
2A

Action

General Session

Approval of the September 2018 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the September 2018 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the September 2018 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the September 27-28, 2018 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair (9/27 only)
Kathleen Allavie, School Board Member
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative
José Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative
Jane Marks, Teacher Representative
Monica Martinez, Public Representative (9/27 only)
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California
Tom Torlakson, Superintendent of Public Instruction (9/27 only)

Commission Members Absent

Castle Redmond, Public Representative
Andrew Wall, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

Thursday, September 27, 2018

Executive Committee

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the Executive Committee at 9:04 a.m.

1A: Educator Preparation Student Liaison

Rhonda Brown, Manager, Executive Office, presented this item which provided information regarding the selection process for the Educator Preparation Student Liaison.

Commissioner Cooney moved to appoint Aya Shhub to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year beginning October 1, 2018. Commissioner Gonzalez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

General Session

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the September 27-28, 2018 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:11 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Darling-Hammond welcomed State Superintendent of Public Instruction Tom Torlakson to the Commission table.

Chair Darling-Hammond introduced Kathleen Allavie as a new member of the Commission.

2A: Approval of the August 2018 Minutes

Commissioner Martinez moved approval of the August 2018 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Barnes, Gonzalez, and Klatt and abstaining.

2B: Approval of the September 2018 Agenda

Commissioner Rodriguez moved approval of the September 2018 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 1A and 2C. Commissioner Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2C: Approval of the September 2018 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Gonzalez moved approval of the September 2018 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 5. Timothy Bennett, 22. Damien Dilucchio, and 69. Deanna Quintano to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2D: Chair's Report

Chair Darling-Hammond discussed ways of creating context for high quality teaching and learning for all teachers and students in our state and spoke about the importance of having a strong ethical education and a strong ethical standard for our children.

2E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Mary Sandy welcomed Superintendent Torlakson and new Commission member Kathleen Allavie to the Commission table.

Executive Director Sandy reported on the Commission's grant-funded programs and the release of Request for Proposals (RFPs) for the Teacher Residency Capacity Grants, Teacher Residency Expansion Grants and Local Solutions to the Shortage of Special Education Teachers Grants.

2F: Commission Member Reports

Superintendent Tolarkson spoke about the work accomplished by the California Department of Education (CDE) and reflected on the partnership and collaboration between the CDE and the Commission in developing systems of support for improving educator quality.

Commissioner Barnes reported that the California Association of School Counselors' fall conference will be held on October 17-19, 2018 in Riverside.

Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer reported that the inaugural meeting of the California Alliance on Inclusive Schooling will take place during the California Council on Teacher Education's fall conference.

Commissioner Martinez notified the public that the XQ Institute put out a comprehensive guide to understand what state policymakers can do to ensure that every high school better prepares students for the workforce.

Commissioner Rodriguez shared her excitement on teaching the 10th grade.

Commissioner Escobedo reported that she participated in a mentor orientation for Butte County Office of Education's induction program.

2G: Liaison Reports

Commissioner Barnes reported on her attendance at the Pupil Personnel Services workgroup meeting.

Commissioner Browne raised concerns about facilitating teacher preparation from community colleges into the four year universities. She talked about the teacher internship program that was supported by the Skyline College President's Innovation Fund and Chancellor's Strong Workforce Program fund. She stated that the work that's been done with Getting Down to Facts II identifies that early learning is alive and well in the community colleges.

Autumn Sannwald, Commission Student Liaison, thanked the Commission for giving her the opportunity to serve as the Liaison for the past year.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair José Gonzalez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

3A: Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2016-17 as Required by Title II of the Higher Education Act

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, and Phi Phi Lau, Research Program Specialist, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the *Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2016-17* as required by Title II of the Higher Education Act.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a letter which raised concerns regarding the ethnic distribution of teacher candidates and questioned whether the Commission anticipates a continuing increase in candidate enrollment. The letter also thanked the Commission for addressing the minimum student teaching hour requirement and putting an emphasis on increasing the number of credentials issued in the areas of math, science and special education.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, raised concerns about the enrollment changes of African American candidates and asked a clarifying question about the difference in the enrolled candidates versus the completers. She also raised concerns regarding relying on paraprofessional teachers addressing teacher shortage areas and requested the Commission to look into the issues of whether the alternative route is the best it can be to ensure candidates are prepared and supported to meet the needs of their students.

Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education, raised concerns regarding the lack of diversity in the teaching workforce and requested the Commission work affirmatively to remove the barriers in recruiting and retaining bilingual teachers.

Commissioner Martinez moved to approve the 2016-2017 Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for transmission to the U.S. Department of Education on or before October 31, 2018. Commissioner Marks seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

3B: Discussion of the Subject Matter Requirements for Teaching Credentials

Teri Clark, Director and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on California's statutory subject matter requirements for preliminary teaching credentials and discusses options for reviewing this system.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, stated that reconsidering how we look at subject matter competence could be a critical tool to increasing the diversity of the teaching profession. She also spoke about how standardized tests, including the subject matter tests, are problematic for individuals with test anxiety and the disproportionate pass rates for people of color are well documented. She requested the Commission to think about whether there is any room for performance assessment in this area.

Jessica Sawko, California Science Teachers Association, raised concerns regarding the limitation of the California Subject Matter Examinations for Teachers (CSET) in terms of its ability to truly assess the understanding of the three dimensions of the next generation of science standards and requested the Commission to look at the connections between standards and subject matter requirements (SMRs) to ensure teachers are prepared to teach college and career readiness standards.

Barbara Howard, Center for Teacher Innovation-Riverside County Office of Education, talked about the perceived obstacles of the CSET.

Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers, talked about the difficulty of passing the test and asked the Commission to consider other options to qualify candidates through different measures.

Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education, spoke about the importance of alignment and suggested the Commission to think about the possibility of having additional means of verifying subject matter competency.

3C: Update on the Development of the California Administrator Performance Assessment

Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessment Development, presented this item which provided an update on the efforts to develop the California Administrator Performance Assessment (CalAPA).

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a letter which supported the decision to make 2018-19 a nonconsequential year of administration to ensure programs are not only able to provide sustainable field placements for candidates to complete all three cycles, but also able to identify effective strategies for supporting candidates who are currently serving as teachers or those in positions outside of the classroom.

Peg Winkelman, California Association of Professors of Education Administration, asked the Commission about the possibility of reconvening the design team beyond standard setting to consider feedback from this nonconsequential year.

Ivannia Soto, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education, voiced appreciation of the equity focus in cycle one and requested the equity piece be built upon in cycle three. She also raised concerns regarding the abilities of leaders and administrators to work with teachers who serve English learners and to lead bilingual schools.

John Borba, California State University Stanislaus, stated that it is important to continue to refine the CalAPA for the consequential year and raised concerns regarding the lack of clarity in cycles one and two. He asked the Commission to collect more data on cycles one and two to fine tune the CalAPA.

3D: Update on Creating a Work Group to Explore Solutions Surrounding Career Technical Education Issues

Jake Shuler and Bob Loux, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the progress of Commission staff in their work with WestEd and staff from the California Department of Education to develop a plan for a work group to explore solutions surrounding Career Technical Education.

Janis Davis, California Federation of Teachers, spoke on this item.

Danette Brown, California Teachers Association, requested the Commission to include educators from a variety of industry sectors in the selection process to address the challenges that are unique to individual industry sectors.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:37 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126, to consider the following pending litigation: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE) and *Dr. John Doe Educator v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2018-80002849). The

Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Proposed Decisions, and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

Friday, September 28, 2018

General Session

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:32 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair José Gonzalez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

3E: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to Cost Recovery Fees for Extraordinary Accreditation Activities

Kathryn Polster, Analyst, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations sections 80691 and 80692 pertaining to Cost Recovery Fees for Extraordinary Accreditation Activities.

Commissioner Hartwig moved to adopt the proposed amendments to sections 80691 and 80692 pertaining to Cost Recovery Fees for Extraordinary Accreditation Activities for the purpose of beginning the rulemaking file for submission to the Office of Administrative Law and scheduling a public hearing. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Certification Committee

Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Certification Committee.

4A: Proposed Addition to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations for the Handling of Applications, Including Variable Term Waiver Applications, Submitted by Qualified Individuals with a Disability

Tammy Duggan, Consultant, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed the addition of Section 80002.1 to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations (CCR) to clarify the procedures for the handling of applications, including variable term waiver (VTW) applications, submitted by qualified individuals with a disability.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, voiced support of the proposed regulations.

Commissioner Barnes moved to adopt the proposed addition of Section 80002.1 related to the handling of applications submitted by qualified applicants with disabilities for the purpose of beginning the rulemaking file for submission to the Office of Administrative Law and scheduling a public hearing. Commissioner Gonzalez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair C. Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

5A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

5B: Division of Professional Practices Annual Workload Report Fiscal Year 2017-18

Vanessa Whitnell, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided the annual report on the discipline workload of the Division of Professional Practices (DPP) for Fiscal Year 2017-18.

Legislative Committee

Chair Darling-Hammond appointed Commissioner Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo to serve as Acting Committee Chair due to Commissioner Alicia Hinde's absence.

Acting Committee Chair Escobedo convened the Legislative Committee.

6A: Status of Legislation

Joshua Speaks, Governmental Relations and Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, thanked the Commission staff for their work on AB 3048 and the work that has been done to implement the RFPs on the Teacher Residency Grants and Local Solutions Grants.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

2H: Report of Closed Session Items

Commissioner Rodriguez reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC* and *Dr. John Doe Educator v. CTC*, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Rochelle Hunter
- Pamela Price
- Marie Thomas

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- David Acrea
- Victor Collins
- Billington Mbolo

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Emily Ismael. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the matter of Mark Petrowsky. A Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matters of Andreama McCall and Hawanya Smith, and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Erik Avol
- Robert Difruscio
- Larisa Irving
- Harry Kirschner
- Lisa La Quatra
- Anna Ramirez
- John Singh

The Commission denied the request for reconsideration in the matter of Leonard Isenberg and sustained its previous decision.

The Commission granted the request for reconsideration in the matter of Ofelia Keeno and sustained its previous decision.

The Commission granted the request for reconsideration in the matter of Kimberlee Nickerson and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #22 Damien Dilucchio and #69 Deanna Quintano, and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #5 Timothy Bennett, and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

2I: Report of the Executive Committee

Chair Darling-Hammond reported that the Executive Committee appointed Aya Shhub to serve as the Educator Preparation Student Liaison to the Commission for one year beginning October 1, 2018.

2J: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Audience Presentation

Danette Brown, California Teachers Association, introduced Belen Moreno as the new Student Liaison for the California Teachers Association to the Commission.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 10:07 a.m.