

---

# 1A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the June 2018 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the June 2018 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the June 2018 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

##### ***III. Communication and Engagement***

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the June 13-15, 2018 Meeting

---

### Commission Members Attending

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative (6/14 only)  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University  
José Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative (6/13 and 6/14)  
Castle Redmond, Public Representative  
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Christine Zeppos, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities  
Michelle Zumot/Stephanie Papas, Designees, Superintendent of Public Instruction

### Commission Members Absent

Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative

### *Wednesday, June 13, 2018*

#### Ad Hoc Committee

Committee Chair C. Michael Cooney convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 4:00 p.m.

#### **1A: Interview and Recommendation as to Vacancies, Members and Alternates for the Committee of Credentials**

Commissioner Klatt moved to declare one additional Public Member vacancy on the Committee of Credentials effective July 1, 2018. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

- Wade Steve Thorpe
- Robert Elder
- Scotty Cameron Byrd
- Fernando Rukshan
- Kevin Thompson

Commissioner Kung moved to recommend Wade Steve Thorpe be appointed to serve in the Public Member position on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cooney moved to recommend Scotty Cameron Byrd be appointed to serve in the Public Member position and Robert Elder as a Public Member alternate for the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Kung moved to recommend Fernando Rukshan be appointed as a School Board Member alternate for the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Klatt moved to recommend Kevin Thompson be appointed as a Secondary Teacher alternate for the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Committee Chair Cooney adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 6:05 p.m.

### ***Thursday, June 14, 2018***

### **General Session**

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the June 14-15, 2018 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:01 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

### **2A: Approval of the April 2018 Minutes**

Commissioner Escobedo moved approval of the April 2018 Ad Hoc Committee minutes. Commissioner Kung seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the April 2018 Commission Meeting minutes. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Barnes, Darling-Hammond and Gonzalez abstaining.

### **2B: Approval of the June 2018 Agenda**

Commissioner Gonzalez moved approval of the June 2018 Agenda. Commissioner Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2C: Approval of the June 2018 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Klatt moved approval of the June 2018 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 6. Lisa Bartels, 7. Anita Baskin, 10. Timothy Bennett, 44. Michael Jalbert, 55. Stephanie Nichols, 69. Maricela Berzosa and 77. Raul Wootton to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2D: Chair's Report**

Chair Darling-Hammond spoke about the recent work on special education.

**2E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Mary Sandy provided an update on the Commission's work and progress this year.

**2F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Hinde reported that she gave birth to a baby girl on April 14, 2018.

Commissioner Barnes informed the public that the American School Counselor Association Conference will be held this July in Los Angeles.

Commissioner Gonzalez thanked everyone for their service, commitment and dedication to education.

**2G: Liaison Reports**

Commissioner Barnes reported on her attendance at the Pupil Personnel Services work group meeting.

Commissioner Escobedo gave a report on behalf of Commissioner Haydee Rodriguez on the work completed at the May Committee on Accreditation meeting.

Commissioner Browne reported on her attendance at the Academic Senate State conference in April. She also talked about the initiative at the state chancellor's office around strong workforce development and the support from the community colleges for developing guided pathways for high school students moving into college.

Autumn Sannwald, Commission Student Liaison, reported on her recent activities with her credential program.

**Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Kirsten Barnes convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

**3A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2018-19 Budget**

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided an overview of the budget proposed for the Commission for the 2018-19 fiscal year.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair José Gonzalez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**4A: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for Hollister School District**

Lynette Roby, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, Hollister School District's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

**Jennifer Wildman and Christine White, Hollister School District**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commissioner Hinde moved to grant eligibility to Hollister School District to move forward to Stage III of the Initial Institutional Approval process. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4B: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage II: Eligibility Requirements for University of Antelope Valley**

Lynette Roby, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, University of Antelope Valley's responses to the Eligibility Requirements for consideration and possible approval by the Commission.

**Chonnea Harris, Crystal Stephens, University Antelope Valley**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commissioner Hinde moved to grant eligibility to University of Antelope Valley to move forward to Stage III of the Initial Institutional Approval process. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Commission further directed the University of Antelope Valley to address in Stage III issues relating to staffing, oversight, curriculum development and instructor/faculty experience.

**4C: Proposed Preliminary Administrative Services Credential Program Standards Additions**

Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, and Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessment Development, presented this item which provided updated language for the Preliminary Administrative Services Credential programs to address the implementation of a performance assessment in the programs.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which supported adoption of the proposed changes to the Preliminary Administrative Services program standards as outlined in Appendix A of the agenda item.

**Peg Winkelman, California Association of Professors of Educational Administration**, voiced support of rewording the term "placement" and agreed with the suggestion about addressing the issue of avoiding assessor bias relating to issues of candidate placement, local resources, and other factors not directly related to the assessment of candidate competence. She suggested that exemplars of a candidate Administrator Performance Assessment (APA) submission which demonstrated satisfactory work in challenging settings be collected and distributed during the non-consequential year to help support equitable assessment of candidates. She also stated that attention needs to be paid to a candidate's ability to videotape within their educational work setting and suggested that the APA Design Team create a letter outlining the conditions necessary for candidates to complete the APA tasks.

**Ardella Dailey, California Association of Professors of Educational Administration**, emphasized the importance of equitable access for candidates who work in the most challenging settings.

Commissioner Zumot moved to adopt the proposed changes to the Preliminary Administrative Services Program standards with additional recommendations regarding the progress of implementation of the standards. Commissioner Darling-Hammond seconded motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4D: Intern Program Early Completion Option: Entry Requirement Modification**

Teri Clark, Director, Bob Loux, Consultant, Professional Services Division, and Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessment Development, presented this item which provided potential modifications to the entry requirements for the Intern Program Early Completion Option (ECO) for the Commission's consideration and possible adoption.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which supported staff recommendations made in this agenda items.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, asked the Commission to revisit the statute regarding the intent and use of the early completion option. She questioned the ability and validity of the specified assessment in terms of accessing the candidates and suggested passage of the test and passage of the Teaching Performance Assessment (TPA) within the first four months of teaching.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, raised concerns regarding the potential negative impact for students by allowing the ECO candidates to have one year to pass the TPA.

**Michele Badovinac, Teachers College of San Joaquin**, asked staff a clarification question regarding fall enrollment for ECO candidates and requested that the Commission consider requiring ECO candidates to start and continue the coursework until they pass the first task of the applicable TPA model.

Commissioner Darling-Hammond moved to require ECO candidates to fully engage in the intern program until they pass all the specific assessments. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4E: Addressing the Teacher Shortage in Career Technical Education**

Jake Shuler and Bob Loux, Consultants, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a proposal to engage in a collaborative effort to explore solutions to the challenges surrounding Career Technical Education (CTE) in California and requested the Commission's direction for moving forward to help assure effective teachers for CTE courses.

**Donna Wyatt, California Department of Education and Rose Owens-West, WestEd**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which supported the proposal for the Commission to work with WestEd and the California Department of Education to identify possible approaches to addressing issues related to CTE, including the shortage of teachers.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, spoke in support of the proposal and suggested the Commission include teacher representatives from various industry sectors in the work group.

Commissioner Barnes moved to direct staff to move forward with the proposed plan to collaborate with WestEd and the California Department of Education, along with other constituents, to identify possible approaches to addressing issues related to CTE, including the shortage of teachers. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4F: Update on Work Related to the Child Development Permit**

Erin Sullivan, Consultant, and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the work related to the Commission's Child Development Permit.

**Jan Fish and Sandra Moe, PEACH**, spoke and submitted a letter on this item which offered the following recommendations: 1) The Early Childhood Education (ECE) Teacher Performance Expectations (TPEs) at all levels must reflect all of the essential knowledge and skills for ECE teachers and administrators in the delivery of quality programs for young children, 2) TPEs and Administrator Performance Expectations (APEs) must consistently reflect a progression in knowledge and skills across job role levels, 3) Children's play in ECE programs is the consistent core contextual component for all activities and learning, and 4) Clarifications on preparation program guidelines.

**Carolyn Crolotte, Early Edge California**, suggested the Commission do more to ensure that the state's current research based ECE competencies developed by the California Department of Education are embedded in all of the work related to the Child Development Permit. She recommended that the Commission's TPEs and APEs be modified to better align with the policy outlined in the English Learner Roadmap specifically for dual language learners. She stated that the TPEs could benefit if there is a developmental progression of competencies across job roles and functions and there should be deeper more complex practical experiences with an emphasis on demonstration of the candidate's skills within ECE program settings working with children and adults.

#### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair C. Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

#### **6A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

## **Legislative Committee**

Commissioner Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

### **7A: Status of Legislation**

Joshua Speaks, Governmental Relations and Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission.

**Jenny Teresi, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, thanked staff and the Commission for including the stakeholders in the discussion on AB 3048 (Irwin).

## **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:07 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126, to consider the following pending litigation: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE), *Dr. John Doe Educator v. Commission on Teacher, An Agency of the State of California* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2018-80002849) *Credentialing*, and *Juan M. Jaimes v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Los Angeles Superior Court, BS170161). The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Proposed Decisions, and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

### **Friday, June 15, 2018**

### **General Session**

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:31 a.m. and roll call was taken.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair José Gonzalez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **4G: Teaching Performance Expectations and Program Standards for the Preliminary Education Specialist Credentials**

William Hatrick and Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a set of draft teaching performance expectations for the five preliminary Education Specialist credentials and a draft set of program standards for the Preliminary Education Specialist Credential for the Commission's consideration and adoption.

Included in Appendix A is a list of individuals and organizations that submitted letters or spoke on this topic. The audio file of the discussion is available at [https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/audio/agendas/2018-06/2018-06-4g.mp3?sfvrsn=3af550b1\\_2](https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/audio/agendas/2018-06/2018-06-4g.mp3?sfvrsn=3af550b1_2).



Commissioner Klatt moved to adopt staff recommendations 4, 5, 6 and 7 listed on page 4G-6 of the agenda item and the intent to adopt at the next Commission meeting recommendations 1, 2, 3, and 8 after modifications. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **General Announcement**

Ex-Officio member Marquita Grenot-Scheyer was appointed to serve as a voting member in the event that a quorum was needed.

#### **4H: Proposed Content Knowledge Requirements and Authorizations for Education Specialist Credentials for Special Education Teacher Candidates and Additional Authorizations for Credentialed Special Education Teachers**

William Hatrick and Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a recommendation for the appropriate content knowledge requirements for prospective special education teachers and draft authorization statements for proposed Education Specialist credentials. In addition, this item proposed a bridge or pathway for existing credential holders who may want to earn the additional authorizations within the new credential structure.

Included in Appendix B is a list of individuals and organizations that submitted letters or spoke on this topic. The audio file of the discussion is available at [https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/audio/agendas/2018-06/2018-06-4h.mp3?sfvrsn=3ff550b1\\_2](https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/audio/agendas/2018-06/2018-06-4h.mp3?sfvrsn=3ff550b1_2).

Commissioner Hinde moved to adopt staff recommendation that the Commission maintain the existing requirement for Education Specialists to meet content knowledge requirements for their credential. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Certification Committee.

#### **5A: Repeal of Numerical Limits on Speech-Language Pathology Services Credential Waivers and Future Rulemaking**

Tammy Duggan, Consultant, Certification Division, presented this item which sought to repeal the criteria established by the Commission in October 2014 and February 2015 related to numerical limits of variable term waivers to individuals seeking Speech-Language Pathology (SLP) Services Credentials. This agenda item also requested direction to staff to propose regulations that place limits on all waiver documents issued by the Commission, as well as regulations for handling waiver applications from qualified individuals with a disability.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which voiced support of staff's recommendation.

**Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education**, requested the Commission allow individuals additional time to complete undergraduate coursework before they enter into a graduate program to obtain a SLP credential if limits are placed on all waiver documents. She also asked the

Commission to consider a three year waiver to waive the EL requirement for candidates who are in the three year CTE program.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, spoke in support of placing limits on all waiver documents and requested a more in-depth discussion regarding the data around the areas and reasons which waivers are needed.

Commissioner Linda Darling-Hammond moved to approve the recommendation to repeal the criteria related to numerical limits of variable term waivers for individuals seeking SLP credentials and directed staff to propose regulations as to numerical limits on all waivers and the handling of waiver applications from qualified individuals with a disability. The Commission further directed staff to bring back information on the progress of waiver candidates completing the expectations. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

### **2H: Interview and Recommendation as to Vacancies, Members and Alternates for the Committee of Credentials**

Commissioner Cooney moved to accept the following recommendations: 1) the appointment of Wade Steve Thorpe and Scotty Cameron Byrd to serve in the Public Member positions of the Committee of Credentials effective July 1, 2018, and 2) the appointment of Robert Elder as a Public Member alternate, Rukshan Fernando as a School Board Member alternate, and Kevin Thompson as a Secondary Teacher alternate. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **2I: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair Hinde reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC*, *Dr. John Doe Educator v. CTC*, and *Juan Jaimes v. CTC*, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Sahar Bakhoud
- Kenneth Cortez
- Nica Claire Wong

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Russell Hunt
- Alvina Sheeley
- Kelly Leslie

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Carlitha Allen
- Jeanette Bailey-Sanchez
- Jorge Chavez

- Lupe Gutierrez
- Joseph Hoggatt
- Candace Jarman
- Kathleen Randall
- Beverly Vaughn

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Mark Petrowsky and called for the transcript.

The Commission granted the following requests for reconsideration and sustained its previous decisions:

- Danette Boles
- Jerome Butler
- Elida Campos
- Paul Dahl
- Robert Florentino Pascual
- Kathy Wu

The Commission denied the request for reconsideration in the matter of Miriam Aguilar-Escobar.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #6 Lisa Bartels, #7 Anita Baskin, #10 Timothy Bennett, #44 Michael Jalbert, #55 Stephanie Nichols, #69 Maricela Verzosa, and #77 Raul Wootton, and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials.

## **2L: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

## **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 11:10 a.m.

**Appendix A**  
**Teaching Performance Expectations and Program Standards for the Preliminary  
 Education Specialist Credentials**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
1.	Naomi Eason	California School Boards Association	Written
2.	Julie Maier	California Deafblind Services	Written
3.	Beth Kauffman	Los Angeles Unified School District	Written
4.	Paul Sindeler	Collaboration for Effective Educator Development, Accountability and Reform	Written
5.		California Association of Professors of Special Education	Written
6.	Kathy Gee	California State University, Sacramento	Written
7.	Jean Gonsier-Gerdin	California State University, Sacramento	Written/Oral
8.	Elva Duran	California State University, Sacramento	Written
9.	EunMi Cho	California State University, Sacramento	Written
10.	Rachael Gonzales	California State University, Sacramento	Written
11.	Cindy Collado	California State University, Sacramento	Written
12.	Virginia Kennedy	California Council on Teacher Education	Written
13.	Pam Hunt	San Francisco State University	Written/Oral
14.	Yvonne Bui	San Francisco State University	Written
15.	Kathleen Mortier	San Francisco State University	Written
16.	Maureen Burness	California Statewide Special Education Task Force	Oral
17.	Tracy Eagle	Los Angeles Unified School District	Oral
18.	Patricia Pernin	Los Angeles Unified School District	Oral
19.	Thierry Rackley	Los Angeles Unified School District	Oral
20.	Danette Brown	California Teachers Association	Oral
21.	Kristin Wright	California Department of Education	Oral

**Appendix B**  
**Proposed Content Knowledge Requirements and Authorizations for Education  
Specialist Credentials for Special Education Teacher Candidates and Additional  
Authorizations for Credentialed Special Education Teachers**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
1.	Naomi Eason	California School Boards Association	Written
2.	Javier Ponce Garcia	Self	Written
3.	Janet Davis	Self	Written
4.	Rico Tamayo	California Federation of Teachers	Written
5.		California Association of Professors of Special Education/CEC Teacher Education Division	Written
6.	Kathy Gee	California State University, Sacramento	Written
7.	Jean Gonsier-Gerdin	California State University, Sacramento	Written
8.	Elva Duran	California State University, Sacramento	Written
9.	EunMi Cho	California State University, Sacramento	Written
10.	Rachael Gonzales	California State University, Sacramento	Written
11.	Cindy Collado	California State University, Sacramento	Written
12.	Virginia Kennedy	California Council on Teacher Education	Written
13.	Pam Hunt	San Francisco State University	Written/Oral
14.	Yvonne Bui	San Francisco State University	Written
15.	Kathleen Mortier	San Francisco State University	Written
16.	Maureen Burness	California Statewide Special Education Task Force	Oral
17.	Jenny Teresi	Riverside County Office of Education	Oral
18.	Barbara Howard	Riverside County Office of Education	Oral
19.	Danette Brown	California Teachers Association	Oral
20.	Jane Robb	California Teachers Association	Oral
21.	Jacki Campos	State SELPA Organization	Oral
22.	Joyce Childs	CARS Plus	Oral
23.	Elizabeth Jara	Teachers College San Joaquin	Oral