

---

# 2A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the February 2018 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the February 2018 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the February 2018 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

##### ***III. Communication and Engagement***

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the February 7-9, 2018 Meeting

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative (2/7 only)  
José Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative (2/8 only)  
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Kevin Kung, Teacher Representative  
Shane Martin, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities  
Castle Redmond, Public Representative  
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative  
Ref Rodriguez, Public Representative  
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California (2/9 only)  
Michelle Zumot/Stephanie Papas, Designees, Superintendent of Public Instruction

### **Commission Members Absent**

Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative

### ***Wednesday, February 7, 2018***

#### **Ad Hoc Committee**

Committee Chair C. Michael Cooney convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 3:32 p.m.

#### **1A: Interview and Recommendation of Members/Alternates for the Committee of Credentials**

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

- Beverly Young
- Dana Morelini
- Heidi Chipman

Commissioner Cooney moved to recommend the appointment of Beverly Young to serve as a Public Member representative on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Escobedo moved to recommend the appointment of Dana Morelini to serve as an Elementary Teacher representative on the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner H. Rodriguez in opposition.

Commissioner H. Rodriguez moved to recommend the appointment of Heidi Chipman as an alternate Elementary Teacher representative to the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Escobedo seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Committee Chair Cooney adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 5:03 p.m.

### ***Thursday, February 8, 2018***

#### **General Session**

Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the February 8-9, 2018 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:06 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Darling-Hammond announced that this would be Commissioner Martin's last meeting and presented him with a certificate for his service and contributions to the Commission.

#### **2A: Election for the Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2018**

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy presented this item which provided information regarding the election for Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2018.

Commissioner José Gonzalez declined the nomination for Vice Chair.

Commissioner Barnes moved to remove the tabling of the election for Vice Chair. Commissioner Cooney seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. The Commission further moved to waive the applicable provisions of the Policy Manual to allow for a voice vote to elect Alicia Hinde as Vice Chair. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **2B: Approval of the December 2017 Minutes**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the December 2017 Commission Meeting Minutes with a typo correction on page GS 2B-7. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Gonzalez, H. Rodriguez and R. Rodriguez abstaining.

#### **2C: Approval of the February 2018 Agenda**

Commissioner Gonzalez moved approval of the February 2018 Agenda with revised agenda items 2L and 4E and an agenda insert for item 2D. Commissioner H. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2D: Approval of the February 2018 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner H. Rodriguez moved approval of the February 2018 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items 2. Brian Baggett, 54. Kristina Kvalnes, 58. Steven Martin Nunez and 122. Brad Grant to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Darling-Hammond seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner R. Rodriguez recusing himself from items 9. Lisa Bowden Loo, 13. Harold Burnett, 36. Sheila Green, 38. Francisco Guzman, 42. Eric Hernandez, 43. David Hickman, 46. Scott Hunter, 66. Edgar Mosley, 72. Juan Orozco, 76. Rocio Rinto, 86. Donald Rogers, 89. Lamar Sally, 113. Harvey Wright, 116. Susana Betancourt, 117. Alejandra Bustos, 120. Lindsay Garcia, 130. Latesha Thomas, 132. Dean Ziegel, and 138. Lani Tachera.

**2E: Chair's Report**

Chair Darling-Hammond spoke about the work on restructuring special education.

**2F: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Mary Sandy shared the Commission's priorities for 2018.

**2G: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Martin expressed his gratitude for the opportunity to have served as an ex-officio member of the Commission on behalf of the Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities.

Commissioner Hinde talked about Dr. Bruce Perry's speech on Early Childhood Education at the WestEd board meeting.

Commissioner Gonzalez spoke about the accreditation process that Merced County Induction Consortium went through and commended the work of the accreditation team.

Commissioner Barnes celebrated National School Counseling Week. She also reported that the California Association of School Counselors held a one-day workshop in Berkeley on Feb 5, 2018.

**2H: Liaison Reports**

Commissioner Barnes reported on her attendance at the Pupil Personnel Services workgroup meeting.

Ilene Straus, State Board of Education Liaison, updated the Commission on the State Board's recent activities.

**Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Kirsten Barnes convened the Legislative Committee.

**3A: Update on the Governor's Proposed 2018-19 Budget**

Michele Perrault, Director, Administrative Services Division, and Elizabeth Hambridge, Manager, Fiscal and Business Services, presented this item which provided an update on the sections of the Governor's proposed 2018-19 budget that relate to the Commission.

**Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education**, asked staff a clarifying question.

#### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair José Gonzalez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

#### **4A: Initial Institutional Approval – Stage III: Consideration of Provisional Approval for High Tech High Graduate School of Education**

Commissioner H. Rodriguez recused herself from this item.

Lynette Roby, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as a part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, High Tech High Graduate School of Education's responses to the Common Standards and Program Preconditions for the Commission's consideration and possible provisional approval.

**Ben Daley and Kelly Wilson, High Tech High Graduate School of Education**, assisted staff in presenting this item.

Commissioner Klatt moved to grant provisional approval to High Tech High Graduate School of Education and set the provisional approval period to be three years. Commissioner R. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4B: Proposed Credential Structure and Related Considerations for the Preliminary Education Specialist Teaching Credential**

William Hatrick and Sarah Solari Colombini, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed revisions to the credential structure, candidate preparation requirements and authorization statements for the education specialization credentials for the Commission's consideration.

Included in Appendix A is a list of individuals and organizations that submitted letters or spoke on this topic. The audio file of the discussion is available at [https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/audio/agendas/2018-02/2018-02-4b.mp3?sfvrsn=336d56b1\\_2](https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/audio/agendas/2018-02/2018-02-4b.mp3?sfvrsn=336d56b1_2).

Chair Darling-Hammond moved to adopt staff's recommendations listed on page EPC 4B-6. Commissioner R. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4C: Update on the Work Related to the Child Development Permit**

Erin Sullivan, Consultant, and Phyllis Jacobson, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the work related to the Commission's Child Development Permit, including an outline and timeline of the work going forward.

**Nancy Hurlbut, PEACH, CCDAA, First 5 LA, California Together, and Early Edge California**, submitted a letter and spoke on this item which underscored the importance of including the California Early Childhood Education (ECE) Competencies as foundational to the development of Performance Expectations related to early childhood. She also suggested the Commission include an ECE specialist

in dual language learning and additional ECE professionals with diverse backgrounds to provide multiple perspectives on the Transforming the Workforce for Children Birth through Age 8 (TWB8) workgroup.

**Serette Kaminski, California County Superintendent Educational Services Association**, requested the Commission add additional stakeholders from the field while pursuing the next steps with the TWB8 workgroup.

#### **4D: Next Steps in the Work Related to Career Technical Education**

Bob Loux and Jake Shuler, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the authorization statements and preparation required for both general education single subject and Career Technical Education (CTE) teaching credentials and brought forward an additional possible bridge for the Commission's consideration.

**Donna Wyatt, California Department of Education**, answered questions regarding the funding for CTE.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which emphasized equitable access to career readiness and recognized that teacher pipeline issues present significant barriers for entry into the field.

**Annie Johnston, College and Career Academy Support Network/California Community College Chancellor's Office Teacher Preparation Programs**, emphasized the need for teachers who satisfy the credential requirements for both CTE and single subject credentials and voiced support for the externship credential. She also spoke about the challenges of implementing dual enrollment and suggested streamlining the CTE program to be competency-based.

#### **Recess**

#### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:33 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126, to consider the following pending litigation: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE). The Commission will also consider adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Proposed Decisions, requests for Reconsideration, and Motions to Vacate the Default Decision and Order in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

#### **Friday, February 9, 2018**

#### **General Session**

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:35 a.m. and roll call was taken.

**2I: Proposed Amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations Pertaining to Regional Accreditation and Acceptance of Degrees, Course Work, and Private School Experience for Purposes of Certification in California**

Chair Darling-Hammond opened the public hearing.

Erin Skubal, Policy Manager, Certification Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations section 80457 related to accreditation requirements for degrees, course work, and K-12 private school experience used for certification purposes.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter in support of the recommendation to adopt the proposed amendments.

Commissioner H. Rodriguez moved to adopt the proposed regulations pertaining to regional accreditation and acceptance of degrees, course work, and private school experience for purposes of certification. Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Certification Committee**

Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Certification Committee.

**5A: Request to Waive the Regional Accreditation Requirement for a Bachelor's Degree Needed for Certification**

Alyse Montgomery, Program Analyst, Certification Division, presented this item which provided one waiver request submitted by a Local Education Agency (LEA) on behalf of a candidate who earned a bachelor's degree at a time when the institution was not regionally accredited.

Commissioner Barnes moved to grant the waiver request for Deborah Johnston to allow her to pursue certification while staff completes the regulatory process. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Chair Darling-Hammond appointed Commissioner Haydee Rodriguez to chair the Educator Preparation Committee due to Commissioner Gonzalez's absence.

Acting Committee Chair H. Rodriguez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**4E: Reading Instruction Competence Assessment (RICA): Background and Discussion of Issues**

Roxann Purdue and Jake Shuler, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided background information on Education Code section 44283 and a summary of a public meeting to examine the use of the Reading Instruction Competence Assessment (RICA) as a measure to evaluate a candidate's preservice knowledge, skills, and abilities relative to effective reading and literacy instruction.

**Doug Gephart, Association of California School Administrators**, asked the Commission to think

about the original intent of the assessment prior to assessing the effectiveness of the test.

**Serette Kaminski, California County Superintendent Educational Services Association**, urged the Commission to take further steps to evaluate the scope, role and advocacy of the RICA in its current form.

**Erin Githens, California Teachers Association Student Liaison**, talked about her personal experience of taking the RICA exam and suggested the Commission consider a non-test based alternative way to demonstrate the knowledge of teaching comprehensive integrated literacy across all subjects.

**Mary Dolan, Los Angeles County Office of Education**, spoke about the struggle that candidates experience with the RICA and raised concerns regarding the structure and the content of the test.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, urged the Commission to consider the questions that were discussed at the December 20, 2017 meeting to examine what candidates need to know about integrated literacy that is reflected in the current framework and how to best assess the knowledge, skills and abilities of the candidates.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, spoke about the difficulty of passing the RICA test.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, voiced support of alternative methods to ensure preliminary candidates are prepared to teach diverse learners and students with diverse culture and linguistic and special need backgrounds.

**Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education**, raised concerns regarding the impact on future bilingual teacher candidates and the financial burden of retaking the RICA test. He also requested the Commission consider the fee restructure for the RICA and suggested that the test be embedded into the coursework.

**Sue Baker, California State University, Sacramento**, voiced support of a performance assessment to evaluate a candidate's preservice knowledge, skills, and abilities relative to effective reading and literacy instruction.

**Elva Duran, California State University, Sacramento**, spoke in support of keeping the RICA.

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, talked about the need of focusing on the purpose of the test and requested the Commission to work with stakeholders to discuss ways to have an authentic assessment to help prepare students to read.

#### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.



**6A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Gil Gonzalez, Manager, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Acting Committee Chair H. Rodriguez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**4F: Annual Report on Passing Rates of Commission-Approved Examinations from 2012-13 to 2016-17**

Kathryn Polster, Analyst, and Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which reported the passing rates of Commission-approved examinations. For each examination, the purpose of the examination, its structure, the scoring process, the examination volume, the first-time passing rate, and the cumulative passing rate were discussed.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, submitted a letter which asked Commission staff about efforts on addressing issues relating to discrepancies of results for different candidate groups.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, raised concerns regarding the discrepancies between regional ethnic groups. She also requested more data on the National Evaluation Series-Assessment of Professional Knowledge examinations and TPA passing rates.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, asked the Commission to look at the option of extending test time.

**Lyn Scott, California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education**, asked staff a clarifying question and asked the Commission to consider other options to allow Multiple Subject candidates to meet subject matter competencies other than taking the CSET.

**4G: Update on the Commission's Program Surveys and Their Use in Accreditation**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, and Teri Clark, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the implementation of the Commission's program completer surveys, master teacher survey, and employer survey. The item also discussed how the information from surveys would be used in the accreditation process.

**Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates**, commended the Commission for the change in survey delivery and requested the Commission publish other specific data.

**Legislative Committee**

Commissioner Hinde convened the Legislative Committee.

Chair Darling-Hammond appointed Ex-Officio member Tine Sloan to serve as a voting member for the purpose of maintaining a quorum.

**7A: Status of Legislation**

Joshua Speaks, Governmental Relations and Public Affairs Manager, Administrative Services Division, presented this item which provided the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission.

**Reconvene General Session**

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

**2J: Interview and Recommendation of Members/Alternates for the Committee of Credentials**

Chair Darling-Hammond moved to accept the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee: 1) the appointment of Beverly Young to serve in the Public Member position of the Committee of Credentials effective immediately; 2) the appointment of Dana Morelini to serve in the Elementary Teacher position effective July 1, 2018; and 3) for Heidi Chipmen to be appointed as an alternate. The motion carried without dissent.

**2K: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair Hinde reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Anne Clark
- Ann Farmer

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Jose Britto
- Michael Mooney
- Teri Sherman

The Commission rejected the Administrative Law Judge's Proposed Decision in the matter of Paul Dahl and voted to issue its own Decision. A Decision and Order will be considered at the next Commission meeting for adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty day delay for staff preparation of the Decision.

The Commission rejected the Administrative Law Judge's Proposed Decision in the matter of Maria Reyes. A Decision and Order will be considered at the next Commission meeting for adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty day delay for staff preparation of the Decision.

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- James Cathey III
- Alina Dudding
- Amethyst Garner (Zielke)
- Paul Loveall
- Andrew Prouse

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the following matters:

- Cheryl Chambers
- Peter Heffner
- Marcela Meneses

The Commission granted the following requests for reconsideration and sustained its previous decision:

- Jason Allen
- Windy Boeck
- Roque Burio Jr.
- William Carter
- Roopa Dilip
- Susana Gomez
- Troy McComak
- Adrienne Moore

The Commission denied the following requests for reconsideration:

- Marcus Mendez
- Carlos Valencia

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #2 Brian Baggett, #54 Kristina Kvalnes, and #58 Steven Martin Nunez, and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item #122 Brad Grant and rejected the Proposed Consent Determination.

Commissioner R. Rodriguez recused himself from the following matters: Roque Burio Jr. and Susana Gomez.

## **2L: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy acknowledged Teri Clark's and Michele Perrault's birthdays.

## **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 12:01 p.m.

**Appendix A**  
**Proposed Credential Structure and Related Considerations for the Preliminary  
Education Specialist Teaching Credential**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Written/Oral Statement</b>
1.	Ann England	California Autism Professional Training and Information Network	Written
2.	Leslie Schaeffer-Haverstock	Self	Written
3.	Leslie A. A. Anido	Blackford Elementary	Written/Oral
4.	Judy White	Riverside County Superintendent of School	Written
5.	Kathy Bays	Self	Written
6.	Maureen O'Leary Burness	Statewide Special Education Task Force	Written
7.	Vicki Barber	Statewide Special Education Task Force	Written
8.	Victoria Graf	Education Preparation Subcommittee	Written
9.	Paul Sindelar	University of Florida	Written
10.	Eric Heins	California Teachers Association	Written
11.	Naomi Eason	California School Boards Association	Written
12.	Bonnie and Gilles Denoyer	Self	Written
13.	Elizabeth Jara	Teacher's College of San Joaquin	Oral
14.	Eli Gallup	State SELPA Organization	Oral
15.	Yvonne Bui	San Francisco State University	Oral
16.	Jenny Teresi	Riverside County Office of Education	Oral
17.	Barbara Howard	Riverside County Office of Education	Oral
18.	Danette Brown	California Teachers Association	Oral
19.	Michael Flores Castaneda	California Teachers Association	Oral
20.	Harold Acord	California Teachers Association	Oral
21.	Janet Davis	California Federation of Teachers	Oral
22.	Serette Kaminski	CA. County Superintendents Educational Services Association	Oral
23.	Sue Shalvey	Special Education Task Force	Oral
24.	Lyn Scott	California Association for Bilingual Teacher Education	Oral
25.	Nancy Hurlbut	PEACH	Oral