
2A

Action

General Session

Approval of the November 2018 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the November 2018 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the November 2018 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the November 29-30, 2018 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Kathleen Allavie, School Board Member
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative (11/29 only)
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University (11/29 only)
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative
Castle Redmond, Public Representative
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities
Michelle Zumot/Stephanie Papas, Designees, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Commission Members Absent

Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative
José Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative
Monica Martinez, Public Representative

Wednesday, November 28, 2018

Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair C. Michael Cooney convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 3:33 p.m.

1A: Interview and Recommendation of Members/Alternates for the Committee of Credentials

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

Ray Prock Jr.
Kenneth Dickson
Darrel Woo

Commissioner Rodriguez moved to recommend Darrel Woo be appointed to serve in the School Board Member position and Ray Prock Jr. and Kenneth Dickson be appointed as School Board Member alternates on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Committee Chair Cooney adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 5:05 p.m.

Thursday, November 29, 2018

General Session

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the November 29-30, 2018 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:02 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Darling-Hammond introduced Andrew Wall as the new Ex-Officio member representing the Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU) and Aya Shhub as the new Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission.

2A: Approval of the September 2018 Minutes

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the September 2018 Executive Committee Meeting minutes. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Rodriguez moved approval of the September 2018 Commission Meeting minutes with corrections of three typographical errors. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2B: Approval of the November 2018 Agenda

Commissioner Barnes moved approval of the November 2018 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 1A, 2H and 3B. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2C: Approval of the November 2018 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Allavie moved approval of the November 2018 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw item 5. Henry Armenta Jr. to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2D: Chair's Report

Chair Darling-Hammond sent thoughts and prayers for the people affected by the Camp Fire.

2E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy introduced Cara Mendoza as a new Consultant in the Professional Services Division.

Executive Director Sandy congratulated Catherine Kearney on her upcoming retirement.

Executive Director Sandy updated the Commission on the progress of the performance assessments development.

2F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Rodriguez shared a note from Commissioner Escobedo about what she witnessed on the front lines of the Camp Fire crisis.

Commissioner Barnes stated that the California Association of School Counselors received a message from the Butte County Office of Education to ask any available counselors, mental health and social workers to help the students and families.

Chair Darling-Hammond gave a brief report on the results of the evaluation of Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy.

2G: Liaison Reports

Commissioner Browne reported that the California Community College Early Childhood Education Executive Board would be meeting on November 30, 2018.

Educator Preparation Committee

Chair Darling-Hammond appointed Commissioner Kevin Kung to serve as Acting Committee Chair due to Commissioner Jose Gonzalez's absence.

Acting Committee Chair Kevin Kung convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

3A: Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation

Cheryl Forbes, Committee on Accreditation Member, and Cheryl Hickey and Catherine Kearney, Administrators, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the 2017-18 Annual Accreditation Report from the Committee on Accreditation (COA).

3C: Assignment Monitoring of Certificated Staff in California by County Office of Education 2015-17, A Report to the Legislature

Roxann Purdue, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided data collected by the Commission from the county offices of education and addressed the assignment of teachers and other certificated staff in California as required by Education Code (EC) §44258.9.

Commissioner Hinde moved to approve the Assignment Monitoring of Certificated Employees in California by County Offices of Education 2015-17 report for transmittal to the Governor and the Legislature. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3D: Update on Work Related to the Intern Program Early Completion Option

Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an overview of current statutory provisions enabling teaching interns to complete an intern preparation program early based on successful demonstration of readiness to teach as measured on various assessments. This item also included options to pursue changes to the current statute for Commission consideration.

Danette Brown, California Teachers Association, asked staff a clarification question and voiced support of this item.

Commissioner Darling-Hammond moved to approve the proposed changes to the current statute and to modify section (c) listed on page EPC 3D-5 as follows: An Intern who participates in the Early Completion Option must continue in all coursework and be supervised and receive support until the passage of a teaching performance assessment. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3E: Update on Work Related to the Child Development Permit

Erin Sullivan, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the work related to the Commission's Child Development Permit.

Nancy Hurlbut, Partnerships for Education, Articulation and Coordination through Higher Education (PEACH), spoke about the importance of including the concepts of social-emotional development, exceptional needs, play as intentional language, family engagement, and health and safety within the Performance Expectations and Program Guidelines in Early Childhood Education (ECE). She also emphasized the importance of including early childhood education as a career ladder pathway.

Jan Fish, PEACH, agreed with the reports cited in this agenda item to increase depth and breadth of competencies, knowledge, skills, and dispositions in preparation so that early childhood educators share position, compensation, and preparation parity with other educators. She suggested the need for preparation systems to inform each other to build child skills and improve learning outcomes at ages 0-8 and requested continued inclusion of ECE specialists in the development of the Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs).

Toni Isaacs, PEACH, spoke in support of the need for early childhood specific competencies.

Carolyn Crolotte, Early Edge California, thanked the Commission for moving California towards a competency-based early educator preparation system.

Antonia Lopez, Campaign for Quality Early Education, asked the Commission to be cautious on relying on the current dual language learner competencies and requested the opportunity to be involved in the process.

Josefina Notsinneh, Children Now, stated that it is critical for the Commission to revise the current permit matrix and suggested the work group reconvene to take a fresh look at the recommendations.

Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education, spoke about the emphasis on dual language learners.

3B: Update on State-Funded Grant Programs

Iyore Osamwonyi, Assistant Consultant, and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, and Donna Glassman-Sommer, California Center on Teacher Careers, presented this item which provided an update on five state-funded grant programs administered by the Commission on

Teacher Credentialing. This agenda item also presented the 2018 annual report on the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing program as required by statute for Commission review and approval to transmit to the Legislature by January 1, 2019.

Serette Kaminski, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, voiced a concern about assuring the field can access the funds to carry out robust successful programs that subsequently benefit classrooms across California.

Doug Gephart, Association of California School Administrators, shared information regarding the outcome of the candidates who completed integrated teacher preparation programs.

Jacob Guthrie, Los Angeles Unified School District, provided an update regarding his district's funded grant program.

Commissioner Zumot moved to approve the 2018 Annual Report on the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program for transmittal to the Legislature. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:24 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126, to consider the following pending litigation: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE), *Emiterio Escobar v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Los Angeles Superior Court, BS171090), and *Daniel Lindstrom v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing, and Does 1 to 20* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2017-80002760). The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Proposed Decisions, and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, November 30, 2018

General Session

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:33 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Educator Preparation Committee

Acting Committee Chair Kevin Kung reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

3F: Initial Employment of New Teachers in California

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided findings of a pilot study of the 2012-13 cohort of newly credentialed teachers and focused on initial employment rates between 2013 and 2018 for Commission discussion and feedback.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, voiced appreciation for the data analysis and talked about the importance of making the data local and useable. She also requested the opportunity to work with Commission staff and other stakeholders to discuss what other analyses would be useful.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair C. Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

4A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

4B: Committee of Credential Vacancies for Fiscal Year 2019-20

Ani Kindall, Staff Attorney, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which reviewed the terms of the current members of the Committee of Credentials to declare vacancies for one school administrator member, one secondary teacher member and one public member.

Commissioner Klatt moved to declare vacancies for one school administrator member, one secondary teacher member, and one public member. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Hinde moved to open the vacancies to the public and reach out to any interested individuals currently in the alternate pool for each position to conduct interviews for those who submit an application. Commissioner Hartwig seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

4C: Division of Professional Practices' and Committee of Credentials' Workload and Statutory Framework – Efficiency, Due Process, and Public Safety Implications

Mary Vixie Sandy, Executive Director, Commission on Teacher Credentialing, and Linda Schneider, Senior Assistant Attorney General, Office of the Attorney General, presented this item which addressed the existing challenges to efficiency, due process, and public safety, created by the increasing workload of the Division of Professional Practices and the Committee of Credentials, as well as the statutory framework currently governing the educator disciplinary process.

Lori Easterling, California Teachers Association, requested the Commission broaden the perspective of the regulatory work and not be limited to the recommendations suggested by Ms. Schneider. She also asked the Commission to work collaboratively with stakeholders in this process.

Commissioner Klatt moved to authorize staff to engage with stakeholders and seek legislative solutions. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Legislative Committee

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

5A: Legislative Proposals

Joshua Speaks, Governmental Relations and Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided possible sponsored legislative proposals for the 2019 legislative year for Commission consideration.

Robert Williams, San Francisco State University, asked staff a clarifying question regarding the required degree for Pupil Personnel Services Credentials.

Jenny Teresi, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, requested the Commission to include stakeholders in the discussion on modernizing the assignment monitoring process.

Commissioner Marks moved to approve the legislative proposal regarding the use of professional education baccalaureates. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Redmond and Zumot abstaining.

Commissioner Klatt moved to approve the legislative proposal to update the Education Code to reflect current terminology regarding world languages. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Redmond and Zumot abstaining.

Commissioner Marks moved to approve the legislative proposal to update the clear credentialing requirements. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Redmond and Zumot abstaining.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

2H: Interview and Recommendation as to Vacancies, Members and Alternates for the Committee of Credentials

Chair Darling-Hammond moved to accept the following recommendations: 1) the appointment of Darrel Woo to serve in the School Board position of the Committee of Credentials, and 2) the appointment of Ray Prock Jr. and Kenneth Dickson as School Board Member alternates. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2I: Report of Closed Session Items

Commissioner Hinde reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC*, *Emiterio Escobar v. CTC*, and *Daniel Lindstrom v. CTC*, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Betty Lyttle
- Abe Snobar
- Anthony Dahl
- Billy Woody II

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Scott Fisch
- Thomas Sinagra

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matters of Jimmy Gonzales and Michael Turner Jr., and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the Proposed Decision in the matter of Allen Young.

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the following matters:

- Emily Ismael
- Mark Petrowsky

The Commission granted the following requests for reconsideration and sustained its previous decisions:

- Janelle Burns
- Richard Odegaard

The Commission granted reconsideration in the matter of Tiffany Tung and remanded the matter back to the Administrative Law Judge for the sole purpose of allowing Ms. Tung to offer evidence in mitigation concerning the appropriate adverse action.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #5 Henry Armenta Jr., and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

2J: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Audience Presentation

Jenny Teresi, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, thanked Commission staff for their partnership in providing vital training to the field at the Annual Credential Counselors and Analysts of California Conference.

2K: Nominations and Elections for the Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2019

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy presented this item regarding the nominations and elections for Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2019.

Commissioner Rodriguez nominated Linda Darling-Hammond as Chair. Commissioner Kung nominated Alicia Hinde as Vice Chair.

Commissioner Allavie moved to waive the applicable provisions of the Policy Manual to allow for a voice vote to elect Linda Darling Hammond as Chair. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Hartwig moved to waive the applicable provisions of the Policy Manual to allow for a voice vote to elect Alicia Hinde as Vice Chair. Commissioner Allavie seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 11:38 a.m.