

---

# 2A

## Action

### *General Session*

### Approval of the September 2019 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the September 2019 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the September 2019 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

### Strategic Plan Goal

#### ***III. Communication and Engagement***

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the September 26-27, 2019 Meeting

---

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Tine Sloan, Faculty Member, Chair  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Kathleen Allavie, School Board Member  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol De La Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative (9/27 only)  
Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative  
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Castle Redmond, Public Representative (9/27 only)  
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative  
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

### **Commission Members Absent**

Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University

### ***Thursday, September 26, 2019***

#### **Executive Committee**

Chair Tine Sloan convened the Executive Committee at 9:05 a.m.

#### **1A: Educator Preparation Student Liaison**

Rhonda Brown, Manager, Executive Office, presented this item which provided information regarding the selection process for the Educator Preparation Student Liaison.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner De La Torre-Escobedo moved to appoint Lindsey Balidoy to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year beginning October 1, 2019. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan convened the September 26-27, 2019 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:13 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

**2A: Approval of the August 2019 Minutes**

Commissioner Allavie moved approval of the August 2019 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Klatt abstaining.

**2B: Approval of the September 2019 Agenda**

Commissioner Rodriguez moved approval of the September 2019 Agenda. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2C: Approval of the September 2019 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Jackson moved approval of the September 2019 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 4. Keith Baxter, 6. Annmarie Blevins, 31. John Hoffmeyer, 33. Kendra Huff, 35. Kenneth Ingersoll, 37. Rachel Kamiya, 39. Timothy Krahn, 47. Ruben Martinez, 50. Dan Mcquigg, 57. Salvador Navarro, 63. Todd Potter, 73. Jeremy Severin, and 78. Loren Thrathen, to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2D: Chair's Report**

Chair Sloan spoke about her experience at college parent orientation and encouraged the Commission and public to allow their beliefs, which were developed over many years, to be challenged regarding their perspective on literacy.

**2F: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy welcomed Brandon Hinton as a new attorney in the Commission's Legal Office. Executive Director Sandy also congratulated Lynette Roby on her upcoming retirement.

**2G: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Jackson reported on her attendance at the Excellence through Equity Conference 2019 at Riverside County Office of Education.

Commissioner Barnes reported that the California Association of School Counselors fall conference will be held on October 2-4, 2019 in Riverside. She also talked about the campaign launched by the California Association of School Counselors and the American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU) to decrease school counselor-student ratios in California.

Commissioner Browne updated the Commission on the Heising-Simons grant to support the development of early math instruction at two and four year colleges. She also provided an update on recent activities at the Community College Chancellor's Office.

Commissioner Rodriguez greeted her 9<sup>th</sup> grade students who were watching the Commission meeting remotely from their classroom and thanked her substitute teacher for filling in while she was absent from the class.

Commissioner Marks recognized the celebration of 100 years of Waldorf education internationally. She also acknowledged her school's 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary as the only public Waldorf School in the nation.

Commissioner Kung shared about his excitement for having a student teacher in his classroom.

## **2H: Liaison Reports**

Aya Shhub, Commission Student Liaison, shared her first year teaching experiences as a new middle school special education teacher at Riverside Unified School District. She also thanked the Commission for giving her the opportunity to serve as the Liaison for the past year.

Commissioner Rodriguez reported on her attendance at the August 2019 Committee on Accreditation meeting.

## **Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

## **3A: Commission on Teacher Credentialing Budget**

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an overview of the Commission's budget for the 2019-20 fiscal year including the overall revenue and expenditure projection. She also presented one-time project expenditures.

## **Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

## **4A: Status of Legislation**

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the Commission's sponsored legislation for 2019-20 and the status of legislative measures of interest.

## **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

## **5A: Draft Subject Matter Requirements and Draft Teaching Performance Expectations for the New Single Subject Theatre and Dance Credentials**

Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, and Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided draft Subject Matter Requirements (SMRs) and draft Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) for the new Single Subject Theatre and Dance credentials for the Commission's review and input, and requested Commission direction to move these draft SMRs and TPEs forward for content review by the field.

## **Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to approve the draft SMRs and TPEs for Theatre and Dance for content review by the field. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**5C: Discussion of Potential Addition of New Teaching Performance Expectations for the Development of Literacy and Assessment Considerations**

Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultant, and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission review and discussion draft Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) that explicitly address current knowledge, skills, and abilities necessary for the development of literacy, including the teaching of reading. The item also presented for discussion options concerning literacy TPEs and assessment.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted [written comments or spoke on this item](#).

The Commission directed staff to provide a benefit and cost analysis on the ideas that were surfaced during the discussion of this item and schedule a study session on best practices in assessing reading competency for teachers.

**5B: Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2017-18**

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2017-18, as required by Title II of the 2008 Reauthorization of the Higher Education Act. This is the nineteenth annual Title II report and includes a description of credentialing requirements to teach in California public schools and qualitative and quantitative information on teacher preparation programs.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA)**, submitted a letter which thanked Commission staff for compiling and preparing the information and data provided in the report.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, raised concerns about institutions that require fewer hours of supervised clinical experience than the minimum 600 hours required and the low number of fully prepared special education teachers. She suggested more movement in the area of gender and ethnicity distribution of enrolled candidates and requested the Commission consider more ways to increase teacher enrollment. She also spoke about the importance of institutions meeting the goals that they are setting and asked the Commission to include Teaching Performance Assessment pass rates in the report.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Allavie moved to approve the Annual Report Card on Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2017-18. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2J: New Business**

**Audience Presentations**

**Nancy Hurlbut, PEACH**, spoke about the importance of early childhood education and requested the Commission to move forward with the work on revising the Child Development Permit.

### **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:15 p.m. to consider the pending litigation in The Matter of Emily Ismael v. CTC (Case no. 34-2019-80003046), and The Matter of an Appeal before The State Personnel Board (Case no. 19-1012). The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, a Decision and Order, and a Proposed Decision in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

### ***Friday, September 27, 2019***

### **General Session**

Chair Tine Sloan reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:31 a.m. and roll call was taken.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **5D Review of the Preconditions for Single Subject Matter Programs**

Hart Boyd and Miranda Gutierrez, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an analysis of the current precondition requirements related to the minimum number of units required in a Commission-approved Single Subject Matter program. This item also presented questions for the Commission to consider related to the Single Subject Matter programs and preconditions and proposed a plan to review the required number of units for each program.

### **5E: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Los Angeles Pacific University**

Lynette Roby Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Los Angeles Pacific University's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

**Craig Brewer and Gordon Jorgenson, Los Angeles Pacific University**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Hinde moved to grant Eligibility to Los Angeles Pacific University and move the institution forward to Stage III. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**5F: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for Alameda County Office of Education**

Hart Boyd, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Alameda County Office of Education's responses to the Common Standards and applicable preconditions for consideration and possible Provisional approval by the Commission.

**Derek Gorshow, Alameda County Office of Education**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Allavie moved to grant Provisional approval to Alameda County Office of Education and set the Provisional approval period to three years. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**5G: Update on the Work Group on Career Technical Education**

Bob Loux and Jake Shuler, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the work group convened by the Commission, in collaboration with the California Department of Education and the Comprehensive Assistance Center at WestEd to review Career Technical Education (CTE) in California.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA)**, submitted a letter which urged the Commission to maintain the existing requirement that CTE teachers be prepared to provide linguistic supports for English learners and suggested the Commission consider the recruitment for the CTE work group draw more extensively from the four industry sectors.

**Elly Garner, Project Lead the Way (PLTW)**, submitted a letter which requested the Commission to allow programs like PTLW be considered allowable industry experience and suggested that current alternate methods to fulfill the hours requirement through coursework, industry certification or teaching be kept in place. The letter also asked the Commission to provide sufficient time to allow the field to come into compliance with new rules and regulations as a result of this work.

**Annie Johnston, UC Berkeley College & Career Academy Support Network**, raised concerns regarding the current practice of putting CTE teachers into classrooms based on their industry competencies alone with infrequent access to minimum mentoring. She suggested the workgroup identify competencies that include learning experts who understand the key role of CTE teachers in effective college and career pathways and teacher educators with expertise in STEM pathway development. Lastly, she thanked Commission staff for providing more effective statewide guidance to the field regarding work experience requirements.

**5H: Plan to Review and Update the Bilingual Authorization Program Standards**

Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a plan to work with stakeholders, preparation programs, and teachers to review and revise the program standards for Bilingual Authorization programs.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA)**, submitted a letter which expressed their interest in reviewing the bilingual authorization preparation standards to ensure programs align with the field's current understanding of best practices.

### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

#### **6A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

#### **6B: Division of Professional Practices Annual Workload Report Fiscal Year 2018-19**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided the annual report on the discipline workload of the Division of Professional Practices for Fiscal Year 2018-19.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Sloan reconvened the General Session.

### **2H: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair Hinde reported that the Office of the Attorney General briefed the Commission on the pending litigation matter of Emily Ismael v. CTC. No reportable action was taken.

Staff briefed the Commission on The Matter of an Appeal before the State Personnel Board (Case no. 19-1012). No reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Ponchita Beckham
- Donavon Doyle
- Duane Flanigan
- Ellen Shumacher

The Commission denied the Petition for Reinstatement in the matter of Jennifer Foley.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Matef Harmachis and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Margarito Madueno.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #6 Annmarie Blevins, #37 Rachel Kamiya, #47 Ruben Martinez, #50 Dan Mcquigg, #57 Salvador Navarro, #63 Todd Potter, #73 Jeremy Severin, # 78 Loren Thrathen, and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed the following Consent Calendar items and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials:



- #4. Keith Baxter
- #31. John Hoffmeyer
- #33. Kendra Huff
- #35. Kenneth Ingersoll
- #39. Timothy Krahn

**2I: Report of Executive Committee**

Chair Sloan reported that the Executive Committee appointed Lindsey Balidoy to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year beginning October 1, 2019.

**2J: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

**Audience Presentations**

**Jane Robb, California Teachers Association**, requested the Commission to include a statement of financial implication as a part of agenda items.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Sloan adjourned the meeting at 10:56 a.m.

**Appendix A**

**Discussion of Potential Addition of New Teaching Performance Expectations for the  
Development of Literacy and Assessment Considerations**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
1	Danette Brown	California Teachers Association	Oral
2	Harold Acord	California Teachers Association	Oral
3	Serette Kaminski	California County Superintendents Educational Services Association	Oral/Written
4	Ivannia Soto	California Association for Bilingual Education	Oral
5	Lyn Scott	California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education	Oral
6	Rigel Massaro	Public Advocates	Oral
7	Bill Lucia	EdVoice	Oral/Written
8	Michelle Jones	Teachers College of San Joaquin	Oral
9	Jane Robb	California Teachers Association	Oral
10	Tobie Meyer	Decoding Dyslexia CA	Written
11	Naomi Eason	California School Boards Association	Written
12	Laura DePole	Self	Written
13.	Raymond Depole	Self	Written
14	Kristen Koeller	Self	Written
15	Allison Stone	Self	Written
16	Megan Potene	Self	Written
17	Elaine Bush	Self	Written
18	Kathryn Inglin	Self	Written
19	Jennifer Veras	Self	Written
20	Kim Mclean	Self	Written
21	Virginia Culy	Self	Written
22	Kelie Ginestet	Self	Written
23	Helen Zielinski	Self	Written
24	Catherine Lara	Self	Written
25	Olympia Montgomery	Self	Written
26	Sara Veloz	Self	Written
27	Amber Owen	Self	Written
28	Amy Tompkins	Self	Written
29	Stacy Raleigh	Self	Written
30	Irene Tackett	Self	Written
31	Sabrina Axt	Self	Written
32	Elizabeth Murray	Self	Written
33	Rhea Rojas	Self	Written

September 26-27, 2019 Commission Meeting  
Approved Minutes

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
34	Stacy McKellar	Self	Written
35	Jana Adams	Self	Written
36	Christina Romero	Self	Written
37	Martha Brooder	Self	Written
38	Lori Parra	Self	Written
39	Doris Lee	Self	Written
40	Celeste Winders	Self	Written
41	Dennis Palmer	Self	Written
42	Jenae Cooper	Self	Written
43	Therese Devine	Self	Written
44	Cindy Kim	Self	Written
45	Taffy Johnson	Self	Written
46	Aimee Hays	Self	Written
47	Adriana Garcia	Self	Written
48	Christine Sharrock	Self	Written
49	Elise Youmans	Self	Written
50	Patricia Carlin	Self	Written
51	Terry Leppien	Self	Written
52	Deborah Jacobson	Self	Written
53	John DeVillers	Self	Written
54	Melinda Luby	Self	Written
55	Sharon Philips	Self	Written
56	Emma Elizalde	Self	Written
57	Elizabeth Bloom	Self	Written
58	Sheila Iverson	Self	Written
59	Esther Romero	Self	Written
60	Julia Hoffman	Self	Written
61	Lilliana Po-Garcia	Self	Written
62	Christina Pickart	Self	Written
63	Leatha Ferreira	Self	Written
64	Deirdre Brownell	Self	Written
65	Linda Diamond	Self	Written
66	Kristin Ekvall	Self	Written
67	Jennifer Spencer	Self	Written
68	Patricia Schreiner	Self	Written
69	Daryl Ragan	Self	Written
70	Audrey Ledesma	Self	Written
71	Patrick Settle	Self	Written
72	Gloria Jackson	Self	Written
73	Susan Sloan	Self	Written
74	Stacy Franks	Self	Written

September 26-27, 2019 Commission Meeting  
Approved Minutes

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
75	Cecilia Silva-Santisteban	Self	Written
76	Marcine Johnson	Self	Written
77	Joe Buhowsky	Self	Written
78	Roberta Gleeson	Self	Written
79	Prisca Gloor	Self	Written
80	Cindi Darling	Self	Written
81	Laura Zarembski	Self	Written
82	Robert Matlock	Self	Written
83	James Dodd	Self	Written
84	Jim Lieberman	Self	Written
85	Amy Carlos	Self	Written
86	Thomas Frank	Self	Written
87	Carey Corr	Self	Written
88	James Fletcher	Self	Written
89	Dennis Tapley	Self	Written
90	Diana Puccio	Self	Written
91	Robert Barry	Self	Written
92	Karen-Michele Russell-Hagler	Self	Written
93	Jeff McCann	Self	Written
94	Al Owen	Self	Written
95	Julie Frank	Self	Written
96	David Peters	Self	Written
97	Alexandria Lopez	Self	Written
98	Jill Davine	Self	Written
99	Karen Chow	Self	Written
100	John Walton	Self	Written
101	Alma Marquez	Self	Written
102	Virginia Leslie	Self	Written
103	Mark Cappetta	Self	Written
104	Denise Balma	Self	Written
105	Howard Cohen	Self	Written
106	Arthur Rock	Self	Written
107	Penny Hartman	Self	Written
108	Nancy Lucia	Self	Written
109	Regina Richards	Self	Written
110	Irv Richards	Self	Written
111	Paul Warenycia	Self	Written
112	Michael Denton	Self	Written
113	Lisa Turnbow	Self	Written

September 26-27, 2019 Commission Meeting  
Approved Minutes

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
114	Donna Jensen	Self	Written
115	Anita Barone	Self	Written
116	Camille Gilbert	Self	Written
117	Charlotte Pirch	Self	Written
118	Warren Gold	Self	Written
119	Alana Inugai	Self	Written
120	Linda Noltensmeier	Self	Written
121	Toni Rux	Self	Written
122	Deanna Knickerbocker	Self	Written
123	Susanna Ordway	Self	Written
124	Mark Glasser	Self	Written
125	Katie Herberger	Self	Written
126	Camille Michaud	Self	Written
127	Eric Tilenius	Self	Written
128	Leticia Gomez	Self	Written
129	Maryellen Redish	Self	Written
130	John Maybury	Self	Written
131	Joe Smith	Self	Written
132	Arlene Kaplan	Self	Written
133	Jennifer Biang	Self	Written
134	Teresa Pierce	Self	Written
135	Marilyn Cachola	Self	Written
136	Joel Pitts	Self	Written
137	Lydia Tinder	Self	Written
138	Danny DeTora	Self	Written
139	Megan Portoni	Self	Written
140	Kathy Futterman	Self	Written
141	Tom Edminster	Self	Written
142	Marvilene Hagopian	Self	Written
143	Leslie Woodward	Self	Written
144	Nancy Redding	Self	Written
145	Amy Webster	Self	Written
146	Kari Cone	Self	Written
147	Bianca Molgora	Self	Written
148	Delia Chudanski	Self	Written