

---

# 1A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the April 2016 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the April 2016 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the April 2016 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

#### Strategic Plan Goal

##### ***III. Communication and Engagement***

- b) Maintain effective communication and coordination between Commissioners and staff in carrying out the Commission's duties, roles and responsibilities.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the April 13-15, 2016 Meeting

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Chair (4/14 only)  
Kathleen Harris, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Joseph Aguerrebere, California State University  
Kirsten Barnes, Non-Administrative Services Representative (4/14 only)  
Constance Blackburn, Teacher Representative  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Marysol de la Torre-Escobedo, Teacher Representative  
Jose Gonzalez, Administrative Services Representative  
Alicia Hinde, Teacher Representative  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative  
Shane Martin, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (4/14 only)  
Ref Rodriguez, Public Representative  
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Michelle Zumot, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction

### **Commission Members Absent**

Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
Haydee Rodriguez, Teacher Representative

### ***Wednesday, April 13, 2016***

#### **Ad Hoc Committee**

Committee Chair Alicia Hinde convened the Ad Hoc Committee at 3:03 p.m.

#### **1A: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation**

The Committee interviewed the following individuals:

##### *K-12 Finalists*

James Webb  
Gerard Morrison  
Simone Simmons

##### *Postsecondary Finalists*

Cheryl Forbes  
Lory Selby  
Iris Riggs

Commissioner Aguerrebere moved to recommend Gerard Morrison be appointed to serve as a K-12 member on the Committee on Accreditation (COA). Commissioner Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Barnes moved to recommend James Webb and Simone Simmons be appointed as alternates for the COA. Commissioner Aguerrebere seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Barnes moved to recommend Cheryl Forbes and Iris Riggs be appointed to serve as postsecondary members on the Committee on Accreditation and Lory Selby as an alternate for the COA. Commissioner Aguerrebere seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Committee Chair Hinde adjourned the Ad Hoc Committee at 4:30 p.m.

***Thursday, April 14, 2016***

### **General Session**

Chair Darling-Hammond convened the April 14-15, 2016 General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 9:02 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

#### **2A: Approval of the February 2016 Minutes**

Commissioner Barnes moved approval of the February 2016 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Gonzalez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **2B: Approval of the April 2016 Agenda**

Commissioner Blackburn moved approval of the April 2016 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 1A, 2C, 2H and 7A. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **2C: Approval of the April 2016 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the April 2016 Consent Calendar. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **2D: Chair's Report**

There was no report.

#### **2E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Sandy notified the public that the Commission awarded a contract to Evaluation Systems group of Pearson to assist the Commission's CalTPA Design Team in redesigning the California Teaching Performance Assessment.

Executive Director Sandy provided an update on the work of the Network for Transforming Educator Preparation (NTEP).

Executive Director Sandy introduced Katie Hampton as a new attorney in the Division of Professional Practices.

Executive Director Sandy congratulated General Counsel Nanette Rufo on her upcoming retirement.

### **2F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Martin spoke about the upcoming Better Together: California Teacher Summit on July 29, 2016.

### **1G: Liaison Reports**

Ilene Straus, State Board of Education Liaison, updated the Commission on the State Board's recent activities.

Grace Wakefield, Commission Student Liaison, talked about the financial burden and the range of requirements for various options to obtain credentials for future teachers.

### **Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Kirstin Barnes convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

### **3A: Approval of Contract for Administrator Performance Assessment**

Amy Reising, Director of Performance Assessment Development, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the progress of the design and development of the Commission's Administrator Performance Assessment (APA) and requested that the Commission approve a sole source contract for that work.

**The California Association of Professors of Education Administration (CAPEA)** submitted a written letter which recommended the following amendments: 1) provide a description of the design team composition; 2) provide an explanation of the funding for the design team component and a clear description of the design team's participation noted in the APA design and development Components and Tentative Completion Dates Table; and 3) Under Component II, replace the terms "training and scorers" with "calibration and assessors".

**Peg Winkelman, California Association of Professors of Educational Administration (CAPEA)**, requested the APA be job-embedded and authentic.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, thanked staff for their efforts to provide transparency in the process and working collaboratively with stakeholders to develop the APA.

Commissioner Harris moved to approve a contract with Evaluation Systems group of Pearson to provide technical and psychometric support to the APA design team and Commission staff to design and develop the Commission's APA and to administer the assessment from 2018-2020. Chair Darling-Hammond seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

## **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair Bonnie Klatt convened the Certification Committee.

### **4A: Routes for Out of State Credentialed Teachers**

Erin Skubal, Program Analyst, Tammy Duggan, Consultant, and Charlie Watters, Director, Certification Division presented this item which provided an overview of the requirements from 1970 to the present for out of state credentialed teachers to earn a California teaching credential.

**Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education**, voiced support of amending the definition of “professional-level teaching credential” and expressed concerns about expanding the definition of accredited private school experience and also for adding a recency requirement for the out of state teaching experience.

**David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, voiced the importance of accreditation and raised a concern about expanding the definition for regionally-accredited private school as it relates to out of state teaching experience.

**Derek Ramage, Los Angeles Unified School District**, suggested the Commission consider a review of Canadian teacher certification in order to develop routes for out of country teachers from Canada to ease the challenges and hurdles for both applicants and districts.

**Cristina Ruelas, KIPP LA Schools**, spoke about the challenges for out of state applicants to obtain and clear their credentials in California.

The Commission directed staff to research amendments 1, 2 and 3 on pages CC 4A-15-16 and bring back an agenda item in June for Commission consideration.

### **4B: Review of Regulations and Policy Pertaining to the Period of Validity of Examinations for Certification**

David Crable, Program Analyst, and Charlie Watters, Director, Certification Division, presented this item which reviewed the impact of policy that limits the validity of an examination score to five years and identified potential modifications and regulations concerning this policy.

**Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education**, voiced support of extending the current term of validity and suggested the Commission have an appeal process in place.

Chair Darling-Hammond directed staff to review bullets 2, 3 and 4 on page CC 4B-4 and bring an agenda item back for Commission consideration. Commissioner R. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **4C: Proposed Revision of Options for Meeting the Subject Matter Requirement for Multiple Subject Credential Candidates**

David Crable, Program Analyst, and Charlie Watters, Director, Certification Division, presented this item which provided a review of current regulations that require multiple subject credential

candidates to demonstrate their subject matter competence by passing the California Subject Examinations for Teachers (CSET), and do not allow completion of an approved subject matter program to waive this requirement.

**Carol Bohlin, California Association of Mathematics Teacher Educators**, submitted a letter which supported staff's recommendation to reinstate the option to complete an elementary subject matter program to meet the state subject matter requirement.

**Jenny Teresi, Riverside County Office of Education**, voiced support of this item to amend the current regulations to increase options for candidates seeking the Multiple Subject teaching credential.

**Luz Ortega, Los Angeles Unified School District**, requested the institutions of higher education consider the need for in-depth study in math and science when working on reestablishing subject matter preparation programs.

**Naomi Eason, California School Boards Association**, voiced support of reinstating the option to complete an elementary subject matter program to meet the subject matter requirement for the Multiple Subject teaching credential.

**David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, voiced support of this item and suggested the Commission examine the math and science content for Liberal Studies subject matter waivers.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, spoke in support of the item.

Commissioner Gonzalez moved to direct staff to initiate the rulemaking process to reinstate the option to complete an elementary subject matter program to meet the state subject matter requirement. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4D: Request to Waive the Requirement that a Candidate Hold a Bachelor's Degree from a Regionally Accredited College or University**

Raquel Rodriguez, Staff Services Manager, and Charlie Watters, Director, Certification Division, presented this item which provided a request from Academy of Art University (AAU) to waive the requirement that a candidate hold a bachelor's degree from a regionally accredited college or university, specifically for an AAU graduate, Jason Gilbertson.

**Joe Vollaro and Cathy Corcoran, Academy of Art University**, requested the Commission grant a waiver of the requirement to hold a bachelor's degree from a regionally accredited college or university to Mr. Gilbertson.

**Diana Earl and Jason Gilbertson, representing themselves**, asked the Commission to grant the waiver request.

Commissioner Harris moved to approve the requested waiver of the regional accreditation requirement for the bachelor's degree earned by Mr. Gilbertson at AAU. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Jose Gonzalez convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

#### **5A: Accreditation: Teacher Supply in California, 2014-15 A Report to the Legislature**

Marjorie Suckow and Lynette Roby, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided a report to the Governor and the Legislature on the number of teachers who received credentials, certificates, permits and waivers to teach in California public schools and demonstrated recently developed dashboards on teacher supply and demand.

**Erica Romero, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities**, suggested the Commission use its partners and resources in addressing the teacher shortage and in the long term create innovative remedies.

Commissioner Barnes moved to approve the Teacher Supply in California, 2014-15 Report for transmittal to the Governor and the Legislature. Commissioner R. Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **5B: Accreditation: Delivery Models for Teacher Preparation Programs, Options for Clinical Practice and Data Collection**

Nancy Tseng, Consultant, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an overview of delivery models that Commission-approved teacher preparation programs may offer, including the variety of clinical practice options and a discussion of common language and priorities for program-level data collection.

#### **5C: Annual Report on Passing Rates of Commission-Approved Examinations from 2010-2011 to 2014-2015**

Michael Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the passing rates for Commission-approved examinations over the past five years, 2010-2011 through 2014-2015. The purpose of each examination, the structure, the scoring process, the volume, and the first-time and cumulative passing rates were discussed in detail.

### **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 3:36 p.m. pursuant to California Government Code section 11126(e), to consider the following pending litigation: *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (Sacramento Superior Court, 34-2012-00135527-CU-OE). The Commission also considered adverse actions, petitions for reinstatement and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245, 44248, and Government Code section 11126(e).

**Friday, April 15, 2016**

**General Session**

Vice Chair Kathleen Harris reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:34 a.m. and roll call was taken.

**Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Jose Gonzalez reconvened the Educator Preparation Committee.

**5D: Work Related to Establishing Reciprocity for Instructors of Adult Education**

Erin Sullivan, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided for Commission consideration and possible adoption proposed new pathways for instructors of adult education at the California Community Colleges to obtain a Designated Subjects Adult Education (DSAE) teaching credential issued by the Commission.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, voiced concerns about the reciprocity language in the bill and suggested the Commission obtain input from the adult education community prior to making any decisions.

The Commission directed staff to: 1) prepare a report to the Legislature that includes the work and research that the Commission has done with the community colleges and indicates that the Commission is still investigating an experience and early completion option for reciprocity for instructors of adult education, and 2) that staff move forward with stakeholder conversations to get clarity on local level programs and how to best meet the needs of the K-12 community and adult education instructors. Commissioner Hinde seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

The Commission also directed staff to provide an update on the report at the June Commission meeting.

**Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Michael Cooney convened the Professional Practices Committee.

**6A: Division of Professional Practices Workload Report**

Nanette Rufo, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided a report on the Division of Professional Practices' current workload.

**Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair Kathleen Harris convened the Legislative Committee.

**7A: Status of Legislation**

Joshua Speaks, Legislative Representative, Office of Governmental Relations, presented this item which provided the status of legislative measures of interest to the Commission.

### **7B: Analyses of Bills**

Joshua Speaks, Legislative Representative, Office of Governmental Relations, presented an analysis of AB 1756 (Bonilla).

**Karen Cadiero-Kaplan, California Association for Bilingual Education**, shared data regarding bilingual programs.

Commissioner Hinde moved to take a position of “Seek Amendments” on AB 1756. Commissioner Gonzalez seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Zumot abstaining.

Joshua Speaks, Legislative Representative, Office of Governmental Relations, presented an analysis of AB 2122 (McCarty).

Commissioner Hinde moved to take a position of “Support if Amended” on AB 2122. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Zumot abstaining.

Joshua Speaks, Legislative Representative, Office of Governmental Relations, presented an analysis of AB 2336 (Olsen).

Commissioner Hinde moved to take a position of “Watch” on AB 2336. Commissioner Klatt seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Zumot abstaining.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Vice Chair Harris reconvened the General Session.

### **2H: Interview, Recommendation, and Appointment of Members for the Committee on Accreditation**

Commissioner Hinde moved to accept the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee for the appointment of Gerard Morrison, Cheryl Forbes and Iris Riggs to serve as members on the Committee on Accreditation effective July 1, 2016 and for James Webb, Simone Simmons and Lory Shelby to be appointed as alternates.

The motion carried without dissent.

### **2I: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair Harris reported that staff briefed the Commission on the case of *Kathleen Carroll v. CTC* and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- James Konugres
- Darilyn Washington-Williams
- Bridget Galassi

The Commission adopted the following Proposed Decisions:

- Amy Chizek

- Randall Perez

The Commission denied Deborah Brown's request for reconsideration and sustained its previous decision.

The Commission granted Jody Olhava's request for reconsideration and sustained its previous decision.

**1J: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Vice Chair Harris adjourned the meeting at 11:20 a.m.