

---

# 2A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the March 2012 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Executive Director recommends that the Commission approve the minutes of the March 2012 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the March 2012 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

**Strategic Plan Goal: 2**

**Support policy development related to educator preparation, conduct and professional growth**

April 2012

## **Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the March 8, 2012 Meeting**

---

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Charles Gahagan, Teacher Representative, Chair  
Linda Darling-Hammond, Faculty Member, Vice Chair  
Constance Blackburn, Teacher Representative  
Erick Casallas, Teacher Representative  
C. Michael Cooney, Public Representative  
Eddie Cuevas, Teacher Representative  
Marlon Evans, Public Representative  
Kathleen Harris, Teacher Representative  
Carolyn McInerney, School Board Member  
Tine Sloan, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Alicia Williamson, Teacher Representative  
Beverly Young, Ex-Officio, California State University  
Michelle Zumot, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction

### **Commission Members Absent**

Shane Martin, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities  
Nancy Ramirez, Public Representative  
Louise Stymeist, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative

### **General Session**

Chair Charles Gahagan convened the General Session of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing at 8:36 a.m. Roll call was taken and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

#### **1A: Approval of the January 2012 Minutes**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the January 2012 Minutes. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **1B: Approval of the March 2012 Agenda**

Commissioner Cooney moved approval of the March 2012 Agenda with agenda inserts for items 2C, 3B and 5A. Commissioner Cuevas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **1C: Approval of the March 2012 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Harris moved approval of the Consent Calendar. Commissioner Casallas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **1H: Proposed Amendments and Additions Pertaining to Education Specialist Instruction Credentials for Out-of-State and Out-of-Country Credentialed Teachers**

Chair Gahagan opened the public hearing at 8:40 a.m.

Tammy Duggan, Consultant, Certification, Assignment and Waivers Division, presented this item which provided proposed amendments and additions to Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations pertaining to the requirements for out-of-state and out-of-country credentialed teachers seeking Education Specialist Instruction Credentials in California.

Chair Gahagan solicited input from the Commissioners and the public.

There was no public input.

Commissioner McInerney moved to adopt the proposed amendments and additions to the regulations pertaining to Education Specialist Instruction Credentials for out-of-state and out-of-country credentialed teachers. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **1D: Chair's Report**

Chair Gahagan appointed Commissioner Alicia Williamson to serve as the Commission liaison to the Teacher Preparation Advisory Panel.

Chair Gahagan reported that the Commission held a strategic planning meeting at UC Davis on March 7, 2012.

### **1E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Mary Sandy introduced Chastine Gaspar, a new attorney, and Adrian Chavez, a new investigator, in the Division of Professional Practices.

Director Sandy announced the appointment of Anne Padilla as the Interim Administrator of the Office of Governmental Relations.

Director Sandy shared a letter from Tom Torlakson, Superintendent of Public Instruction about issues arising from the allegations of teacher misconduct at Miramonte Elementary School in the Los Angeles Unified School District. She reported the steps that staff has taken to provide the public with information about the Commission's role in protecting children in school.

### **1F: Commission Member Reports**

There was no report.

### **1G: Liaison Reports**

There was no report.

### **Professional Services Committee**

Committee Chair Constance Blackburn convened the Professional Services Committee.

**2A: Teacher Supply in California, 2010-2011, A Report to the Legislature**

Marjorie Suckow, Consultant, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, provided a report on the number of teachers who received credentials, certificates, permits and waivers to teach in California public schools in 2010-11.

**Tara Kini, Public Advocates**, voiced concerns regarding the numbers of non-fully trained teachers assigned to classrooms by the districts.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, raised concerns about the large percentage of teachers prepared by private colleges and requested data on the numbers of single subject credentialed holders prepared by various systems of higher education.

**Catherine Kearney, California Teacher Corps**, commented on the importance of intern programs.

Commissioner Evans moved to approve the 2010-11 Teacher Supply Report for submission to the Governor and the Legislature. Commissioner Cuevas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2C: Initial Institutional Approval**

Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information submitted by Bard College for purposes of initial institutional approval in response to Commission concerns.

**Norton Batkin, Bard College**, provided an update as to the manner in which the institution has addressed concerns and questions raised by the Commission.

**Carla Finkelstein, Bard College MAT Program**, provided an overview of the Bard College MAT program activities in the area of admission and advising.

**William Phillimore, Paramount Bard Academy**, provided brief background information on the MAT program of the Paramount Bard Academy.

**Lindsay Kuntz, representing herself**, questioned the sincerity of Bard College in resolving issues with the 2010-11 MAT students.

Commissioner McInerney moved to grant the initial institution approval to Bard College with the following stipulations: 1) assurance from Bard College not to offer any new programs without the Commission's prior approval; and 2) follow up with a site visit in the fall focusing on the program quality and on preparation to teach English learner. Commissioner Casallas seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**2B: Alternative Certification Programs in California**

Nadine Noelting, Administrator, and Teri Clark, Director, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information about California's Alternative Certification Programs and raised several programmatic and policy issues relating to alternative certification for discussion.

**Tara Kini, Public Advocates**, stated that intern teachers should be held to the same standards as individuals who went through the traditional programs, and that state and federal policy should promote equitable distribution of those intern teachers. She also raised concerns regarding the early completion option.

**Catherine Kearney, California Teacher Corps**, talked about the purpose of alternative routes to education careers and spoke about the importance of maintaining alternative certification programs.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, raised concerns regarding units and credentials that were earned by individuals at local district intern programs are not transferable or accepted by other states.

**2D: Educator Preparation Standards Revisions, Updates, and/or Modifications Recommended by the English Learner Authorizations Advisory Panel**

Phyllis Jacobson, Paula Jacobs, and Claudia Lockwood, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided proposed revisions, updates and/or modifications to educator preparation standards with respect to teaching English learners recommended by the English Learner Authorizations Advisory Panel.

**Gene Kluck, California Association for Bilingual Education and Californians Together**, voiced support of the following option: *the Commission could choose to review the EL Advisory Panel's suggested standards revisions and updates and adopt revisions/updates for implementation by preparation programs independent of the work of the TAP Panel* for the Preliminary Teacher Preparation Program Standard including revisions made to the CTEL KSAs. She also asked for clarification regarding the intern program delivery model.

**David Simmons, Ventura County Office of Education**, urged the Commission to accept the revisions to the Induction and Clear Program Standards.

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, requested the Commission provide more information regarding how this work will be blended with the Teacher Preparation Advisory Panel's work.

The Commission directed staff to move forward with the revision to the array of educator preparation program standards, conduct a field review of the draft revised standards and bring back the final proposed revised program standards for Commission consideration in the future.

**Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee**

Committee Chair Eddie Cuevas convened the Fiscal Policy and Planning Committee.

**3A: Establishment of the Fee Structure for Commission Examinations for 2012-13**

Crista Hill, Division Director, Administrative Services Division - Fiscal and Business Services Section, presented this item which provided a revised examination fee structure for Fiscal Year 2012-13.

Commissioner McInerney moved to adopt the 2012-13 examination fee as presented on page 3A-4. Commissioner Gahagan seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**3B: Update on the Proposed 2012-13 Governor's Budget**

Crista Hill, Division Director, Administrative Services Division - Fiscal and Business Services Section, presented this item which provided the specific details regarding the impact of the proposed budget.

**Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Kathleen Harris convened the Professional Practices Committee.

**4A: Division of Professional Practices Strategic Plan**

Nanette Rufo, Director, Division of Professional Practices (DPP), presented this item which provided a proposed amendment to the current Strategic Plan to add Goal 7: *Effectively, efficiently, and fairly monitor the fitness of all applicants and credential holders to work with California students* to address the DPP issues that were identified in the Bureau of State Audits report.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, provided suggestions regarding the objectives that were presented under Goal 7.

**Ken Burt, California Teachers Association**, provided information regarding the regulatory process to solicit public input on the reporting requirements from school districts.

**Janet Davis, United Teachers Los Angeles**, voiced concerns about the districts blurring discipline and performance issues.

**David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, asked the Commission not to shut the door on having the stakeholder meetings in the future to talk about balancing educator discipline issues while protecting the due process rights of the accused.

Commissioner Cooney moved to adopt the proposed amendment to its 2007 Strategic Plan listed on page 4A-2 to 4A-4 with the following changes: 1) under objective 1, bullet 3 should read: Institute a Best Practices Committee of CTC staff to research and identify internal and external best discipline practices; 2) under objective 3, bullet 2 should read: Solicit input from stakeholders and public regarding applicable revisions to regulations or legislation; and 3) under objective 5, add a bullet 4: Utilize the CTC website as a means of communicating with public. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4B: Policies on Division of Professional Practices Cases**

Nanette Rufo, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided proposed policy recommendations for the Commission's consideration on discipline relating to single alcohol offenses and failure to disclose information on an application.

**Ken Burt, California Teachers Association**, suggested the Commission revise its application form and educate the public on how to disclose certain information on their applications prior to implementing the policy on Failure to Disclose letters to assure fundamental fairness to applicants.

**David Simmons, California County Superintendents Educational Services Association**, voiced support of Ken Burt's suggestions.

**Janet Davis, California Federation of Teachers**, raised concerns regarding the lack of clarity about questions on dismissal and non-reelect under adverse actions.

Commissioner Evans moved to adopt the policy for sending Failure to Disclose letters listed on page PPC 4B-5. Commissioner McInerney seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Ken Burt, California Teachers Association**, suggested implementing the same policy for handling the first DUI and second DUI. He also raised concerns regarding subsequent DUIs and the language about the exception of the involvement of a child in the alcohol offense.

Commissioner McInerney moved to adopt the policy for a single alcohol related offense on page PPC 4B-4 and 4B-5. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4C: Workload Report Regarding the BSA Audit Recommendations**

Nanette Rufo, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided an update to the Commission on the April 7, 2011 Bureau of State Audits' Audit of the Division of Professional Practices, the Commission's response to the Audit, and an update on staff progress in addressing the recommendations. Ms. Rufo further provided information on the implication of the reports of a substantial change in employment status received from the Los Angeles Unified School District.

**Derek Ramage, Los Angeles Unified School District**, provided information regarding steps that the district has taken in regards to fulfilling its mandated report requirement to ensure student safety.

**Danette Brown, California Teachers Association**, confirmed the CTA's commitment to the ongoing streamlining of processes while continuing to protect the safety of students and rights of applicants and licensees by the effective, efficient and fair handling of cases in a timely manner. She further commended the Commission in informing the superintendents about their reporting requirement.

**Ken Burt, representing himself**, stated that the reporting duty lies with the given superintendent and it is unprofessional conduct not to do so. He also said that if the Commission chooses to investigate, the issue should be what the sanction would be, from nothing all the way to credential revocation.

#### **Legislative Committee**

Committee Chair Linda Darling-Hammond convened the Legislative Committee.

#### **5A: Analyses of Bills**

Anne Padilla, Interim Administrator, Office of Governmental Relations, presented an analysis of AB 1765 (Brownley).

**Harold Acord, California Teachers Association**, voiced concerns regarding timely posting of the agenda in accordance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act. He also raised concerns regarding the idea of creating a new credential on teacher leadership and the cost associated to convene an advisory panel of stakeholders to discuss this topic.

Commissioner Harris moved to take a position of “Watch” on AB 1765. Commissioner McInerney seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**Reconvene General Session**

Chair Gahagan reconvened the General Session.

**1J: New Business**

The Quarterly Agenda was presented.

**Recess**

Chair Gahagan recessed the meeting to go into Closed Session at pursuant to California Government Code sections 11126(e), to consider pending litigation (*Carroll v Commission on Teacher Credentialing* (SPB 11-0739)) and to also consider adverse actions, petitions for reinstatement and requests for reconsideration in discipline cases pursuant to California Education Code sections 44245 and 44248.

**II: Report of Closed Session Items**

Chair Gahagan reported that the Commission considered one pending litigation item, *Carroll v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing*, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission denied the Petition for Reinstatement in the matter of Valerie Mayers.

The Commission granted the Petition for Reinstatement in the matter of Laura Spitler.

The Commission adopted the Proposed Decision in the matter of Sondra Tompkins.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Gahagan adjourned the meeting at 4:35 p.m.