District, spoke in support of the proposed amendments.

Commission Action

Commissioner Klatt moved to approve the proposed amendments to allow LEAs to request a TPSL to be used when a teacher of record is unable to provide instructional services due to being on extended Military Leave or Administrative Leave for the purposes of beginning the rulemaking file for submission to the Office of Administrative Law. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4B: Proposed Additional Requirements for the Issuance of an Eminence Credential

Katherine Wright, Analyst, Certification Committee, presented this item which provided proposed additions to the current requirements for the issuance of both the preliminary and clear Eminence Credentials for the Commission's consideration and potential adoption.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA), submitted a letter which agreed with the need for establishing high standards for classroom teachers and the expectation that candidates should have similar Knowledge, skills and abilities for instructing English learners and students with disabilities. In addition to asking for clarification on the number of candidates that would be affected by the proposed requirements, the letter also expressed their interest in continuing to find ways to address the teacher shortage, especially in hard to fill areas.

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, requested the Commission to consider all of the proposed requirements be added to the Eminence Credential.

Commission Action

Commissioner Jackson moved to approve the proposed additional requirements for the Eminence Credential as presented in this item. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Legislative Committee

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

6A: Legislative Proposals

Sasha Horwitz, Manager, Government Relations & Public Affairs, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided legislative proposals for the 2020 legislative year for Commission consideration.

Commission Action

Commissioner Marks moved to approve the legislative proposal regarding the subject matter competency requirement. Commissioner Sloan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Allavie moved to approve the legislative proposal regarding outdated Education Code sections. Commissioner Redmond seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Rodriguez moved to approve the legislative proposal regarding preaccreditation. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

2H: Interview and Recommendation of Members/Alternates to the Secondary Teacher Position for the Committee of Credentials

Commissioner Rodriguez moved to accept the following recommendations: 1) the appointment of Julia Knoff to serve in the Secondary Teacher position on the Committee of Credentials, and 2) the appointment of Jannis Wilson as the first alternate and Carol McKee Marque as the second alternate in the Secondary Teacher position. Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2I: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice Chair Hinde reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of *Kathy Little, Simone Kovats and Debra Sather v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Committee of Credentials of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Doe 1 through Doe 20; Brandon Blevins v. CTC; Emily Ismael v. CTC; and the Matter of an Appeal before the State Personnel Board*, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- John Nguyen
- Jermaine Calhoun
- Thomas Lueker
- Michael Smith

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Matef Harmachis. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order. Commissioners Cooney and Sloan recused themselves from this item.

The Commission adopted the Proposed Decision in the matter of Harry Kirschner.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #41 Alfred Gragg, #53 Bradley Johnson, #69 Lauren Morris, and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:

- #31 Matthew Fischer
- #37 Paul Gappmayer

2J: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

2K: Nominations and Elections for the Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2020

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy presented this item regarding the nominations and elections for Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2020.

Commissioner Rodriguez nominated Tine Sloan as Chair. Commissioner Browne nominated Alicia Hinde as Vice Chair.

Commissioner Jackson moved to waive the applicable provisions of the Policy Manual to allow for a voice vote to elect Tine Sloan as Chair. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Klatt moved to waive the applicable provisions of the Policy Manual to allow for a voice vote to elect Alicia Hinde as Vice Chair. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 11:41 a.m.

Appendix A

3C: Discussion of the California Dyslexia Guidelines and Their Potential Use within Educator Preparation

	Name	Affiliation	Written/Oral Statement
1.	Catherine Christo	Self	Oral
2.	Harold Acord	California Teachers Association	Oral
3.	Renee Webster Hawkins	Decoding Dyslexia California	Oral
4.	Patricia Pernin	Los Angeles Unified School District	Oral
5.	Carrier Chee	Self	Oral
6.	Janet Davis	California Federation of Teachers	Oral
7.	Naomi Eason	California School Boards Association	Written
8.	Lisa Klipfel	Self	Written
9.	Shannon Soller	Self	Written
10.	Elva Duran	Self	Written
11.	Veronica Ino	Self	Written
12.	Megan Potente	Self	Written
13.	Elizabeth Bloom	Self	Written
14.	Laura Haislip	Self	Written
15.	Sherry Rubalcava	Self	Written
16.	Erica Chapman	Self	Written

Appendix B

**3D: Possible Adoption of New Teaching Performance Expectations Addressing Teaching
Reading and Developing Literacy**

	Name	Affiliation	Written/Oral Statement
1.	Jane Robb	California Teachers Association	Oral
2.	Nancy Brynelson	California State University	Oral
3.	Renee Webster Hawkins	Decoding Dyslexia California	Oral
4.	Doug Gephart	Association of California School Administrators	Oral
5.	Tobie Meyer	Decoding Dyslexia California	Written
6.	Naomi Eason	California School Boards Association	Written
7.	Christy Rees	Self	Written
8.	Donna Walsh	Self	Written
9.	Laura Haislip	Self	Written
10.	Kathleen Henderson	Self	Written
11.	Megan Potente	Self	Written
12.	Rachel Hurd	Self	Written
13.	Virginia Merwin	Self	Written
14.	Kelly Hatfield	Self	Written
15.	Deberah Schlagel	Self	Written
16.	Sue Gonzalez	Self	Written

Appendix C

3E: Further Discussion of Candidate Assessment Options for the Teaching of Reading and Developing Literacy

	Name	Affiliation	Written/Oral Statement
1.	Renee Webster Hawkins	Decoding Dyslexia California	Oral
2.	Efrain Mercado	California Teachers Association	Oral
3.	Doug Gephart	Association of California School Administrators	Oral
4.	Tonya Almeida	Riverside County Office of Education	Oral
5.	Jane Robb	California Teachers Association	Oral
6.	Savannah Campbell	Edvoice	Oral
7.	Sarah Lillis	Teach Plus California	Oral
8.	Janet Davis	California Federation of Teachers	Oral
9.	Rigel Massaro	Public Advocates	Oral
10.	Bill Lucia	EdVoice	Written
11.	Tobie Meyer	Decoding Dyslexia California	Written
12.	Katie Braude	SpeakUP	Written
13.	Barbara Langeloh	International Dyslexia Association – Los Angeles	Written
14.	Steve Mayo	International Dyslexia Association – San Diego	Written
15.	Emma Elizalde	International Dyslexia Association – Northern California	Written
16.	Seth Litt	Parent Revolution	Written
17.	Margaret Goldberg	Right to Read Project	Written
18.	Regina Richards	International Dyslexia Association – Southern California Tri-Counties	Written
19.	Alma Marquez	La Comadre	Written