
1A

Action

General Session

Approval of the October 2016 Minutes

Executive Summary: The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the October 2016 meeting of the Commission.

Recommended Action: Approve the minutes of the October 2016 meeting.

Presenter: None

Strategic Plan Goal

III. Communication and Engagement

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the October 27-28, 2016 Meeting

Commission Members Attending

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair
Kathleen Harris, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative
Constance Blackburn, Teacher Representative
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative
Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative
Jose Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative
Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Ex-Officio, California State University
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative
Shane Martin, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (10/28 only)
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative
Ref Rodriguez, Public Representative (10/27 only)
Michelle Zumot, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Commission Members Absent

Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California

Thursday, October 27, 2016

General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond convened the October 27-28, 2016 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:01 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

1A: Approval of the September 2016 Minutes

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the September 2016 Executive Committee Minutes. Commissioner Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Barnes moved approval of the September 2016 Commission Minutes. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Gonzalez abstaining.

1B: Approval of the October 2016 Agenda

Commissioner Gonzalez moved approval of the October 2016 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 1C, 2B and 4B. Commissioner H. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

1C: Approval of the October 2016 Consent Calendar

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the October 2016 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw item 5. Kevin Bain to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Gonzalez recusing himself from item 46. Raymond Maravilla, and Commissioner H. Rodriguez recusing herself from item 70. Arelys Thompson.

1D: Chair's Report

There was no report.

1E: Executive Director's Report

Executive Director Sandy updated the Commission on the work of implementing the technical assistance to Commission-approved program sponsors. Executive Director Sandy reported that Commission staff participated in the Credential Counselors and Analysts of California (CCAC) conference. Executive Director Sandy also reported that she attend the California Council on Teacher Education Fall Conference and Deans of Education meeting this month.

1F: Commission Member Reports

Commissioner Cooney reported that Commissioner Haydee Rodriguez received the 2016 Alumni Excellence in Education Award along with Joseph Castro, President of CSU Fresno, and Piya Sorcar, Founder of TeachAIDS.

Commissioner Barnes reported that she attended the annual conference of the California Association of School Counselors' on October 16-18, 2016 in Riverside.

Commissioner Gonzalez reported that he joined Ilene Straus and Tom Adams on a policy panel that met with the California Deans of Education on October 19, 2016 in San Diego.

1G: Liaison Reports

Ilene Straus, State Board of Education Liaison, spoke about her attendance at the California Council on Teacher Education Fall Conference and updated the Commission on the State Board's recent activities.

Grace Wakefield, Commission Student Liaison, reported on her recent work in the residency program.

Commissioners Browne and Grenot-Scheyer reported that they attended a teacher preparation pipeline meeting initiated by the Director of the Teacher TRAC Program at Cerritos Community College.

Commissioner Browne mentioned that the National Association of Community College Teacher Education Programs annual conference will be held in March 2017 in San Francisco. She also reported that she attended the California Community College ECE Faculty Association's joint advisory meeting in September 2016 in Sacramento.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Jose Gonzalez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

2A: Proposed Adoption of Revised Elementary Subject Matter Program Standards

Miranda Gutierrez, Assistant Consultant, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed updated Elementary Subject Matter (ESM) program standards to the Commission for review and possible adoption to restore the option of allowing completion of a Commission-approved subject matter program to meet the subject matter requirement.

Lisa Hegdahl, California Science Teachers Association, submitted a letter which supported the changes in the proposed ESM programs standards to include three domains of science and a lab science requirement.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a letter which supported the proposed streamlined standard as well as the expansion of the VAPA and Science requirements. The letter also supported the proposed review process for re-instating former subject matter programs and approving new applications.

Matthew d'Alessio, California State University Northridge, submitted a letter which suggested the subject matter preparation for multiple subjects credential candidates should: 1) encompass all three dimensions of the CA NGSS and meaningfully integrate these three dimensions, 2) align with the Disciplinary Core Ideas of the CA NGSS, 3) include engineering content, and 4) emphasize the interactions between human and natural systems.

Jessica Sawko, California Science Teachers Association, voiced support of this process as well as future revisions of the Science SMRs.

Stephen Blake, Children Now, voiced support of the changes in the proposed ESM programs standards to include three domains of science and a lab science requirement.

Commissioner Hinde moved to adopt the revised Elementary Subject Matter program standards. Commissioner R. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2B: Redeveloped CalTPA Pilot-Participant Waiver Requests

Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessments, presented this item which provided criteria for the selection of institutions to participate in the California Teaching Performance Assessment (CalTPA) pilot study and recommended that the Commission approve the selection criteria for participation; approve the requested waiver for selected institutions that meet the proposed criteria; and adopt a performance level for successful completion of the redeveloped CalTPA for use during the pilot.

Helene Mandell, University of San Diego, submitted a letter which supported the CalTPA participants to be able to use a satisfactory score on the two cycles in the pilot to meet the performance assessment necessary to meet the TPA credentialing requirement.

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, voiced a concern regarding provisions of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act and the public posting of the agenda item to allow stakeholders sufficient time to provide input.

Chair Darling-Hammond moved to approve the selection criteria for participation; approve the requested waiver for selected institutions that meet the proposed criteria; and adopt a performance level for successful completion of the redeveloped CalTPA for use during the pilot. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner R. Rodriguez recusing himself from this item.

2C: Proposed Revisions to the Preconditions and Standards for Special Education Induction Programs

Sarah Solari, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed revisions to the current Education Specialist Induction Preconditions and Program Standards and the field response to the proposed standards.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a letter which suggested the Commission approve the proposed amendments to the preconditions and standards.

David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, suggested the Commission adopt the proposed revisions to the preconditions and standards for Education Specialist Induction programs.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, voiced support of the Commission's action to establish the expectations for Education Specialist Induction.

Commissioner Blackburn moved to adopt the proposed revisions to the preconditions and standards for Education Specialist Induction programs with a correction under Standard 3 to remove "for example" and substitute "such as" to provide a link to the prior sentence. Commissioner R. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2E: Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2014-15 as Required by Title II of the Higher Education Act

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, and Phi Phi Lau, Research Program Specialist, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the *Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2014-2015* as required by Title II of the Higher Education Act.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, suggested the Commission include more data and analysis of annual goal results to provide more data transparency to inform the public.

Commissioner Klatt moved to approve the 2014-2015 Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for transmission to the U.S. Department of Education on or before October 31, 2016. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

2F: Update on the Development of the California Administrator Performance Assessment (CalAPA)

Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessments, presented this item which provided an update on the efforts to develop the California Administrator Performance Assessment (CalAPA).

Peg Winkelman, California Association of Professors of Educational Administration, voiced a concern regarding the timing of getting all the pilot programs together to make the necessary adjustments for candidates.

2D: Initial Institutional Approval

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Lynette Roby, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided, as a part of the Initial Institutional Approval process, one prospective program sponsor's responses to the twelve eligibility criteria for consideration by the Commission.

Doug Gephart, Association of California School Administrators, asked the Commission to use a critical eye to determine whether alternative programs truly have the level of the expertise to ensure candidates have the skill set and knowledge to deliver the services to the degree that the Commission has set for all other programs.

Noni Reis, California Teachers Association and California Faculty Association, suggested the Commission deny the Eligibility Requirements submitted by Relay Graduate School of Education (Relay) and shared a report entitled "Independent Teacher Education Programs: Apocryphal Claim, Illusory Evidence" by the National Education Policy Center (NEPC).

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, raised concerns regarding the teaching and management techniques that are taught in the Relay Graduate School of Education program. He also emphasized the importance of not contributing to a stratified system and asked the Commission to encourage programs to meet the candidates where they are at and to ensure all candidates have as many advantages as possible to succeed.

Danette Brown, California Teachers Association, spoke about Criteria 10: History of Prior Experience and Effectiveness in Education Preparation with regard to Relay and urged the Commission to deny its submission of Eligibility Requirements.

Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers, raised concerns regarding Relay's program and recommended the Commission not approve the submitted Eligibility Requirements.

Rigel Massaro, Public Advocates, stated it is critical to use multiple measures for accountability, teacher evaluation and teacher preparation to meet the needs of students in a comprehensive way that goes beyond a test score and raised concerns regarding granting approval to Relay.

Pamela Inbasekaran and Sarah Marder-Eppstein, Relay Graduate School of Education, shared information about their institution, clarified some misconceptions about their program, and answered questions that were raised by Commission members.

Jane Robb, California Teachers Association, suggested the Commission make its judgement based on the materials submitted by an institution and whether or not it has met all twelve criteria to move to the next step in the approval process. She also recommended that Relay be denied or at minimum not be allowed to go forward without providing additional information on the Eligibility Requirements.

Ken Burt, California Teachers Association, discussed the application process for initial institutional approval.

Commissioner Harris moved to deny the application for initial institutional approval submitted by Relay Graduate School of Education and requested the institution provide evidence that the program includes restorative practices, equity and support for children in poverty if they reapply. Commissioner H. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners R. Rodriguez, Cooney and Klatt in opposition and Commissioner Darling-Hammond abstaining.

The Commission directed staff to refine the application process and bring an analysis back to the Commission for discussion.

Recess

Closed Session

The Commission went into Closed Session at 2:33 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126(e), to consider the following pending litigations: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE); and *Luis Osollo v. Linda Darling-Hammond, Et Al* (United States District Court Central District of California, CV-16-03045-SJO (AS)). The Commission also considered adverse actions, petitions for reinstatement and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126(e).

Friday, October 28, 2016

General Session

Chair Darling reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:33 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Professional Practices Committee

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

3A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report

Vanessa Whitnell, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

Legislative Committee

Committee Chair Kathleen Harris convened the Legislative Committee.

4A: Status of Legislation

Joshua Speaks, Legislative Representative, Office of Governmental Relations, presented this item which provided the status of legislative measures on which the Commission has adopted a position and those of interest to the Commission.

4B: Final Federal Title II Regulations of the Higher Education Act (HEA)

Joshua Speaks, Legislative Representative, Office of Governmental Relations, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information on the final version of the new Federal Title II regulations for postsecondary teacher preparation programs for Commission consideration and discussion.

Educator Preparation Committee

Committee Chair Jose Gonzalez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

2G: Update on the Commission's Work Related to the Education Specialist Preliminary Credential and Associated Work Group

William Hatrick and Sarah Solari, Consultants, presented this item which provided an update on the work associated to improve the preparation of prospective special education teachers.

Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association, submitted a letter which supported the work group's suggestions that the Commission maintain an initial credential for Early Childhood Special Education (ECSE) and that the ECSE credential be expanded to include the authorization to teach Kindergarten and Transitional Kindergarten.

Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers, raised a concern regarding authorizing Education Specialists to teach kindergarten and transitional kindergarten.

David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, agreed with Janet Davis's comments and raised concerns regarding subject matter-specific competence at the secondary level for special education teachers.

Harold Acord, California Teachers Association, echoed the same concerns.

Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education, voiced concerns regarding the ECSE credential being expanded to include kindergarten and transitional kindergarten and the subject matter competency requirement for an Education Specialist credential candidate.

Derek Ramage, Los Angeles Unified School District, reiterated the comments that were made by previous speakers.

2H: Literacy: What Teachers Need to Know and to be Able to Do

Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, Hallie Yopp Slowik and Nancy Brynelson, CSU Center for the Advancement of Reading, presented this item which provided information on the knowledge and skills that both elementary and secondary teachers need to have regarding literacy.

A series of discussion questions was also presented for the Commission's consideration related to potential action that may need to be considered to more effectively prepare educators in the area of literacy for the future.

Miyuki Manzanedo, Student California Teachers Association, suggested the Commission consolidate some elements of RICA into the updated versions of the Commission-approved TPAs and urged the Commission to consider measuring what teachers need to be able to do through the TPA rather than including those elements in the RICA.

David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association, stated that it would be preferable to get a more authentic assessment of what candidates know about and are able to do in regard to literacy.

Reconvene General Session

Chair Darling-Hammond reconvened the General Session.

2L: Report of Closed Session Items

Vice Chair Harris reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC* and no reportable action was taken.

Staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Osollo v. CTC* and there was no reportable action.

The Commission granted Danny Desanto's Petition for Reinstatement.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Jim Chambers
- William Hua
- Veronica Ruiz
- Greg Schneider

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision in the matter of Samantha Sorkin and called for the transcript.

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Jay Dunlap
- Allen Young

The Commission granted the following requests for reconsideration and sustained its previous decisions:

- Kevin Robertson
- Marvl Thomas

The Commission granted the request for reconsideration in the matter of Phylcia Johnson and remanded the matter back to the Committee of Credentials.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar item 5, Kevin Bain and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials.

11: New Business

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Chair Darling-Hammond adjourned the meeting at 11:26 a.m.