Executive Summary: Senate Bill 173 (Chap. 545, Stats. 2014) requires the Commission on Teacher Credentialing and the Academic Senate of the California Community Colleges to review the current requirements for adult education instructors, as specified, and develop recommendations for modifying or establishing reciprocity standards for these instructors. The recommendations from this work are to be submitted to the Legislature by July 1, 2016.

Policy Question: Does the Commission wish to consider one or more alternative pathways for California Community College adult education instructors to obtain a Designated Subjects Adult Education Teaching Credential?

Recommended Action: For information only

Presenter: Erin Sullivan, Consultant, Professional Services Division
Work Related to Establishing Reciprocity for Instructors of Adult Education

Introduction
Signed by the Governor in 2014, Senate Bill (SB) 173 (Chap. 545, Stats. 2014) includes the following language:

“The Commission on Teacher Credentialing and the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges shall meet to review their current requirements for noncredit adult education and adult education instructors, and shall develop and submit recommendations to the appropriate policy and fiscal committees of the Legislature for modifying or establishing reciprocity standards for instructors of adult education courses by July 1, 2016.”

This agenda item discusses work already begun and provides further background information for the Commission’s information as part of the ongoing work to meet the Legislative reporting requirement timeframe.

Background
As authorized by current law, both the California Community Colleges (CCC) and the public K-12 school system offer adult education courses. Both entities receive state funding for specified adult education courses, including the following:

- Adult programs in family education
- Adult programs in elementary and secondary basic skills and other courses and classes required for the high school diploma
- Adult education programs in English as a second language
- Adult education programs for immigrant eligible for educational services in citizenship, English as a second language, and workforce preparation classes in the basic skills of speaking, listening, reading, writing, mathematics, decision-making and problem solving skills, and other classes required for preparation to participate in job training
- Adult education programs for adults with disabilities
- Adult short-term career technical education programs with high employment potential
- Adult programs for older adults
- Adult education programs for apprentices
- Adult programs in home economics
- Adult programs in health and safety education

In December 2012 the Legislative Analyst’s Office (LAO) issued a report – Restructuring California’s Adult Education System\(^1\) – that discussed the history and status of adult education

---
\(^1\) [http://www.lao.ca.gov/Publications/Detail/2672](http://www.lao.ca.gov/Publications/Detail/2672)
in California. The report identified a number of weaknesses in the adult education system that create general confusion for the public and for policy makers. These weaknesses include that adult education courses offered by the K-12 school districts and the community colleges are subject to different policies relating to funding, performance data, and accountability systems and that the system of adult education “applies inconsistent and conflicting policies regarding faculty qualifications ... at adult schools and community colleges.” When comparing the aspects of the two systems of providing adult education there is a key preparation distinction based on whether the courses offered by the adult education instructor are offered within the Community College system or the K-12 public school system. These distinctions are discussed more fully in the sections following.

The recommendations contained in the LAO report became the basic structure for SB 173. The LAO recommendations included reframing and restructuring the funding for adult education, creating clear distinctions between adult education and collegiate (postsecondary) education at the community colleges, promoting a consistent data system across the K-12 and CCC sectors, and to no longer require instructors at K-12 adult schools to hold a teaching credential so that adult education faculty can teach at both the K-12 and the CCC. SB 173 did not enact these recommendations. Rather, as part of a package of legislation on adult education, SB 173 required collaborative efforts between the Chancellor’s Office of the California Community Colleges and the California Department of Education around a set of specified activities, and between the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges and the Commission on Teacher Credentialing around a different set of specified activities, with each set of partners developing reports to the legislature that provide information and recommendations based on their collaborations.

**Comparison of Qualifications for Instructors of Adult Education**

As instructed by statute, Commission staff has conferred with staff from the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges to better understand each system’s requirements for instructors and to identify potential ways to address reciprocity. The information that follows is based on the outcomes thus far of this collaborative effort.

Within the California Community College system, requirements for instructors typically vary depending on the nature of the course taught. For example, the CCC offers academic courses that can be applicable to an Associate’s Degree, adult basic skills education courses, vocational and remedial education courses. The requirements for instructors teaching academic-oriented courses are typically higher than for instructors teaching vocational or other non-academic courses. Similarly, the Commission’s credentialing requirements distinguish between non-academic or vocational subjects and academic

For purposes of meeting the statutory mandate, staff discussions have focused only on CCC instructors of non-academic or noncredit courses. Educators who provide academic-related courses to adult learners through the community colleges are not required to hold a credential issued by the Commission. They must meet the requirements established by the CCC Board of Governors. The CCC Board of Governors requires adult education instructors at the community
colleges to have a bachelor’s or master’s degree depending on the type of course taught. CCC instructors who also wish to teach in K-12 adult schools are required to hold a teaching credential issued by the Commission, the requirements for which are described below.

In contrast to the CCC requirements, educators who provide services to adult learners through the K-12 adult schools are generally required to hold a valid Designated Subjects Adult Education Teaching Credential (DSAE) issued by the Commission. Similar to Career Technical Education, the requirements for the adult education instructor are often tied to and defined by the source of the funding for the course. The Commission’s credential preparation requirements differ from the preparation requirements of the CCC in that in order to qualify for a preliminary DSAE, individuals teaching general, non-academic subjects must have a minimum of three years of experience or education directly related to the subject they will teach, must possess a high school diploma and are required to satisfy the basic skills requirement. Individuals teaching academic-related subjects to adult learners in a K-12 setting must have a bachelor’s degree and must also satisfy the basic skills requirement. To qualify for a clear DSAE, individuals must meet all of the requirements for the preliminary credential, complete a Commission-approved program of individualized preparation, have two years of successful teaching on a preliminary DSAE, and satisfy other requirements including demonstration of knowledge of the United States Constitution. The program of individualized preparation must include adult learning theory, curriculum and instructional planning, using technology in the classroom, instructional practices, assessing student learning, school and community resources, and an early orientation in the first month of teaching. The program standards for the Commission’s Adult Education teacher preparation programs can be found on the CTC website: http://www.ctc.ca.gov/educator-prep/standards/Adult-Education-Handbook.pdf.

The chart in Appendix A, developed in collaboration with representatives from the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC), provides a side by side comparison of the qualifications for instructors of noncredit courses as required by the CCC and by the Commission (at the clear credential level), based on the course to be taught.

As noted above, the primary difference between CCC and Commission adult education instructor requirements is that of the focus of preparation. The Commission requires candidates for a Clear Designated Subjects Adult Education credential to complete a Commission-approved program of individualized preparation, to verify knowledge of the U.S. Constitution by either coursework or examination as specified in the program standards. The CCC does not have a preparation requirement once the individual has met the minimum qualifications for employment, which are a baccalaureate or master’s degree and/or work experience in the area of instruction.

Commission Discussion
Staff requests that the Commission provide guidance to inform the ongoing discussions with the ASCCC. Does the Commission wish to consider the idea of reciprocity in the credentialing of adult education instructors? For example, might the Commission wish to consider options such as potentially accepting a specified number of years of experience within the Community College system in place of the individualized preparation program, or options such as
identifying selected clear credential requirements in lieu of the full range of requirements? Might the Commission decide not to modify any of the current requirements for the Designated Subjects Adult Education teaching credential for Community College instructors for purposes of reciprocity or might the Commission find itself in agreement with the LAO’s recommendation to eliminate the credential requirement for K-12 adult schools?

Next Steps
The ASCCC meets twice per year, in fall and spring, and the ongoing discussions between Commission staff and the ASCCC will continue at each of these two meetings, as informed by the Commission’s discussion of the issues. Updates will be provided to the Commission as the work progresses and a final report will come before the Commission for its approval prior to transmittal to the appropriate fiscal and policy committees of the Legislature.
## Appendix A

**Minimum Requirements for all CCC Noncredit Courses and CTC Adult Education Credentials**

**High School Prerequisite:** Three years of experience and/or education directly related to each subject to be named on the credential.

- High School diploma\(^1\)
- Commission-approved program of personalized preparation
- Two years of successful teaching in the subject listed on the credential\(^2\)
- Additional requirements – see information in table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>California Community College</th>
<th>Commission on Teacher Credentialing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discipline</strong></td>
<td><strong>Minimum Qualifications</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Interdisciplinary—Basic Skills: Noncredit instruction | (a) For an interdisciplinary noncredit basic skills course a bachelor’s in any social science, humanities, mathematics, or natural science discipline or in liberal studies, as appropriate for the course. | Title 5 §53412 (a) | Elementary and secondary basic skills courses and other courses such as remedial academic courses in reading, mathematics, and language arts, and Individualized high school learning lab/G.E.D. preparation/contract class settings | Elementary and Secondary Basic Skills | Bachelor’s degree or higher completed at a regionally accredited college or university, including completion of 20 semester units (or 10 upper division units) with at least 3 units in four of the following six areas:  
- English  
- Mathematics  
- Science  
- Social Sciences  
- Fine Arts  
- Language other than English |
| Mathematics—Basic Skills: Noncredit | (b) For a noncredit basic skills course in mathematics a bachelor’s degree in mathematics. | Title 5 §53412(b) | | Individual Subjects restricted to the one identified subject area | Bachelor’s degree or higher completed at a regionally accredited college or university, including completion of 20 semester units (or 10 upper division units) in the specified subject |
| Reading—Basic Skills: Noncredit | For a noncredit basic skills course in reading and/or writing, either: a bachelor’s degree in English, literature, comparative literature, composition, linguistics, speech, creative writing, or journalism; OR | Title 5 §53412 (c) | | | |

---

\(^1\) This requirement can be met by one of the following methods: high school diploma, diploma based on passage of the GED Test, or the Foreign equivalent of a high school diploma

\(^2\) Defined as teaching a minimum of one course in each of four terms within the three-year period of validity of preliminary credential

\(^3\) Requires satisfaction of the basic skills requirement (BSR).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Minimum Qualifications</th>
<th>Title 5</th>
<th>Courses organized primarily for adults</th>
<th>Adult Education Credential(s) Subjects</th>
<th>Additional requirements based on the subject named on the credential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Writing—Basic Skills: Noncredit</td>
<td>Bachelor’s degree in any discipline and twelve semester units of coursework in teaching reading.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) For a noncredit course in reading and/or writing, either: a bachelor’s degree in English, literature, comparative literature, composition, linguistics, speech, creative writing, or journalism; OR A bachelor’s degree in any discipline and twelve semester units of coursework in teaching reading.</td>
<td>Title 5 § 53412 (c)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESL—Basic Skills: Noncredit</td>
<td>Bachelor’s degree or higher completed at a regionally accredited college or university including completion of 20 semester units (or 10 upper division units) in one or any combination of the following:  - Teaching English as a Second Language (TESL)  - Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL)  - Second Language Acquisition  - Language other than English  - Linguistics  - Bilingual/Bicultural studies</td>
<td></td>
<td>Courses in English as a second language, including vocational English as a second Language</td>
<td>English as a Second Language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>Minimum Qualifications</td>
<td>Title 5</td>
<td>Courses organized primarily for adults</td>
<td>Adult Education Credential(s) Subjects</td>
<td>Additional requirements based on the subject named on the credential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>year of employment as a noncredit instructor; OR (3) A bachelor’s degree with any of the majors specified in subparagraph (2) above; and one year of experience teaching ESL in an accredited institution; and a certificate in teaching English as a second language, which may be completed concurrently during the first two years of employment as a noncredit instructor; OR (4) Possession of a full-time, clear California Designated Subjects Adult Education Teaching Credential authorizing instruction in ESL.</td>
<td>Title 5, § 53412 (j)</td>
<td>Short-term vocational courses and programs with high employment potential</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| General Subjects<sup>4</sup> | (i) For a short term noncredit vocational course, any one of the following: (1) A bachelor’s degree; and two years of occupational experience related to the subject of the course taught; OR                                              | Title 5, § 53412 (j)                                                 | Short-term vocational courses and programs with high employment potential                           | 1. Agriculture and Natural Resources, 2. Arts, Media, and Entertainment 3. Building Trades and Construction 4. Education, Child Development, and | Specific to the prerequisite 3 years of work experience, applicants for Adult Education credentials in these general subjects areas must have completed at least one year of work experience directly related to the subject to be named on the credential. At least one year of this required work experience must have been within the last 5 years, or 2 years within the last 10 years, |

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Minimum Qualifications</th>
<th>Title 5</th>
<th>Courses organized primarily for adults</th>
<th>Adult Education Credential(s) Subjects</th>
<th>Additional requirements based on the subject named on the credential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>An associate degree; and six years of occupational experience related to the subject of the course taught; OR Possession of a full-time, clear California Designated Subjects Adult Education Teaching Credential authorizing instruction in the subject matter; OR For courses in an occupation for which the district offers or has offered apprenticeship instruction, the minimum qualifications for noncredit apprenticeship instructors in that occupation, as specified in Section 53413.</td>
<td>Title 5, § 53412 (d)</td>
<td>Workforce preparation courses in the basic skills of speaking, listening, reading, writing, mathematics, decision-making, problem solving skills, and other courses required for preparation to participate in job-specific technical training</td>
<td>Family Services 5. Energy and Utilities 6. Engineering and Design 7. Fashion and Interior Design 8. Finance and Business 9. Health Science and Medical Technology 10. Hospitality, Tourism, and Recreation 11. Information Technology 12. Manufacturing and Product Development 13. Marketing, Sales, and Service 14. Public Service 15. Transportation</td>
<td>immediately preceding the issuance of the preliminary credential.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizenship—Basic Skills: Noncredit</td>
<td>(d) For a noncredit course in citizenship a bachelor’s degree in any discipline, and six semester units in American history and institutions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Elementary and Secondary Basic Skills³</td>
<td>Bachelor’s degree or higher completed at a regionally accredited college or university AND completion of 20 semester units with at least 3 units in four of the following six areas: - English - Mathematics - Science - Social Science - Fine Arts - Language other than English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>Minimum Qualifications</td>
<td>Title 5</td>
<td>Courses organized primarily for adults</td>
<td>Adult Education Credential(s) Subjects</td>
<td>Additional requirements based on the subject named on the credential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Parent Education: Noncredit | (i) For a noncredit course in parent education a bachelor’s degree in child development, early childhood education, human development, family and consumer studies with a specialization in child development or early childhood education, educational psychology with a specialization in child development, elementary education, psychology, or family life studies; and two years of professional experience in early childhood programs or parenting education. | Title 5, § 53412 (i) | Parenting, including parent cooperative preschools, courses in child growth and development and parent-child relationships | • Family Education  
• Education, Child Development, and Family Services | Specific to the prerequisite 3 years of work experience, applicants for Adult Education credentials in these general subjects areas must have completed at least one year of actual work experience directly related to the subject to be named on the credential. At least one year of this required work experience must have been within the last 5 years, or 2 years within the last 10 years, immediately preceding the issuance of the preliminary credential. |
| Specialized Instruction (DSPS): Noncredit | (e) The minimum qualification for service as a faculty member to provide noncredit specialized instruction for students with disabilities shall be any one of the following:  
(1) The minimum qualifications for providing specialized instruction for students with disabilities as specified in this section.  
(2) A bachelor’s degree with any of the following majors: education of students with disabilities shall be any one of the following:  
| Title 5 § 53414 (e) | Courses and programs for persons with substantial disabilities | No comparable CTC credential. |
### California Community College

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Minimum Qualifications</th>
<th>Title 5</th>
<th>Courses organized primarily for adults</th>
<th>Adult Education Credential(s) Subjects</th>
<th>Additional requirements based on the subject named on the credential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Older Adults: Noncredit | specific or multiple disabilities; special education; psychology; physical education with an emphasis in adaptive physical education; communicative disorders; rehabilitation; computer-based education; other computer-related majors which include course work on adapted or assistive computer technology for students with disabilities; other majors related to providing specialized instruction or services to persons with disabilities; OR An associate degree with one of the majors specified in subparagraph (2) above; and four years of experience providing specialized instruction or services to persons in the disability category or categories being served. | Title 5, § 53412 (h) | Courses and programs for older adults | • Art  
• Health and Safety  
• Family Education  
• Financial Literacy  
• Education, Child Development, and Family Services | Specific to the prerequisite 3 years of work experience, applicants for Adult Education credentials in these general subjects areas must have completed at least one year of actual work experience directly related to the subject to be named on the credential. At least one year of this required work experience must have been within the last 5 years, or 2 years within the last 10 years, immediately preceding the issuance of the credential. |

(h) For a noncredit course intended for older adults, either pattern (1) or (2) following:

(1) Bachelor’s degree with a major related to the subject of the course taught, and either:

(A) Thirty hours or two semester units of course work
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Minimum Qualifications</th>
<th>Title 5</th>
<th>Courses organized primarily for adults</th>
<th>Adult Education Credential(s) Subjects</th>
<th>Additional requirements based on the subject named on the credential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Home Economics: Noncredit        | (g) For a noncredit course in home economics a bachelor’s degree                        | Title 5, § 53412 (g) | Courses and programs in home economics | • Health and Safety  
• Family Education                                                      | Specific to the prerequisite 3 years of work experience, applicants for Adult Education credentials in these general subjects areas must |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Minimum Qualifications</th>
<th>Title 5</th>
<th>Courses organized primarily for adults</th>
<th>Adult Education Credential(s) Subjects</th>
<th>Additional requirements based on the subject named on the credential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health and Safety: Noncredit</td>
<td>in home economics, life management, family and consumer studies, dietetics, food management interior design, or clothing and textiles; or an associated degree in any of those subjects, and four years of professional experience related to the subject of the course taught.</td>
<td>Title 5, § 53412 (f)</td>
<td>Courses in health and safety education</td>
<td>• Education, Child Development, and Family Services&lt;br&gt;• Public Service</td>
<td>have completed at least one year of actual work experience directly related to the subject to be named on the credential. At least one year of this required work experience must have been within the last 5 years, or 2 years within the last 10 years, immediately preceding the issuance of the preliminary credential.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>