

---

# 3B

## Action

### *General Session*

### Approval of the February 2019 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the February 2019 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the February 2019 meeting.

**Presenters:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

#### *III. Communication and Engagement*

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the February 6-8, 2019 Meeting

---

### Commission Member Attending

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Kathleen Allavie, School Board Member  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University (2/7 only)  
José Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative (2/7 only)  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative  
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative  
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

### Commission Member Absent

Terri Jackson, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Castle Redmond, Public Representative  
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California

### *Wednesday, February 6, 2019*

#### Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 1:07 p.m.

#### **1A: Interview and Recommendation of Members/Alternates to the School Administrator Position for the Committee of Credentials**

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

- Marybeth Murray
- Mark Ryan
- Richard Lopez
- Judy Farina
- Tammy Patten
- Jacob Guthrie

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Martinez moved to recommend Jacob Guthrie be appointed to serve in the School Administrator position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Hartwig moved to recommend Richard Lopez and Tammy Patten be appointed as School Administrator alternates on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Committee Chair Rodriguez adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 3:34 p.m.

### ***Thursday, February 7, 2019***

### **General Session**

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the February 7-8, 2019 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:01 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Darling-Hammond announced the appointments for the 2019 Executive Committee:

- Haydee Rodriguez, Educator Preparation Committee
- Michael Cooney, Professional Practices Committee
- Monica Martinez, Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee
- Alicia Hinde, Legislative Committee
- Marysol Escobedo, Certification Committee
- Kevin Kung, Appeals and Waivers Committee

### **2A: Approval of the November 2018 Minutes**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the November 2018 Ad Hoc Committee Meeting minutes. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the November 2018 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Escobedo, Gonzalez, and Martinez abstaining.

### **2B: Approval of the February 2019 Agenda**

Commissioner Gonzalez moved approval of the February 2019 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 2C and 6A. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2C: Approval of the February 2019 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Allavie moved approval of the February 2019 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 27. Juan Centeno, 54. Benjamin Gillam, 104. Veronica Pellegrin,

106. Dave Pinkston, to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2D: Chair's Report**

Chair Darling-Hammond spoke about the major shift in California policy over the past eight years in education and what challenges still need to be addressed.

**2E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy congratulated Charlie Watters on his recent retirement.

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy introduced Erin Skubal as the Interim Director for the Certification Division and Erin Sullivan as an Administrator for the Professional Services Division.

**2F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Barnes celebrated National School Counseling Week and talked about the Counselor ratio that has improved to 1:620 as compared to few years ago. She also congratulated Catalina Cifuentes on her recent appointment by State Superintendent Tony Thurmond as the Deputy Superintendent of the Performance, Planning, and Technology Branch of the California Department of Education.

Commissioner Browne thanked Commission staff Erin Sullivan and Phyllis Jacobson for their presentation at the California Community College Early Childhood Education meeting. She also reported that the California Community College Association Spring conference will be held in April.

Commissioner Gonzalez reported on his attendance at the California School Boards Association Annual Education conference in November 2018 and expressed his appreciation to Commission staff for the work they do.

Commissioner Escobedo provided an update on the current situation in Butte County after the Camp Fire.

**2G: Liaison Reports**

Commissioner Rodriguez reported her attendance at the January Committee on Accreditation meeting.

Commissioner Kung reported that he and Commissioner Klatt attended the first of four Career Technical Education work group meetings.

Commissioner Klatt also reported on her attendance at the Career Technical Education work group meeting.

Aya Shuub, Commission Student Liaison, reported on her conversations with various cohorts at the University of California, Riverside and also with first year student teachers.

**2H: Commission on Teacher Credentialing Priorities for 2019**

Mary Vixie Sandy, Executive Director, presented this item which provided an update on the ongoing work of the Commission, listed specific milestones for this year related to ongoing projects, and identified new priority projects for 2019.

**Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Education**, reiterated the need for a bilingual expert panel to provide guidance in between the bilingual workgroup meetings to make developmentally appropriate recommendations.

**Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education**, suggested a dual language/bilingual advisory group be assembled to assist the Commission with the work on the Child Development Permit and the upcoming RICA panel.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, spoke about the priority on working with the Attorney General's Office and stakeholders to restructure the Commission's educator discipline process.

**Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Monica Martinez convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

**3A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2019-20 Budget**

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Governor's proposed 2019-20 budget that relates to the Commission.

**Serette Kaminski, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, raised a concern on the trailer bill regarding assignment monitoring.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**4A: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Stella Middle Charter Academy**

Lynette Roby, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Stella Middle Charter Academy's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

**Alexandra Lee and Marina Velez, Stella Middle Charter Academy**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to grant eligibility to Stella Middle Charter Academy to move forward to Stage III of the Initial Institutional Approval process. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **4B: Child Development Permit: Candidate Performance Expectations and Preparation Program Guidelines**

Erin Sullivan and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the revised Early Childhood Education (ECE) Performance Expectations and Preparation Program Guidelines related to the Child Development Permit for review and potential adoption.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association (CSBA)**, submitted a letter which thanked the Commission for its work to move towards a competency-based system for the licensed early childhood workforce. The letter also stated that CSBA looks forward to working with the Commission and the legislature on potential approaches for the Commission's role in program accountability.

**Patricia Lozano, Early Edge California**, voiced support of moving towards a competency based certification system and suggested the workforce be compensated while raising the qualifications.

**Jeannette Mulhern, California Community College Early Childhood Educators**, voiced support for the adoption of the revised ECE Performance Expectations and Preparation Program Guidelines and requested continued collaboration on the finalization and implementation of the document. She also asked that the unique needs of young children, age 0-8, and related teacher practices and content be retained in the document and the finalization of the Child Development Permit.

**Toni Isaacs, Partnerships for Education, Articulation and Coordination through Higher Education (PEACH)**, recommended additional minor modifications to the revised performance expectations and program guidelines.

**Jan Fish, PEACH**, spoke and submitted a letter on this item which suggested additional modifications and next steps be accomplished to finalize the current drafts. She requested the Commission to invite the Child Development Permit Advisory Panel to collaborate with Commission staff to finalize and vet descriptions of the ECE concepts reflected in the key areas identified by the field and to clearly represent an ECE perspective.

**Jaime Kalenik, First 5 Los Angeles**, thanked the Commission for its efforts in developing ECE performance expectations and preparation program guidelines as well as for the commitment to continue to engage with the field throughout this process. She also voiced support of the movement towards a competency based system for the performance expectations, especially the use of California early childhood educator competencies as a resource and guide.

**Antonia Lopez, Campaign for Quality Early Education**, raised concerns regarding dual language learners.

**Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education**, suggested the Commission correct the terminology from “English learners” to “Dual language learners” in the ECE Teaching Performance Expectations.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Darling-Hammond moved to adopt the revised draft Performance Expectations and Program Guidelines with the modification that the language throughout the documents be modified to change “English learners” to “Dual language learners (DLL)”, ensuring that DLL are viewed consistently in the document as having assets as well as needs, and modifying the language concerning the role of play in early learning to include the value of “child-initiated play.” Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Commission further directed staff to bring back the Performance Expectations and Program Guidelines for future amendments while continuing to work with stakeholders.

#### **4C: Concurrent Bilingual Authorization Candidates and the Teaching Performance Assessment Requirement**

Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessment Development, and Miranda Gutierrez, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which addressed the context of Concurrent Bilingual Candidates relative to the Teaching Performance Assessment (TPA) requirement, and provided options for the Commission’s consideration and potential staff direction.

**Tamara Collins-Parks, representing herself**, submitted a letter which suggested: 1) that the California Department of Education and the Commission require and Pearson provide bilingual scorers for single subject candidates in bilingual placements, 2) that the remuneration to scorers be increased, and 3) more attention be given to bilingual pedagogy within the bilingual versions of the edTPA.

**Ivannia Soto, California Association of Bilingual Education**, voiced support for option 1 and 2 listed in the item with a slight preference for option 2 as it emphasized the work with English learners.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, spoke in favor of option 2 that best aligned with the broad majority of statutory options for teaching English learners.

**Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education**, raised concerns about option 3 and voiced support for option 2.

The Commission directed staff to clarify with the field regarding the intent of the Assessment Design Standards concerning the concurrent bilingual candidates and the TPA.

#### **4D: Proposed Modification of the Equivalency Process for Commission-Approved Subject Matter Preparation Programs**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the current equivalency process for Commission-approved subject matter preparation programs (SMPPs) and proposed a modification to the process that would allow Commission-approved SMPPs to grant an equivalency when a candidate has passed one or more subtests of the California Subject Examinations for Teachers (CSET).

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which supported staff recommendations to allow SMPPs to grant equivalency for SMPP coursework that addresses the Subject Matter Requirements assessed in the CSET subtests that have been successfully passed by a candidate.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, commended Commission staff on the creativity, flexibility and quick turnaround to address the barrier for teacher candidates while maintaining the standards and commitment to subject matter competence.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Hinde moved to approve the proposed modification of the equivalency process for SMPPs. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **Recess**

#### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 1:29 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126, to consider the following pending litigation: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE). The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Proposed Decisions, hearing transcripts, and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

#### **Friday, February, 2018**

#### **General Session**

Vice Chair Alicia Hinde reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:32 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Vice Chair Alicia Hinde opened the public hearing.

#### **2I: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to Cost Recovery Fees for Extraordinary Accreditation Activities**

Kathryn Polster, Analyst, and Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of



Regulations sections 80691 and 80692 related to Cost Recovery Fees for Extraordinary Accreditation Activities.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Klatt moved to adopt the proposed regulations pertaining to Cost Recovery Fees for Extraordinary Accreditation Activities for submission to the Office of Administrative Law. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2J: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to Administrative Services Credentials**

Tammy Duggan, Consultant, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations section 80054 pertaining to California prepared administrators and the addition of section 80054.1 to clarify, interpret, and make specific the Education Code sections pertaining to the requirements for administrators prepared outside California.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which supported the recommendation to recruit out-of-state educators who have demonstrated acceptable levels of preparation elsewhere.

**Noni Reis, California Association of Professors of Educational Administration (CAPEA)**, submitted a letter which acknowledged the logical equivalency to allow out-of-state prepared administrators with at least three years of full-time teaching or services experience to substitute two years of out-of-state administrative experience to satisfy the five-year teaching/services experience requirement for a Preliminary Administrative Services Credential. The letter also addressed concerns about the CalAPA and requested a group be convened to resolve the issues before proceeding to a high-stakes consequential year.

**Peg Winkelman, CAPEA**, reiterated information that was provided in the letter from CAPEA.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Hartwig moved to adopt the proposed regulations pertaining to Administrative Services Credentials. Commissioner Martinez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2K: Proposed Addition to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to the Handling of Applications from Qualified Individuals with Disabilities**

Tammy Duggan, Consultant, Certification Division, presented this item which provided the proposed addition of section 80002.1 to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations to clarify how applications from qualified individuals with disabilities who request reasonable accommodations will be handled by the Commission.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, voiced support of this item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Marks moved to adopt the proposed regulations pertaining to the handling of applications from qualified individuals with disabilities as amended in this item and instructed staff to prepare a 15-day notice. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Haydee Rodriguez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

#### **4E: Draft Revised Program Standards for Pupil Personnel Services (PPS) Credential Programs and Draft Revised PPS Candidate Performance Expectations**

Lynette Roby and Karen Sacramento, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the work related to revising the Pupil Personnel Services Program Standards and the PPS Candidate Performance Expectations.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which urged the Commission to amend the PPS Program Standards to direct programs to include a process for resolving disagreements about plan revisions so that all parties can be confident that revisions will be made in a manner that meets the preparation needs of candidates, field site and program supervisory staff, and local educational agencies.

#### **4F: Update on the Commission's Program Surveys and Their Use in Accreditation**

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on implementation of the Commission's Program Completer Surveys, Master Teacher Survey, and Employer Survey. The item also discussed how the information from surveys will be used in the accreditation process.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which thanked Commission staff for the development, dissemination and collection of survey results from program completers, master teachers and employers.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, raised a concern regarding first year induction teachers and requested the data be clarified to better understand the statistics.

### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair C. Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

#### **5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

**5C: Committee of Credentials Substitute Member**

Ani Kindall, Staff Attorney, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided information concerning appointment of substitute members to the Committee of Credentials to address anticipated short absences.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Rodriguez moved to appoint Helio Brasil, Sheila Ryskamp, Mario Moya, Tillie Soliz, and Mary Jane Roberts as substitute members of the Committee of Credentials and to designate each to serve as a short-term substitute as needed. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**5B: Proposed Disciplinary Guidelines for Adverse Action Orders and Conditions of Probation**

Thomas Lazar, Deputy Attorney General, and Antoinette Cincotta, Supervising Deputy Attorney General, Licensing Section, Office of the Attorney General, and Katie Hampton, Staff Counsel, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which introduced Proposed Disciplinary Guidelines for Adverse Action Orders and Conditions of Probation for use by the Commission, legal counsel, administrative law judges, and other persons involved in the educator misconduct process.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, raised concerns regarding working collaboratively with stakeholders on the draft proposed Disciplinary Guidelines and requested the Commission not to approve the rulemaking process until adequate engagement with the stakeholders has been accomplished.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, spoke in objection to initiating the rulemaking process prior to engaging with stakeholders.

**Lori Easterling, California Teachers Association**, raised concerns regarding the process of drafting the proposed Disciplinary Guidelines and requested the Commission delay the rulemaking process.

**Shannon Baker, Rothschild Wishek & Sands**, questioned the Commission's legal authority to place a teacher on probation except through the settlement process and raised concerns regarding many of the conditions and terms proposed in the draft Disciplinary Guidelines.

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, asked the Commission to follow through the commitment to work with stakeholders on regulating the profession and requested the proposed Disciplinary Guidelines be pulled back until stakeholders input has been provided.

**Jane Robb, California Teachers Association**, spoke about the importance of stakeholder engagement prior to the regulatory hearings and urged the Commission to engage with stakeholders to get all the issues raised early and completely prior to the regulatory process.

The Commission directed staff to postpone the rulemaking process and to initiate conversations with stakeholders regarding the draft Disciplinary Guidelines and bring the Guidelines back at a future meeting for Commission consideration.

### **Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

### **6A: Status of Legislation**

Joshua Speaks, Governmental Relations and Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the Commission's sponsored legislation for 2019-20, the status of legislative measures of interest, and asked the Commission to review and reaffirm its adopted Legislative Guidelines.

**Dean Drescher, EdVoice**, voiced support for authorizing the data-sharing agreement between the Commission and the California Department of Education and raised concerns regarding the requirement for more potential coursework for intern candidates. She also spoke in opposition of AB 221.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, spoke in support of leveraging the data Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) to bring other workforce reports to the Legislature and expressed appreciation for the efforts on closing the loophole for the early completion option. She also raised concerns regarding the assignment monitoring proposal.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Kung moved to approve the updated Legislative Guidelines. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

### **2L: Interview and Recommendation of Members/Alternates to the School Administrator Position for the Committee of Credentials**

Chair Darling-Hammond moved to appoint Jacob Guthrie to serve in the School Administrator position of the Committee of Credentials, and Richard Lopez and Tammy Patten be appointed as School Administrator alternates. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2M: Report of Closed Session Items**

Commissioner Hinde reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Jeffrey Clark
- Reginald Moore

- Jack Poster
- Mark Smith Jr.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matters of Jimmy Gonzales, Andreana McCall, Hawanya Smith, and Michael Turner Jr. Decisions and Orders will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decisions and Orders.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Cesar Escobar and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Enrique Garcia
- Jason Hamm
- Linda McDaniel

The Commission granted the following requests for reconsideration and sustained its previous decisions:

- Katrina Angeja
- Rubin Garcia
- Paul Kovac
- Thomas Sinagra

The Commission granted reconsideration in the matter of Diana Regalado and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission denied the request for reconsideration in the matter of Protus Taniform. The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item # 27 Juan Centeno and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed the Consent Calendar items #54 Benjamin Gillam, #104 Veronica Pellegrin, #106 Dave Pinkston, and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials.

## **2N: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

## **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 12:05 p.m.